

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 416 East Huron Street, Application Number HDC 14-279

DISTRICT: Old Fourth Ward Historic District

REPORT DATE: January 8, 2015

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: January 5, 2015

	OWNER	APPLICANT
Name:	Zaki Alawi	Same
Address:	414 Huntington Pl Ann Arbor, MI	
Phone:	(734) 260-7215	

BACKGROUND: This stately Queen Anne appears in the 1894 Polk City Directory as number 58 East Huron, the home of Sarah C. Rettich (widow of Frederick). Mrs. Rettich lived in the house until 1917. It features a steep hipped roof with three inset gables and a corner tower with a pyramidal roof. The house's exterior has suffered from artificial shingle siding and general neglect, but its original form is largely intact.

In April, 2014 the HDC approved a request to add an egress window to the basement of the west elevation, and denied a request to enlarge two original window openings in the side gable bumpouts. In July, 2014 the HDC approved a request to add four egress skylights, six furnace vents, seven bath vents, and three air conditioning condensers. Also in July, a staff approval was issued for two doublehung windows to be placed in openings with missing windows, and in August, 2014 a staff approval was issued for reroofing.

LOCATION: The site is located on the south side of East Huron Street, between South Division Street and South State Street.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to install two flat dryer vents and two pvc pipe water heater vents on the tower on the northwest corner of the house.



APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:**From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:**

- (1) A property will be used as it was historically or given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize a property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings:**Mechanical Systems**

Recommended: Installing a completely new mechanical system if required for the new use so that it causes the least alteration possible to the building's floor plan, the exterior elevations, and the least damage to the historic building material.

Providing adequate structural support for new mechanical equipment. Installing the vertical runs of ducts, pipes, and cables in closets, service rooms, and wall cavities.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Guidelines may apply):**Mechanical Equipment**

Appropriate: Installing mechanical equipment and wiring in a location so it is not visible from a public right-of-way.

Installing new air conditioning units and related mechanical equipment in such a manner that historic materials and features are not damaged or obscured.

Using screening such as vegetation and fencing around mechanical equipment.

Painting mechanical equipment to blend with the house or landscape.

Not Appropriate: Installing a new mechanical system that changes or destroys character-defining features and materials.

Cutting through architectural character-defining features to install mechanical equipment, antennas, satellite dishes, and related equipment.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The owner is requesting to install two 2" pvc pipes and two 4"x4" vents on the west-facing wall of the front tower. The lower penetrations through the wall were recently made without permits. (This despite being advised in the last HDC staff report and at two meetings to figure out what HDC approvals would be necessary and apply for a certificate of appropriateness *before* beginning work.) The requested new vents are due to building code requirements for new water heaters and bath fans.
2. Previously approved vents on this house include four 2" pvc pipes extending out of the roof near the east eave; eight 2" pvc pipes extending out of the east elevation of the building; and five 4"x4" bath fan vents (three on the east elevation and two on the west). In 2014 the house was converted from six bedrooms to 18.
3. The staff approvals list includes the installation of mechanical equipment "provided that the equipment or work is not visible from the street or sidewalk". Given that the work is visible from the sidewalk, and that the commission previously approved a plan for wall and roof penetrations on this house, and that the tower is a significant architectural feature of the house, staff feels this application is most appropriately reviewed by the Historic District Commission.
4. The Historic District Commission will need to decide whether the work meets the *SOI Guidelines* and the *City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines* for Mechanical Equipment.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motions below are only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission approve the application at 416 E Huron Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to install two 4" square vents and two 2" pvc vent pipes on the back side of the tower, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* and *Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 1, 2, and 9, and the guidelines for mechanical systems, and the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*, in particular for mechanical equipment.

MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 416 E Huron in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District

_____ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: application, drawings, window information, photos

416 E Huron (December 2014)





City of Ann Arbor

PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES — PLANNING SERVICES

Mailing: 301 E. Huron Street P.O. Box 8647 Ann Arbor, Michigan 48107-8647
Location: Larcom City Hall First Floor 301 E. Huron St. Ann Arbor, MI 48104-6120
p. 734.794.6265 f. 734.994.8312 planning@a2gov.org

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION APPLICATION

Section 1: Property Being Reviewed and Ownership Information	
Address of Property: <u>416 E. HURON</u>	
Historic District: _____	
Name of Property Owner (If different than the applicant): <u>ZAKI ALAWI</u>	
Address of Property Owner: <u>414 HUNTINGTON PLACE</u>	
Daytime Phone and E-mail of Property Owner: <u>(734) 260 7215 Zmichiganrental@gmail.com.</u>	
Signature of Property Owner: <u>Z. Alawi</u>	Date: <u>12/18/14</u>
Section 2: Applicant Information	
Name of Applicant: <u>ZAKI ALAWI</u>	
Address of Applicant: <u>414 HUNTINGTON PLACE ANN ARBOR MI 48104</u>	
Daytime Phone: <u>(734) 260 7215</u> Fax: <u>(734) 327 5929</u>	
E-mail: <u>Zmichiganrental@gmail</u>	
Applicant's Relationship to Property: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> owner <input type="checkbox"/> architect <input type="checkbox"/> contactor <input type="checkbox"/> other	
Signature of applicant: <u>Z. Alawi</u>	Date: <u>12/18/14</u>
Section 3: Building Use (check all that apply)	
<input type="checkbox"/> Residential <input type="checkbox"/> Single Family <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Multiple Family <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rental	
<input type="checkbox"/> Commercial <input type="checkbox"/> Institutional	
Section 4: Stille-DeRossett-Hale Single State Construction Code Act (This item MUST BE INITIALED for your application to be PROCESSED)	
Public Act 169, Michigan's Local Historic Districts Act, was amended April 2004 to include the following language: "...the applicant has certified in the application that the property where the work will be undertaken has, or will have before the proposed completion date, a fire alarm or smoke alarm complying with the requirements of the Stille-DeRossett-Hale Single State Construction Code Act, 1972 PA 230, MCL 125.1501 to 125.1531."	
Please initial here: <u>ZA</u>	

Section 5: Description of Proposed Changes (attach additional sheets as necessary)

1. Provide a brief summary of proposed changes. _____

- ① Add 2 dryer vents in the Front tower as shown in pictures none of it is visible from the street as shown.
- ② Add 2x2" pipes in front tower for water heater. Hidden/Not visible from street.

2. Provide a description of existing conditions. _____

3. What are the reasons for the proposed changes? _____

- ① NEED TO VENT 2 dryers serving 16 people.
- ② DTE Electric Company only provided 208 Voltage drops to this building, where normally they provide 240 Voltage drops making the existing water heater improper installation.

4. Attach any additional information that will further explain or clarify the proposal, and indicate these attachments here.

We have superficially attached the 2 heater pipes and 2 dryer vents and painted them & took pictures from different relevant angles in the front of the house to show they are not visible from the street and minimal effect if you are standing in front of them.

5. Attach photographs of the existing property, including at least one general photo and detailed photos of proposed work area.

STAFF USE ONLY

Date Submitted: 12/19/14. Application to _____ Staff or HDC
Project No.: HDC 14-279 Fee Paid: \$250⁰⁰ ~~xx~~
Pre-filing Staff Reviewer & Date: BA/12/19/14. Date of Public Hearing: _____
Application Filing Date: 12/19/14. Action: _____ HDC COA _____ HDC Denial
Staff signature: _____ _____ HDC NTP _____ Staff COA

Comments:





