



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, July 14, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Bushkuhl called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

Present: 5 - Ellen Ramsburgh, Thomas Stulberg, Benjamin L. Bushkuhl, Jennifer Ross, and Evan Hall

Absent: 2 - Robert White, and John Beeson

B **ROLL CALL**

Staff Present: Jill Thacher

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was unanimously Approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

Jill Thacher provided the Ann Arbor District Library Summer Game Player code.

E **HEARINGS**

E-1 **16-1019** HDC16-124; 215 S State - New Business Sign - SSHD

This application was withdrawn by the applicant.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Withdrawn

E-2 **16-1020** HDC16-140; 530 Elizabeth - New Directional Sign - OFWHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Stulberg and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg reported that in reviewing the proposed sign location on the site he felt it was appropriate, as was the proposed size. He said the sign will be highly visible from the residents living on the other side of Elizabeth Street. He agreed with staff comments.

Bushkuhl agreed with Stulberg's report, adding that the sign seemed to abide by our guidelines and he was looking forward to further discussion by the Commission on the material of the signage.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Rob Hohler, 530 Elizabeth Street, Ann Arbor, the applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by Bushkuhl, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 530 Elizabeth Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to install a new wood directional sign on the condition that staff reviews the final specifications for consistency at the time of sign permit review. As conditioned, the proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 9 and the guidelines for building sites, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for signs.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Vice Chair Beeson

E-3 [16-1021](#) HDC16-123; 428 S Seventh - Door/Window Alterations - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Stulberg and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review.

Bushkuhl reported that it was interesting to see the various additions that have been added over time, noting that one of those additions was added during a historic time. He said the canopy that is proposed to be added would not be confused with anything historic and is of simple design. He said the rear windows were looked at and were confirmed not to be historic. He said the project seems to meet our historic guidelines and it makes sense to have the front door more accessible.

Stulberg reviewed the site plan with the Commission and reported that it makes sense to move the front door for livability issues, without detracting from the historic house. He noted that the features being altered with the addition of the front porch are not character defining features.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Michael Bruner, 539 S. First Street, Ann Arbor, Architect for the project was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, seconded by Ramsburgh, that the Commission approve the application at 428 S. Seventh, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to: remove two non original

windows on the rear elevation and replace them with a sliding glass door; and to move the front door from the south side of the modern front addition to the north side and add a canopy and deck, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, and 9, and the guidelines for entrances, doors, and windows, and the Ann Arbor Historic Guidelines for windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Vice Chair Beeson

E-4 [16-1022](#) HDC16-119; 220 S Main - New Window Openings - MSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Stulberg and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg said the new windows would be visible from across the street on S. Main but they would not be visible from Liberty Street.

Bushkuhl agreed with the staff report, noting that the even spacing and having them in a level line they would not be drawing attention to themselves.

PUBLIC HEARING:

PUBLIC HEARING:

Andrew Curtis, 220 S. Main Street, owner, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ross, seconded by Bushkuhl, that the Commission approve the application at 220 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install four (4) new, non-vinyl windows along the western half of the south building elevation at the third floor, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, and 9, and the guidelines for windows and health and safety, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular for windows and safety codes.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Vice Chair Beeson

E-5 [16-1023](#) HDC16-141; 209 Murray - Rear Addition - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Stulberg and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their

review.

Bushkuhl reported that it was evident to see that the grade of this house was at least 1 foot lower than those around it, and could be at risk for flooding. He said it was nice to see that the owners were proposing to take measures to preserve this property for future generations, adding that the proposed peers would not be visible from the street or available sight-lines. He agreed with the staff report and noted that all his questions were answered during the site visit.

Stulberg explained that after the proposed changes, this house would not be incompatible with the neighboring houses' height off the grade. He said since the backyard is very tight, he felt the proposed layout of maxing out the width would be the most appropriate.

PUBLIC HEARING:

McLain Clutter, 209 Murray Avenue, owner, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Stulberg, seconded by Hall, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the as-drawn plan in the application at 209 Murray Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to raise the house, fill the basement, and construct a 400 square foot, two story rear addition, on the condition that evidence of a hipped front porch roof and stair window on the south elevation are provided to staff before that work may be submitted for building permits. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Vice Chair Beeson

E-6 [16-1024](#) HDC16-139; 1120 W Liberty - Rear Addition - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Stulberg and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg thanked the applicant for bringing a very interesting application, which included thorough plans. He said he liked the application.

Bushkuhl complimented the owners for keeping the house in such good condition. He said from across the street the addition would only slightly be visible and from Crest Street it would be difficult to see it, given the existing vegetation. Bushkuhl said, in viewing the porch that is proposed to be demolished, they did not see any character defining features in how it was constructed and it was not contributing to the house. He said it is clear that the work would be reversible which is great.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Sharon Haar, 1120 W. Liberty Street, Ann Arbor, co-owner, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Kasey Vliet, KASE Builders, LLC, 800 W. Huron Street, Ann Arbor, contractor and applicant was also present to respond to enquiries. He provided a revised grading plan to the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ross, seconded by Bushkuhl, that the Commission issue

a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1120 West Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District to construct a covered, enclosed, and conditioned walkway connecting the existing house to an existing garage, and a rear patio, and paving the existing gravel driveway with concrete. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Vice Chair Beeson

E-7 [16-1025](#) HDC16-125; 209 S Main - Replace Storefront - MSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Stulberg and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review.

Bushkuhl reported that in visiting the site he agreed with the staff report. He noted that having the third floor windows changed to match with the second floor windows would be an improvement and aid in meeting the feel of the rhythm when walking down the street.

Stulberg agreed with Bushkuhl.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Kirk Phillips, 209 S. Main, Ann Arbor, design architect, and Jon Wakeman, project architect, were present to respond to enquiries from the Commission. They provided revised plans of their application to the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

For the mechanical equipment:

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by Stulberg, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 209 S. Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District to install mechanical units on the existing roof to accommodate restaurant modifications, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 9 and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON MECHANICAL EQUIPMENT:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

For the mechanical equipment:

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Vice Chair Beeson

For the storefront, business signs, and cornice:

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by Stulberg, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 209 S. Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District to (1) remove an existing storefront and construct a new storefront as proposed in the handout; (2) install two new exterior business signs. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts, commercial entries, signs and historic metal, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 3, 5 6, and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts, building site, and new additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

For the storefront, business signs:

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by Stulberg to postpone taking action until the August HDC meeting. On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0 - Item Postponed

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Vice Chair Beeson

E-8 [16-1026](#) HDC16-126; 225 S State - New Elevator - SSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Stulberg and Bushkuhl visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg said the staff report was very thorough and he had nothing to add.

Bushkuhl said the only issue the Commission might have would be losing the original window, but he noted it was not character defining, such as the whole front façade. He said the location was on the side and would not be visible like the front.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Timothy Stout, O’Neal Construction, Ann Arbor, designer and contractor, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Russ Collins, the owner, was also present.

Patrick Roach and Kim Newbauer, Quinn Evans, 219 ½ N. Main Street, Ann Arbor, were present as well.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ross, seconded by Ramsburgh, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 225 S. State Street, a contributing property in the State Street Historic District, to restore the existing façade, and add an addition to provide an elevator for barrier free access to the mezzanine and third levels, and other work, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions and safety codes, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 3, 6, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for storefronts, setting, accessibility and new additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Vice Chair Beeson

F UNFINISHED BUSINESS

G NEW BUSINESS

G-1 16-1027 525 South First Marker Application

Jill Thacher presented the staff memo. See attached in agenda packet.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by Bushkuhl, that the 1888 Koch Horning House at 525 South First Street meets the criteria for a City of Ann Arbor Historic Building marker based on its age, historic and architectural significance, and contribution to the history of Ann Arbor.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Vice Chair Beeson

G-2 16-1028 224 Crest Marker Application

Jill Thacher presented the staff memo. See attached in agenda packet.

Moved by Hall, seconded by Ramsburgh, that the 1917 William Nimke House at 224 Crest Avenue meets the criteria for a City of Ann Arbor Historic Building marker based on its age, historic and architectural significance, and contribution to the history of Ann Arbor.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented

application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Vice Chair Beeson

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1 **16-1031** Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes of the June 9, 2016

The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

Ramsburgh provided a report from Cobblestone Farm Association. She noted their farmer's market days with associated activities.

J ASSIGNMENTS

J-1 **Review Committee: Monday, August 8, 2016, at 5pm for the August 11, 2016 Regular Meeting**

Stulberg and Bushkuhl volunteered for the August Review Committee.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF

K-1 **16-1029** June 2016 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Thacher reviewed the criteria for submitting applications, pointing out that last minute substitutions of plans is not generally allowed, per the HDC bylaws. She said she will be working on revising the application to make the expectations clear to the applicant.

M COMMUNICATIONS

- M-1** [16-1030](#) Various Communications to the HDC
Received and Filed

N ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 10:40 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- *Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx*
- *Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.*

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.