



City of Ann Arbor
Meeting Minutes - Final
City Planning Commission

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Wednesday, August 5, 2020

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

**This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and
online at a2gov.org/watchCTN**

**To speak at public comment call: 877 853 5247 (Toll Free) or 888 788 0099
Meeting ID: 977 1150 1143**

1 CALL TO ORDER

Chair Sarah Mills called the meeting to order at 7:01 p.m.

2 ROLL CALL

City of Ann Arbor Planning Manager Brett Lenart called the roll.

Present 8 - Woods, Mills, Milshteyn, Gibb-Randall, Ackerman, Sauve,
 Abrons, and Hammerschmidt

Absent 1 - Briggs

3 INTRODUCTIONS

None.

4 APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Abrons, to approve the agenda.

Unanimously approved.

5 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

None.

**6 REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER,
PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN
COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS**

6-a City Council

Councilmember Zach Ackerman shared the results of the August 4, 2020 primary election in Ann Arbor.

6-b Planning Manager

No report.

6-c Planning Commission Officers and Committees

Vice Chair Shannon Gibb-Randall reported that the Environmental Commission is making revisions to support neutrality goals, and that those revisions will intersect with the Ordinance Revision Committee in the future.

Chair Mills discussed site plan requirement changes, C1 and C1AR zoning district changes, evaluation of table layouts as part of a group of amendments.

6-d Written Communications and Petitions

[20-1180](#) Various Communication to the City Planning Commission

Received and Filed

7 AUDIENCE/PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)

Seeing no speakers, Chair Mills closed Audience Participation.

8 PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING

[20-1181](#) Public Hearings Scheduled for the August 18, 2020 Planning Commission Meeting

Received and Filed

9 UNFINISHED BUSINESS – Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion on Each Item

- 9-a [20-1182](#) Sign Ordinance Amendments for City Council Approval - Proposed amendments to Chapter 55 - Unified Development Code, Section 5.24 Signs, to update and modernize requirements for signage. Proposed sign amendments were postponed at the May 19, 2020 City Planning Commission Meeting to give staff time to address their comments. Staff recommendation: Approval

Lenart summarized proposed changes to the draft as attached. Full presentation available online at:

<https://ctnvideo.a2gov.org/CablecastPublicSite/show/2833?channel=1>

PUBLIC HEARING

Tom Renkert, Ann Arbor Board of Realtors, 1919 W. Stadium, opposed the elimination of the time exception for signs, explaining that 41% of the current properties for sale in Ann Arbor have on the market for greater than 65 days. Discussed open houses, which adds signage when homeowners are advertising open houses. Encouraged the maximum height to be established.

MAIN MOTION

Moved by Woods, seconded by Sauve, that The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the amendments to Chapter 55 Unified Development Code, Section 5.24 and related references.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Lenart clarified that the time exception is not proposed to be eliminated.

Commissioner Lisa Sauve sought clarification regarding for sale and for lease signs as they relate to court rulings.

Lenart explained that a sign ordinance that requires the content to be enforced is inappropriate.

Commissioner Wendy Woods inquired about election signs, referencing a sheriff sign from the attached staff report.

Lenart explained that the intention in including sign examples was to encourage discussion regarding creating a place in the code for signs

with no time limit.

Commissioner Alex Milshteyn discussed making an amendment to allow the maximum height of freestanding size from 5 feet to 6 feet.

AMENDMENT 1

Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Sauve to amend the maximum height of temporary residential freestanding signs from 5 feet to 6 feet maximum height.

DISCUSSION AMENDMENT 1

None.

VOTE ON AMENDMENT 1 TO MAIN MOTION

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring Amendment 1 approved.

Yeas: 8 - Wendy Woods, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Erica Briggs

DISCUSSION OF MAIN MOTION

Commissioner Milshteyn discussed open house signs, discussing that he is in favor in amending the 12 square foot limit to 16 square feet to account for a potential open house sign, so that open house signs are legal.

AMENDMENT 2 TO MAIN MOTION

Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Abrons, to amend the maximum temporary sign area for residential properties from 12 square feet to 20 square feet.

DISCUSSION OF AMENDMENT 2

Commissioner Ellie Abrons inquired about the per sign and per lot limit.

Lenart clarified that the proposed limit is 12 feet per lot.

Commissioner Shannon Gibb-Randall explained that she is not in favor of increasing the per sign area.

Chair Mills discussed an appropriate square footage to allow for an open house sign.

Milshteyn explained that at least 16 feet is enough, but more than that would also be helpful to the real estate community.

Commissioner clarified that the amendment to increase square footage applies to single and multiple family residential zonings.

Commissioner Sara Hammerschmidt inquired about temporary signs as they relate to open house signs.

The Commission further discussed configurations of different types of signage.

Milshteyn inquired about sign limits for lot widths greater than 65 feet.

Lenart clarified that the Planning Commission would need to adjust the limit for lots with a width greater than 65 feet. Lenart discussed capping all lot signage at 20 feet.

VOTE ON AMENDMENT 2 TO MAIN MOTION

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion passed.

Yeas: 8 - Wendy Woods, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Erica Briggs

DISCUSSION OF MAIN MOTION

Commissioner Abrons discussed potential confusion about the unlimited time limit for signs in the temporary category, discussing the term "impermanent" to replace the term "temporary".

Commissioner Hammerschmidt discussed increasing the total amount of residential signage permitted. Hammerschmidt also discussed that many

residences currently have more signs than would be allowed by the ordinance, and that perhaps a limitation needs to be increased.

Chair Mills inquired about political signs relating to the current ordinance.

Lenart explained the current allowance for political signs, describing setback requirements, size limitations, and duration permitted to be in a yard.

Commissioner Woods emphasized that the total signage proposed may not be enough.

AMENDMENT 3 TO MAIN MOTION

Moved by Mills, seconded by Milshteyn to amend the maximum number of temporary signs in residential zones from 4 to 6.

Yeas: 8 - Wendy Woods, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Erica Briggs

COMMISSION DISCUSSION OF AMENDMENT 3 TO THE MAIN MOTION

Abrons clarified that the proposed increase is to 6 total temporary signs.

DISCUSSION OF MAIN MOTION

Commissioner Hammerschmidt emphasized that it was important to have the same limitation across lot sizes.

THE MOTION AS AMENDED READS AS FOLLOWS:

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the amendments to Chapter 55 Unified Development Code, Section 5.24 and related references.

AMENDMENT 1

To amend the maximum height of temporary residential freestanding signs from 5 feet to 6 feet maximum height.

AMENDMENT 2

To amend the maximum temporary sign area for residential properties from 12 square feet to 20 square feet.

AMENDMENT 3

To amend the maximum number of temporary signs in residential zones from 4 to 6.

VOTE ON THE MAIN MOTION AS AMENDED:

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion passed. **Vote: 8 - 0**

Approved Unanimously.

Yeas: 8 - Wendy Woods, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Erica Briggs

10 REGULAR BUSINESS – Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion on Each Item

- 10-a** **20-1183** Veridian at County Farm Planned Unit Development (PUD) Zoning and Supplemental Regs for City Council Approval - A request to rezone a 13.6-acre site at 2270 Platt Rd from Public Land (PL) to Planned Unit Development (PUD) district, and to approve Supplemental Regulations with the unique development standards for the PUD district. These standards address minimum or maximum (as appropriate) density, unit types, building setbacks, building height, building spacing, open space, landscaping and buffering, off-street parking, amenities, sustainability and conservation. Two site plans consistent with the proposed zoning and Supplemental Regulations are also, separately, proposed. Staff Recommendation: Approval

Veridian at County Farm North Site Plan (Avalon) for City Council Approval - A proposed site plan for 50 apartments in nine 3-story buildings on a 4.70-acre site at 2270 Platt Rd in a proposed Planned Unit Development (PUD) Zoning district. The proposed development is designed to

seamlessly connect with a proposed residential development adjacent to the south. Staff Recommendation: Approval

Veridian at County Farm South Site Plan (Thrive) for City Council Approval - A proposed site plan to develop 99 homes, including detached, attached, and apartments, and community buildings, on an 8.50-acre site at 2270 Platt Rd in a proposed Planned Unit Development (PUD) Zoning district. The development is designed to seamlessly connect with another proposed residential development adjacent to the north in the same proposed PUD district. Staff Recommendation: Approval

Commissioner Gibb-Randall recused herself from this item due to a conflict of interest.

Lenart explained that due to the nature of this project, being two separate projects being developed side-by-side, that one 20 minute presentation is permitted.

Developer Team Present

Wendy Carty-Saxon, Director of Real Estate with Avalon Housing

Meghan Gloyd

Ben Willis, Union Studio

Susan Noblet

James Gray

David Esau, Architect, Cornerstone Design

Joey Jonna

Heath Hartt

Matt Grocoff, Thrive Collaborative

Full Developer Presentation available online at:

<https://ctnvideo.a2gov.org/CablecastPublicSite/show/2833?channel=1>

City of Ann Arbor City Planner Alexis DiLeo presented the Staff Report.

Full presentation available online at :

<https://ctnvideo.a2gov.org/CablecastPublicSite/show/2833?channel=1>

PUBLIC HEARING:

Susan Bowers, 2400 S Huron Parkway, inquired about a traffic study at Platt road. Expressed concern regarding traffic.

Seeing no further speakers, Chair Mills closed the Public Hearing

MAIN MOTION

Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Ackerman, that:

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Veridian at County Farm PUD Zoning District and Supplemental Regulations.

and

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Veridian at County Farm North Site Plan (Avalon Housing) and Development Agreement, subject to land division approval prior to applying for any permits.

and

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Veridian at County Farm South Site Plan (Thrive Collaborative) and Development Agreement, subject to land division approval prior to applying for any permits.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON MAIN MOTION

DiLeo clarified the proposed supplemental regulations, explaining that it may be appropriate to increase specificity.

Councilmember Ackerman emphasized the importance of the proposed project, commending the efforts of the developers in carrying out the project to this point. Ackerman expressed support for approving the project, and inquired about the design renderings.

Grocoff explained that the renderings included are concepts, the exterior of the proposed buildings won't change, but the interior layouts may change depending on need at the time of construction. Also provided a correction to the staff report, explaining that the south elevation is proposed to be 30 feet, instead of the 50 feet listed.

Councilmember Ackerman inquired about the location in the supplemental regulations of the affordable housing requirement and sustainable energy production guarantee.

DiLeo explained that the Living Building Challenge standards requirement will cover the sustainable energy guarantee.

Grocoff further explained that the requirement is built into their purchase agreement with the county as well.

Lenart explained that the ordinance requires that the affordable housing be affordable in perpetuity.

Ackerman also inquired about a traffic study relating to the proposed project.

DiLeo explained that there has been a study done, and reviewed by the City Traffic Engineers.

Cynthia Redinger, City of Ann Arbor Traffic Engineer, explained that a traffic analysis was completed, and that the developer went through a round of revisions before the proposed traffic plan was accepted. Redinger further explained that multiple modes of transportation are anticipated at the site.

Ackerman inquired about the setback error at the site.

Hartt explained that the 30 foot setback allows exclusion from a landscape buffer and an easement. Hartt further explained that the 50 would be a further encroachment than planned.

AMENDMENT 1

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Sauve to amend the south setback from 50 to 30 feet.

DISCUSSION OF AMENDMENT 1

Mills confirmed with DiLeo that the proposed amendment is appropriate.

VOTE ON AMENDMENT 1

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion passed.

Yeas: 8 - Wendy Woods, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Erica Briggs

DISCUSSION OF MAIN MOTION

Commissioner Woods inquired about traffic at the site, and how traffic may impact the school across the street. Woods also inquired about the proposed timing scenarios.

Redinger explained that there is currently a crosswalk near, along with school markings and speed reductions. Redinger explained that the traffic study did not show that any changes would need to be made in that area.

Lenart explained the proposed options for affordable housing at the site, explaining the north component option: all affordable, the south component option: 15% of units built in south component, build units or take credit for units in north component, and payment in lieu.

Commissioner Sauve discussed the configuration of the affordable unit construction, inquiring about changing the configuration over time.

Lenart explained that as long as the requirement is met, the developer could reconfigure.

Commissioner Abrons inquired about which aspects go with the rezoning/site plan as it relates to the supplemental regulations.

DiLeo explained that the proposal is to rezone to PUD, which is essentially to rezone to this specific project, which ties the rezoning to the supplemental regulations.

Commissioner Hammerschmidt, clarified the affordable housing components, and inquired if there is a scenario where no affordable units are built. Hammerschmidt also inquired about the configuration requirements for the affordable units.

Carty-Saxon explained that the intention is to put in an application for all 50 units.

Hammerschmidt emphasized the need for the affordable units to be equitable. Hammerschmidt also inquired about certified vs registered as it relates to the Living Building Challenge. Also clarified the use of shared spaces on the site.

Lenart clarified that currently, at this time, only a number of units is being

proposed, not a certain blend of units.

Grocoff explained that certification occurs when the project has been operating successfully for 12 months, where as registered does not measure efficacy, it just indicates participation. Grocoff further explained that the design is intended to have no noticeable definition between the affordable units, and that the use of shared spaces at the proposed development are permitted by all residents there.

Commissioner Hammerschmidt also clarified that the project is is proposing a rezoning from Public Land to PUD, and explained further that the Public Land is not park, it is land owned by Washtenaw County.

Commissioner Milshteyn expressed appreciation for the proposed project, highlighting the amount of affordable housing. Milshteyn inquired about the timeline for the project.

Carty-Saxon explained that the Avalon portion is intended to begin construction by the end of 2022.

Joey Jonna explained that the Veridian portion of the project is intended to begin construction this winter or early spring.

Chair Mills expressed excitement for the proposed project, and commended the cooperation between developers for the project. Mills also discussed the height limit flexibility.

Grocoff agreed that the height and density flexibility allow for flexibility in the development. The proposed density allowed balance with the site, and flexibility for market conditions.

Mills inquired about the proposed tree counts, explaining that there was some public concern regarding the tree amounts.

DiLeo explained that due to a counting error, the developer is asking for a reduction in trees from 75 to 50 trees. DiLeo explained that 50 trees is close to the required amount.

The Commission discussed tree species in the proposed landscape buffer.

Noblet clarified that neighbors requested shrubs, the proposed shrubs will grow to a minimum of 8 feet, and there will be a 25 foot buffer. Of the 51

proposed trees, 38 are evergreen.

AMENDMENT 2

Moved by Mills, seconded by Woods to remove (ii) from the Supplemental Regulations, which specified 75 trees in the south buffer.

DISCUSSION OF AMENDMENT 2

The Commission discussed that the Unified Development Code already requires specific tree counts, and that the same requirements do not need to be added to the Supplemental Regulations.

Woods discussed that the landscape requirements have already been reviewed.

DiLeo inquired about if the Planning Commission is comfortable with the landscaping shown on the plan, and that if so, DiLeo will make the change to memorialize what is shown in the plan, which would be allowed if the Planning Commission approves the plan as presented.

VOTE ON AMENDMENT 2

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion failed.

Unanimously Denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 8 - Wendy Woods, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Absent: 1 - Erica Briggs

DISCUSSION OF MAIN MOTION:

Mills inquired about guest bicycle parking. Mills also inquired about lighting at the site, discussing the contrast between the Thrive and Avalon areas, encouraging reducing the lighting contrast.

Grocoff explained that 55 open air bicycle parking spaces are proposed.

Carty-Saxon explained that lighting fixtures are consistent, and that based on experience with tenants and properties, it has proved in the past to be beneficial to have increased lighting. As an example, a sense of security is provided by increased lighting, and that the lighting at this site is proposed to be the lowest of any Avalon site.

VOTE ON MAIN MOTION

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the chair declaring the motion approved as amended.

Approved Motion reads as follows:

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Veridian at County Farm PUD Zoning District and Supplemental Regulations as amended to amend the south setback from 50 to 30 feet.

and

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Veridian at County Farm North Site Plan (Avalon Housing) and Development Agreement, subject to land division approval prior to applying for any permits.

and

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Veridian at County Farm South Site Plan (Thrive Collaborative) and Development Agreement, subject to land division approval prior to applying for any permits.

Yeas: 8 - Wendy Woods, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Erica Briggs

10-b [20-1184](#) Review of City Planning Commission Bylaws

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Abrons, to consider item 10-b after 11:30 p.m.

Approved Unanimously.

Lenart presented the Staff Report.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Gibb-Randall expressed support for holding two public comment periods.

Mills discussed the petitioner response opportunity.

Lenart explained the evolution of the petitioner presentation portion.

Milshteyn and Abrons discussed that the Commission is able to address questions without the petitioner rebuttal section.

Abrons discussed allowing the Chair to extend the Public Hearing time allowance.

The Commission further discussed speaking time limits.

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission moves to accept the proposed amendments for future consideration at the August 18, 2020 Planning Commission Meeting.

Approved Unanimously**11 AUDIENCE/PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)**

Seeing no speakers, Chair Mills closed Audience Participation.

12 COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

None

13 ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Sauve, to adjourn the meeting at 11:24 p.m.

Unanimously approved.

Sarah Mills, Chairperson
/kvl

eComments for the Commission may be left via our Legistar calendar page (column to the very right)
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Commission public meetings are usually held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>). Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

(If an agenda item is postponed, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a postponed agenda item will appear on a future agenda please contact Planning staff. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.) Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn> . The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.