



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Draft

City Planning Commission

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Tuesday, March 5, 2024

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Wonwoo Lee called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm in the Ann Arbor City Hall Council Chambers.

2. ROLL CALL

Deputy Planning Manager Hank Kelley called the roll.

Others present:

*Planning Manager Brett Lenart
Deputy Planning Manager Hank Kelley
City Planner Jill Thacher
City Planner Alexis DiLeo*

Present 8 - Mills, Abrons, Disch, Lee, Clarke, Wyche, Weatherbee, and Adams

Absent 1 - Hammerschmidt

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Moved by Commissioner Weatherbee seconded by Commissioner Mills to approve the agenda as presented. On a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

4-a. 24-0270 February 22, 2024 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: February 22, 2024 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes.pdf

Moved by Councilmember Disch seconded by Commissioner Mills to approve the February 22, 2024 City Planning Commission meeting minutes. On a voice vote the minutes were unanimously approved as presented and forwarded to City Council.

5. REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS

5-a. City Council

No updates.

5-b. Planning Manager

Planning Manager Lenart reported:

For the March 12, 2024 Work Session there will be a concept discussion for a site plan for 2854 South State Street which is a large scale development for our TC1 district. The Working Session will have an alternative start time of 8:00pm to accommodate public workshop attendance.

There will be three public engagement opportunities next week, March 12-14th at the downtown library branch to get public feedback on the comprehensive plan, downtown circulation study and DDA TIF plan.

5-c. Planning Commission Officers and Committees

Commissioner Abrons reported:

There was no Ordinance Revisions Committee meeting held last month to allow participants more time to engage with zoning simplification content. The next meeting will be April 23, 2024.

5-d. Written Communications and Petitions

24-0271 Various Communication to the City Planning Commission

Attachments: 716 Packard Owner letter of opposition 732 Packard Street.pdf, Carrasquillo email of support 503 Miller Avenue.pdf, Cuppernull email of support 503 Miller

Avenue.pdf, Dacic email of opposition 416 Longshore Drive.pdf, Field email of support 503 Miller Avenue.pdf, Fink email of support 503 Miller Avenue.pdf, Fischer email of opposition 416 Longshore Drive.pdf, Ganet email of support 503 Miller Avenue.pdf, Garber email 732 Packard PUD.pdf, Gross email of support 503 Miller Avenue.pdf, Jordan letter of opposition 2502 Packard Street.pdf, Kavar email of support 503 Miller Avenue.pdf, Marcus email of support 503 Miller Avenue.pdf, Murphy email of support 503 Miller Avenue.pdf, New Hope Baptist Church email of support 503 Miller Avenue.pdf, Peitzmeier email of support 503 Miller Avenue.pdf, Santer email of support 503 Miller Avenue.pdf, Trautmann email 416 Longshore.pdf, White email of support 503 Miller Avenue.pdf, Wineberg email of opposition 732 Packard.pdf

Received and filed.

6. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)

Brian Donovan, Highland Park MI, work in Ann Arbor for the intercooperative council (ICC), shared examples of other community regulation related to co-op housing.

Brian Pagone, 1507 Washtenaw Avenue, expressed that current zoning regulations make it difficult to maintain and expand ICC owned cooperative housing, and recommended several zoning changes.

Alex Littleman, 1507 Washtenaw Avenue, shared challenges in establishing cooperative group housing under current City regulations, and recommended changing minimum lot size requirements.

Tom Stulberg, Lower Town resident, talked about PUDs and how he disagrees with how they have been used.

Seeing no additional speakers, Chair Lee closed the Public Comment

7. PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT REGULAR MEETING

- 7-a. [24-0273](#)** No public hearings are scheduled. The Tuesday, March 19, 2024 Planning Commission Meeting has been cancelled accordingly.

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None

9. REGULAR BUSINESS – Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing, and Commission Discussion of Each Item**9-a. 24-0274 503 Miller Special Exception Use for Planning Commission Approval (Apple Playschools):**

A request to allow a child care center limited to 47 children and 15 staff. The existing 3,200 square foot structure is to be renovated; no new development is proposed. Site Size: 8,447 square feet. Zoning Designation: R2A (Two-Family Dwelling). Staff Recommendation: Approval.

Attachments: 503 Miller SR 022924.pdf, 503 Miller Civil Plans 022624.pdf, 503 Miller Ave Zoning Map.pdf, 503 Miller Ave Aerial Map Zoom.pdf, 503 Miller SEU application.pdf, 503 Miller SEU citizen participation summary.pdf

PROJECT/PRESENTATION:

Etta Heisler, Apple Playschools, presented the proposed request

STAFF REPORT/PRESENTATION:

City Planner Jill Thacher presented the proposed request

PUBLIC HEARING:

Laurie Lounsbury, 507 Miller Avenue, spoke in opposition to the proposed project

Frances Todoses Hargraves, resident, spoke in support of the proposed project

Moved by Commissioner Mills seconded by Councilmember Disch that

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission, after hearing all interested persons and reviewing all relevant information, including an accompanying site plan, finds the petition substantially meet the standards in Chapter 55 (Unified Development Code), Section 5.29.5.D (Special Exception Use) and Section 5.16.2.B (Child Care Center), and therefore approves the 503 Miller Special Exception Use for Child Care Center at 503 Miller Avenue. This approval is

based on the following findings:

1. The proposed use will be consistent with the R2A (Multiple-Family Dwelling) District which allows single- and two-family residential uses and child care centers by special exception.
2. The proposed use will not adversely impact traffic, pedestrians, bicyclists, circulation, road intersections based on the location. Miller Avenue and Chapin Street provide access to the site, and the proposed use is consistent with the existing and other surrounding uses' traffic impact.
3. The subject site meets the use specific standard of at least 7,500 square feet of lot area.
4. A site plan documenting the existing and proposed conditions of the site has been submitted as part of this application.

This Special Exception Use approval is based on the following conditions:

1. Child care is provided for no more than 47 children by no more than 15 caregivers.
2. Six Class B Bicycle Parking spaces will be provided by September 30, 2025 at 511 Miller for shared use with 503 Miller. And that the Ann Arbor Planning Commission approves the attached Site Plan which demonstrates compliance with the applicable Special Exception Use standards as no development which would otherwise require site plan approval has been proposed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the proposed request and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote the vote was as follows with the Deputy Planning Manager declaring the motion carried. **Vote 8-0.**

Yeas: 8 - Sarah Mills, Ellie Abrons, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira Clarke, Donnell Wyche, Julie Weatherbee, and Daniel Adams

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Sara Hammerschmidt

- 9-b. [24-0277](#) 416 Long Shore Drive Site Plan for City Planning Commission Approval:
A proposal to construct a new four story, 15 unit condominium building next to an existing office building. Site Size: 1.66 acres. Zoning

Designation: O (Office). Staff Recommendation: Approval.

Attachments: 2024-02-28 416 Long Shore Drive Revised SP_v1 (2).pdf, 416 and 580 Long Shore Dr Zoning Map.pdf, 416 and 580 Long Shore Dr Aerial Map.pdf, 416 and 580 Long Shore Dr Aerial Map Zoom.pdf, 416 Long Shore DRAFT Development Agreement 022924.pdf

Chair Lee noted due to a noticing error the proposed item will be postponed to the Tuesday, April 2, 2024 City Planning Commission meeting.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Kyle Dramond, 530 Detroit Street, spoke in opposition to the proposed project urging another look at tree mitigation to protect bird habitat and expressing concerns about affordability

Judy Nicolai, 517 Long Shore Drive, spoke in opposition to the proposed project noting concerns with visitor travel to the Argo Cascades

Tom Stulberg, resident, expressed concerns about how project would impact parking at Argo Cascades

Seeing no additional speakers Chair Lee closed the Public Hearing

Moved by Commissioner Mills seconded by Councilmember Disch that

The City Planning Commission postpone item to the Tuesday, April 2, 2024 City Planning Commission meeting.

On a voice vote Chair Lee declaring the motion carried.

- 9-c.** **24-0276** 732 Packard Street PUD Zoning District and Supplemental Regulations, and Site Plan for City Council Approval: A request to rezone a 1.27-acre site from C1A/R (Campus Business Residential) to PUD (Planned Unit Development) and adopt Supplemental Regulations to allow development up to 450,000 square feet and 14 stories, and a site plan to construct a 14-story apartment building with optional ground floor commercial. Proposed beneficial effects of the PUD district include affordable housing (by payment in lieu), enhanced sustainability and open space. As proposed, the building has 376 apartments, 82 vehicle parking spaces, 329 bicycle parking spaces and includes streetscape improvements. The site includes 12 parcels: 722, 726, 732, 736, and 740 Packard Street, and 917, 921, 923, 925, 927, 931 and 933 South State Street. Staff recommendation: Approval.

Attachments: Staff Report March 5, 2024 (723 Packard), Zoning Map (732 Packard), Aerial Map (732 Packard), Site Plan v4 (732 Packard), Site Plan Architecture Renderings v4 (732 Packard), Supplemental Regulations February 26, 2024 Draft (732 Packard), Development Agreement March 1, 2024 Draft (732 Packard).pdf

PROJECT/PRESENTATION:

Andy Savoy, Core Spaces presented the proposed request

STAFF REPORT/PRESENTATION:

City Planner Alexis DiLeo presented the proposed request

PUBLIC HEARING:

Dan Troyka, representing 716 Packard, spoke in opposition to the proposed project, citing requirements to weigh impact on neighboring properties during PUD review.

Lin Kelley, 1912 Anderson, noted that while this seems to be a thoughtful design, with sustainability factors and step backs, 15 stories seems out of scale with existing structures and 7 stories would be more appropriate.

Bela Maserie, 711 Arch Street, urged improvements to Forsythe Park along with a public pathway on the south side of the lot for better pedestrian access.

Adam Jaskewicz, Las Vegas Boulevard, spoke in support of the proposed project

Michelle Hughes, resident, spoke in support of the proposed project

Rita Mitchell, 621 Fifth Street, expressed concerns that the building would be too tall and suggested the developer use bird safe glass.

Adam Goodman, 5th ward, spoke in support of the proposed project, but raised concerns about whether development shows a mix of bike parking for all users.

Seeing no additional speakers Chari Lee closed the Public Hearing.

Moved by Commissioner Mills seconded by Commissioner Wyche that

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 732 Packard PUD Zoning District and Supplemental Regulations.

and

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 732 Packard Site Plan and Development Agreement, subject to addressing outstanding comments from staff.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the proposed request and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

A first friendly amendment was moved by Commissioner Adams seconded by Councilmember Disch that

To amend supplemental regulations to state that there will be no natural gas connection except for restaurant cooking and emergency back-up generator, and auxiliary hot water generation only during periods when demand cannot be met by the available electric supply.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the proposed request and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 8-0.

Yeas: 8 - Sarah Mills, Ellie Abrons, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira Clarke, Donnell Wyche, Julie Weatherbee, and Daniel Adams

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Sara Hammerschmidt

A second friendly amendment was moved by Councilmember Disch seconded by Commissioner Wyche that

Direct staff to work with developer to modify development

agreement to reflect the offer to make a \$1.6 million investment in the electric grid to free capacity for this project to be fully electric.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the proposed request and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. **Vote 8-0.**

Yeas: 8 - Sarah Mills, Ellie Abrons, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira Clarke, Donnell Wyche, Julie Weatherbee, and Daniel Adams

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Sara Hammerschmidt

Moved by Commissioner Mills seconded by Commissioner Wyche that

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 732 Packard PUD Zoning District and Supplemental Regulations, with an amendment to the Supplemental Regulations stating that there will be no natural gas connection except for restaurant cooking and emergency back-up generator, and auxiliary hot water generation only during periods when demand cannot be met by the available electric supply.

and that

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 732 Packard Site Plan and Development Agreement, subject to addressing outstanding comments from staff, and further direct staff and direct staff to work with developer to modify the development agreement to reflect the offer to make a \$1.6 million investment in the electric grid to free capacity for this project to be fully electric.

On a roll call vote the vote was as follows with the Deputy Planning Manager declaring the motion carried. **Vote 8-0**

Yeas: 8 - Sarah Mills, Ellie Abrons, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira Clarke, Donnell Wyche, Julie Weatherbee, and Daniel Adams

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Sara Hammerschmidt

10. OTHER BUSINESS

None

11. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)

Seeing no speakers Chair Lee closed the Public Comment

12. COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

Commissioner Wyche clarified his previous question regarding use exception and churches. Churches require a special exception across multiple districts.

Commissioner Mills and Councilmember Disch discussed with staff the cooperative housing concerns raised during public comment, resolving that another follow-up conversation be held with the ICC organization to understand needs and concerns.

Commissioner Wyche inquired about changing Section 5.16.2 Use Specific Standards, Subsection 1 Residential Uses, Paragraph A Residential Occupancy that would point to limits on occupancy, and requested advice from the City Attorney's office. Manager Lenart offered reflections on the far-reaching impacts of such a change, and agreed to follow-up on the request.

Chair Lee clarified a comment he made during the 503 Miller Avenue discussion related to criteria for approval and economic value.

13. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Chair Lee, seconded by Commissioner Wyche, to adjourn the meeting at 10:03 pm. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried unanimously.

Wonwoo Lee, Chairperson

/courtneymanor

eComments for the Commission may be left via our Legistar calendar page (column to the very right) <http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Persons requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting.

Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>). Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

(If an agenda item is postponed, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a postponed agenda item will appear on a future agenda please contact Planning staff. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org))

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.) Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>. The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150

City Planning Commission regular meetings have transitioned to a hybrid meeting model. The City of Ann Arbor highly encourages the public to participate in public meetings, either in-person or remotely.

The City of Ann Arbor has existing COVID-19 safety rules that are required of visitors entering city facilities. If you choose to attend a meeting in-person, the following safety rules are expected to be observed. These include:

City Hall is mask-friendly to all guests at all times.

Masks will be required for all meeting participants and guests when the local CDC Community Level in Washtenaw County is high. Check the current level for Washtenaw County through the CDC's website [here](#).

Please do not attend if you are sick for any reason, including having symptoms or a diagnosis of COVID-19, or have recently been in close contact with someone with COVID-19. Several other attendance options are available when you are sick or in quarantine, or simply for your convenience.