

## ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

### Staff Report

**ADDRESS:** 634 Turner Park Court, Application Number HDC23-0023

**DISTRICT:** Old West Side Historic District

**REPORT DATE:** April 13, 2023

**REPORT PREPARED BY:** Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

**REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE:** April 10, 2023

	<b>OWNER</b>	<b>APPLICANT</b>
<b>Name:</b>	Gary Wise & Rhonda Hute	Trevor Graham, Graham Carpentry LLC
<b>Address:</b>	634 Turner Park Court Ann Arbor, MI 48103	1235 E Cross St Ypsilanti, MI 48198
<b>Phone:</b>	(586) 413-0576	(810) 730-8006

**BACKGROUND:** This unique structural clay tile home was built in 1928 as a garage below and residence above. The one-story addition on the south end was present by 1931 and was also an automobile garage originally. The fireplace and chimney were added in 1949, per building permit records. At some point after 1948 the lower level was converted to living space and the numerous garage door openings were infilled with windows, some above stone masonry.

The building is part of a group of three structures that were originally on one lot, though they have since been divided into three. The brick home at 633 Fifth Street first appears in City Directories in 1926, and the structural tile home at 637 Fifth Street was built first, in 1911.

The house's address was changed in 2023 from 635 Fifth Street to 634 Turner Park Court.

**LOCATION:** The site is on the west side of Turner Park Court, which dead ends into Wurster Park.

**APPLICATION:** The applicant seeks HDC approval to replace two large post-1948 steel windows with similar windows, and to partially infill two other large post-1948 steel windows with stone masonry similar to that found on other parts of the house and smaller metal sashes.

#### **APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:**

##### **From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:**

- (2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

**From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):**

**Windows**

Recommended: Replacing in kind an entire window that is too deteriorated to repair using the same sash and pane configuration and other design details. If using the same kind of material is not technically or economically feasible when replacing windows deteriorated beyond repair, then a compatible substitute material may be considered.

Not Recommended: Installing new windows, including frames, sash, and muntin configuration that are incompatible with the building's historic appearance or obscure, damage, or destroy character-defining features.

**Architectural Metals – Replace**

Recommended: Replacing in kind an entire architectural metal feature that is too deteriorated to repair – if the overall form and detailing are still evident – using the physical evidence as a model to reproduce the feature. Examples could include cast iron porch steps or steel sash windows.

**STAFF FINDINGS:**

- 1) The four window openings in this application are presumed to have been added after the period of significance, when the garage was converted to habitable space. Therefore, the windows are not contributing historic features, though they compliment the character of the home.
- 2) The two windows to be replaced in kind have been altered, with the typical awning or casement center sashes removed and replaced with a double-hung window unit. The new windows' four center lights would be the more traditional awning style. They are proposed to be insulated glass and have compatibly sized and placed muntins.
- 3) The two windows to be infilled would have a new window proportional to the top row of lites on the current window. Below this would be stone masonry infill, with the stones a slightly smaller size than those found elsewhere on the house.
- 4) The work is compatible with the historic structure and will not displace any historic materials. Since these openings are presumed to be non-historic, the new windows and infill are appropriate. Staff believes the work meets the *SOI Standards and Guidelines*, and the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*.

**POSSIBLE MOTION:** (Note that the motion is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 634 Turner Park Court, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace two steel windows with similar windows and to partially infill two other window openings with stone masonry and shortened metal sashes, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 2 and 9 and the guidelines for windows and architectural metals, as well as the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*, particularly as they pertain to windows.

**MOTION WORKSHEET:**

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 634 Turner Park Court in the Old West Side Historic District

\_\_\_\_\_ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

**ATTACHMENTS:** drawings, window specs photos.

635 Fifth Street (aka 634 Turner Park Ct) (survey photo, May 2008)



1931/1948 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map, 635 Fifth Street

