

City of Ann Arbor Formal Minutes - Draft City Planning Commission

301 E. Huron St. Ann Arbor, MI 48104 http://a2gov.legistar.com/ Calendar.aspx

Tuesday, April 1, 2025

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Lee called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm in Council Chambers at City Hall of Ann Arbor.

2. ROLL CALL

Deputy Planning Manager Kelley called the roll.

Present 9 - Mills, Abrons, Hammerschmidt, Disch, Lee, Wyche, Weatherbee, Adams, and Norton

Others present:

Planning Manager Brett Lenart
Deputy Planning Manager Hank Kelley
Senior Planner Michelle Bennett

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Moved by Commissioner Mills seconded by Commissioner Wyche to approve the agenda. On a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

4-a. 25-0695

March 18, 2025 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: March 18, 2025 City Planning Commission Meeting

Minutes.pdf

Moved by Commissioner Weatherbee seconded by Councilmember Disch to approve the March 18, 2025 City Planning Commission meeting minutes. On a voice vote the minutes were unanimously approved as presented and forwarded to City Council.

- 5. REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER,
 PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN
 COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS
- 5-a. City Council

Councilmember Disch stated there was nothing to report.

5-b. Planning Manager

Deputy Planning Manager Kelley reported:

- The Tuesday, April 8, 2025 Working Session will have a Capital Improvements Plan presentation by Kayla Coleman
- The Planning Department has hired two temporary interns. Welcome to Emma Berger and Beth Hartsog.
- 5-c. Planning Commission Officers and Committees

None.

5-d. Written Communications and Petitions

25-0696 Various Communication to the Planning Commission

Attachments:

Beggs In Support of New Buildings.pdf, Blayney
Proposed Zoning Changes.pdf, Block Concerns
Regarding the Comprehensive Land Use Plan.pdf,
Bower Communication to Planning Commission.pdf,
Bokas Proposed Zoning Changes.pdf, Bower
Communication to Planning Staff.pdf, Bradley
Comprehensive Plan.pdf, Carlson Allowing Mid Rise
Buildings in Burns Park.pdf, Chambers Form-based
Zoning and 4-Story Residential - Public Communication
Plan Draft.pdf, Chambers Neighborhood Comp Plan
Opposition Flyer and the Abundance Agenda
Response.pdf, Chambers.pdf, Checkoway Extensive
Public Input.pdf, Crockett Comments.pdf, Dabrowski

Comprehensive Plan Feedback.pdf, Dabrowski Tonights Planning Commission Meeting.pdf, DeBord Strong Opposition to Upzoning.pdf, Dokas Feedback on Your Resolution.pdf, Dokas There is Something Missing in Your Plan.pdf, Dybdahl A2 Comp Plan.pdf, Dybdahl Comprehensive Plan Needs More Neighborhood Input.pdf, Ellison Zoning.pdf, Freeland Rezoning Proposals.pdf, Goldberg Density Subsidizes Neighborhoods.pdf, Guszynski Council Meeting Re Zoning Tues 4.1 7pm Questions.pdf, Guszynski Council Meeting Re Zoning Tues 4.1 7pm Questions Follow Up.pdf, Haarer Vote on April 1 2025.pdf, Hagadone Please Plaease Take Steps to Reduce Property Tax Burden on Homeowners.pdf, Halloran Up Zoning.pdf, Hauser City Comprehensive Plan.pdf, Homan PUD Amendments Question.pdf, Horowitz and Segar Ann Arbor Citizens Very Concerned About Propsoed Zoning Changes.pdf, Jaskiewicz Support for Comprehensive Plan.pdf, Jones Save Our 100+ Year Old Neighborhoods for Generations to Come.pdf, Kochmanski Support for Comprehensive Plan That Emphasizes Density and Transit.pdf, Ibluemle Up Zoning.pdf, Leff Apology.pdf, Levine Importance of policies to allow greater compactness.pdf, Lipowski A2 Land Use Plan - My Vote.pdf, Lorenz Ann Arbor Community Land Trust.pdf, Matthews A2 residents support increased housing options.pdf, Matujec Southtown Short Term Rentals.pdf, McDaniel Hodges Oppose New Planning Ordinance Passing it Will Ruin Ann Arbor Neighborhoods.pdf, McMullen A2 Goals and our Comprehensive Plan.pdf, Nagler Notes on Upzoning.pdf, Pascoe Support for New Housing and an Inclusive Ann Arbor.pdf, Pelak and Parent Concerns Regarding Comprehensive Plan.pdf, Perkins New Plans.pdf, Pinnell A Third Way Proposal for Densification and Affordable Housing.pdf, Pritts Input for Public Comment.pdf, Roberts Comprehenisve Land Use Plan.pdf, Rosenbaum Support for Pro Density Comprehensive Plan.pdf, Russell REVISED Document for This Evenings Meeting.pdf, Sarosi Proposed Residential Zoning Changes.pdf, Scerbo 2025-04-01 Planning Commission Meeting Feedback.pdf, Schiff Proposed Zoning Changes to Upzoning pdf, Schiff S Proposed Zoning Changes to Upzoning.pdf, Sedman Comments for the Planning Commission Meeting 4.1.2025.pdf, Seldin Public Input Required on Upzoning Plans.pdf, Seldin We Oppose the Proposal to Allow

Multi Unit Buildings in R1.pdf, Sims Public Hearings.pdf, Sjo Response to Comprehensive Plan Low Density Residential Memo.pdf, Svensson Comprehensive Land Use Plan.pdf, Thornton Zoning Changes Being Considered by Planning Commission.pdf, Vanden Broek Note to Planning Commission 1 April 2025.pdf, Weissman Support for new Comprehensive Plan.pdf, West Up Zoning.pdf, Williams Comprehensive Land Use Plan.pdf, Wasneski Comments for Planning Commission April 1 2025.pdf

Received and filed.

6. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)

Jim Pyke, 912 Pomona, iln favor of more housing. If we stop growing, then we might become less successful.

Alex Lowe, Pittsfield Village resident, spoke to the Comprehensive Plan noting Ann Arbor needs density.

Sarah Lorenz, 1784 Scio Church Road, thanked the Planning Commission and shared information about Ann Arbor Community Land Trust plans.. Spoke to work Community Land Trust has built in the area.

Anthony Devy, 2434 Laurelwood Circle, spoke in support of the Community Land Trust.

Ken Wenick, 1045 Olivia Avenue, spoke in opposition to the Comprehensive Plan.

Chris Vannenbrook, 802 Edgewood Place, is Office of Sustainability on board with the plan? What are the Planning Commission's outreach efforts?

Mark Scerbo, 217 Fair Street, the FAQ doesn't include discussion of effects of housing filtering.. Loud voices do not represent progressive voters. Support residential density.

Suzette Wanninkhof, 225 Murray Avenue, car-free homeowner, spoke in support reducing car dependency through density..

Brendan Roos, 127 Fieldcrest Street, renter for 6 years, support for tackling the housing crisis, more flexibility in residential area and remove transition zone.

Jonathan Levine, 456 Hilldale Drive, supports residential density. Helps us to achieve carbon neutrality, affordability for housing and transportation, improve traffic safety, exclusionary zoning, and fiscal sustainability.

Hannah Reischl, 921 Raymond Street, supports the Comprehensive Plan so that workers can live here.

Tony Benal, 1328 Minerva Road, read a letter on behalf of Ken Burns.

Tom Reed, 225 Murray Avenue, spoke in support the Comprehensive Plan and housing for all incomes.

Rob Russell, 2004 Crescent Street, supports increasing density, walkability and affordability but concerned about expensive student rentals - desiring university to provide more housing.

Zurkay Hirsch, 1st Ward resident, spoke in support of the Comprehensive Plan and addressing sprawl and suburban style development.

Megan, Fair Street resident, RN at U-M, wants more affordable housing, priced out of previous place and can't afford to live here. Renters are voters and taxpayers too.

Krista Spalding, 8257 Chamberlain Road, Dexter, MI, supports Community Land Trust. The Wagner development would be a good opportunity for housing.

Noah Kazis, 1304 Wells Street, UM law professor spoke in support of the Comprehensive Plan, development change is slow. Micromanaging housing development is not helpful because market changes. Neighborhoods have a responsibility to end exclusionary zoning.

Tim Rhoades, 448 South First Street Old West Side, expressed concerns about impacts to historic districts in the Comprehensive Plan, as well as concerns about density, parking availability, growing student population and existing affordable housing at risk of demo.

Kathy Griswold, resident, early investor in Community Land Trust. University needs to build more housing.

Marieta McGraw, resident, shared challenges with home affordability and advocated for equal access to homeownership and the Ann Arbor community land trust.

Levy Barnes, resident, Taubman College student who supports higher density housing.

Kirk Westphal, 3505 Charter Place, advocated for residential density and expressed disappointment in the low-rise resolution, characterizing it as political.

Adam McCue, 618 South Main Street, identified as disabled and supports the Comprehensive Plan for its micromobility benefits and proximity of development to hospital.

Hank Barry, resident, criticized the process, particularly regarding engagement about height limits and units. He suggested the chairman should recuse himself.

Jordan Carrasquillo, 517 Glendale, came to Ann Arbor for its diversity and is pro density but wants to consider height limits.

Ralph McKay, resident, suggested pausing when the CPC disagrees and starting over. He commented on replacing cheaper houses with more expensive buildings. Need to focus on mixed use along East Stadium and Packard.

Tom Ewing, resident, expressed doubt that building would stabilize rent and suggested slowing population growth to reduce demand and removing the occupancy ordinance.

Stacy Haar, 2004 Crestland, appreciates presentation of Comprehensive Plan. Urges the CPC to slow down and involve neighborhoods in the plan.

Gaia Kile, 522 Miller Avenue, advocated for cooperative living and suggested basing occupancy limits on building codes rather than arbitrary restrictions.

Gary Hoffman, 1546 Marlborough, urged special consideration for neighborhoods and advocated for public hearings on every project, as well as on-site parking. He expressed concerns about student population growth and worried that cheaper housing would be targeted for more expensive rebuilds..

Richard Dokas, 1243 Marlborough, spoke in support of the Community

Land Trust and inquired about how infrastructure will handle the proposed increases in density in the Comprehensive Plan.

Scott Trudeau, 523 North Main Street, urged the Commission to consider less specific and higher density options in the Comprehensive Plan to aid in building housing, as well as addressing lot regulations to allow increased density.

Ryan Brase, 1019 Lincoln, supports density in North Burns Park.

Eleanor Jones, 1319 Olivia, expressed concerns about light pollution, traffic, and noise, urging the Commission to slow down the Comprehensive Plan process and think about different density options.

Alex Kim, resident, undergrad at the University, expressed concern at expensive and difficult rental housing market for students.

Chris, 2018 Runnymede Blvd, urged the Commission to take a moderate approach to the Comprehensive Plan and expressed indecision regarding the current recommendations.

Erin Kenny, 1039 Olivia, expressed concerns about crime near her residence related to college students and noted receiving offers from developers to purchase her property; urge the Commission to slow down the process.

John Godrey, 2809 Brockman, discussed affordability challenges in Ann Arbor and across the United States, expressing support for the Community Land Trust initiative and tenant unions.

Joe Zilka, 1920 Woodbury Drive, shared data about high occupancy rates in Ann Arbor's rental market since 2019, noting that full rental markets lead to price increases.

Luis Vasquez, 909 Barton Drive, expressed feeling engaged by the City and advocated for building higher and taller structures where possible. Expressed thanks to Councilmember Disch for including facts about the comprehensive process in her most recent newsletter.

Barry Checkoway, 1920 Norway, criticized the quality of community engagement in the planning process, suggesting it shouldn't be measured by attendance numbers alone - advocating for more diverse community participation.

Sarah Ellen Strongman, 1534 Woodland Drive, Professor in African American studies agrees single family zoning is exclusionary and supports multi-family housing. Project 2025 was like the opposite of what we are proposing locally in the comp plan so we should resist comparisons.

Adam Goodman, 400 Virginia Avenue, spoke in opposition of low rise resolution, expressing support for higher height limit and recommending leaving this question for the Zoning Ordinance.

Alice Ralph, 1607 East Stadium Boulevard, generational wealth is through housing. Would like organic development, which takes time. Wants children to have a voice.

Robin Grosshuesch, 719 Spring Street, Waterhill Association President, urged slowing down the process.

Kevin Davenport, 723 Spring Street, supported creating an innovation center near north campus to serve as a tech hub, noting limited student amenities in that area and desire for University of Michigan to assist.

Claudius Vincenz, 545 South Fifth Avenue, questioned the consequences of inaction given development pressure around Ann Arbor and advocated for equitable solutions.

Ken Garber, 28 Haverhill Court, addressed agenda item eight regarding UDC amendments to eliminate certain public hearings for site plans, urging retention of comment options.

Eric Ivancich, spoke to the history of single-family zoning noting lack of diversity in neighborhoods. Single family housing drives up prices, making ownership difficult for future generations.

Karen Hart, spoke to the lack of affordability in Ann Arbor and urged development progress without excessive focus on details until UDC implementation.

Tom Stuhlberg, criticized the current process's effectiveness and expressed doubt about the affordability of proposed developments. He suggested the Community Land Trust should target groups needing assistance.

Kitty Kahn, pause the Comprehensive Plan to gather more input from residents.

Jamie McDaniel Hodges, 1225 Kensington Drive, expressed concern about developers targeting properties to buy at low prices and charge high rental rates. Jamie advocated for engaging all interested parties and implementing a citywide vote.

Greg Matthews, 1208 Brooklyn Avenue, urged adherence to the Council's original resolution for densification in single-family zones.

Jeff Crockett, argued that the proposal doesn't qualify as a Comprehensive Plan due to omitting topics like infrastructure, historic properties, traffic, and neighborhood character.

Hannah Rose Stanton, identified self as a co-op resident and advocated for bold approaches to accommodate unique living situations and residential density.

Linda Barella, Ward 5 resident, acknowledged appreciation for input consideration but noted the plan focuses primarily on density. Linda expressed support for community land trusts while criticizing the engagement process.

Seeing no additional speakers Chair Lee closed the Public Comment.

7. PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT REGULAR MEETING

7-a. Public Hearings Scheduled for Tuesday, April 15, 2025, Planning Commission Meeting

Attachments: 4-15-2025 Notice of Public Hearing.pdf

Deputy Planning Manager Kelley reported for the Tuesday, April 15, 2025 City Planning Commission meeting:

- 2845 South State Street "Arbor South" Site Plan for Planning Commission Approval (File SP24-0011) — A proposed site plan to construct approximately 15 new buildings in downtown-style development around two existing buildings at 777 and 789 E Eisenhower Blvd. New buildings include a hotel, eight residential buildings, restaurant buildings, and three parking structures. The development proposes 93,500 square feet of new commercial space, approximately 150 hotel rooms, approximately 840 apartments or condominiums units including 230 affordable units, and approximately 2,500 vehicle parking spaces. Construction is planned in five phases. The 23.5-acre site is zoned TC1 (Transit Corridor) district.

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

8-a. 25-0698

An Ordinance to amend Sections 5.28 General Procedures, 5.29.4 Wetlands Use Permit, 5.29.6 Site Plan, 5.29.7 Area Plans, Section 5.29.11 Planned Unit Development District of Chapter 55 (Unified Development Code) of Title V of the Code of the City of Ann Arbor to remove public hearing requirements from numerous reviews. Staff Recommendation - Approval

Attachments: PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES STAFF

REPORT.pdf, Ordinance 2025-03-18 (Hearings and

Notices).pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Planning Manager Lenart presented the proposed item.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Jame D'Amour, 3rd Ward resident, spoke in opposition to the proposed request noting the public should be able to weigh in on projects.

Stacy Haar, 2004 Crestland, spoke in opposition to the proposed request stressing to keep public hearings so the public can ask questions.

Alex Lowe, Pittsfield Village resident, expressed curiosity about opposition to this item since public comment would continue to exist.

Linda Brower, resident, spoke in opposition of the proposed request.

[For a complete record of the comments, please see available video format].

Seeing no additional speakers Chair Lee closed the Public Hearing.

Moved by Commissioner Wyche seconded by Councilmember Disch that

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve amendments to Chapter 55, Unified Development Code, Sections 5.28.2, 5.28.3, 5.28.4, 5.29.6, 5.29.7, and 5.29.11 to remove public hearing requirements from sections of the code as proposed in the attached ordinance.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the proposed amendment and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format].

On a roll call vote the vote was as follows with Deputy Planning

Manager Kelley declaring the motion carried. Vote 8-1.

Yeas: 8 - Ellie Abrons, Sara Hammerschmidt, Lisa Disch,

Wonwoo Lee, Donnell Wyche, Julie Weatherbee, Daniel

Adams, and Richard Norton

Nays: 1 - Sarah Mills

9. REGULAR BUSINESS – Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing, and Commission Discussion of Each Item

None.

10. OTHER BUSINESS

10-a. 25-0699 Comprehensive Plan Review Discussion

<u>Attachments:</u> Comprehensive Plan Review Process Updates

Memo_CPC 4.1.25.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Planning Manager Lenart and Senior Planner Michelle Bennett, presented the Comprehensive Plan overview.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission held an open discussion on the item. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format].

10-b. 25-0722 Comprehensive Plan Low Density Residential Memo

Attachments: 2025 4-1 Low Rise Residential Memo.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Planning Manager Lenart and Senior Planner Michelle Bennett, presented the Comprehensive Plan overview.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission held an open discussion on the item. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format].

10-c. 25-0724 Planning Commission Retreat Logistics and August Meeting

Discussion postponed.

11. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)

Mark Scerbo, 2017 fair Street, spoke in support of the new Engage Ann Arbor website noting he is excited to see the Comp Plan added. Please add additional documents not included by the consultants. Asked to please add FAQ and recordings to the new hub.

Luis Vasquez, 909 Barton Drive, beware of the outrage machine that is Ann Arbor. Don't give up. Let's build more housing

Kirk Westphal, 3505 Charter Place, the public should remember priorities. Is housing abundance the point? Would you limit housing in desirable neighborhoods? If so, why?

Adam Goodman, 400 Virginia Avenue, if the Comp Plan is vague, we will have this fight again with the UDC. Keep it high level.

Alex Lowe, Pittsfield Village resident, there is already three or 4 story single-family housing.

Chris, resident, not super in favor of high density in single-family neighborhoods. Wealthy neighborhoods become exempt from these changes. Everyone should share the burden equally.

Tom Stulberg, 1202 Traver Street, you do want to have a bit more certainty in your Comprehensive Plan and not leave it extremely vague waiting for the zoning code so you don't delay development and create uncertainty. City Council has to adopt the plan. Zoning should be a translation of the plan into enforceable code.

Hannah Rose Stanton Gockel, 615 Oswego Street, landlords use RealPage software, what can the city do to limit the use of that software to support more affordable housing? Four cities have banned Real Page and other software like that. That is something we need to consider doing along with building high density housing.

Shannon Lau, 2870 Oakdale Drive in Pittsfield Township, carfree, need to converge on a definition of low rise residential to avoid confusion. Support using visuals and values-based communication methods with the public.

Kathy Strekins, Ward 1 resident, agree that there needs to be a definition on low rise density so people know what you are talking about. Doesn't want character of single family neighborhood destroyed.

Seeing no additional speakers Chair Lee closed the Public Comment.

12. COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

Commissioner Wyche noted the bylaws were incorrect on the City website. He also asked if the FAQ on the Comp Plan could include the presentation that the Waste Management group presented at the Council Work Session.

13. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Commissioner Abrons seconded by Commissioner Hammerschmidt to adjourn the meeting at 12:23 am. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried unanimously.

Wonwoo Lee, Chairperson

/Courtney Manor

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Persons requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting.

Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx). Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

(If an agenda item is postponed, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a postponed agenda item will appear on a future agenda please contact Planning staff. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.) Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website https://a2gov.org/watchctn . The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at https://a2gov.org/watchctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150

City Planning Commission regular meetings have transitioned to a hybrid meeting model. The City of Ann Arbor highly encourages the public to participate in public meetings, either in-person or remotely.