

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**Staff Report****ADDRESS:** 719 West Washington, Application Number HDC23-0055**DISTRICT:** Old West Side Historic District**REPORT DATE:** May 11, 2023**REPORT PREPARED BY:** Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator**REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE:** May 8, 2023

	OWNER	APPLICANT
Name:	John Mouat	Same
Address:	719 West Washington Ann Arbor, MI 48103	
Phone:	(734) 417-9723	

BACKGROUND: The 1890 David F. Allmendinger house features a large stone wrap-around front porch with tapered square half columns, an inset front gable in the attic with decorative wood trim and rafter-tails, and a pair of pedimented dormer windows on each side elevation. Several pairs of windows at or near the front of the house retain their working shutters. The Allmendingers had thirteen children when the house was built. Its location was rural, with branches of the Allen Creek running through the backyard. The Allmendingers made the property a paradise of fruit trees, gardens, an arbor, fishponds and terraces. The house was occupied by Allmendingers until 1991, when it was purchased by the current owners. They received a Preservation Award from the HDC in 2013 for their excellent stewardship of the property.

LOCATION: The site is located on the south side of West Washington Street, between Murray Avenue and Mulholland Street (both of which were developed by David Allmendinger's son in law, Judge William Murray).

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to construct an approximately 8'1" x 14' balcony/deck off the first floor at the rear of the house, over a walkout basement.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:**From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:**

- (2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Entrances and Porches

Recommended: Designing and installing additional entrances or porches on secondary elevations when required for the new use in a manner that preserves the historic character of the buildings, i.e., limiting such alteration to non-character-defining elevations.

Not Recommended: Introducing a new entrance or porch that is incompatible in size, scale, material, and color.

Building Site

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings and their features as well as features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Guidelines may apply):

Residential Porches

Appropriate: Installing a new porch and entrance on secondary elevations may be appropriate if it does not diminish the building's architectural character and the design and materials are compatible with the building and the site.

Not Appropriate: Creating a false historical appearance by adding a porch, entrance, feature, or detail that is conjectural or comes from other properties.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The deck/balcony is on the first floor, with a walkout below. The deck's framing and guardrail would be constructed of wood (to be painted white), and decking is composite. The structure would be supported by two posts on the outer edge and attached to the house on the inner edge. The width is logical and matches the width of the rear wing of the house that is not sun porch. (The sun porch was apparently added after 1948 per Sanborn, though its exact age is unknown.) This portion of the house is invisible from the public right-of-way.
2. An existing window, age unknown, is proposed to be removed and replaced with a full-lite clad door leading onto the deck. The door would be aligned with the basement window below it.
3. Staff recommends approval of the application because the deck is an appropriate design and size, would be easily removable and reversible, and is not visible from the right-of-way. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, material and relationship to the rest of the site and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines* and the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motions are only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 719 West Washington, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a 14' x 8'1" wood deck and convert a window to a door off the first floor of the rear (south) elevation, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for entrances and porches and building site, as well as the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*, particularly as they pertain to residential porches.

MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 719 W Washington Street in the Old West Side Historic District

___ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: drawings, photos

719 West Washington Street (application photo) and 1948 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map

