

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 436 Third Street, Application Number HDC14-237

DISTRICT: Old West Side Historic District

REPORT DATE: November 13, 2014

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: Monday, November 10, 2014

	OWNER	APPLICANT
Name:	Ed Smith Smithcrew MI, LLC	Damian Farrell Design Group
Address:	436 Third St Ann Arbor, MI 48103	359 Metty Drive 4A Ann Arbor, MI 48103
Phone:	(703) 304-7454	(734) 998-1331

BACKGROUND: This stately Queen Ann appears to have been used as a duplex at least as early as 1894, when the house was number 40 and number 42 Third Street. Mary Baessler, widow of John, resided in 40, and Jonas Beck, a carpenter, lived in 42, per the Polk City Directory. In 1898 when addresses were renumbered it was given the single address of 436. Sometime between 1899 and 1908 a one-story wing was added to the north side of the two-story house.

What staff is calling a “carriage house” is not shown on the 1899 Sanborn map, but appears on the 1908 and 1916 Sanborn maps as a two-story barn with a one-story addition on the north end. The 1925 Sanborn shows the one-story concrete addition on the south end that was built as an ice cream factory. By 1970, the carriage house was used as a warehouse and the ice cream factory was a “detergent lab”. The one-story addition had been removed. The second floor, with its gambrel roof, was added by John Stafford in the 1980s.

LOCATION: The site is located on the west side of Third Street, south of West Liberty and north of West Jefferson.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to 1) construct a new front porch and second floor balcony on the east elevation of the shop, and infill the second floor opening with a slider window; 2) construct a new dormer on the west (rear) elevation, and re-side the rear elevation with cementitious lap siding; 3) construct a new deck and new side door in a new opening on the north elevation of the shop; 4) construct new windows in new openings on the second floor of the south elevation and first floor east elevation of the carriage house, and replace a non-original casement window on the second floor east elevation with a pair of double-hung windows, and install a new window in an existing opening on the first floor north elevation of the carriage house; and install a new skylight and three light tubes on the commercial building roof; 5) add a large area of patio pavers between the main house and the

commercial building; 6) install new bulkhead doors and extend the shop roof; and 7) remove three shed roofs, one on the north side of the building and two on the north wall of the shop.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (1) A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
- (2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Entrances and Porches

Recommended: Designing and installing additional entrances or porches on secondary elevations when required for the new use in a manner that preserves the historic character of the buildings, i.e., limiting such alteration to non-character-defining elevations.

Not Recommended: Cutting new entrances on a primary elevation. Altering utilitarian or service entrances so they appear to be formal entrances by adding panelled doors, fanlights, and sidelights.

Introducing a new entrance or porch that is incompatible in size, scale, material, and color.

Building Site

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings and their features as well as features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character.

Not Recommended: Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

Windows

Recommended: Designing and installing additional windows on rear or other non-character-defining elevations if required by the new use. New window openings may also be cut into

exposed party walls. Such design should be compatible with the overall design of the building, but not duplicate the fenestration pattern and detailing of a character-defining elevation.

Not Recommended: Introducing a new design that is incompatible with the historic character of the building.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Guidelines may apply):

Doors

Not Appropriate: Installing a new door opening.

Windows

Not Appropriate: Removing or radically changing a window that is important in defining the overall historic character of the property.

Changing the number, location, and size or glazing pattern of windows by cutting new openings, blocking-in, or installing replacement sash which does not fit the historic opening.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The applicant hopes to convert a commercial structure that has been most recently used for a carpentry office, workshop, and storage into two dwelling units. Simultaneously, the main house would be converted from four units down to two, keeping the number of housing units on the site the same but permanently removing the commercial use. No alterations are proposed to the exterior of the main house at this time.
2. The changes to the former ice-cream factory are appropriate. Much of the work is removing small add-ons that have no historic significance. The work on the second floor is inconspicuous (windows, skylights, roofline). The second floor sliding barn door will remain, though the opening will be infilled with a wood slider window. A new single-light wood entry door is proposed to be added near the inner corner. Since the location is inconspicuous, staff feels it is appropriate.
3. On the carriage house, which is the older of the two parts of the structure, a new wood double-hung window is proposed to be installed under the front porch to the right of the front door. Since the character of the carriage house has already been changed to a residential appearance, and since this is a secondary building, and since it's not visible from the street, staff finds this addition acceptable. Replacing the large casement window in the front gable with a pair of doublehung windows is appropriate and will help improve the balance of the overall balance of the front of the building. The new window on the north elevation would be installed in an existing window opening that is currently boarded over without sashes. The large dormer on the back is largely blocked from sight from neighbors' backyards because of a large garage located near the rear lot line. The new windows are proposed to be clad, since maintenance on the back of the building is more difficult because of the zero lot line in back.
4. The replacement porches and new deck are appropriate. Since the building has no yard

behind it, a small deck tucked into the corner will not negatively affect the building and is completely reversible.

5. Staff believes that the proposed work meets the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards*, the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitation*, and the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motion is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 436 Third Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to 1) construct a new front porch and second floor balcony on the east elevation of the shop, and infill the second floor opening with a slider window; 2) construct a new dormer on the west (rear) elevation, and re-side the rear elevation with cementitious lap siding; 3) construct a new deck and new side door in a new opening on the north elevation of the shop; 4) construct new windows in new openings on the second floor of the south elevation and first floor east elevation of the carriage house, replace a non-original casement window on the second floor east elevation with a pair of double-hung windows, install a new window in an existing opening on the first floor north elevation of the carriage house; and install a new skylight and three light tubes on the commercial building roof; 5) add a large area of patio pavers between the main house and the commercial building; 6) install new bulkhead doors and extend the shop roof; and 7) remove three shed roofs, one on the north side of the building and two on the north wall of the shop, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* and *Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines* for additions.

MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 436 Third Street in the Old West Side Historic District

_____ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: application, photos, drawings, cut sheets

436 Third Street (April 2008 survey photo)

