



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Final

City Planning Commission

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Wednesday, January 4, 2023

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

**This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and
online at a2gov.org/watchCTN**

**To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247
or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226**

This meeting is accessible in person, via Zoom, or by phone, see agenda for details.

Please click the link below to join this hybrid meeting via Zoom:

<https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/97766341226?pwd=akdzTVllcnBBaGJNSlZJdFpDdGUrdz09>

Passcode: 882985

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or
888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226

Please note it is possible that telephone or electronic public comment may encounter technical
difficulties that prevent your participation. For the greatest assurance that your comments will be heard,
submit them in writing ahead of the meeting or attend in person.

1. CALL TO ORDER

*Chairperson Shannan Gibb-Randall called the meeting to order at 7:06
pm, in Council Chambers at City Hall of Ann Arbor.*

2. ROLL CALL

Present 5 - Mills, Gibb-Randall, Sauve, Lee, and Wyche

Absent 4 - Abrons, Hammerschmidt, Disch, and Clarke

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

**Moved by Lisa Sauv , Seconded by Wonwoo Lee, to Approve the
Agenda as presented. On a voice vote the Agenda was unanimously
Approved.**

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

- 4-a. [22-1876](#) October 18, 2022 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 10-18-2022 CPC Approved Meeting Minutes.pdf

Moved by Sarah Mills, Seconded by Donnell Wyche, to approve the October 18, 2022 City Planning Commission meeting minutes and forward to City Council. The minutes were unanimously approved as presented.

5. REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS

5-a. City Council

No report. Lenart explained that City Council moved their January meetings to the 9th and 23rd, so no January meeting has been conducted yet.

5-b. Planning Manager

Lenart reported that they continue to work with the Selection Committee on the Comprehensive Plan, and they are proceeding to work with the selecting of two firms, Interface Studios and Houzel Levine, for interviews to be conducted, hopefully in January, with recommendations following up after that.

5-c. Planning Commission Officers and Committees

5-d. Written Communications and Petitions

[22-2127](#) Various Communications to the Planning Commission

Attachments: Pierson, Anderson, McClelland & Anderson LLP.pdf, Spitz.pdf, Astrup.pdf, Kahn.pdf, Loken.pdf, Mitchell.pdf, Oesterling.pdf, Trudeau.pdf, Air Source-Heat Pumps_Kaufman-Sandalow-DiSchio-Higdon (1).pdf, Westphal.pdf, Chambers.pdf

Received and Filed

ROLL CALL

7:09 pm: Enter Sadira Clarke

Present 6 - Mills, Gibb-Randall, Sauve, Lee, Clarke, and Wyche

Absent 3 - Abrons, Hammerschmidt, and Disch

6. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)

Tom Stulberg called from Lowertown, Ann Arbor, and spoke about the Lowertown development, and urged everyone to encourage the developer to use sustainable features in this project.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair closed the Public Comment period.

7. PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT REGULAR MEETING

7-a. [22-2128](#) Public Hearings Scheduled for Tuesday, January 17, 2023 Planning Commission Meeting

Attachments: 1-17-2023 Notice of Public Hearing.pdf

No new public hearings scheduled.

Received and Filed

8. REGULAR BUSINESS – Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing, and Commission Discussion of Each Item

8-a. [22-2097](#) Adoption of the 2024-2029 Capital Improvements Plan

Attachments: CIP Staff Report FY24-29.pdf, CIP_Project Clean-up FY24-29.pdf, CIP Metrics.pdf, CIP Transportation Commission Recommendations_Final_2022.09.21.pdf, CIP_Plan Memo for Hearing_2022 (002).pdf, CIP_NewProjects FY24-29 CIP cycle.pdf, FY24-29 CIP Project Report-updated.pdf, CIP Planning Comm Public Hearing.pdf, StrategicValueScoring.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Kayla Coleman, Capital Projects Asset Manager, Systems Planning

Unit, provided the Capital Improvements Plan (CIP) FY 2024 - FY2029.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Ken Garber, 28 Haverhill Court, Ann Arbor commended the work on the plan; stating I am excited for the inclusions of studies with geothermal districts; and we should not wait for the outcomes of these studies before budgeting; 720 airport expansion; Why allow jets here in the first place, they are a climate disaster.

Noting no additional public speakers, Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Hearing.

Moved by Sarah Mills, Seconded by Donnell Wyche,

Whereas, Section 1:185 of the Ann Arbor City Code requires that the City Planning Commission annually prepare a Capital Improvements Program, identifying public improvements that will be needed within the ensuing six years, in the general order of priority;

Whereas, The FY2024-2029 Capital Improvements Plan (CIP) has been drafted by City asset category teams and reviewed by the City Planning Commission; and

Whereas, A duly-noticed public hearing on the draft plan was held by the City Planning Commission on January 4, 2023;

Resolved, That the City Planning Commission hereby approves the FY2024-2029 Capital Improvements Plan; and

Resolved, That the City Planning Commission recommends that City Council approve the FY2024-2029 Capital Improvements Plan as the basis for the FY2024/2025 Capital Budget.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format].

On a roll call voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 - 0

Yeas: 6 - Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Elizabeth Sauve, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira Clarke, and Donnell Wyche

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Ellie Abrons, Sara Hammerschmidt, and Lisa Disch

- 8-b.** [22-2125](#) Adoption of the 2023-2028 Parks and Recreation Open Space Plan (PROS Plan). The Plan is an element of the City's Comprehensive Plan and the City's vision for parks and recreation in Ann Arbor. The Plan provides an inventory of existing parks and facilities, describes the relationship between the Parks and Recreation system and surrounding municipalities and recreational providers, identifies parks and recreation needs and deficiencies, and proposes potential capital park projects within the parks system. The document was last updated in 2017.

Attachments: Planning Commission response.pdf, PROS Plan 2022 FINAL staff rep.pdf, PROS Plan 2022_Final Draft_12282022.pdf, Public Comments and Changes Tracker.pdf

STAFF REPORT:

Josh Landefeld, Parks and Recreation Manager, City Park's Planners Adam Fercho, together with Hillary Hanzel, provided the presentation on the Parks and Recreation Open Space (PROS) Plan 2023-2028.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Peter Allen, Applewood Court, Ann Arbor spoke about his non-profit, 'Equitable Ann Arbor Land Trust'. He expressed seeing problems with sustainability and affordability in the City, while praising the City's affordable housing projects. Equitable Ann Arbor Land Trust is ready to release their report to develop a plan to create 25,000 housing units on publicly owned surface parking lots, now owned by the City, County, Ann Arbor Public Schools, Washtenaw Community College and the University of Ann Arbor; We see these proposed sites as ideal mixed-use sites (rental and for sale); 10-20 minute walkable distances to jobs, near the river, downtown, and near campus; Publicly owned land provided with 99 year lease and affordable housing millage would help contribute; I look forward to sharing this plan with you.

Larry Deck, 3050 Lorraine Street, Ann Arbor, spoke on behalf of Walk/Bike Washtenaw; Previous PROS plan had a Huron River Greenway maps, showing border to border trail, including gaps; the maps should be put back in, and text added back in; But it's not enough, the area around Fuller/Maiden Lane intersection the roads were rebuilt and widened in the 80s for anticipated trail connections; paths were added

under the bridge, but the connections still not put in after 40 years - it needs to happen as it's important for bikers and walkers in that area. He said the greenways are the true jewels in Ann Arbor and need to be treated as such.

Kitty Kahn, 515 Grove Street, Ann Arbor, said, I'm assuming the presentation on screen, on page 52, did include revisions made in the Parks and Recreation Commissions (PAC) meeting yesterday; She said the Council of the Commons is not responsible for providing the funding, so please make that change on page 52. She spoke in support that PAC has added the Charter language for the Center of the City, adding it now should be rezoned to Public Land (PL) and be declared a public park. She asked for DDA funding to be added to maintain downtown parks.

Linda Brouwer, supported Larry Deck's comments; She asked that the maps be added to the PROS Plan; Surprised that not all City owned property and parks are not already zoned Public Land (PL); She asked for the City to rezone The Center of the City to Public Land and have it declared a public park, since the City Charter says it should be City parkland in perpetuity.

Daniel Adams, 1016 Daniels Street, Ann Arbor, I appreciate the PROS plan recommendation that identifies that the Center of the City is a poor candidate for prioritizing investment; Survey from a year ago with low support for a park at that location; The survey was a better measure of public support than the ballot initiative that amended the Charter; We need to wait for Library Green, a private organization, to follow through on their commitment to raising money to establish a viable park as they promised.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Donnell Wyche, Seconded by Sarah Mills, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission adopts the 2023-2028 Parks and Recreation Open Space Plan as a citywide element of the Ann Arbor City Comprehensive Plan, and repeals the 2016-2020 Parks and Recreation Open Space Plan, and

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 2023-2028 Parks and Recreation Open Space Plan as an element of the Ann Arbor City Comprehensive Plan.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a roll call voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 - 0

Yeas: 6 - Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Elizabeth Sauve, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira Clarke, and Donnell Wyche

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Ellie Abrons, Sara Hammerschmidt, and Lisa Disch

9. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)

Larry Deck, asked if the approved PROS Plan can be amended in the next two months.

Brett Lenart responded that the next step would be for City Council to adopt the Plan or reject it and send it back to the Planning Commission for how they would like to see it modified. The Planning Commission would again make their modifications or recommendations and the Plan would be re-sent to the City Council.

John Wagner, 111 N. Ashley Street, a recent moved to Ann Arbor Architect, spoke of the enormous advantage Ann Arbor has in their qualified Planners they have on the Planning Commission. He echoed the compliments the Parks Department has received on their PROS Plan presentation and recommendation. He spoke of his huge disappointment that the Border to Border Trail ends at the hospital - such a huge missed opportunity, because its clearly seeing that trail as a recreational asset to the community of Ann Arbor, as well as neighboring communities, but not understood it as a mobility issue. He spoke about itemizing these issues as mobility issues alone is inadequate, noted that parks isn't solely open space, but also mobility infrastructure. He asked how the Commission envisions thinking more interconnectivity of the assets, thinking more holistically, about all these great ideas I'm hearing in these great conversations, rather than them being totally itemized on a policy and funding scale. He said it was really great being here this evening and learning so much about Ann Arbor in a few short hours. He thanked the Commission and Staff.

Adam Goodman, 400 Virginia Avenue, Ann Arbor, responded to Larry Deck's comments; you might wonder why you're hearing about this, and why it's an issue. It's seen as a problem by some in the community; projects like the underpasses at Maiden Lane and Fuller Avenue have a habit of disappearing from City plans. The problem is that we find ourselves with a little bit of lack of trust; The reason that resolution happened is because they were totally dropped off the Capital Improvements Plan (CIP); Maybe that's not true, but it feels like that; like the City has a shiny object syndrome. Now we through large funding into this new bridge project at this intersection, that will make it even less safe than it already is. It's the most dangerous area in the City where I've almost been hit on my bike multiple times.

Kitty Kahn, need to correct something that Dan Adams said about money not being raised; which is not true, Library Green Conservancy have raised more than \$70,000, with more money committed. I was hoping that someone from the Council of the Commons would call in to correct that falsehood. Facts do matter, money has been raised! The Center of the City can succeed; It would really help if that land on the Library Lot was rezoned to Public Land (PL) because then we could get grant money from outside sources. The City would not have to give that money - there are other grants available. Please rezone the Library Lot to PL to help with fundraising; And it would be so great if the Mayor and Downtown Development Authority (DDA) would support this effort, as other cities with thriving public squares, have done.

Kathy Boris, 1726 Charlton, Ann Arbor, spoke of being tired of the wealthy getting special treatment. She has 2 requests regarding the Capital Improvements Plan (CIP): inclusion of an airport runway expansion. Ask Missy Stults how the airport runway extension will helps our A2Zero Sustainable Goal. There is a climate emergency - it was 60 degrees today - emergency; all hands on deck, including the wealthy. How does Commissioner Wyche, who often raises concerns about equity in CPC meetings, believe that the airport runway extension; which would benefit only those who own private jets, will affect Ann Arbor's equity goals? Does it send the wrong message - I think it maybe does! So, please Ms. Stults and please Commissioner Wyche consider commenting publicly on the airport extension that benefits only those who travel by private jet.

Linda Brouwer, spoke in agreement to previous speakers about the airport extension. She asked, Before you adjourn, can you go back to revisit your vote and remove the funding to extend the airport, it is completely in contrary to everything that we count as our values, in terms

of dealing with the climate crisis. It makes no sense - it is catering to the wealthy; We prefer corporate profits; When it's a choice between climate change and profits, we chose profits! When it's a choice between equity and profits, we chose profits! I am tired of the hypocrisy, and I know that you guys care about climate and equity - you talk about it all the time. Please, consider this seriously, and go back on your vote and recommend to Council to stick up to your values; It is an excuse to make money off more corporate people; We don't need an extended runway for safety reasons. I'm begging you to do it. Thank-you.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair closed the Public Comment period.

10. COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

11. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Lisa Sauv , Seconded by Wonwoo Lee, to adjourn the meeting at 10:09 pm. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried unanimously.

Shannan Gibb-Randall, Chairperson

/mia gale

eComments for the Commission may be left via our Legistar calendar page (column to the very right)
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Persons requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting.

Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>). Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

(If an agenda item is postponed, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a postponed agenda item will appear on a future agenda please contact Planning staff. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org))

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.) Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>. The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150

City Planning Commission regular meetings have transitioned to a hybrid meeting model. The City of Ann Arbor highly encourages the public to participate in public meetings, either in-person or remotely.

The City of Ann Arbor has existing COVID-19 safety rules that are required of visitors entering city facilities. If you choose to attend a meeting in-person, the following safety rules are expected to be observed. These include:

City Hall is mask-friendly to all guests at all times.

Masks will be required for all meeting participants and guests when the local CDC Community Level in Washtenaw County is high. Check the current level for Washtenaw County through the CDC's website [here](#).

Please do not attend if you are sick for any reason, including having symptoms or a diagnosis of COVID-19, or have recently been in close contact with someone with COVID-19. Several other attendance options are available when you are sick or in quarantine, or simply for your convenience.