

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 210 South Ashley Street, Application Number HDC13-012

DISTRICT: Main Street Historic District

REPORT DATE: February 8, 2013 for the February 14, 2013 HDC meeting

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: Monday, February 11, 2013

	OWNER	APPLICANT
Name:	Mark Hodesh	Mitchell and Mouat Architects, Inc
Address:	210 S Ashley St113 Ann Arbor, MI 48103	South Fourth Ave Ann Arbor, MI 48103
Phone:	(734) 662-8122	(734)662-6070

BACKGROUND: The two brick commercial vernacular buildings at 210 and 212-216 South Ashley were built in 1899 and 1910, respectively. Number 210 was originally occupied by Mann & Zeeb Agricultural Imports, and 212-216 by Hertler Brothers Agricultural Implements. They are contributing structures in the Main Street Historic District. The proposed project is in the Downtown Home & Garden parking lot at the corner of South Ashley and West Liberty Streets and formerly had the address 218 South Ashley. On the current parking lot portion of the 218 South Ashley site, a house appears on 1888 through 1925 Sanborn maps, but this part of the site was vacant by 1931.

LOCATION: The site is at the corner of South Ashley and West Liberty Streets.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to install a non-illuminated sign on the black metal fence near the entrance to the parking lot/beer garden off South Ashley Street.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that



characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Storefronts

Not Recommended: Introducing a new design that is incompatible in size, scale, material, and color; using inappropriately scaled signs and logos or other types of signs that obscure, damage, or destroy remaining character-defining features of the historic building; using new illuminated signs.

STAFF FINDINGS

1. The proposed sign is not to exceed 2' by 6' and would be hung on the fence near the driveway entrance to the parking lot (see application attachment), which by evening serves as Bill's Beer Garden. It is not illuminated. The sign is painted wood.
2. The size, materials, and colors are compatible with the historic structure and neighborhood, and do not impact any character-defining feature of the site. It is easily removable and reversible.
3. Staff recommends approval of the application since the size, scale, design, materials, and color of the proposed sign are compatible with the historic character of the site and has no negative impact on the surrounding historic resources.

MOTION

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 210 South Ashley Street in the Main Street Historic District to install a sign on the metal fence near the South Ashley driveway, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the contributing structures on the site and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 9 and 10, and the guidelines for Storefronts.

MOTION WORKSHEET

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 210 South Ashley Street in the Main Street Historic District

_____ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: application, letter, drawings, photos

Aerial Photo (2009)



212-216 South Ashley Street (2007)



Moseley's No 2 Typewriter Service Co., 218 S Ashley (now part of 212-216 S Ashley)
(1973 City Survey)





City of Ann Arbor
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES — PLANNING SERVICES

100 North Fifth Avenue | P.O. Box 8647 | Ann Arbor, Michigan 48107-8647
p. 734.794.6265 | f. 734.994.8312 | planning@a2gov.org

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION APPLICATION

Section 1: Property Being Reviewed and Ownership Information
Address of Property: <u>210 S. ASHLEY</u>
Historic District: <u>MAIN STREET</u>
Name of Property Owner (If different than the applicant): <u>JEANNE PROPERTIES</u>
Address of Property Owner: <u>210 S. ASHLEY</u>
Daytime Phone and E-mail of Property Owner: <u>662-8122 MARK@DOWNTOWNHOMEANDGARDEN.COM</u>
Signature of Property Owner: <u>Mark Hodesch</u> Date: <u>01/25/13</u>
Section 2: Applicant Information
Name of Applicant: <u>MITCHELL AND MOOAT ARCHITECTS, INC.</u>
Address of Applicant: <u>113 S. FOURTH AVE.</u>
Daytime Phone: (<u>734</u>) <u>662-6070</u> Fax: (<u>734</u>) <u>662-3802</u>
E-mail: <u>RMITCHELL@MITCHELLANDMOOAT.COM.</u>
Applicant's Relationship to Property: <input type="checkbox"/> owner <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> architect <input type="checkbox"/> contractor <input type="checkbox"/> other
Signature of applicant: <u>[Signature]</u> Date: <u>01/24/13</u>
Section 3: Building Use (check all that apply)
<input type="checkbox"/> Residential <input type="checkbox"/> Single Family <input type="checkbox"/> Multiple Family <input type="checkbox"/> Rental
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commercial <input type="checkbox"/> Institutional
Section 4: Stille-DeRossett-Hale Single State Construction Code Act (This item MUST BE INITIALED for your application to be PROCESSED)
Public Act 169, Michigan's Local Historic Districts Act, was amended April 2004 to include the following language: "...the applicant has certified in the application that the property where the work will be undertaken has, or will have before the proposed completion date, a a fire alarm or smoke alarm complying with the requirements of the Stille-DeRossett-Hale Single State Construction Code Act, 1972 PA 230, MCL 125.1501 to 125.1531."
Please initial here: <u>[Initials]</u>

Section 5: Description of Proposed Changes (attach additional sheets as necessary)

1. Provide a brief summary of proposed changes. THE OWNER PROPOSES TO INSTALL A SIGN (NOT TO EXCEED 2' X 6') ON AN EXISTING STEEL FENCE. THE SIGN WILL BE PAINTED WOOD AND WILL NOT BE EQUIPPED WITH LIGHTING.

2. Provide a description of existing conditions. THE FENCE IS THE EXISTING ENCLOSURE OF THE HIGH PARKING/SALES AREA BY DAY AND BILLS BEER GARDEN BY NIGHT. ALL EXISTING COMPONENTS HAVE BEEN PREVIOUSLY APPROVED BY HDC.

3. What are the reasons for the proposed changes? BUSINESS IDENTITY AND WAY-FINDING.

4. Attach any additional information that will further explain or clarify the proposal, and indicate these attachments here.

SEE TWO ATTACHED RENDERINGS.

5. Attach photographs of the existing property, including at least one general photo and detailed photos of proposed work area.

STAFF USE ONLY

Date Submitted: _____ Application to _____ Staff or HDC

Project No.: HDC 13-012 Fee Paid: \$100.00

Pre-filing Staff Reviewer & Date: _____ Date of Public Hearing: 2/14/13

Application Filing Date: _____ Action: _____ HDC COA _____ HDC Denial

Staff signature: _____ HDC NTP _____ Staff COA

Comments:



bill's beer garden

NO PARKING
ANY TIME
ANY DAY

NO PARKING
ANY TIME
ANY DAY



bill's beer garden

DOWNTOWN