



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Final

City Planning Commission

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Tuesday, April 4, 2023

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226

This meeting is accessible in person, via Zoom, or by phone, see agenda for details.

Please click the link below to join this hybrid meeting via Zoom:

<https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/97766341226?pwd=akdzTVllcnBBaGJNSlZJdFpDdGUrdz09>

Passcode: 882985

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226

Please note it is possible that telephone or electronic public comment may encounter technical difficulties that prevent your participation. For the greatest assurance that your comments will be heard, submit them in writing ahead of the meeting or attend in person.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Shannan Gibb-Randall called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm, in Council Chambers at City Hall of Ann Arbor.

2. ROLL CALL

City of Ann Arbor Planning Manager, Brett Lenart, called the roll.

Present 8 - Mills, Gibb-Randall, Sauve, Hammerschmidt, Disch, Lee, Clarke, and Wyche

Absent 1 - Abrons

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Moved by Sarah Mills, Seconded by Lisa Disch, to Approve the Agenda as presented. On a voice vote the Agenda was unanimously Approved.

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

- 4-a. [23-0569](#) January 4, 2023 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 1-4-2023 CPC Approved Meeting Minutes.pdf

Moved by Lisa Sauvé to approve the January 4, 2023 City Planning Commission meeting minutes and forward to City Council. The minutes were unanimously approved as presented.

- 4-b. [23-0568](#) March 21, 2023 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 3-21-2023 CPC Approved Meeting Minutes.pdf

Moved by Lisa Sauvé to approve the March 21, 2023 City Planning Commission meeting minutes and forward to City Council. The minutes were unanimously approved as presented.

5. REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS

- 5-a. **City Council**

Councilmember Lisa Disch reported on the previous Council meeting; Council enthusiastically and unanimously passed the North Maple Rezoning and Site Plan project.

- 5-b. **Planning Manager**

Brett Lenart reported on the upcoming City Planning Commission Working Session; there will be a presentation from Ann Arbor Downtown Development Authority (DDA) on a Downtown Market Analysis - a snapshot of the state of the downtown, post Covid-19 virus.

- 5-c. **Planning Commission Officers and Committees**

Commissioner Lisa Sauvé reported that the Ordinance Revisions Committee (ORC) had met to discuss Building Height.

Chairperson Shannan Gibb-Randall reported that the Environmental Commission is putting together a resolution to prohibit natural gas

connections, which would go to City Council first, before coming before the City Planning Commission for their review.

5-d. Written Communications and Petitions

23-0570 Various Communications to the Planning Commission

Attachments: Baker re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Barclay re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Benton re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Boster re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Carey re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Colvin re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Creekmore, NAMI Washtenaw re 121 Catherine.pdf, Creten re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Deckert re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Garber-Gas Ban Ordinance Petitions 3-31-23.pdf, Haig re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Hart re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Ishii re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Johnstone re 2929 Plymouth Rd.pdf, Kieras re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Kraker re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Lowe re 3680 Platt Rd.pdf, Moore-PUD Community Benefits_721 Forest.pdf, Morehead re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Pearson re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Ransley re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Robbins re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Roca-Campana re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Roca-Campana re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Springgay re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Steiner re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Stone re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Tomsic re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Torch re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Westphal re 2929 Plymouth, TC1.pdf, Willebey re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Zaret re 2929 Plymouth.pdf, Zechar re 2929 Plymouth.pdf

Received and Filed

6. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)

Ken Garber, 28 Haverhill Court, Ann Arbor, spoke in support of a natural gas ban ordinance.

Noting no additional public speakers, Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Comment.

7. PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT REGULAR MEETING

23-0571 Public Hearings Scheduled for Tuesday, April 18, 2023 Planning

Commission Meeting

Attachments: 4-18-2023 Notice of Public Hearing.pdf

Brett Lenart reviewed the Public Hearing Notice with the Commission.

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

9. REGULAR BUSINESS – Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing, and Commission Discussion of Each Item

- 9-a. 23-0286** University of Michigan Credit Union Site Plan and a Special Exception Use for City Planning Commission Approval - A proposal to build a new 4,740 square foot building with three drive-through lanes and 22 parking spaces on this 1 acre site located at 2929 Plymouth Road. Parcel is zoned O (Office). A Special Exception Use is requested for the three drive-through teller lanes. Staff Recommendation: Approval

Attachments: 2929 Plymouth SEU & SP (1).pdf, 2929 Plymouth Rd 2022-12-20 UMCU_Revised Site Plan_v2 (5).pdf, 2929 Plymouth Rd Zoning Map.pdf, 2929 Plymouth Rd Aerial Map.pdf, 2929 Plymouth Rd Aerial Map Zoom.pdf

PROJECT PRESENTATION:

Ted Hirsch, P.E. Project Consultant, Midwestern Consulting, LLC. 3815 Plaza Dr., Ann Arbor, provided the proposed project presentation.

Tom Philips, Architect of development, was also available to respond to Commission enquiries.

STAFF REPORT:

Chris Cheng, City Planner, was available to respond to questions from the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Stephan, Orchard Hills resident spoke in opposition to the project.

Ken Garber spoke in opposition to the demolition and drive-through lanes; he suggested installation of a geothermal field across both parcels instead.

Hernan Roca, neighbor, spoke in opposition to the project.

Adam Jaskiewicz, spoke in opposition to the project.

Erich Zechar, spoke in opposition to the project.

Jacob Kitzman, spoke in opposition to the project.

Libby Benton, spoke in opposition to the project.

Michelle Hughes, spoke in opposition to the project.

Michael Anderson, neighborhood resident, spoke in opposition to the project.

Praveena Ramaswami, neighborhood resident, spoke in opposition to the project.

Alex Lowe, resident, spoke in opposition to the project.

Brandon Currington, area resident, spoke in support of seeing more mosques in the area.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair closed the Public Hearing.

Moved by Lisa Disch, Seconded by Sarah Mills, that The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission, after hearing all interested persons and reviewing all relevant information, finds the petition to substantially meet the standards in Chapter 55 (Unified Development Code), Section 5.29.5 (Special Exceptions), approves the UMCU Special Exception Use for a three-lane drive-thru bank facility with the following condition:

This approval is based on the following findings:

- 1. Will be consistent with the general objectives of the City Master Plan of office uses in the area;**
- 2. The proposed use will not adversely impact traffic, pedestrians, bicyclists, circulation, or road intersections based on the location. The proposed use is consistent with other surrounding uses' traffic impact.**

and

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the UMCU Site Plan, subject to 1) demolishing the existing structure on site; 2) dividing the subject parcel from the parent parcel; and 3) a landscape modification for the location of street trees outside the public right-of-way as required in 5.20.10 of Chapter 55.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with Chair declaring the motion failed. Vote: 0 - 8

Petition Denied

Yeas: 0

Nays: 8 - Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Elizabeth Sauve, Sara Hammerschmidt, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira Clarke, and Donnell Wyche

Absent: 1 - Ellie Abrons

Commission Break at 9:15 pm.

Commission Reconvened at 9:30 pm.

10. OTHER BUSINESS

- 10-a. [23-0567](#)** Unified Development Code (UDC) Downtown Premiums Discussion to Establish Assumptions and to Prioritize Goals.

Attachments: 2023-03-30_Report on ZO Options CWA W-Appendix.pdf

Ben Carlisle, AICP, and Megan Masson-Minock, AICP, Carlisle Wortman Associates, Inc., 117 N Fifth Street, Suite 70, Ann Arbor, Carlisle Wortman Associates, Inc., 117 N Fifth Street, Suite 70, Ann Arbor, provided a report on Assumptions, Goals, and Options for Downtown Premiums in Ann Arbor.

Alexis DiLeo, City Planner, was also present to respond to Commission enquiries.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented material and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Received and Filed

- 10-b.** [23-0604](#) 2023 City Planning Commission Meeting Calendar Revision

Attachments: 2023 CPC Meeting Schedule-rev 4-4-23.pdf

Moved by Lisa Sauv , Seconded by Lisa Disch, to Approve the 2023 City Planning Commission Meeting Calendar as Revised.

On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried unanimously.

11. **PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)**

Steve Christensen, Elmwood, Ann Arbor, spoke in support of residential development incentives, suggesting Energy Star programs to be included in Premium conditions; Viewed energy efficiency as cornerstone of sustainability; Tax credits have been a game changer.

Alex Lowe, asked to get rid of Floor Area Ratio (FAR), Height limits, and Setbacks.

Noting no additional public speakers, Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Comment.

12. **COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS**

Commissioner Mills asked for drive-throughs to be added to the Commission's priorities list for future discussion.

13. **ADJOURNMENT**

Moved by Sarah Mills, Seconded by Lisa Disch, to adjourn the meeting at 10:49 pm. Without objection the meeting was adjourned.

Shannan Gibb-Randall, Chairperson

/mia gale

/courtney manor

eComments for the Commission may be left via our Legistar calendar page (column to the very right)
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Persons requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting.

Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>). Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

(If an agenda item is postponed, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a postponed agenda item will appear on a future agenda please contact Planning staff. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org))

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.) Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>. The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150

City Planning Commission regular meetings have transitioned to a hybrid meeting model. The City of Ann Arbor highly encourages the public to participate in public meetings, either in-person or remotely.

The City of Ann Arbor has existing COVID-19 safety rules that are required of visitors entering city facilities. If you choose to attend a meeting in-person, the following safety rules are expected to be observed. These include:

- City Hall is mask-friendly to all guests at all times.
- Masks will be required for all meeting participants and guests when the local CDC Community Level in Washtenaw County is high. Check the current level for Washtenaw County through the CDC's website [here](#).
- Please do not attend if you are sick for any reason, including having symptoms or a diagnosis of COVID-19, or have recently been in close contact with someone with COVID-19. Several other attendance options are available when you are sick or in quarantine, or simply for your convenience.