

**Ann Arbor City Council Regular Session: September 7, 2021
Email Redactions List Pursuant to Council Resolution R-09-386**

| | A | B | C | D | E | F | G |
|----|------------------|----------------------|---|--------------------|---|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| 1 | <u>Sent Time</u> | <u>Received Time</u> | <u>TO</u> | <u>From</u> | <u>CC</u> | <u>Redactions</u> | <u>Reason for Redaction</u> |
| 2 | 8:58 PM | | City Council | Jacqueline Beaudry | | | |
| 3 | 9:17 PM | | City Council | Sally Oey | Brett Lenart | Email address, phone number | Privacy |
| 4 | 9:27 PM | | Christopher Taylor | Jacqueline Beaudry | John Fournier, Kevin McDonald | | |
| 5 | 9:52 PM | | Erica Briggs, Travis Radina, Elizabeth Nelson, Kathy Griswold | Jeff Hayner | Jacqueline Beaudry | | |
| 6 | 10:21 PM | | Jacqueline Beaudry | Jen Eyer | | | |
| 7 | 10:21 PM | | City Council | Jacqueline Beaudry | John Fournier, Kevin McDonald | | |
| 8 | 10:36 PM | | Sally Oey | Kathy Griswold | | | |
| 9 | 10:40 PM | | John Fournier, | Jeff Hayner | Kathy Griswold, Elizabeth Nelson, Ali Ramlawi | Email address, phone number | Privacy |
| 10 | 10:56 PM | | City Council, John Fournier | Brian Chambers | Missy Stults, John Mirksy | Email address | Privacy |
| 11 | 11:23 PM | | Elizabeth Nelson | Kathleen Murphey | | Email address | Privacy |
| 12 | 11:43 PM | | Linh Song, Kathy Griswold | Patrick Ford | | Email address | Privacy |

Journal Archive

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline
Sent: Tuesday, September 7, 2021 8:58 PM
To: *City Council Members (All)
Cc: McDonald, Kevin; Fournier, John; Stults, Missy; Wilhelm, Tim
Subject: FW: Proposed Substitute to DC-1

Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk (she/her/hers)

2nd Vice President, Michigan Association of Municipal Clerks

2019 Michigan City Clerk of the Year

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104

734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401

jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

From: Radina, Travis <TRadina@a2gov.org>
Sent: Tuesday, September 07, 2021 11:35 AM
To: *City Council Members (All) <CityCouncilMembersAll@a2gov.org>
Cc: Beaudry, Jacqueline <JBeaudry@a2gov.org>; Stults, Missy <MStults@a2gov.org>; Fournier, John <JFournier@a2gov.org>; Mirsky, John <jmirsky@sbcglobal.net>
Subject: Proposed Substitute to DC-1

Colleagues - After significant conversation with and input from Energy Commission leadership, Dr. Stults, and my fellow Council Liaison to the Energy Commission, tonight I will offer the following substitute resolution as an amendment to DC-1. I am sharing language in advance as a courtesy for your review, but will ask Clerk Beaudry to re-circulate during the meeting as well. The most significant change is to the deadline given to Energy Commission, shifting the date by which we request their recommendation from next week to December 31, upon the completion of previously scheduled sessions related to this topic. Thank you. - Travis

DC-1 Substitute: Resolution Directing the Energy Commission to Consider the Question of a Feasibility Study Regarding a Public Power Utility

Whereas, the Energy Commission unanimously endorsed and Ann Arbor City Council unanimously adopted the A2ZERO Carbon Neutrality Plan and the goal of achieving community-wide carbon neutrality by the year 2030;

Whereas, in early 2021 the Energy Commission and Ann Arbor City Council adopted Energy Principles and Criteria to help guide the City's energy-related decision making;

Whereas, the Ann Arbor Energy Commission identified a series of energy-related initiatives that may be useful to help achieve the A2ZERO Plan and that may align with Energy Commission- and City Council- adopted Energy Principles and Criteria;

Whereas, the Energy Commission established a prioritized work plan to evaluate those initiatives;

Whereas, the Energy Commission has been systematically and purposefully reviewing and learning about its top-voted energy procurement, energy technology, and energy policy options to understand their appropriateness for the City of Ann Arbor in light of state law constraints, local conditions, and resource scarcity;

Whereas, the October 2021 meeting of the Energy Commission is dedicated to learning about municipalization efforts, processes, lessons learned, and other pertinent details;

Whereas, the October 2021 meeting of the Energy Commission was scheduled to accommodate the availability of speakers from two communities who have undertaken municipalization initiatives in the last two decades and, as such, are able to share their experience and answer questions;

Whereas, the Energy Commission, especially the chair and co-chair, have been deliberate in ensuring the commissioners have relevant information to make informed recommendations to City Council;

Whereas, City Council recognizes the value of receiving a fully-informed and well-reasoned recommendation from the Energy Commission upon the completion of all previously-scheduled work on this topic, including the learning session in October 2021;

Resolved, Ann Arbor City Council applauds the Energy Commission for its purposeful, intentional, and efficient process of undertaking due diligence on energy-related issues;

Resolved, Ann Arbor City Council requests the Energy Commission to provide a recommendation no later than December 31, 2021 as to whether or not the Commission believes the City should undertake a feasibility study to understand options related to creating a municipal utility, including traditional and non-traditional models;

Resolved, That any such recommendation is requested to explicitly discuss how municipalization and/or municipal utility options align with the goal of community-wide carbon neutrality by 2030 and adheres to the Energy Principles and Criteria adopted by Council, and should provide the Commission's perspectives on the advantages, disadvantages, and value propositions of each;

Resolved, That any such recommendation is requested to explicitly discuss how it would be sustainable, equitable, and transformative, which are three core values outlined in A2ZERO.

--

Travis Radina
Council Member, Ward 3
(he|him|his)

City of Ann Arbor
301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<https://www.a2gov.org/>

The land the City of Ann Arbor occupies is the ancestral, traditional, and contemporary lands of the Anishinaabeg – (including Odawa, Ojibwe and Boodewadomi) and Wyandot peoples. Our City stands, like almost all property in the United States, on lands obtained, generally in unconscionable ways, from indigenous peoples. The taking of this land was formalized by the Treaty of Detroit in 1807. Knowing where we live, work, study, and recreate does not change the past, but a thorough understanding of the ongoing consequences of this past can empower us in our work to create a future that supports human flourishing and justice for all individuals.

Journal Archive

From: Sally Oey [REDACTED]
Sent: Tuesday, September 7, 2021 9:17 PM
To: CityCouncil
Cc: Lenart, Brett
Subject: Lighting ordinance: thank you!

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Dear City Council:

Many thanks for passing the Lighting Ordinance! Our group, Michigan Dark Skies, will continue to be available to provide help and information. Our website offers a Michigan-oriented resource on this issue.

Please don't hesitate to contact us: <https://sites.lsa.umich.edu/darkskies/>

Best,
Sally Oey

Sally Oey (she/her)
Professor
University of Michigan, Department of Astronomy
323 West Hall, 1085 S. University Ave, Ann Arbor, MI 48109-1107
phone: [REDACTED] fax: +1-734-763-6317
<http://www.astro.lsa.umich.edu/~msoey/>
<https://sites.lsa.umich.edu/darkskies/>

Journal Archive

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline
Sent: Tuesday, September 7, 2021 9:27 PM
To: Taylor, Christopher (Mayor)
Cc: Fournier, John; McDonald, Kevin
Subject: Amendment and postponement

Just making sure you know that we haven't voted on the motion to amend the resolution yet – only the amendment to the amendment. If the resolution is postponed, the original resolution will be returned in two weeks.

Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk (she/her/hers)

2nd Vice President, Michigan Association of Municipal Clerks

2019 Michigan City Clerk of the Year

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104

734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401

jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.



EVERYWHERE • EVERYONE • EVERY DAY.

a2gov.org/A2BeSafe

Journal Archive

From: Hayner, Jeff
Sent: Tuesday, September 7, 2021 9:52 PM
To: Briggs, Erica; Radina, Travis; Nelson, Elizabeth; Griswold, Kathy
Cc: Beaudry, Jacqueline
Subject: Energy Commission Draft Resolution of July 13th

Can someone please provide council with the “draft resolution to recommend that City Council authorize a feasibility study for a municipal utility” of July 13th as referred to in the 8th whereas clause. I see it is footnoted on Legistar but the link does not work for me.

Sincerely,

Jeff Hayner
Ward 1 City Council

Journal Archive

From: Eyer, Jen
Sent: Tuesday, September 7, 2021 10:21 PM
To: Beaudry, Jacqueline
Subject: amendment

Strike these:

RESOLVED, The City Administrator is directed to collect information from all City departments regarding food purchases (by type and vendor) by November 1, 2021;

RESOLVED, The City Administrator is directed to coordinate with the Washtenaw County Food Policy Council, the Ann Arbor Farmers Market, and others in local food production to develop a plan for improved food procurement policies for the City of Ann Arbor; and

Amend this:

RESOLVED, The City Administrator is directed to collaborate with service area staff in identifying potential changes to City food purchases and submit a report to City Council before February 1, 2022 with recommendations, including an estimated cost.

To this:

RESOLVED, The City Administrator is directed to identify potential changes to City food purchases and submit a report to City Council before February 1, 2022 with recommendations, including an estimated cost.

Journal Archive

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline
Sent: Tuesday, September 7, 2021 10:21 PM
To: *City Council Members (All)
Cc: Fournier, John; McDonald, Kevin
Subject: FW: amendment

Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk (she/her/hers)
2nd Vice President, Michigan Association of Municipal Clerks
2019 Michigan City Clerk of the Year
Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104
734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401
jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

From: Eyer, Jen <JEyer@a2gov.org>
Sent: Tuesday, September 07, 2021 10:21 PM
To: Beaudry, Jacqueline <JBeaudry@a2gov.org>
Subject: amendment

Strike these:

RESOLVED, The City Administrator is directed to collect information from all City departments regarding food purchases (by type and vendor) by November 1, 2021;

RESOLVED, The City Administrator is directed to coordinate with the Washtenaw County Food Policy Council, the Ann Arbor Farmers Market, and others in local food production to develop a plan for improved food procurement policies for the City of Ann Arbor; and

Amend this:

RESOLVED, The City Administrator is directed to collaborate with service area staff in identifying potential changes to City food purchases and submit a report to City Council before February 1, 2022 with recommendations, including an estimated cost.

To this:

RESOLVED, The City Administrator is directed to identify potential changes to City food purchases and submit a report to City Council before February 1, 2022 with recommendations, including an estimated cost.

Journal Archive

From: Griswold, Kathy
Sent: Tuesday, September 7, 2021 10:36 PM
To: Sally Oey
Subject: Re: Lighting ordinance: thank you!

You are most welcome!

From: Sally Oey [REDACTED]
Date: Tuesday, September 7, 2021 at 9:17 PM
To: CityCouncil <CityCouncil@a2gov.org>
Cc: "Lenart, Brett" <BLenart@a2gov.org>
Subject: Lighting ordinance: thank you!

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Dear City Council:

Many thanks for passing the Lighting Ordinance! Our group, Michigan Dark Skies, will continue to be available to provide help and information. Our website offers a Michigan-oriented resource on this issue.

Please don't hesitate to contact us: <https://sites.lsa.umich.edu/darkskies/>

Best,
Sally Oey

Sally Oey (she/her)
Professor
University of Michigan, Department of Astronomy
323 West Hall, 1085 S. University Ave, Ann Arbor, MI 48109-1107
[REDACTED], fax: +1-734-763-6317
<http://www.astro.lsa.umich.edu/~msoey/>
<https://sites.lsa.umich.edu/darkskies/>

Journal Archive

From: Hayner, Jeff
Sent: Tuesday, September 7, 2021 10:40 PM
To: Fournier, John; Request For Information City Administrator
Cc: Griswold, Kathy; Nelson, Elizabeth; Ramlawi, Ali
Subject: Follow-up on two passed council resolutions outstanding

Dear Mr. Fournier, and co-sponsors of resolutions described below:

I am writing to ask for follow-up on two council resolutions I sponsored, as enacted:

R-20-285 enacted 7/20/2020

Resolution to implement a "Rooney Rule" for executive and management Level Hires in the City of Ann Arbor

I know that implementing this has had some questions surrounding it, but with all our efforts to enhance DEI programs at City Hall, I would point out that my action to do so by way of this resolution has fallen by the wayside. Can you please provide an update, or arrange a meeting with myself, the remaining co-sponsors and perhaps our HR Director to find out where this stands? We have two executive and management level hires before us, and this is not in place. I recognize that our recruiter has an established record of acting in the manner that this resolution would encourage and formalize.

R-21-213 enacted 6/7/2021

Resolution Establishing a Council Subcommittee for the Purpose of Studying and setting Parameters for a Payment In Lieu of Taxes (PILOT) Program for the City of Ann Arbor

Any action on this? I think that this needs to get going as it calls for a preliminary report delivered "no later than March 31, 2022". If you like I could suggest a list of persons who have expressed interest in participating in such a group, both on council, on staff, in the community, and at the University and AAPS, who would of course be major partners in anything that would result from the city's adopting such a policy/program.

Thank you for your timely consideration of this matter,

Sincerely,

Jeff Hayner
Ward 1 City Council

Journal Archive

From: BRIAN CHAMBERS [REDACTED] >
Sent: Tuesday, September 7, 2021 10:56 PM
To: Taylor, Christopher (Mayor); Fournier, John; Radina, Travis; Briggs, Erica; Nelson, Elizabeth; Griswold, Kathy; Grand, Julie; Ramlawi, Ali; Disch, Lisa; Hayner, Jeff; Song, Linh; Eyer, Jen
Cc: Stults, Missy; Mirsky, John
Subject: Re: A2 Electric Municipalization Feasibility Analysis - A Climate Crisis Emergency Action - V2

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Mayor Taylor, Council and Interim-City Administrator:

Thank you for unanimously approving the resolution to the Energy Commission regarding an electric municipalization feasibility study. I like the direction, but the process was a bit baffling. At least it got the municipalization issue formally on the City agenda.

Hopefully, all of this feasibility analysis work can be completed in time, so that if a Climate Millage moves forward, it gets adjusted for any mini-bonds used for municipalization, as a result of the feasibility assessment.

Please provide funding for a City membership to the American Public Power Association, based on the information I previously shared.

Ann Arbor for Public Power (A2P2) has a fundraiser this Thursday, September 9th, 5 - 9 pm, at Burns Park. State Senator Jeff Irwin and State Representative Yousef Rabhi, are speaking, as well as Sean McBreaty of Clean Water Action. Music and entertainment will be provided by RJ Spangler's NOLA Quartet, as well as Dr Ron Suarez (former A2 City Council Member).

Please consider registering for the event: <https://neighborsquad.org/a2p2-fundraiser-registration/#reg>

Thank you, again, for your support on requesting the Energy Commission to complete their assessment yet this year on recommending a feasibility assessment for municipalization. That was a mouthful.

Regardless, thank you.

Brian

On 09/05/2021 9:56 PM BRIAN CHAMBERS [REDACTED] > wrote:

Mayor Taylor and City Council:

I am writing with regard to Tuesday's Council agenda item "Energy Commission Feasibility Study Request".

First of all, I view this as an urgent matter that should be treated as a high priority, given the Council's 2019 Climate Emergency resolution, let alone due to the recent climate events that have impacted Ann Arbor residents and businesses with increasing ferocity.

I understand there will be an amendment offered on Tuesday that will provide additional time for the Energy Commission on the proposal for funding a feasibility study. I also understand that the Energy Commission has an existing timeline, and that their agenda is already set by the A2Zero plan execution, with priorities established by the Office of Sustainability and Innovation.

On this basis, I assume that the amendment to extend the date for the Energy Commission to make its recommendation on funding a feasibility study, will most likely be adopted by Council.

Given this, I believe a further amendment is in order, to clarify the expectations City Council has for the feasibility study recommendation, including its objectives, scope and structure. If the time is extended for the Energy Commission to make a recommendation, there should be language in the resolution that defines some of the broad parameters for any feasibility analysis recommended for City Council funding, given the additional time that is being afforded to the Commission.

I believe it would make sense for Council to establish the goals and objectives for the feasibility analysis. Is it just the economics and legal framework, or would there be other elements to the assessment, maybe held in multiple phases?

For example, the scope of the analysis presumably will assess a range of options for municipalization. The options would be assessed based on the feasibility for achieving the objectives identified for municipalization. These objectives could include the rate reduction potential; technical ability to affect reliability and uptime performance; isolating the Ann Arbor grid from DTE's, and the costs required to achieve significantly improved electric grid performance and architectural separation from DTE's grid; ability to achieve 100% renewable energy (technical, legal and economic) for Ann Arbor by 2030 over other alternatives; equity impacts of each option; etc.

The economics of municipalization, that is, the most likely cost to buy-out and separate from DTE, and the length of time it would take to finance the buyout and physically separate from DTE's network, whether through mini-bonds or another millage, would be core to the analysis. Another core element of the analysis would be the legal constraints of municipalization, its operation, and any legal issues on the options framed for achieving 100% renewable energy by 2030.

Given the complexity of a feasibility analysis, and what I gleaned from a review of recent efforts by other cities across the US, one could also expect a couple phases to the feasibility assessment. This is to be expected, as there will be a number of gates required before a full adoption, including a City-wide vote, of course. The first phase may just address the economics and legal challenges, with a second phase to conduct a deeper level of analysis on the addition elements (i.e., reliability / uptime performance, rate reduction potential, voter approval, etc.). A third phase may be on the governance

structure, its board-level framework, and management structure with regard to other City departments.

While Council should not attempt to detail the work of the Energy Commission on this matter, I believe setting some of the broad parameters will help provide direction. Setting expectations as to (1) the goals and objectives for municipalization, and hence the feasibility analysis, (2) having a range of options considered, and (3) identifying potential phasing of additional assessments, will improve the outcome. Getting this level of detail back from the Energy Commission will facilitate the contracting phase, and should shorten the time it takes to award the contract and get the initial / preliminary feasibility study completed. Waiting to structure the feasibility analysis until after the Energy Commission's funding recommendation will only further extend the timeline for the feasibility assessment results.

The exact wording of any further amendment I will leave to one of you to consider and propose.

In closing, I am listing a key resource, the American Public Power Association. I recommend a City membership for supporting the work of the Energy Commission and OSI staff.

American Public Power Association - membership based resources. See description and membership page below. The APPA has a collection of case studies of recent municipalization efforts, as well as the feasibility studies conducted, and how they were structured.

- <https://www.publicpower.org/all-member-benefits>
- <https://www.publicpower.org/municipalization>
- https://www.publicpower.org/system/files/documents/municipalization-forming_a_public_power_utility.pdf

I'd would be happy to discuss any of this, if I can help.

Best regards, and stay safe with your family,

Brian Chambers, 3rd Ward


Journal Archive

From: KATHLEEN MURPHEY [REDACTED]
Sent: Tuesday, September 7, 2021 11:23 PM
To: Nelson, Elizabeth
Subject: Thank you!

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Dear Elizabeth,

I think you were courageous for putting forth your original resolution! You responded to the needs of the moment, as you should have. I'm unfortunately convinced that the Energy Commission wants to put off this decision about having a feasibility study because they're hoping to eventually just say no. I truly care about the climate crisis and don't see how OSI can justify working with DTE when it is so addicted to fossil fuels.

I spoke at the beginning of the meeting but the comments of all 3 of the supporters of your resolution were entirely disregarded in the discussion. So residents' voices don't matter?

I invite you to come to Ann Arbor for Public Power's (A2P2's) fundraiser from 5-9 this Thursday evening at Burns Park! You might meet others who supported your resolution!

Thanks, again, for your leadership on these matters!

Most Sincerely,

Kathleen

Kathleen Murphey
[REDACTED]

Sent from my iPhone

Journal Archive

From: Patrick Ford [REDACTED]
Sent: Tuesday, September 7, 2021 11:43 PM
To: Song, Linh; Griswold, Kathy
Subject: A2 Racquet Club Sidewalk Waiver should be granted

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

As a constituent and resident of the neighborhood, I'm disappointed by the resistance to the waiver...Geddes is well-served by bike lanes, crossings and sidewalks in this area....and this segment is a sidewalk to nowhere.

-Pat Ford