



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Draft

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, June 13, 2024

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

Join from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device: [https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/96536699762?](https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/96536699762?pwd=KzhoREg5eHgyUCtjV0NlWVY0lhUIMvQT09)
pwd=KzhoREg5eHgyUCtjV0NlWVY0lhUIMvQT09
Passcode: 880017

Or join by phone: Call: 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099
Webinar ID: 965 3669 9762

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson David Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:02 pm stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, June 13, 2024, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. ROLL CALL

Present: 4 - Chair David Rochlen, Jennifer Ross, Benjamin Calderon, and Chip Smith

Absent: 2 - Kathryn Fortener, and Steve Kaplan

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

ROLL CALL

Commissioner Steve Kaplan walked in at 7:07 pm.

Chairperson Rochlen introduced Mariana Melin-Corcoran, City Planner and Brittany Alexander, City Staff.

Present: 5 - Chair David Rochlen, Jennifer Ross, Benjamin Calderon, Chip Smith, and Steve Kaplan

Absent: 1 - Kathryn Fortener

D. PUBLIC COMMENT- (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Seeing no speakers Chair Rochlen closed the Public Comment.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

E-1. [24-1093](#) HDC24-0018; 1201 Gardner Ave, Rear Door, HHHD

Attachments: 1201 Gardner SR and Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Benjamin Calderon and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present via Zoom to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Ross seconded by Commissioner Calderon that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1201 Gardner Avenue, a contributing property in the Robert & Erma Hayden House Historic District, to relocate a rear door to face east instead of south, and inset it 1'7" into the existing breezeway. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, and 9, and the guidelines for accessibility and entries and porches, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to residential porches.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Motion to amend moved by Commissioner Ross seconded by Commissioner Calderon, to add a condition that the landing is at least 3 feet deep.

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 5-0.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Fortener

F. HEARINGS

F-1. [24-1094](#) HDC24-0065; 516 Fifth Street, Rear Addition, OWSHD

Attachments: 516 Fifth St SR addition with attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Benjamin Calderon and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present via Zoom to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Kaplan seconded by Commissioner Smith that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 516 Fifth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a 242-square foot rear addition and screened porch. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions and roofs, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, residential additions, and roofs.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 5-0.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Fortener

F-2. [24-1095](#) HDC24-0066; 510 Fifth Street, Rear Addition, OWSHD

Attachments: 510 Fifth St SR addition with attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Benjamin Calderon and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present in person to respond to the Commissioner's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Calderon seconded by Smith that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 510 Fifth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a 268 square foot rear addition. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions and roofs, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, residential additions, and roofs.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 5-0.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Fortener

F-3. [24-1096](#) HDC24-0069; 719 W Jefferson, Relocate Driveway, OWSHD

Attachments: 719 W Jefferson SR move driveway with
 attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Benjamin Calderon and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Smith seconded by Commissioner Calderon that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 717-719 West Jefferson Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove the asphalt driveway and replace it with soil and to install a new gravel driveway. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for paved areas and landscape features, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 5-0.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Fortener

F-4. [24-1097](#) HDC24-0071; 1407 Broadway, Rear Addition and Repairs, BHD

Attachments: 1407 Broadway SR upper addition garage with
attach.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Benjamin Calderon and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Ross seconded by Commissioner Kaplan that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1407 Broadway Street, a contributing property in the Broadway Historic District, to add a 236 square foot second floor addition on top of an existing single-story rear wing and a new single-car garage, to rebuilt and expand the front porch, replace a person door and overhead door on the existing garage, add a fenced trash enclosure, rebuild the stoop to the screened porch, and repair the existing garage, front porch, and screen porch. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the

guidelines for building site, additions and roofs, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for additions and accessory structures.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 5-0.

F-5. [24-1098](#) HDC24-0077; 808 Lawrence, Mudroom Addition, OFWHD

Attachments: 808 Lawrence St SR addition with attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Benjamin Calderon and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was present in person and via Zoom. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Kaplan seconded by Commissioner Calderon that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 808 Lawrence Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to add an 84- F-5 (p. 5) square foot rear addition and a connecting 49-square foot porch. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and

10 and the guidelines for building site, additions and roofs, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, residential additions, and roofs.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. **Vote 5-0.**

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Fortener

F-6. [24-1099](#) HDC24-0078; 321 Ann, New Front Porch, OFWHD

Attachments: 321 E Ann SR new porch with attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Benjamin Calderon and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Kaplan seconded by Commissioner Ross that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 321 East Ann Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to replace a non-historic front stoop with a new covered porch, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, and material to the

building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for neighborhood setting and entrances and porches and the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.

On a voice vote the cote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 5-0.

F-7. [24-1100](#) HDC24-0080; 115 Crest, Rear Deck and Fence, OWSHD

Attachments: 115 Crest SR deck and fence with attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Benjamin Calderon and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present via Zoom to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Calderon seconded by Commissioner Kaplan that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 115 Crest Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to demolish an existing landing and stairs to build a new 24 ft x 14 ft deck and to add 33 ft of fencing in the rear yard. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for Residential Decks and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the Guidelines for District/Neighborhood and Setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 5-0.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Fortener

F-8. [24-1101](#) HDC24-0089; 903 W Huron, Replace Rear Stoop and Ramp, OWSHD

Attachments: 903 W Huron SR with Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Benjamin Calderon and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Smith seconded by Commissioner Kaplan that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the portion of the staff-initiated application at 903 W Huron Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace a porch beam, three porch posts, decking, and skirting. The work as completed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for

Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, and 9 and the guidelines for entrances and porches, and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for porches.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 5-0.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Fortener

Moved by Commissioner Smith seconded by Commissioner Ross that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the portion of the staff-initiated application at 903 W Huron Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove a window on the south elevation and replace it with a door and transom, on the following condition: that drawings showing compatible trim and cladding around the door that meets the Ann Arbor Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Design Guidelines are submitted as a new application in STREAM for staff approval, and that the work is completed by December 13, 2024. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, and 9 and the guidelines for entrances and porches, and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for porches.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

No vote taken.

Moved by Commissioner Smith seconded by Commissioner Ross that:

The Historic District Commission postponed to the July 11, 2024 HDC Meeting.

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the chair declaring the motion to postpone carried. Vote 5-0.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Fortener

G. NEW BUSINESS

G-1. [24-1102](#) Staff Approvals List Additions

Attachments: Staff approvals additions 061324.pdf

Historic District Coordinator Jill Thacher presented the Staff Approvals List Additions.

39) The installation of basement egress windows that are not on a front elevation or the 2/3 of a side closest to the front, or that are not visible from the public right of way. Windows and wells should be the minimum size required to meet building code requirements for egress. If bollards are required by building code they must be shown on the plans.

Line Sets

40) Installation of line sets for mini-splits that on the rear elevation or not visible from the public right of way, and contained in a line split cover. Line sets should run up interior or exterior corners or alongside existing gutters and be as inconspicuous as possible.

Removal of Non-contributing Accessory Structures

41) Removal of non-contributing accessory structures (typically sheds and garages) built after 1944.

New Sheds

42) Installation or construction of new accessory structures in the backyard that do not exceed 100 square feet in floor area or footprint.

Moved by Commissioner Smith seconded by Commissioner Kaplan that:

I move that the Commission approve the following additions to the Staff Approvals List as presented, and delegate this work to staff to approve on the Historic District Commission's behalf: basement egress windows, line sets, removal of non-contributing accessory structures, and new sheds.

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-1.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 1 - Ross

Absent: 1 - Secretary Fortener

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [24-1124](#) April 11, 2024 HDC Meeting Minutes

Attachments: April 11, 2024 HDC Meeting Minutes.pdf

The April 11, 2024 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

None

J. ASSIGNMENTS

J-1. [24-1103](#) Review Committee: Monday, July 8, 2024 at 5pm, for the Thursday, July 11, 2024 Regular Meeting

Chair Rochlen and Commission Steve Kaplan volunteered for the Monday July 8, 2024 HDC Review Committee.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Chair Rochlen brought up the status of the seventh commissioner.

Commissioner Smith requested a quorum check for the July 11, 2024 meeting.

Commissioner Ross noted that backyard decks should be added to the Staff Approvals List Additions if they meet the guidelines.

M. COMMUNICATIONS

Received and filed.

N. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 10:57 pm.

David Rochlen, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Brittany Alexander, Administrative Assistant
Courtney Manor, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.