



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, December 11, 2014

7:00 PM

City Hall, 301 E. Huron Street,
Basement Conference Rooms

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Stulberg called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 6 - Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, Thomas Stulberg,
Benjamin L. Bushkuhl, John Beeson, and Jennifer Ross

Absent: 1 - Patrick McCauley

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was unanimously approved with the order of items F-1 and G-1 switched. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

E **HEARINGS**

E-1 **14-1730** HDC14-262; 211 South Main Street - Rooftop Addition - MSHD

Jill Thacher gave the following staff report:

BACKGROUND:

This three story, brick Italianate commercial style building features brick pilasters with stone trim, brick corbelling, and double-hung one-over-one windows with segmented arches on the second floor and round arches on the third floor. The front façade windows on the second and third floors also feature arched stone window hoods, and brick surrounds. The building was constructed in 1868 or 1872 and Florian Muehlig is listed as the first occupant. The 1869 City Directory lists Muehlig as both an undertaker and furniture manufacturer and dealer.

LOCATION:

The site is located on the east side of South Main Street south of East Washington Street and north of East Liberty Street.

APPLICATION:

The applicant seeks HDC approval to construct a 514 square foot rooftop addition and roofdeck, enclose rear-facing balconies on the second and third floors, rebuild the rear deck and trellis, and on the six west-facing windows, replace the non-original lower sashes and install insulated glass in the upper sashes.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (1) A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*
- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*
- (5) Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*
- (6) Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize a property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

*Alterations/Additions for the new use**Recommended:*

Designing additions to roofs such as residential, office, or storage spaces; elevator housing; decks and terraces; or dormers or skylights when required by the new use so that they are inconspicuous from the public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure character-defining features.

*Additions**Recommended:*

Designing new additions in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new.

Considering the attached exterior addition both in terms of the new use and the appearance of other buildings in the historic district or neighborhood. Design for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building. In either case, it should always be clearly differentiated from the historic building and be compatible in terms of mass, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and color.

Designing additional stories, when required for the new use, that are set back from the wall plane and are as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street.

Not Recommended:

Designing a new addition so that its size and scale in relation to the historic building are out of proportion, thus diminishing the historic character.

Duplicating the exact form, material, style, and detailing of the historic building in the new addition so that the new work appears to be part of the historic building.

Constructing a rooftop addition so that the historic appearance of the building is radically changed.

*District or Neighborhood Setting**Recommended:*

Designing and constructing new additions to historic buildings when required by the new use. New work should be compatible with the historic character of the setting in terms of size, scale, design, material, color, and texture.

Not Recommended:

Introducing new construction into historic districts that is visually incompatible or that destroys historic relationships within the setting.

Windows

Not Recommended:

Changing the number, location, size, or glazing pattern of windows, through cutting new openings, blocking-in windows, and installing replacement sash which does not fit the historic window opening.

Introducing a new design that is incompatible with the historic character of the building.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines:

Guidelines for All Additions

Appropriate:

Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining or inconspicuous elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic property.

Designing a new addition in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new.

Not Appropriate:

Designing an addition that overpowers or dramatically alters the original building through size or height.

Windows

Appropriate:

If a window is completely missing, replacing it with a new window based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design compatible with the original opening and the historic character of the building. Materials other than wood will be reviewed by the Commission on a case-by-case basis.

Not Appropriate:

Removing or radically changing a window that is important in defining the overall historic character of the property.

STAFF FINDINGS

1. *The proposed rooftop addition is 29 feet deep and spans the width of the 22 foot wide building. An 18' deep deck sits in front of the addition, with a metal guardrail that is inset a couple of feet from the front parapet. The sidewalls of the addition are proposed to be brick with no openings. The front and rear walls would be cementitious board and batten that is painted. The proposed windows are wood with aluminum cladding.*

2. *Per line-of-sight drawings provided, only a metal chimney will be visible to a person standing across South Main Street. The parapet on the building next door to the south is slightly lower, so it is possible that a small part of the brick sidewall may be seen from the sidewalk across the street to the south. Since the building is mid-block, the work should not be visible from street level anywhere else. If the metal chimney is non-reflective, staff has no concerns about a small portion of it being visible from certain vantage points across the street. Chimneys are customary on rooftops, and it would not damage or obscure character-defining features of the building.*

3. *The work on the rear of the building includes moving the rear walls on the second and third floors a little less than 7', to align them with the ends of the historic side walls of the building. Sliding doors and casement windows on the new walls would be wood that is clad in aluminum. The new walls would be clad in cementitious plank siding, as would a 9'8" privacy wall on the alley side of the rear deck that would replace an existing privacy fence. The rear deck would be expanded to the north, and the existing wood trellis structure replaced with a new, slightly larger, wood trellis.*

4. *Per the SOI Guidelines for additions, no character-defining features of the historic building are obscured, damaged, or destroyed by this proposal. The addition's height is low, and is set back from the parapet 18' and stepped in order to minimize the line of sight from pedestrians on Main Street. The materials and methods of construction clearly delineate what is historic and what is new. The design is contemporary.*

5. *The lower sashes of the front (west) windows are stated to be replacements in the application. The Review Committee will confirm this at the site. Replacement of non-original lower sashes with new custom built ones that match the dimensions of the historic upper sashes is appropriate. The use of insulated glass on both the lower and upper sashes is appropriate as long as the glass is clear and the inset from the face of the wooden sash to the face of the glass does not change.*

6. *The design and scale of the proposed additions do not detract from the existing building and use distinct materials to differentiate them from the historic structure. The work on the back deck over the garage is*

appropriate, and installing new lower sash to match the upper ones is encouraged. Overall, staff feels that the historical integrity and character-defining features of the building will not be harmed. Staff recommends approval of the application with the conditions noted below.

REVIEW COMMITTEES REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioner Stulberg visited the site with Jill Thacher as part of their review.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Jessica Quijano and Tamara Burns from Hopkins Burns Design Studio were present and answered questions from the Commissioners.

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by White, that the Historic District Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 211 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to construct a 514 square foot rooftop addition and roofdeck, enclose rear-facing balconies on the second and third floors, rebuild the rear deck and trellis, and on the six west-facing windows, replace the non-original lower sashes and install insulated glass in the upper sashes, on the following conditions: The glass in the west-facing windows must be clear and the inset between the sash face and glass on the upper sash must remain the same, and the chimney must be non-reflective. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, 6, and 9, and the guidelines for additions, district/neighborhood setting, and windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Stulberg, Vice Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Beeson, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - McCauley

F UNFINISHED BUSINESS

F-1 [14-1732](#) 415 West Washington Street Status; Continued Discussion

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented buildings' status and discussed the matter.

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by White, that the Historic District Commission recognize the status of five buildings at 415 West Washington Street: The buildings are contributing structures in the Old West Side Historic District. The five structures are as identified in the Rueter Associates report "415 West Washington Historic Structure ASsessment", dated August 29, 2013, as: A. High bay space; B. Concrete frame addition; C. Second concrete frame addition; D. Brick bearing wall addition; and E. Steel frame and concrete block shed.

G NEW BUSINESS

G-1 [14-1733](#) Downtown Ann Arbor Historical Street Exhibit Update

Received and Filed

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

[14-1729](#) Minutes of the November 13, 2014 HDC Meeting

The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission.

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J ASSIGNMENTS

Review Committee: Monday, January 5, 2015, at Noon for the January 8, 2015 Regular Meeting

Commissioner Ramsburgh volunteered for the January Review Committee. Staff will contact Commissioner McCauley about his availability, with Commissioner Bushkuhl acting as a backup.

K **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

[14-1731](#) November 2014 HDC Staff Activities

 Received and Filed

L **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

Commissioner Ramsburgh suggested that the Historic District Commission send a letter to the University of Michigan expressing concerns about the demolition of University owned historic structures without notice to the Commission or City. The Commissioners discussed the matter and unanimously directed staff to assist the Chair in preparing a letter to the University outlining these concerns, and requesting a closer working relationship between both parties on such matters.

M **COMMUNICATIONS**

[14-1734](#) Various Communications to the HDC

 Received and Filed

N **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 8:27 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- *Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx*
- *Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via*

Comcast Cable channel 16.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.