



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Final

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, December 12, 2024

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:04 PM stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, December 12, 2024, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762. This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. ROLL CALL

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 5 - Chair David Rochlen, Kathryn Fortener, Benjamin Calderon, Chip Smith, and Steve Kaplan

Absent: 1 - Jennifer Ross

Others present:

City Planner, Mariana Melin-Corcoran

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Seeing no speakers at this time Chair Rochlen closed the Public Comment.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

F. HEARINGS

F-1. 24-2030 HDC24-0161; 539 S Seventh Street, ADU, garage, OWSHD

Attachments: 539 Seventh SR and Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Steve Kaplan and Kathryn Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathryn Fortener seconded by Steve Kaplan that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 539 South Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove a non-contributing accessory structure in the back yard and construct a garage with an accessory dwelling unit on the second floor, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design,

arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, especially those for residential accessory structures, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for building site and district or neighborhood setting.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. **Vote 5-0.**

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-2. [24-2031](#) HDC24-0163; 407 W Mosley; rear addition, OWSHD

Attachments: 407 W Mosley SR w attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Steve Kaplan and Kathryn Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Benjamin Calderon seconded by Steve Kaplan that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 407 West Mosley Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a 618 square foot addition on the rear elevation of the house, and an 8' x 24' deck behind the addition, with the following condition: that the clad windows and patio doors have no grilles between the glass, and that either muntins in the patterns shown are applied on the interior and exterior with spacers or that no muntins be used at all. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions and roofs, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, residential additions, and roofs.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. **Vote 5-0.**

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-3. [24-2032](#) HDC24-0171; 117 N Division; egress stair, OFWHD

Attachments: 117 N Division SR w attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Steve Kaplan and Kathryn Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved Steve Kaplan, Seconded by Kathryn Fortener that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 117 N Division Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to remove the existing exterior fire escape stair on the rear of the building and construct a new exterior fire escape stair on the north side of the building. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, material, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for health and safety and additions, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions and safety codes.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 5-0.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-4. [24-2033](#) HDC24-0173; 102 Crest; small addition, OWSHD

Attachments: 102 crest SR w attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Steve Kaplan and Kathryn Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Steve Kaplan seconded by Benjamin Calderon that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 102 Crest Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a 45-square foot addition on the south elevation; install a new patio door and rebuilt a patio; remove a basement egress window well and install a new, smaller window; modify a basement window and add a well to make it egress compliant; infill two basement windows on the south elevation; relocate the air conditioning unit; infill a small kitchen window and replace it with a narrow horizontal window; and rebuild the office walls and foundation and install four new windows. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions and windows, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions and residential additions.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 5-0.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-5. [24-2034](#) HDC24-0176; 1017 W Liberty; infill rear door, OWSHD

Attachments: 1017 W Liberty SR w attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Steve Kaplan and Kathryn Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved Kathryn Fortener seconded by Steve Kaplan that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1017 W Liberty St, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove a person door on the south elevation and infill the openings with brick, leaving a one-inch relief to show where the door once existed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, and 9 and the guidelines for entrances and porches, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to residential doors.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. **Vote 5-0.**

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

G. NEW BUISNESS**G-1. [24-2067](#)** Approval of 2025 Meeting Calendar

Attachments: 2025 HDC MEETING SCHEDULE-DRAFT.pdf

The 2025 Historic District Commission meeting calendar was approved unanimously.

G-2. [24-2070](#) Design Guidelines Assignment and Review

Commissioners reviewed the content of the chapter and discussed any proposed changes. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**H-1. [24-2068](#)** October 10, 2024 HDC Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 10-10-2024 HDC Meeting Minutes.pdf

The October 10, 2024 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

H-2. [24-2069](#) November 14, 2024 HDC Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 11-14-2024 HDC Meeting Minutes.pdf

The November 14, 2024 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

None.

J. ASSIGNMENTS

- J-1. [24-2072](#) Review Committee: Monday, January 6, 2025 at 12pm for the Thursday, January 9, 2025 Regular Meeting
Commissioner Kaplan and Commissioner Rochlen volunteered for the Monday, January 6, 2025 HDC Review Committee.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

Historic Preservation Coordinator Jill Thacher reported that the Revised Old Fourth Ward Survey should be received by December 31, 2024.

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

None.

M. COMMUNICATIONS

Received and filed.

N. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:27 pm.

David Rochlen, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
Mariana Melin-Corcoran, City Planner

Brittany Alexander, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.