



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, January 14, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Bushkuhl called the meeting to order at 7:03 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Jill Thacher called the roll.

Staff Present: Jill Thacher

Present: 6 - Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, Thomas Stulberg,
Benjamin L. Bushkuhl, John Beeson, and Evan Hall

Absent: 1 - Jennifer Ross

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

E **HEARINGS**

E-1 **16-0031** HDC15-240; 444 Fifth St - Rear Addition - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg reported that in visiting the site you see the nice deep lot and given the proposed location of the addition and the way it sits inset on both sides, and from the roof peaks he doesn't feel that it is pushing the

limit numerically even though it may. He felt the proposed means of egress would be pretty well obscured by vegetation and given the close proximity to the neighboring house the addition wouldn't be seen much. He said it was nice that they would be reusing the window.

Beeson agreed noting that the 50% is right at the threshold and given the narrowness of the house it gives it pretty much what is available to work with.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Bonnie Greenspoon, 440 S. Main Street, Ann Arbor, applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission and review the application with the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Stulberg, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 444 Fifth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove a modern rear addition and construct a 558 square foot, two story rear addition with a new back porch/balcony, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

E-2 [16-0032](#) HDC15-241; 215 N Division - Egress Window - OFWHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Beeson reported that it is pretty tight in the back and the means of egress won't be seen since the window is in the back of the house. He said he thought all in all it would work out.

Stulberg added that there are several character defining features of the house and while this is not visible and he would not like to see it taken out prior to seeing them get all of the improvements for the interior work.

PUBLIC HEARING:

David Lewis, 440 S. Main Street, Ann Arbor, applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission and review the application with the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 215 N. Division Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to add a driveway barrier and basement egress window, and relocate rear stairs, on the condition that the proposed barrier is secured along the driveway near the street prior to the issuance of building permits. The work is compatible in exterior design arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, especially those for windows, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

E-3 [16-0033](#) HDC15-245; 1540 Broadway - Two-Story Addition - BHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg reported that this home is a very lovely and distinctive home and the view from the street and the view from the street is very lovely and it has a very lovely entry way that isn't used as much as it looks like it might be, given the driveway and garage to the south it is more convenient to access the house from the southern entrance which enters into a main parlor entrance. He said it makes sense that they would want some covered protection from the weather. He said given the size of the lot and the proposed addition he didn't think it would be out of proportion. He said the proposed side addition will definitely be noticed but it will be set back quite a ways from the main house and you will still be able to read the original house as a separate unit from this addition, along with it being 2-story and not 1-story.

Beeson added that since there are some very tall trees in the back they will help make the roofline seem smaller in height and scale. He noted that there would like be some trees lost due to the construction which he wanted more information on from the applicant.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Michael Klement, Architectural Resource, 2301 Platt Road, Ann Arbor, applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission and review the application with the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Stulberg, seconded by White that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1540 Broadway Street, a contributing property in the Broadway Historic District to add 1) a 523 square foot addition next to and above an existing, non historically significant, first floor addition on the north elevation, 2) a 55 square foot one story side entry and portico on the south elevation, and 3) add an additional window on the rear elevation. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

E-4 [16-0034](#) HDC15-247; 213 S Main - Rooftop Stair Enclosure -- MSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Beeson said it was clear from visiting the site that the proposed work would not be visible.

Stulberg agreed.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Sam Kafaei, KBG Construction, PO BOX 8408, Ann Arbor, applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission and review the application with the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by White, that the Historic District Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 213 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to construct a maximum 260 square foot roof deck and stair enclosure, as proposed and as amended during the meeting. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1 and 2, and the guidelines for additions and district/neighborhood setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

E-5 **16-0035** HDC15-250; 1310 Hill - Basement Egress Door -- WHHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Beeson reported that the staff report was accurate in terms of what was proposed and since the applicant had last been before the Commission. He references a slide where there would be a door at the bottom of the climb where he felt it would be inviting enough to use it and he felt that the proposed 80" jump to the bottom could be taken on as a challenge by the occupants instead of being a deterrent. He said because of the location and the Standards he felt the appropriateness of that location in terms of all of the other locations around the house this would be the most inconspicuous side to add some additional egress.

Stulberg reported that they saw that all the split lines had been taken out which was a great improvement with the exception where they need to penetrate in the one spot through the basement window pane, which seems less intrusive. He said where the radon exhaust was is pretty conspicuous and where they intend to relocate it needs to be incorporated into any approved plans. He said it seems that the applicant is on course to try to remedy the mess that was made and cleaning up the site, even if it won't be able to be restored exactly it seemed that they have a handle on how it needs to be done. He said he had some additional concerns on the new fence that is now required due to the excavation.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Robb Burroughs, OX Studio Inc. 302B South State Street, Ann Arbor, applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission and review the application with the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1310 Hill Street, a contributing property in the Washtenaw Hill Historic District, to install an egress door below a re installed replica window, in a new drywell with a steep terrace leading up to grade, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, and 9 and the guidelines for entrances, health and safety, neighborhood setting, and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for safety

codes.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion defeated. Application Denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Absent: 1 - Secretary Ross

F UNFINISHED BUSINESS

G NEW BUSINESS

G-1 [16-0036](#) Design Guidelines for Residential Signs

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the agenda item and discussed the matter.

Received and Filed

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1 [16-0037](#) Minutes of the November 12, 2015 HDC Meeting

Without objections, the minutes were unanimously approved.

H-2 [16-0038](#) Minutes of the December 10, 2015 HDC Meeting

A motion was made that the Minutes be Postponed to the next Historic District Commission meeting. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J **ASSIGNMENTS**

Review Committee: Monday, February 8, 2016, at Noon for the February 11, 2016 Regular Meeting

Ramsburgh and Stulberg volunteered for the February review Committee.

K **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

16-0039 December 2015 Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

The Commission discussed future topics for their retreat or working sessions.

M **COMMUNICATIONS**

16-0040 Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:50 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- *Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/*

Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx

- *Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.*

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.