

Construction Proposal Evaluation Form

Project Name:	On-Demand Fiber Optic Architecture, Engineering, Design & Const.	
RPF No.	23-31	
Attendees:	Tom Shewchuk	
Date:	June 20, 2023	

Part A - Qualifications, Experience, & Accountability - 20 pts		Max.
1.	Qualifications and experience of the bidder and of key persons, management, and supervisory personnel to be assigned by the bidder.	5
2.	References from individuals or entities the bidder has worked for within the last five (5) years including information regarding records of performance and job site cooperation.	5
3.	Evidence of any quality control program used by the bidder and the results of any such program on the bidder's previous projects.	5
4.	A statement from the bidder as to any major subcontractors it expects to engage including the name, work, and amount.	5

Part B - Workplace Safety - 20 pts		Max.
1.	Provide a copy of the bidder's safety program, and evidence of a safety-training program for employees addressing potential hazards of the proposed job site. Bidders must identify a designated qualified safety representative responsible for bidder's safety program who serves as a contact for safety related matters.	5
2.	Evidence of the bidder's worker's compensation Experience Modification Rating ("EMR") for the last three consecutive years. Preference within this criterion will be given to an EMR of 1.0 or less based on a three-year average.	5
3.	Evidence that all craft labor that will be employed by the bidder for the project has, or will have prior to project commencement, completed at least an authorized 10-hour OSHA Construction Safety Course.	5
4.	For the last 3 years provide a copy of any documented violations and the bidder's corrective actions as a result of inspections conducted by MIOSHA, OSHA, or any other applicable safety agency.	5

Part C - Workforce Development - 20 pts		Max.
1.	Documentation as to bidder's pay rates, health insurance, pension or other retirement benefits, paid leave, or other fringe benefits to its employees.	7
2.	Documentation that the bidder participates in a Registered Apprenticeship Program that is registered with the United States Department of Labor Office of Apprenticeship or by a State Apprenticeship Agency recognized by the USDOL Office of Apprenticeship. USDOL apprenticeship agreements shall be disclosed to the City in the solicitation	7
3.	Bidders shall disclose the number of non-craft employees who will work on the project on a 1099 basis, and the bidders shall be awarded points based on their relative reliance on 1099 work arrangements with more points assigned to companies with fewer 1099 arrangements. Bidders will acknowledge that the City may ask them to produce payroll records at points during the project to verify compliance with this section.	6

Part D - Social Equity & Sustainability - 20 pts		Max.
1.	A statement from the bidder as to what percentage of its workforce resides in the City of Ann Arbor and in Washtenaw County, Michigan. The City will consider in evaluating which bids best serve its interests, the extent to which responsible and qualified bidders employ individuals in either the city or the county. Which jurisdiction is prioritized for scoring purposes will be indicated in the solicitation.	4
2.	Evidence of Equal Employment Opportunity Programs for minorities, women, veterans, returning citizens, and small businesses.	4
3.	Evidence that the bidder is an equal opportunity employer and does not discriminate on the basis of race, sex, pregnancy, age, religion, national origin, marital status, sexual orientation, gender identity or expression, height, weight, or disability.	4
4.	The bidder's proposed use of sustainable products, technologies, or practices for the project, which reduce the impact on human health and the environment, including raw materials acquisition, production, manufacturing, packaging, distribution, reuse, operation, maintenance, and waste management.	4
5.	The bidder's environmental record, including findings of violations and penalties imposed by government agencies.	4

Part E - Schedule of Pricing/Cost - 20 pts		Max.		
<table border="1" style="width: 100%; text-align: center;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Low Bid = \$</td> <td style="width: 50%;">4,720.42</td> </tr> </table>		Low Bid = \$	4,720.42	20
Low Bid = \$	4,720.42			

TOTAL SCORE:

--

Henkels & McKoy	TurnKey
-----------------	---------

\$5,623.21	\$4,700.42
5	5
5	5
5	0
5	5

5	5
5	5
5	0
5	5

0	0
0	0
6	6

0	0
4	0
4	4
3	3
0	4

10.0	20.0
------	------

67.0	67.0
-------------	-------------

Scoring Method (per APP 209)

Judge quality of qualifications/experience and assign whatever points deemed appropriate.

Judge quality of responses and assign whatever points deemed appropriate.

If sufficient evidence is provided of a QC program, then full points. If not zero.

Full points if provided. Staff can deduct points if identified subs are not qualified.

All or nothing criterion; except if they do not provide a designated safety representative, then they only get 4 points.

Full points for EMR of 1.0 or less; otherwise zero.

Full points if provided. A statement that training will be completed prior to commencement is sufficient for full points. (Actual evidence needs to be submitted prior to start of construction)

Full points to bidder with least safety violations, and a proportional number of points to other bidders based on relative number of violations.

All or nothing criterion based on whether info is provided or not.

All or nothing criterion.

Full points to bidder with the least reliance on 1099 labor, and a proportional number of points to other bidders based on relative number of 1099 laborers.

Full points to any firm 50% or above in Washtenaw County. Half points (2) if 15%-50%. Zero for less than 15%. Prioritizing % residents in County rather than City.

All or nothing criterion.

All or nothing criterion.

Points shall be awarded based on thoroughness, completeness, and quality of th response at the discretion of evaluating staff members.

Any bidder subject in the last 10 yrs to enforcement actions by EGLE gets zero; otherwise full points.

Notes

Turnkey - Evidence of a program, but no results provided.

TurnKey said contractors will be identified if needed per project

Both bidders rating were 1 or below.

Henkels 2 cited violations. None reported by Turnkey.

No pay rates included

Neither participates in an apprenticeship

H&M only has 8% reside in Washtenaw County and TurnKey as 0%

Henkels environmentl incidents: 2022 = 0, 2021 = 2, 2019 = 4, 2018 = 0.

Henkel's labor costs are significantly higher and they did not comform to the pricing grid in the RFP.