



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, December 9, 2021

7:00 PM

Electronic Meeting

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 978 6401 4515

A. **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairperson Anna Epperson called the meeting to order at 7:02 pm, stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, December 9, 2021 electronic meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission.

The meeting is being held electronically to protect public health and safety due to the COVID-19 virus and to comply with orders issued by the governor, the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services, and/or the Washtenaw County Health Department.

We intend to conduct this meeting similarly to an in-person meeting. However, please be patient if there are technical issues. Public comment will be via telephone only. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 978 6401 4515 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. **ROLL CALL**

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Historic District Commission members, Rochlen, Quijano, Epperson, and White, present via Zoom, stated they were in Ann Arbor, Michigan.

Historic District Commission member Beeson, present via Zoom, stated

he was in Perrysburg, Pennsylvania.

Historic District Commission member Ross, present via Zoom, stated she was in Detroit, Michigan.

Staff present via Zoom; Jill Thacher and Alexis DiLeo.

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

None

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

F. HEARINGS

F-1. [21-2183](#) HDC21-180 108 Koch Ave; Meter; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Jessica Quijano, seconded by Commissioner Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 108 Koch Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on an east elevation, one foot from the front corner of

the house, as shown in the application. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Beeson, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Fortener

F-2. [21-2184](#) HDC21-097 502 S First Ave; Meter; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner John Beeson, seconded by Commissioner

Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 502 S First Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the north elevation, two feet from the northwest corner of the house, as shown in the application. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 1

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Beeson, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, and White

Nays: 1 - Ross

Absent: 1 - Fortener

F-3. [21-2185](#) HDC21-332 121 E Liberty St; Business Sign; MSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the

Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Jennifer Ross, seconded by Commissioner Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 121 East Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install a new non-illuminated business sign, mounted in mortar joints, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for signs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 9 and the guidelines for storefronts.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Beeson, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Fortener

F-4. [21-2186](#) HDC21-318 224 Murray Ave; Solar Array; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was not available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Jessica Quijano, seconded by Commissioner Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 224 Murray Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a black-on-black solar array, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for roofs, energy efficiency, and mechanical systems, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to solar installations.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Beeson, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Fortener

F-5. [21-2187](#) HDC21-333 1008 W Washington St; Rebuild Porch; OWSHD - WITHDRAWN

Withdrawn

F-6. [21-2188](#) HDC21-334 419 N State St; Rebuild Porch; OFWHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner John Beeson, seconded by Commissioner Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 419 North State Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to remove and rebuild the front porch and stair roof, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, and material to the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for entrances and porches, additions and building.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Beeson, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Fortener

F-7. **21-2189** HDC21-335 245 Murray Ave; Enlarge Windows; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner David Rochlen, seconded by Commissioner Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 245 Murray Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install narrow sidelight windows on both sides of the 2nd floor gable windows facing north and south, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, especially those for windows and safety codes, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for windows, neighborhood setting, and health and safety.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner David Rochlen, seconded by Commissioner Bob White to postpone application to the next HDC meeting to allow applicant to provide more information to the Commission.

Application Postponed.

Yeas: 6 - Beeson, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Fortener

F-8. 21-2190 HDC21-336 306 N State St; Demo Garage; OFWHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Certificate of Appropriateness

Moved by Commissioner John Beeson, seconded by Commissioner David Rochlen, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the after-the-fact application at 306 N State Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to demolish a noncontributing garage. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for Residential Accessory Structures, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 6, and the guidelines for Building Site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the Chair declared the motion defeated. Vote: 0 - 6

Yeas: 0

Nays: 6 - Beeson, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, White, and Ross

Absent: 1 - Fortener

Notice to Proceed

Moved by Commissioner Bob White, seconded by David Rochlen, that the Commission issue a Notice to Proceed for the application at 306 N State Street to demolish a wood-framed garage behind the house, as proposed. The Commission finds that the resource constitutes a hazard to the safety of the public or to the structure’s occupants and that the demolition was necessary to substantially improve or correct this condition.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion defeated. Vote: 1 - 5

Yeas: 1 - White

Nays: 5 - Beeson, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, and Ross

Absent: 1 - Fortener

Motion to Order Reconstruction

Moved by Commissioner John Beeson, seconded by Commissioner Jessica Quijano, that the Commission finds that the demolition of the garage at 502 North State Street does not qualify for a certificate of appropriateness, and that the property owner is ordered to reconstruct the garage to be substantially the same as it was before demolition, with all permits finalized by June 9, 2022. A new Historic District Commission application for the reconstructed garage will be required with the building permit application and will be reviewed by staff with input from the officers of the Historic District Commission.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote the Chair declared the Motion to Order Reconstruction, approved. Vote: 6 - 0

Yeas: 6 - Beeson, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Fortener

F-9. [21-2191](#) HDC21-337 113 W Washington St; Public Art; MSHD

A public hearing was held to allow public comment since a public hearing had been advertised.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner John Beeson, seconded by Commissioner David Rochlen, to Postpone application to the January HDC meeting. On a roll call vote, the Chair declared the application postponed.

Yeas: 6 - Beeson, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Fortener

F-10. [21-2192](#) HDC21-338 120 W Washington St; Public Art; MSHD

A public hearing was held to allow public comment since a public hearing had been advertised.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner John Beeson, seconded by Commissioner Jessica Quijanon, to Postpone application to the January HDC meeting. On a roll call vote, the Chair declared the application

postponed.

Yeas: 6 - Beeson, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Fortener

F-11. **21-2193** HDC21-297 112-114 W Liberty St; Public Art; MSHD

A public hearing was held to allow public comment since a public hearing had been advertised.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner John Beeson, seconded by Commissioner Jennifer Ross, to Postpone application to the January HDC meeting. On a roll call vote, the Chair declared the application postponed.

Yeas: 6 - Beeson, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Fortener

G. **NEW BUSINESS**

H. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

H-1. **21-2194** August 12, 2021 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

The August 12, 2021 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

H-2. **21-2195** October 14, 2021 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

The 2021 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J. ASSIGNMENTS

Commissioners David Rochlen volunteered for the January 10, 2022 HDC Review Committee.

Jill Thacher said she would check with Commissioner Kathy Fortener if she would be able to join.

Commissioner Jessica Quijano said she would check her schedule, but was unable to confirm at the meeting.

- J-1. [21-2196](#) October & November 2021 HDC Staff Activities**

Received and Filed

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

Jill Thacher informed the Commission that John Beeson is resigning from the HDC Commission as of the end of 2021.

The Commission and Thacher thanked him for his exemplary service and dedication to the Commission, the City, and the public. His in-depth knowledge has been a true gift to us all during his 9 years of service on the HDC.

Beeson said his time on the Commission had been humbling and gratifying; he had enjoyed every minute of his time on the Commission and looks forward to seeing the HDC continue providing great service and assistance to the City.

- K-1. [21-2197](#) Various Communications to the HDC**

Received and Filed

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner David Rochlen asked how not having a November HDC meeting worked out, and if it might be something the Commission would consider.

Jill Thacher explained that the only reason the November meeting was skipped was due to scheduling issues with the election being the biggest factor this year.

M. COMMUNICATIONS

N. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 10:32 pm.

THERE WILL BE A WORKING SESSION IMMEDIATELY FOLLOWING THE REGULARLY SCHEDULED HDC MEETING

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

Public kiosks are now installed in the lobby and basement of City Hall to allow members of the public to attend and participate in electronic meetings.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

Anna Epperson, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Mia Gale, Administrative Assistant