

Approved Minutes
November 18, 2009
Ann Arbor Transportation Authority
Board of Directors Meeting
ATA Headquarters, 2700 South Industrial Highway, 6:30 p.m.

Board Members Present: Paul C. Ajegba (Chair), Ted Annis, Jesse Bernstein, Sue McCormick, David Nacht, Rich Robben

Board Members Absent: Charles Griffith

Staff Present: Terry Black, Ron Copeland, Michael Ford, Dawn Gabay, Jan Hallberg, Ed Robertson, Mary Stasiak, Phil Webb, Chris White

LAC Representative: Rebecca Burke

Recording Secretary: Karen Wheeler

Chairman Paul Ajegba declared that a quorum was present and called the meeting to order at 6:37 p.m. Mr. Ajegba appointed Mr. Bernstein Acting Secretary.

1.0 Public Hearing – None Scheduled

There was no Public Hearing.

2.0 Communications and Announcements

Mr. Ajegba announced a special Board meeting scheduled for Tuesday, December 8 at 5:30 p.m. The meeting will be open to the public, and the Board will discuss Public Act 196.

3.0 Public Time – Comment on Agenda Items

Jim Mogensen appeared before the Board. Mr. Mogensen commented on the proposed service changes and Federal Transit Administration Title VI considerations required related to the proposed changes. Mr. Mogensen indicated that there should be a mechanism documenting the assessment. Mr. Mogensen suggested that adopting the service changes will suggest that AATA policy, absent a countywide millage, will require reprogramming service. Mr. Mogensen commented on survey results that suggest that there will be real trouble getting a millage. Mr. Mogensen suggested that new service to the park and ride lot built with Stimulus dollars will need to be provided within the current budget structure which would require a reconfiguration of service. Mr. Mogensen urged the Board to think through their decision.

No one further appearing, Mr. Ajegba declared Public Time closed.

4.0 Review and Approval of Minutes

4.1 Review and Approval of Minutes of October 21, 2009

Mr. Annis moved approval of the minutes as written with support from Ms. McCormick. The motion passed unanimously.

4.2 Review and Approval of Minutes of October 29, 2009

Mr. Annis moved approval of the minutes as written with support from Ms. McCormick. The motion passed unanimously.

5.0 Board and Staff Reports

5.1 Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee

Mr. Bernstein reported that the committee agreed on a proposed Vision Statement to be considered under New Business. Mr. Bernstein announced that future PMER meetings will begin at 3:35 p.m. and end at 5:20 p.m. to be in line with the bus schedule.

Mr. Bernstein indicated that the majority of the meeting was devoted to work on the Vision Statement and the committee did not get to a long list of review items. The committee discussed the Quarterly Service Standards Report. Ridership is down; a trend that is taking place around the country. The committee will track the impact going forward and staff will closely monitor the situation and report back.

The committee discussed the GetDowntown Program which will no longer be housed at the Ann Arbor Chamber of Commerce. The City of Ann Arbor and Downtown Development Authority are working with AATA to make sure that the program continues. AATA will take over payment processing for staff members, and the DDA will pay for housing the program at an appropriate downtown location.

Mr. Bernstein reported that the Washtenaw County telephone survey was complete, and that a report would be forthcoming.

Chris White will publish a topic calendar for the committee so that every month the committee will know in advance what business will be conducted. Mr. Bernstein requested that Board members submit ideas for agenda items so that they can be included on the topic calendar. Mr. Bernstein indicated that the calendar will be presented at the December committee meeting.

5.1.1 Treasurer's Report

Ted Annis presented a Treasurer's Report completed at the end of October. Mr. Annis previously reviewed the report with Mr. Ajegba and provided a copy to Mr. Ford. The report was subsequently sent to all members of the Board at the request of Mr. Ajegba. A copy of the report is attached hereto and included as part of the minutes.

Mr. Annis reported that he devoted considerable thinking and analysis in preparing the report. Mr. Annis indicated that he would like to review the report with the two Board committees prior to hiring a consultant to design a countywide system.

Mr. Annis reviewed the three recommendations included in his report:

- Shift the transportation tax by eliminating the current perpetual Ann Arbor Transportation Tax of 2.06 mills and replacing it with a countywide tax of 1.0 mill. (The elimination needs to be contingent upon approval of the countywide tax.)
- Give the outside consultant an operating budget design objective of \$33,000,000/year for the countywide system and a bus operating budget guideline of \$84/bus service hour.
- Separate WALLY, the North-South rail system proposed between Washtenaw and Livingston counties, from the above planning and funding; and handle it separately.

Mr. Annis made a recommendation to include a design budget objective in the scope of work for the request for proposals for a consultant to design a countywide system. Board members discussed the recommendation. It was suggested that the two committees review the scope of work and agree on the details of building a countywide system, and then determine if the program can be built based on available funding, as opposed to limiting the project by setting a budget in advance.

With regard to the Treasurer's Report, Mr. Ajegba indicated that staff was directed to conduct an analysis of the report. The report and staff's analysis will be fleshed out in committee.

5.2 Planning and Development Committee

Rich Robben reported on the November 12 PDC meeting. Future meetings will be held from 3:00 p.m. to 5:00 p.m. Mr. Robben reported that the committee received an engineering report on the condition of the Blake Transit Center and options for proceeding with either repair or reconstruction of facility. The committee recommended that a modification be made to the third of four options and be presented and

pursued. The committee reviewed the proposed route changes and recommended adoption by the full Board. Staff made a presentation on the Capital and Categorical Grant Program. The Program will be presented to the full Board for adoption in January. Staff reported on a service delivery model for low population density areas, and provided a progress report on park and ride lot development.

Mr. Robben reported that the committee was working on putting together a detailed plan for agenda items to cover each month.

Mr. Annis commented on the fourth option related to redevelopment of the Blake Transit Center suggesting that the Fuller Road Station should figure in to the future of the BTC. Mr. Nacht noted that a similar issue was raised at the PDC meeting. Staff reported that half of the bus riders arriving at the BTC are transferring, and that regardless of future multimodal developments, AATA will continue to need to have a significant downtown presence.

Mr. Nacht elaborated on the redevelopment option chosen by the committee; a design that allows for expansion of the footprint, should the property adjacent to the BTC become available in the future. This would provide a flexible approach and allow for partnering with the private sector. Mr. Nacht noted the need to improve the current station and the availability of \$3Million in funding, a portion of which is scheduled to sunset in September 2010.

Board members continued to discuss redevelopment of the BTC including how the Fuller Road Station, the North University terminal project, and a WALLY terminus, if developed, might impact future transfer patterns. The discussion returned to available funding and timing for utilizing the funds. It was noted that the Federal Transit Administration would not likely approve additional funding for an alternate downtown transit center, if the programmed funds were abandoned. Chris White noted that AATA has had the money since 2003.

Michael Ford explained that the fourth option for redevelopment came out of a conversation with a top official from the City of Ann Arbor who was open to reviewing plans for a concept to expand the transit center to include the adjacent surface lot owned by the City. Mr. Ford restated the need to renovate the BTC. He indicated that all of the transit initiatives will be considered as the projects move forward.

Mr. Ford reported that staff will make a recommendation on redevelopment of the BTC to the PDC, and request that the committee bring it to the full Board. Mr. Annis request that the recommendation include a rationalization.

A copy of the PDC meeting summary is attached hereto and included as part of the minutes.

5.3 Chief Executive Officer

Michael Ford provided an overview of the CEO report contained in the packet. Mr. Ford reported on the October 29 special Board meeting during which the Board reached consensus on moving forward with a Vision Statement and Countywide service initiative.

Mr. Ford reported that legal counsel and chief executive officers from the region who have experience with Public Act 196 would be in attendance at the December 8 special Board meeting. Mr. Ford provided an update on the partnership with McKinley Properties who participates in the Adopt a Stop program and the more recent opportunity to partner for AATA to turn buses around at the Glencoe Crossing shopping center.

Mr. Ford reported on his efforts to work with the Local Advisory Council (LAC) to have Board participation that is amenable to both the LAC and the Board indicating that Board member participation in meetings by teleconference and a standing agenda item might be a good place to start.

Mr. Ford reported that agreement had been reached with the Center for Independent Living to provide new bus service on Research Park Drive. Staff will work with Carolyn Grawi to finalize details of the new service.

Mr. Ford reported on discussions with the City of Ypsilanti and the Ann Arbor Police Department about security issues at both transit centers. Mr. Ford indicated that another meeting with Ypsilanti was scheduled, and he would report back.

Mr. Ford reported on a meeting he and Chris White attended with the Downtown Development Authority (DDA) Board to discuss Link service. The DDA is interested in having AATA take a leadership role and are eager to talk with the AATA Board about the possibility of new downtown circulator.

Mr. Ford reported on receipt of a communication from Kirk Westphal regarding the proposed service changes. Mr. Westphal indicated the need to take a balanced approach to serving park and ride customers with serving Ann Arbor residents.

Mr. Ford thanked staff for their hard work, diligence and support over the past four months.

5.4 Local Advisory Council

Rebecca Burke thanked Mr. Ford for his work over the past month negotiating the LAC liaison issue. Ms. Burke reported that the language in the LAC Charge is rather dated and the Committee will undertake an effort to update the language to bring it in line with the committee's Bylaws.

5.5 Governance Committee Charge

Mr. Ajegba reported that the Governance Committee discussed the concept of having an alternate attend committee meetings, if one of the standing members cannot be present. Mr. Ford distributed a document with proposed changes to the charge adding the following language: "The Governance Committee may include an alternate Board member, if such occasion arises when one of the standing members is not available to attend a particular meeting." Mr. Ford's title, "Chief Executive Officer", was also to replace "Executive Director".

Mr. Annis moved that the Board approve the revised Governance Committee Charge. Ms. McCormick supported the motion.

Mr. Nacht noted a typographical error in the proposed language.

Mr. Bernstein indicated that the intent was that if the Chair of either PDC or PMER could not be present, then another member of that committee would take the chair's place at Governance. Board members discussed Mr. Bernstein's comment. Mr. Nacht indicated that he has confidence that the Governance Committee will handle meeting vacancies as it sees fit.

The motion, with the typographical error corrected, carried: Ajegba – Yes; Annis – Yes; McCormick – Yes; Nacht – Yes; Robben – Yes. Bernstein – Abstained.

A copy of the revised Governance Committee charge is attached hereto and included as part of the minutes.

6.0 Question Time

Mr. Annis requested that staff invite Mike Stoner, General Manager of Bay Metropolitan Transportation Authority, to the December 8 special Board to discuss Public Act 196. Mr. Annis reported that he had spoken with Mr. Stoner and found him to be very informative and helpful.

7.0 Old Business

There was no Old Business.

8.0 New Business

Mr. Nacht moved the following resolution with support from Ms. McCormick.

8.1 Consideration of Resolution Adopting a Vision Statement

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority Board of Directors (AATA Board) has formally adopted a Mission Statement clearly identifying the mission or purpose for which the organization exists; and

WHEREAS, the AATA Board has formally adopted a Values Statement clearly identifying the values the organization will follow and respect in fulfilling its Mission, and

WHEREAS, the AATA Board wishes to provide clear direction toward which the organization will devote its time, energy, resources, and efforts in fulfilling its Mission, now

THEREFORE IT IS RESOLVED: that the AATA Board adopts and endorses the following Vision Statement:

“The Ann Arbor Transportation Authority shall be the public transportation provider for Washtenaw County. Our customers shall see AATA’s expanded services as the preferred option for traveling to destinations within the county, as well as to and from the county. AATA will offer appropriate modes of transportation with the most efficient use of resources. These services shall enhance the quality of life for Washtenaw County stakeholders while promoting the economy, safeguarding the environment, and strengthening communities.”

The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Bernstein moved the following resolution with support from Ms. McCormick.

8.2 Consideration of Resolution Approving Development of a Countywide Transportation Plan

WHEREAS, the City of Ann Arbor, its surrounding communities, and all of Washtenaw County exist as one extended community with common needs for transportation, environmental stewardship and economic development, and

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority (AATA) is the recognized provider of public transit services within the City of Ann Arbor, and the immediate surrounding area, and

WHEREAS, there is a growing need and an increasing desire for the development of a public transportation system that will serve individuals and communities throughout Washtenaw County in order to enhance the quality of life and the overall economic well-being of the region,

NOW THEREFORE IT IS RESOLVED: that the AATA Staff shall take steps toward developing a countywide service plan that includes other transportation initiatives, and positions AATA to identify funding and operating opportunities to coordinate and integrate values-based public transportation systems within all of Washtenaw County, including connecting, as appropriate, with transportation services of adjoining counties, and

IT IS FURTHER RESOLVED: that Staff shall identify county-wide transportation needs, issues, concerns, funding requirements, based on research and stakeholder input, and their possible solutions and report those findings to the Board on a regular basis; and shall seek advice, guidance, and approval prior to implementing major segments of a county-wide transportation system.

Mr. Bernstein reported on his attendance at the WATS Policy Committee meeting earlier in the day during which one of the messages he heard loud and clear was the issue of communicating to the public what AATA is trying to do with regard to a countywide initiative. Mr. Bernstein presented recommended wording changes to the resolution placing more of an emphasis on stakeholder input.

Mr. Annis noted that the original resolution did not include reference of the consultant's involvement. The following amended resolution was presented for Board consideration.

WHEREAS, the City of Ann Arbor, its surrounding communities, and all of Washtenaw County exist as one extended community with common needs for transportation, environmental stewardship and economic development, and

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority (AATA) is the recognized provider of public transit services within the City of Ann Arbor, supported by a city-wide millage and with Purchase of Service Agreements with several local government units, and

WHEREAS, there is a growing need and an increasing desire for the development of a public transportation system that will serve individuals and communities throughout Washtenaw County in order to enhance the quality of life and the overall economic well-being of the region,

NOW THEREFORE IT IS RESOLVED: that Staff, with appropriate outside consultation, shall identify county-wide transportation needs, issues, concerns,

funding requirements, based on research and stakeholder input, and their possible solutions and report those findings to the Board on a regular basis, and

IT IS FURTHER RESOLVED: that the AATA Staff shall take steps toward developing a countywide service plan that includes other transportation initiatives, and positions AATA to identify funding and operating opportunities to coordinate and integrate values-based public transportation systems within all of Washtenaw County, including connecting, as appropriate, with transportation services of adjoining counties, and

IT IS FURTHER RESOLVED: that the AATA Staff shall seek advice, guidance, and approval from the Board prior to implementing major segments of a county-wide transportation system.

Ms. McCormick accepted the amendments. The amended resolution passed unanimously.

Mr. Bernstein moved the following resolution with support from Mr. Nacht.

8.3 Consideration of Resolution Adopting Service Changes

WHEREAS, the AATA has developed proposed service changes intended to provide service to the new Plymouth Road park and ride lot, and,

WHEREAS, riders of the affected service and the public were notified of the proposed service changes and provided an opportunity over more than 30 days to ask questions, and make comments and recommendations via mail, email, telephone, and in person at a series of public meetings, and

WHEREAS, the input from the public has been considered and the service changes revised to reduce the negative effect on existing riders, and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Ann Arbor Board of Directors does hereby adopt the attached recommended service changes to be implemented on January 24, 2010.

Mr. Nacht complimented staff on the quality of work that was put into the service change analysis. Mr. Nacht requested that future proposed service changes are presented with a Google Earth overlay to identify high density residential units and the number of riders superimposed on that to take advantage of technology.

Ms. McCormick noted the comment made during public time about requirements for analyzing impacts on various sectors of the community. Chris White responded that an analysis had been conducted indicating that the proposed changes affect a relatively small portion of the community; not a significant portion of the protected population. Therefore this was not a problem for this particular service change.

The motion passed unanimously.

9.0 Public Time

Larry Kreig appeared before the Board and read from a prepared statement. A copy of Mr. Kreig's statement is attached hereto and included as part of the minutes.

Jim Mogensen appeared before the Board. Mr. Mogensen encouraged the use of signage that is very clear to allay confusion on Route #2 that will now have three segments. Mr. Mogensen suggested that the adopted service changes will impact transit dependent individuals.

Carolyn Grawi appeared before the Board. Ms. Grawi conveyed the story of a family with residents in the City of Ann Arbor and Ypsilanti who would not be able to celebrate Thanksgiving together because there is no Holiday Ride service in Ypsilanti. Ms. Grawi suggested that improvements provided by a countywide system would be very valuable to community. Ms. Grawi requested that transfer point connections of all new transit initiative projects be accessible barrier free. Ms. Grawi noted that the hill near the proposed Fuller Road Station is very steep and would pose a challenge for some customers. Ms. Grawi requested that plans for redevelopment of the Blake Transit Center be made available for review for accessibility. Ms. Grawi thanked Michael Ford for working with the Ann Arbor Center for Independent Living (CIL) on getting an accessible stop in front of the CIL.

Mr. Annis agreed that the hill near the proposed Fuller Road Station is a problem and that a way to get up the hill using transit should be included in intermodal plan. Ms. McCormick indicated that the proposal includes an interconnection that would get customers directly into the hospital.

No one further appearing, Mr. Ajegba declared Public Time closed.

10.0 Adjournment

David Nacht moved to adjourn the meeting with support from Rich Robben. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 8:09 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Jesse Bernstein, Acting Secretary