

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 607-609 East William, Application Number HDC12-201

DISTRICT: State Street Historic District

REPORT DATE: December 6, 2012

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: Monday, December 10 for the Thursday, December 13, 2012
HDC meeting

OWNER

APPLICANT

Name: Boutsikakis Properties, LLC

Same

Address: 4895 St. Andrews Ct.
Ann Arbor, MI 48108

Phone: (734) 604-8737

BACKGROUND: This two story, brick vernacular commercial building features large, double-hung, one-over-one wood windows, set in openings with arched tops and decorative wood trim. The building also features brick corbelling below the cornice and brick pilasters. It was built in 1906. A meat market owned by Stafford B. Nickels was located at 607 E. William, and Helber Brothers grocery store was located at 609 E. William. Until recently, longtime tenants College Shoe Repair and White Market were located within the building.

In March of 2012 the HDC approved the replacement of eleven wood windows, and in October a new wall sign was approved at the staff level for 607 E William.

LOCATION: The building is located on the north side of East William Street between Maynard Street and South State Street.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to remove the existing enamel panels on the first floor to expose the underlying brick.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.



- (4) Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Storefronts

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving storefronts--and their functional and decorative features--that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building such as display windows, signs, doors, transoms, kick plates, corner posts, and entablatures.

The removal of inappropriate, non-historic cladding, false mansard roofs, and other later alterations can help reveal the historic character of a storefront.

Not Recommended: Removing or radically changing storefronts--and their features--which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

Stripping storefront of historic material such as wood, cast iron, terra cotta, carrara glass, and brick.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. White Market was originally located at 607 E William. At that time, the façade of 607 E William had painted brick, with large glass transom windows and a retractable awning (see photo 1). The façade of 609 and 611 E William, which appear to have been two separate storefronts, also was brick, with a large awning covering the entrance to 609. In 1948, White Market moved next door to the combined 609 and 611 E William. At this time, the enamel panels were added to 609-611 E William. It is also likely that at this time the large plate glass windows and double-door entrance were added (see photo 2). Photo 2 also shows the arched window above the entrance to the second floor being infilled with brick. The glass transom windows at 609 and 611 were infilled with brick when the enameled steel panels were installed, and the 607 E William transom was probably bricked over shortly after, when the enamel panels were extended over this portion of the façade.
2. The applicant proposes removing the enameled steel panels from the building to expose the underlying brick. The panels do not fall within the period of significance for the State Street Historic District, and the removal of the panels would help reveal the original historic character of the façade.
3. The enamel panels are damaged and degraded in multiple areas, and the applicant stated that the panels cannot be painted. The panels appear to be attached to wooden strips, which are anchored in the brick façade. The condition of the underlying brick could not be determined at this point. The proposed motion is conditioned upon the applicant repairing whatever damage is found underneath the panels, such as selectively replacing bricks, patching holes, and repointing mortar joints using appropriate compatible materials.

4. At the Review Committee visit, staff will document the current condition of the panels and present the photos as part of the staff report at the HDC meeting.
5. The removal of the enamel panels is appropriate and would help restore the character-defining brick façade. Staff finds the work compatible in exterior design, arrangement, material, and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area, and finds that it meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motion supports staff findings and is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 607-609 East William Street, a contributing property in the State Street Historic District, to remove the enamel panels on the first floor of the front elevation, on the condition that the underlying building façade be repaired as necessary using compatible methods and materials. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 2 and 4 and the guidelines for storefronts.

MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 607-609 East William in the State Street Historic District

_____ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: application.

Photo 1. 607 E William, Published in a January, 1939 Ann Arbor News article.



Photo 2. 609 E William, published in the September 25, 1948 issue of the Ann Arbor News.



607-609 East William Street (March 2007)



HDC12-201
11/20/12.

pd \$100-



City of Ann Arbor

PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES — PLANNING SERVICES

Mailing: 301 E. Huron Street | P.O. Box 8647 | Ann Arbor, Michigan 48107-8647
Location: Larcom City Hall | First Floor | 301 E. Huron St. | Ann Arbor, MI 48104-6120
p. 734.794.6265 | f. 734.994.8312 | planning@a2gov.org

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION APPLICATION

Section 1: Property Being Reviewed and Ownership Information

Address of Property: 1607 & 1609 William - Ann Arbor

Historic District: State Street

Name of Property Owner (If different than the applicant):
Gus Butsikakis

Address of Property Owner: _____

Daytime Phone and E-mail of Property Owner: 734. 404-8737

Signature of Property Owner: _____ Date: 11/20/12

Section 2: Applicant Information

Name of Applicant: Gus Butsikakis

Address of Applicant: 5700 Creekevew Drive - Ann Arbor 48108

Daytime Phone: (734) 404-8737 Fax: (7) 944-0800

E-mail: CIB7@comcast.net

Applicant's Relationship to Property: owner architect contractor other

Signature of applicant: _____ Date: _____

Section 3: Building Use (check all that apply)

Residential Single Family Multiple Family Rental

Commercial Institutional

Section 4: Stille-DeRossett-Hale Single State Construction Code Act (This item **MUST BE INITIALED** for your application to be **PROCESSED**)

Public Act 169, Michigan's Local Historic Districts Act, was amended April 2004 to include the following language: "...the applicant has certified in the application that the property where the work will be undertaken has, or will have before the proposed completion date, a a fire alarm or smoke alarm complying with the requirements of the Stille-DeRossett-Hale Single State Construction Code Act, 1972 PA 230, MCL 125.1501 to 125.1531."

Please initial here: GB

100-8004
11/15/11

Section 5: Description of Proposed Changes (attach additional sheets as necessary)

1. Provide a brief summary of proposed changes. facade changes - remove existing facade to expose original bricks

2. Provide a description of existing conditions. _____

3. What are the reasons for the proposed changes? to restore building to original structure (brick)

4. Attach any additional information that will further explain or clarify the proposal, and indicate these attachments here.

5. Attach photographs of the existing property, including at least one general photo and detailed photos of proposed work area. no photos - per bill

STAFF USE ONLY

Date Submitted: Nov. 20, 2012 Application to _____ Staff or X HDC

Project No.: HDC 12-201 Fee Paid: \$100

Pre-filing Staff Reviewer & Date: _____ Date of Public Hearing: Dec. 13, 2012

Application Filing Date: _____ Action: _____ HDC COA _____ HDC Denial

Staff signature: _____ HDC NTP _____ Staff COA

Comments: