



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Thursday, October 20, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Vice Chair John Beeson called the meeting to order at 7:10 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Beeson called the roll.

Staff Present: Historic Preservation Coordinator Jill Thacher

Present: 6 - Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, John Beeson, Jennifer
Ross, Evan Hall, and Max Cope

Absent: 1 - Benjamin L. Bushkuhl

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The Agenda was unanimously Approved, as presented.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

E **UNFINISHED BUSINESS - HEARINGS**

E-1 **16-1485** HDC16-160; 203 Koch Avenue - Addition, Raising Roof, etc. - OWSHD

*Historic Preservation Coordinator Jill Thacher, provided the proposed
revisions to previously submitted plans. See attached in agenda packet.*

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review.

*Beeson reported that they determined it was aluminum siding along the
sides. He said he agreed with the staff report that changes would not be*

visible from the west and likely invisible from the street; however, changes would be visible from the rear and it would be above the gable, which is what the Commission had concerns about when they reviewed the application previously.

Cope agreed with Beeson as well as the staff report.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Robert Fowler, 5550 Fox Run, Applicant on behalf of owner Zaki Alawi, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Ramsburgh asked why the Commission had not received any measurements with the exception of the one interior drawing. She said she was on the original Review Committee, and visually it didn't look like you gained a foot and a half, by going up to the ridgeline of the front part of the house. She said without any exterior measurements there is nothing that convinced her that the applicant will not exceed the front ridgeline that is parallel to the street, adding that measurements help the Commission verify the application.

Noting no further public speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 203 Koch Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to raise the roof height on the rear addition and change the roof pitch, on the following conditions: the new egress window is all wood, the smallest size possible to meet egress requirements, and is approved separately by staff on behalf of the HDC, and all infill and replacement materials and their dimensions match the historic ones, including eaves, fascia, trim, siding, soffits, etc.: and the artificial siding will be removed and the underlying siding repaired and restored to a sound condition. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material, and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for additions and building sit: and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Vice Chair declaring the motion defeated. Vote: 0-6

Certificate of Appropriateness was Denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

Absent: 1 - Chair Bushkuhl

F HEARINGS

F-1 16-1486 HDC16-176; 514 N. Division - Two Egress Windows - OFWHD

Jill Thacher, presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review.

Beeson reported that the lot is fairly restrictive with little room on either side, but tighter on the driveway side.

Cope added if there were window wells on the driveway side, he could see the possibility of people stepping out of their cars and stepping onto the window wells and the possibility of cars driving onto it. He said if a window well were to be approved on the front side of the house, he would suggest blocking off that section of the driveway for parking, or eliminating a parking spot to make it inaccessible to a car.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Harpreet Singh, 514 N. Division Street, Ann Arbor, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Singh said he plans to plant bushes in front of the bollard or behind it, and build a wall.

Ross commented that if bushes were to be planted in front of the bollards

it would be difficult to see which is one of the points with a bollard.

Beeson asked about the proposed wall and where it would be located.

Singh said it would be built of concrete, as a barrier, to block any car from every going over the window well.

Miss Mary Bundel, Realtor and property manager for Singh, who sold Singhs the house, said they take very good care of their properties in Ann Arbor, and only accept leases from quality people who will take care of the place and have pride in it. She said Singh had proposed to plant a bush in front of the first window well, but now plans to build a wall or whatever will comply.

Ramsburgh asked how many rental occupants the house can currently have.

Singh said four (4) rental occupants as the house is currently configured, and he wants to add two (2) more bedrooms in the basement, for a total of six (6) occupants which is the maximum allowed.

Beeson asked about the location of the proposed basement bedrooms to make sure the proposed egress windows line up with proposed bedrooms in the basement.

Singh said the bedrooms would be in the front part of the basement, with both bedrooms having their own egress window.

Noting no further public speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 514 N. Division Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to replace two existing basement windows with egress windows and wells on the south elevation as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, especially those for windows, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Chair Bushkuhl

F-2 [16-1487](#) HDC16-214; 430 S First - Rear Addition - OWSHD

Jill Thacher, presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review.

Beeson reported that the house is located at the top of the hill, and is similar in size and character of the neighboring houses. He said the lot is fairly deep.

Cope stated that from the street and other angles it would be hard to see the addition. He said the steep sloping roof on the proposed garage might take away from the lot and the surrounding area.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Brad Moore, J. Bradley Moore & Associates, 4844 Jackson Rd #150, Ann Arbor, Architect for the project, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Ross asked if Moore knew the pitch of the existing neighboring garage.

Moore said they estimate it has a 5/12 pitch and he and his client are proposing a 9/12 pitch, which is consistent with the house pitch and the pitches of the historic times of this house, but if the Commission would prefer that to be less, his client would be fine with lowering it to a 5/12 pitch.

Beeson asked how the applicant proposes to handle the transition from the existing vinyl siding and trim on the house and the proposed Hardi plank boards.

Moore explained that the outside corner of vinyl, that is there now would remain and the inside trim would be Hardi plank.

Beeson commented that owners would need to consider carefully what color they use to ensure it matches.

Noting no further public speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ross seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 430 S. First Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a 508 square foot addition to the rear of the house, a 182.5 square foot patio; and a 462 square foot detached garage, as proposed and as amended at the meeting by the applicant. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards, 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for additions and building sites.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Chair Bushkuhl

Jill Thacher, presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review.

Beeson reported that the parapet wall is a character defining feature of this amazing looking building. He said they looked all around the building trying to find the views as proposed on the plans, as well as viewing the rear and sides of the building trying to view the addition in massing and scale to the buildings in the adjacent neighbors. He said the parking lot building at the rear would be mostly impacted, but that, in itself, could be built into a really tall building at any time.

Cope agreed with Beeson.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Ed Shaffran, 209 S. Fourth Avenue, Suite 1C, Ann Arbor, owner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 118-124 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to infill the rear second and third floors to square off the building, and also to construct a fourth and fifth floor, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for additions and district or neighborhood setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Chair Bushkuhl

F-4 [16-1489](#) HDC16-213; 121-123 E Liberty - Two Story Addition - MSHD

Jill Thacher, presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review.

Beeson reported that they looked mainly at the size, scale and massing of the neighboring buildings, mostly. He agreed with the staff report on the proposed building be a cornerstone to the block.

Cope agreed.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Ed Shaffran, 209 S. Fourth Avenue, Suite 1C, Ann Arbor, owner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Brad Moore, J. Bradley Moore & Associates, 4844 Jackson Rd #150, Ann Arbor, Architect for the project, was also present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 121-123 E. Liberty Street and 220 S. Fourth Ave, a non-contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to construct three new floors above the existing one-story building, creating six new residential units. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions and storefronts and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for

Rehabilitating Historic Buildings in particular standards 2, 6, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for storefronts and new additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-1

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - White, Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Cope

Nays: 1 - Secretary Ross

Absent: 1 - Chair Bushkuhl

F-5 [16-1490](#) HDC16-226; 211 Crest - Rear Addition - OWSHD

Jill Thacher, presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review.

Cope reported that he agrees with the staff report that the roof pitch seems a bit overpowering with the west wall, especially with neighboring properties. He said for a house that is not that large, it will make the house stick out and look bulky to neighboring features.

Beeson agreed, adding that he did not believe much of the addition would be seen from the street.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Mike Mahon, Adaptive Building, 2288 S. Industrial, Ann Arbor, Builder, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission. He also provided letters of support from the immediate neighbors.

Lauren and Paul Ranalli, 211 Crest Avenue, Ann Arbor, owners were also present to respond to enquiries.

Chris Allen, 706 Hiscock Street, Ann Arbor, Architect, was present to explain the proposed application. He provided a handout to the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 211 Crest Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a two-story shed-roofed rear addition with a ground floor mud room, screen porch, and overhang, and a second floor bedroom and bath, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, and The secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Settings, and Windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Vice Chair declaring the motion defeated. Vote: 0-6

Certificate of Appropriateness was Denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

Absent: 1 - Chair Bushkuhl

F-6 **16-1491** HDC16-223; 217 Buena Vista - Rear Addition - OWSHD

Jill Thacher, presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review.

Cope reported that the new addition wouldn't be seen from the street. He had a concern with the proposed proximity to the garage. He said the addition was offset and preserved the corner well, but leaves the space from the garage very tight.

Beeson said the house is a cute little house and for sure the tight space inside is challenging, and while the floor plan layout on the first floor was very helpful, he said they had no idea yet, of what was going on upstairs.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Mike Mahon, Adaptive Building, 2288 S. Industrial, Ann Arbor, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 217 Buena Vista Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to build a 280 square foot addition on the rear of the house, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building sites; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Chair Bushkuhl

F-7 [16-1492](#) HDC16-219; 1530 Hill - Enlarge Doorway - WHHD

Jill Thacher, presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review.

Beeson reported that the location of the door is not visible from the street, and the opening is non-original, so he felt the application was quite straight forward. He said they had some comments regarding the existing markings on the French door and would bring those comments during the Commission discussion.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Steven Varnum, 1592 Street, Haslett, MI., designer, and Martin Clarke, 6840 Hashley Road, Manchester, MI., builder, were present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1530 Hill Street, a contributing property in the Washtenaw/Hill Historic District, to install a new double door in place of a single door on the south-facing elevation on the west side of the house. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for entrances and porches, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to doors.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

G NEW BUSINESS

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

[16-1493](#) Minutes of the September 8, 2016 HDC Meeting

Amended

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J ASSIGNMENTS

Review Committee: Monday, November 14, 2016, at Noon for the November 17, 2016 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Hall and Cope volunteered for the November Review Committee.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF

[16-1494](#) September 2016 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Hall commented on construction on a house on First Street, just south of Jefferson.

Thacher said she believed it was an addition that was approved about a year ago.

Ramsburgh asked about a metal fence that has been installed in front of a sorority house in the Hill/Washtenaw HDC district.

Thacher said it had received approval.

M **COMMUNICATIONS****16-1495** Various Communications to the HDC

Thacher provided the Commission on an update to the Sign Guidelines; she will likely have them to the Commission for their review by next month.

Thacher asked the Commission if they would like to add guidelines for egress windows to the Design Guidelines.

The Commission unanimously said, "Yes, please!"

Received and Filed

N **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 10:16 p.m.

Working Session Immediately Following Regular Meeting**1. Ann Arbor Art Center Addition**

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx
- Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.