

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**Staff Report****ADDRESS:** 404 South First Street, Application Number HDC22-1202**DISTRICT:** Old West Side Historic District**REPORT DATE:** October 13, 2022**REPORT PREPARED BY:** Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator**REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE:** Tuesday, October 11, 2022

	OWNER	APPLICANT
Name:	Albrecht Enterprises	Theresa Angelini
Address:	1310 Westboro Dr Birmingham, MI 48009	200 Huronview Blvd Ann Arbor, MI 48103
Phone:	(248) 875-8832	(734) 476-3461

BACKGROUND: This two-story home was built in 1916 and first occupied in 1917 by Carl Sanzi, a mechanical engineer, and printer Richard Hawthorne. On the 1916 and 1925 Sanborn maps the house faces West William and has a full-width front porch on the north elevation, and the street address 301 West William. By 1931 the front door and porch had been moved to their current configuration on the east elevation. The bay window on the north elevation was most likely added then to replace the former front door. The house is clad in 3" lap siding on the ground floor and cedar shakes on the upper floors. It has exposed rafter tails and a round attic window in each of the three gables.

On the 1916-1948 Sanborn maps, five houses are shown on one lot, including this one (404 S First), 408 and 410 S First, and 307 and 309 W William. All of the houses were built in 1916 and occupied in 1917 or '18. Two are Dutch gambrels, the other three were gable fronters, though the property in this application was altered as described above.

The attached garage appears on the 1948 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map but does not appear on the 1931 Sanborn. On the 1947 City Aerial there is a white line that could be the edge of the parapet, but it is inconclusive. Given the design, materials, and massing of the garage, it is consistent with pre-1945 garages and is presumed to be from the period of significance for the Old West Side Historic District.

At the September 8, 2022 HDC meeting, an application for a small corner addition and a larger addition on top of the garage was denied.

LOCATION: The site is located at the southwest corner of South First and West William Streets.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to add a small addition on the southwest corner of the house with a second story that extends slightly over the rear of the garage; install a parking pad; and remove the chimney.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (other SOI Standards may also apply):

- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- (5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property will be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Additions

Recommended: Constructing a new addition so that there is the least possible loss of historic materials and so that character-defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

Locating the attached exterior addition at the rear or on an inconspicuous side of a historic building; and limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building.

Designing new additions in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new.

Placing new additions such as balconies and greenhouses on non-character-defining elevations and limiting and size and scale in relationship to the historic building.

Designing additional stories, when required for the new use, that are set back from the wall plane and are as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street.

Not Recommended: Attaching a new addition so that the character-defining features of the historic building are obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

Designing a new addition so that its size and scale in relation to the historic building are out of proportion, thus diminishing the historic character.

Designing and constructing new additions that result in the diminution or loss of the historic character of the resource, including its design, materials, workmanship, location, or setting.

Constructing additional stories so that the historic appearance of the building is radically changed.

From the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other guidelines from this document may also apply):

Guidelines for All Additions

Appropriate: Locating a required addition on the least character-defining elevation and keeping it subordinate in volume to the historic building.

Placing a new addition on a non-character defining or inconspicuous elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic property.

Designing the addition so it is compatible in terms of massing, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and proportion of openings.

Placing functions and services required for the new use in non-character-defining interior spaces rather than constructing a new addition.

Locating a rooftop addition to be inconspicuous when viewed from the street.

Not Appropriate: Designing a new addition that requires the removal of significant building elements or site features.

Designing an addition to appear older or the same age as the original building.

Residential Accessory Structures

Appropriate: Maintaining and restoring historic barns, garages, sheds, trellises, and other accessory structures to match the historic materials and configuration.

Not Appropriate: Altering historic barns, garages, and sheds by using materials, configurations, and designs that do not match the existing or historic appearance.

STAFF FINDINGS:

From the previous staff report

1. This lot is 3,328 square feet, which is very small for a lot in Ann Arbor. The zoning is C2B Business Service District. Office and residential uses are proposed for the house, both of which are allowed. The lot has two 10' minimum front setbacks and zero setbacks on the side and rear.

Addition

2. The addition on the southwest corner of the house is small, 7'6" x 9'3". It is set between the southwest corner of the house and the attached garage. It is inset from the back corner of the house 1'3" and from the southwest corner of the garage 5". The addition would be built on a crawl space. The second floor of the addition would extend over the rear of the garage for 3'5". A section drawing is provided to illustrate this. The roof is a west (side) facing gable.
3. The addition is clad in cementitious lap siding with a 3" reveal on the first floor and cementitious shakes on the second floor. Windows are aluminum-clad with four-over-one sashes. The windows and cladding are visually very similar to those on the historic house but appropriately distinguished by modern materials.
4. The garage will receive a new EPDM roof as part of the project.

5. The concrete parking pad is in an appropriate location at the rear of the house.
6. The chimney is proposed to be removed in order to allow reconfiguration of the first floor kitchen and stair to the basement. The commission will need to determine whether the chimney is a character-defining feature of the house. If so, it should not be removed. The chimney's brickwork is very plain.
7. This new application only minimally impacts the existing contributing garage. By setting the addition farther from West William Street, the appearance of the single-story attached garage is preserved. Minimal historic materials and features are removed for the addition, and the appearance is very compatible but distinguished by modern material. Staff believes the application meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* and the guidelines used by the Historic District Commission.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motion supports staff findings and is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 404 South First Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct an addition on the southwest corner of the house with a second story that extends modestly over the rear of the garage, install a concrete parking pad, and remove the chimney, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* and *Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for additions, as well as the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*, in particular the guidelines for additions.

ATTACHMENTS: application, drawings, photos

404 South First Street (May 2008 survey photo)



Chimney (courtesy Google Street View 2019)

