

Ann Arbor City Council Regular Session: December 18, 2023
Email Redactions List Pursuant to Council Resolution R-09-386

Sent Time	TO	From	CC	Redactions	Reason for Redaction
9:07 PM	City Council All	Jacqueline Beaudry		Personal Contact Information	Privacy
9:15 PM	City Council All	Brett Lenart		Personal Contact Information	Privacy
10:00 PM	City Council All	Tahani Othman		Personal Contact Information	Privacy
10:18 PM	Chris Watson	Jack Cedarquist		Personal Contact Information	Privacy

From: [Alex Lowe](#)
To: [Akmon, Dharma](#)
Subject: Your communications from council tonight
Date: Monday, December 18, 2023 8:19:42 PM

You don't often get email from alex@lowe.dev. [Learn why this is important](#)

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Thank you so much for what you said. It was heartfelt and made me cry ♥

From: [Eileen Freed](#)
To: [Disch, Lisa](#); [Harrison, Cynthia](#); [Taylor, Christopher \(Mayor\)](#); [Song, Linh](#); [Watson, Chris](#); [Radina, Travis](#); [Ghazi Edwin, Ayesha](#); [Ever, Jen](#); [Akmon, Dharma](#); [Briggs, Erica](#); [Cornell, Jenn](#)
Subject: Rest of my remarks
Date: Monday, December 18, 2023 8:44:06 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Dear City Council Members,

In drafting my remarks, I mis-timed them, as I forgot that I had 4 minutes at the school board last week. I miscalculated the amount I could say in 3 minutes.

Therefore, I'm sharing the last paragraph of my remarks below, since they expressed gratitude for you and your work.

I am grateful to our city council members for their dedication to the citizens of this community and for their patience and grace while under attack. I appreciate your continued focus on the work of governing our city and your efforts to minimize division in our community.

Warm Regards,

Eileen

[Donate to the Israel Emergency Fund](#)

איילין פריד Eileen Freed
Executive Director
Jewish Federation of Greater Ann Arbor
Pronouns: she/hers ([what's this?](#))


734-773-3537
eileenfreed@jewishannarbor.org
www.jewishannarbor.org

[DO GOOD EVERYWHERE – Today.Tomorrow.Always.](#)

Proud to be a **LIFE & LEGACY[®]** partner. Be remembered forever with a gift to the Jewish Federation in your will, trust, retirement account or life insurance policy.

From: [Beaudry, Jacqueline](#)
To: [City Council](#)
Cc: [Kaur, Atleen](#); [Dohoney Jr., Milton](#); [Lenart, Brett](#); [Kelley, Hank](#)
Subject: FW: Protest Petition for No. ORD-23-34-2520 & 2540 Pontiac Trail
Date: Monday, December 18, 2023 9:07:35 PM
Attachments: [WyncottProtest Petition-20231218.pdf](#)

Please see the attached protest that arrived after 7pm tonight.

Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk (she/her/hers)
President, Michigan Association of Municipal Clerks
2019 Michigan City Clerk of the Year
Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104
734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401
jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org
 Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

From: CityClerk <CityClerk@a2gov.org>
Sent: Monday, December 18, 2023 8:53 PM
To: Beaudry, Jacqueline <JBeaudry@a2gov.org>
Subject: FW: Protest Petition for No. ORD-23-34-2520 & 2540 Pontiac Trail

Jackie –

I just saw this email that arrived after the meeting started. Let me know what follow-up actions are appropriate.

Thanks,
Rachel

City of Ann Arbor Clerk's Office
City of Ann Arbor | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104
734.794.6140 (O) · 734.794.8296 (F)
cityclerk@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org

From: April Wyncott [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, December 18, 2023 7:20 PM
To: CityClerk <CityClerk@a2gov.org>
Subject: Protest Petition for No. ORD-23-34-2520 & 2540 Pontiac Trail

You don't often get email from [REDACTED] [Learn why this is important](#)

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Hello,

Please accept Protest Petition for No. ORD-23-34-2520 & 2540 Pontiac Trail.

Thank you,
April Wyncott

April Wyncott



December 18, 2023

Re: Protest Petition for No. ORD-23-34-2520 & 2540 Pontiac Trail

To whom it may concern:

I live at 2990 Montana Way and I am formally filing a protest petition for No. ORD-23-34-2520 & 2540 Pontiac Trail.

My reasoning is due to the significant need for traffic and noise infrastructure along Pontiac trail. Currently there is none and bringing in that amount of additional homes and personnel will add to the current traffic and noise issues along Pontiac trail.

Thank you.

April Wyncott

Sincerely April Wyncott

From: [Lenart, Brett](#)
To: [Beaudry, Jacqueline](#); [City Council](#)
Cc: [Kaur, Atleen](#); [Dohoney Jr., Milton](#); [Kelley, Hank](#)
Subject: RE: Protest Petition for No. ORD-23-34-2520 & 2540 Pontiac Trail
Date: Monday, December 18, 2023 9:15:34 PM

This is not within 100 feet nor the subject property. It would not result in a super-majority vote requirement.

Brett Lenart, AICP | Planning Manager (he/him)

blenart@a2gov.org | Direct (734) 794-6000 #42606 | General (734) 794-6265 | www.a2gov.org

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline <JBeaudry@a2gov.org>
Sent: Monday, December 18, 2023 9:08 PM
To: City Council <CityCouncil@a2gov.org>
Cc: Kaur, Atleen <AKaur@a2gov.org>; Dohoney Jr., Milton <MDohoney@a2gov.org>; Lenart, Brett <BLenart@a2gov.org>; Kelley, Hank <HKelley@a2gov.org>
Subject: FW: Protest Petition for No. ORD-23-34-2520 & 2540 Pontiac Trail

Please see the attached protest that arrived after 7pm tonight.

Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk (she/her/hers)

President, Michigan Association of Municipal Clerks

2019 Michigan City Clerk of the Year

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104

734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401

jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org

 Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

From: CityClerk <CityClerk@a2gov.org>
Sent: Monday, December 18, 2023 8:53 PM
To: Beaudry, Jacqueline <JBeaudry@a2gov.org>
Subject: FW: Protest Petition for No. ORD-23-34-2520 & 2540 Pontiac Trail

Jackie –

I just saw this email that arrived after the meeting started. Let me know what follow-up actions are appropriate.

Thanks,
Rachel

City of Ann Arbor Clerk's Office

City of Ann Arbor | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104

734.794.6140 (O) · 734.794.8296 (F)

cityclerk@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org

From: April Wyncott [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, December 18, 2023 7:20 PM
To: CityClerk <CityClerk@a2gov.org>
Subject: Protest Petition for No. ORD-23-34-2520 & 2540 Pontiac Trail

You don't often get email from [REDACTED] [Learn why this is important](#)

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Hello,

Please accept Protest Petition for No. ORD-23-34-2520 & 2540 Pontiac Trail.

Thank you,
April Wyncott


From: [Kaur, Atleen](#)
To: [Beaudry, Jacqueline](#)
Cc: [Briggs, Erica](#); [Dohoney Jr., Milton](#); [Frost, Christopher](#)
Subject: amendment C-1
Date: Monday, December 18, 2023 9:32:26 PM

I move to amend the ordinance and map to remove the 8 parcels that were not included in the original staff recommendation to the Planning Commission. In the ordinance, those parcels are identified as parcels 46 through 53.

Atleen Kaur
City Attorney
City of Ann Arbor
Guy C. Larcom City Hall
301 E. Huron, 3rd Floor
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
(734) 794-6189
akaur@a2gov.org

From: [Beaudry, Jacqueline](#)
To: [City Council](#)
Subject: FW: amendment C-1
Date: Monday, December 18, 2023 9:37:28 PM

FYI

Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk (she/her/hers)
President, Michigan Association of Municipal Clerks
2019 Michigan City Clerk of the Year
Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104
734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401
jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org
 **Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.**

From: Kaur, Atleen <AKaur@a2gov.org>
Sent: Monday, December 18, 2023 9:32 PM
To: Beaudry, Jacqueline <JBeaudry@a2gov.org>
Cc: Briggs, Erica <EBriggs@a2gov.org>; Dohoney Jr., Milton <MDohoney@a2gov.org>; Frost, Christopher <CFrost@a2gov.org>
Subject: amendment C-1

I move to amend the ordinance and map to remove the 8 parcels that were not included in the original staff recommendation to the Planning Commission. In the ordinance, those parcels are identified as parcels 46 through 53.

Atleen Kaur
City Attorney
City of Ann Arbor
Guy C. Larcom City Hall
301 E. Huron, 3rd Floor
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
(734) 794-6189
akaur@a2gov.org

From: [Othman, Tahani](#)
To: [Cornell, Jenn](#); [Briggs, Erica](#); [Akmon, Dharma](#); [Ghazi Edwin, Ayesha](#); [Eyer, Jen](#); [Watson, Chris](#); [Radina, Travis](#); [Harrison, Cynthia](#); [Song, Linh](#); [Disch, Lisa](#); [Taylor, Christopher \(Mayor\)](#)
Subject: Public Commentary that wasn't able to be heard 12/18
Date: Monday, December 18, 2023 10:00:29 PM

You don't often get email from othmant@aaps.k12.mi.us. [Learn why this is important](#)

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor Taylor and City Council Members,

I had signed up to speak at tonight's council meeting, but wasn't able to stay up waiting for my number (34) to come up. So, here is what I had wanted to say:

Good Evening City Council Members,

My name is Tahani Othman and I am a long time community member and teacher in Ann Arbor Public Schools. I'd like to thank Linh Song, Erica Briggs and Ayesha Ghazi Edwin for their time, energy, and efforts in working towards drafting a resolution calling for a ceasefire in Israel/Palestine and Gaza.

Although the resolution isn't before you tonight, it is a fine document and with a few modifications, it could be a meaningful statement that addresses the ongoing humanitarian crisis in Israel/Palestine and Gaza and its impact on our Ann Arbor community.

As a public school teacher of over thirty years, I think that the most important message we can send our young people is the importance of speaking out against injustice and genocide regardless of who the victims are or who the perpetrators are.

Conflating speech directed against a government with hate speech towards a religious group is a dangerous practice. Labeling academics, students, politicians and everyday citizens as anti-semitic because they are speaking out against Israel's blatant dehumanization and genocide of Palestinians in the name of self defense goes against all that we as a community stand for. We need to be clear that terrorism is terrorism, whether it's carried out by individuals, groups or governments.

As a middle school teacher, I get to spend my days with young people who can clearly see right and wrong, justice and injustice. By not uplifting the voices of the oppressed, we send them the message that justice is reserved for the powerful, that some lives are worth more than others, and that some lives just don't matter.

Council members, I urge you to continue the hard work of crafting a ceasefire resolution that clearly distinguishes criticism of Israel from antisemitism, and one that clearly takes a

stand against genocide as it continues to be perpetuated with the support of our tax dollars.

Thank you

Tahani Othman



--

Tahani Othman (she, her)
7th/8th Grade Humanities Teacher
Ann Arbor Open School
Ann Arbor Public Schools

From: [JACK CEDERQUIST](#)
To: [Watson, Chris](#)
Subject: Re: Item C-1 on tonight's City Council agenda: proposed rezoning of 3055 Plymouth Road as TC1
Date: Monday, December 18, 2023 10:18:01 PM

You don't often get email from [REDACTED] [Learn why this is important](#)

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Chris - thank you for your thoughtful reply. Unfortunately I missed the broadcast of tonight's meeting due to a Comcast outage. I can see it later.

Best, Jack

On 12/18/2023 5:08 PM EST Watson, Chris <cwatson@a2gov.org> wrote:

Good afternoon Jack,

I believe you likely saw the planning commission's discussion of this issue on November 1. I also viewed that discussion and agreed with the decision to proceed with the re-zoning because a deed restriction is an agreement between private parties in which the city has no part. It was acknowledged that the deed restriction might make these properties harder to re-develop. I would also point out that any developer proposing a new site plan would have access to ZBA if they wanted to propose a plan that conforms with the deed restrictions. They would also have the chance to communicate with the parties in the deed restriction at the time of a new proposal.

In addition, here is the staff response to your question (apologies if you have already received this):

Zoning is independent of deed restrictions. While the two can be in conflict, the City is not obligated to cede regulatory control to private deed restrictions. Recent examples of this include the rezoning of portions of Eisenhower to TC1, that purportedly include deed restrictions that limit development to a single story, where the TC1 mandates multi-story development. Likewise, the owner of Maple Village raised concerns regarding tenant desires or requirements but is another example of the City setting a regulatory framework that may be distinct from private property desires.

Thank you for raising this issue. I learned from the discussion and appreciate your attention to the process.

Sincerely,

Chris

Chris Watson | Ward Two City Council Member

City of Ann Arbor
301 E. Huron Street

Ann Arbor, MI 48107-8647

Sign up for my newsletter: votechriswatson.com

From: JACK CEDERQUIST [REDACTED]

Sent: Monday, December 18, 2023 11:58 AM

To: City Council <CityCouncil@a2gov.org>

Subject: Item C-1 on tonight's City Council agenda: proposed rezoning of 3055 Plymouth Road as TC1

Some people who received this message don't often get email from

[REDACTED] [Learn why this is important](#)

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor Taylor and City Council members,

With respect to the proposed rezoning of 3055 Plymouth Road as TC1: The 3055 Plymouth Road property has a Declaration of Building and Use Restrictions, dated June 2, 1980, with Amendment, dated October 6, 1980. These restrictions are stated to be valid and binding for a period of 100 years from their date.

The restrictions include:

a maximum above ground building floor square footage of 18,000 square feet and a maximum basement square footage of 9,000 square feet, uses of the basement are restricted to non-commercial storage by building occupants, rest rooms, elevator and mechanical systems, greenbelts of 50 feet on the east and 40 feet on the west and north, 80% opacity of summer screening in the greenbelts, screening of roof top equipment and of any trash area, non-glare exterior lighting and maintenance of a pedestrian walkway to Briarcliff Street.

These restrictions were negotiated in good faith with the Hoffmann family, developers of the site and of the 19 homes on Ardenne Drive. Signers to the documents include 13 homeowners on Georgetown Boulevard and 11 homeowners on Prairie Street. The future owners of the 19 homes that were soon built on Ardenne Drive and the Dolfen Swim Club (to the west) are also included as parties to the Restriction Declaration.

In addition, the property has two holding ponds along the Plymouth Road boundary and both receives and discharges storm water into Miller's Creek. Any changes to the property must manage storm water and protect the Miller's Creek natural asset.

In view of the above restrictions and obligations, the 3055 Plymouth Road property is not suitable for TC1 rezoning. I suggest two options:

1. Remove 3055 Plymouth Road from the list of properties to be rezoned TC1 or

2. Amend the Restrictions before TC1 rezoning to make the property suitable for rezoning. However, amendment requires that both the Hoffmann family or their assigns and 75% of the beneficiaries listed above agree to the amendments.

Thank you for considering this input to your decision process,
Jack Cederquist

