



**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE REGULAR SESSION OF THE  
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF ANN ARBOR  
Thursday, January 10, 2008.**

**Commissioners Present:** Susan Wineberg, Diane Giannola, Robert White, Jim Henrichs and Kristina Glusac (5);

**Commissioners Absent:** Michael Bruner and Sarah Shotwell (2)

**Staff Present:** Jill Thacher, HDC Coordinator/Planner II, Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting and Brenda Acquaviva, Administrative Support Specialist V, Planning and Development Services (3)

**CALL TO ORDER:** Commissioner White called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL:** Quorum satisfied.

**APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:**

Request from Commissioner Bruner (who is not present) to remove Item Number I-1. Staff gave the Commission further information regarding this.

Moved by Commissioner Wineberg, Seconded by Commissioner Henrichs “to approve the agenda as presented.”

**On a Voice Vote – MOTION TO APPROVE - *PASSED - UNANIMOUS***

**A - HEARINGS**

**A-1      510 WEST LIBERTY STREET - OWSHD**

**BACKGROUND:** The 1906 and 1916 Sanborn maps show a 1 ½ story dwelling on the lot at 510 West Liberty, but the lot is vacant on the 1925 Sanborn. The applicant states that the current two-story, cross-gabled house with a wrap-around front porch was built around 1900 and moved to the site in the 1950s. The 1951-52 Polk Directory shows this parcel as vacant. The 1954 directory shows this address as the home of Robert G. Vorce, a driver for Radio Cab.

**LOCATION:** The property is located on the north side of West Liberty, west of Third Street and east of Murray Avenue.

**APPLICATION:** The applicants are applying to:

- a) add a second floor to the current one-story rear addition and add a shallow two-story addition behind that, all to be clad in cedar or fiber-cement siding with 4” exposure;
- b) remove or replace all windows on the current addition with new white Andersen vinyl clad awnings, casements, and double-hungs with interior removable grilles;
- c) add a rear deck of synthetic or treated-wood with a white metal rail and a wood overhead pergola/trellis;
- d) add an exterior basement access stair with a white metal rail;

- 52
- 53 e) remove a concrete block chimney;
- 54
- 55 f) replace an existing kitchen window with a garden window that projects nine inches in
- 56 the same opening;
- 57
- 58 g) remove the existing aluminum siding and restore/replace the underlying wood siding as
- 59 necessary;
- 60
- 61 h) remove existing aluminum siding from a non-original chimney and replace it with 4”
- 62 exposure lap siding;
- 63
- 64 i) replace a non-original attic window on the front elevation with the original window (found
- 65 stored in attic);
- 66
- 67 j) enclose the notched-out southwest corner of the front porch on the first floor and relocate
- 68 a front-facing window to the west elevation of the new enclosure;
- 69
- 70 k) replace the existing 60” wide front porch steps with a narrower set of wood steps
- 71 (approximately 42”); and l) add a 1 1/2” steel pipe handrail on both sides of the front steps.
- 72

### 73 STAFF FINDINGS:

- 74
- 75 1. The existing rear addition is non-original and does not contribute to the historic character of
- 76 the house. Generally speaking, the rear alterations proposed, including new and relocated
- 77 windows, siding, additional square footage, and a deck with pergola are appropriate and
- 78 designed in such a manner that they are distinguished from the original house (through
- 79 step-backs and a compatible contemporary design) and could be removed in the future.
- 80 The second story addition will not obscure or eliminate any character defining features of
- 81 the rear elevation of the house, and the neighborhood setting and lot are spacious enough
- 82 to accommodate the modifications.
- 83
- 84 2. An exterior basement stair would be located along the rear of the new addition, with 8”
- 85 poured concrete walls and a 36” tall white metal rail to match the deck. There is existing
- 86 basement access from the kitchen that is not proposed to be modified.
- 87
- 88 3. The proposed garden window is an inappropriate design for the original portion of the
- 89 house because of its nine inch projection from the wall.
- 90
- 91 4. The various repairs noted on the plans, the removal of the aluminum siding and repair of
- 92 the underlying wood siding, and replacement of the original attic window are appropriate
- 93 and commendable.
- 94
- 95 5. The front porch of this house is one of its most character-defining features. The notched
- 96 southwest corner of the first floor and southeast corner of the second floor are distinctive to
- 97 this house. Enclosing the first floor corner and relocating its window would result in a
- 98 permanent loss of historic character.
- 99
- 100 6. The proposed front steps are an appropriate design and width. The current steps are
- 101 placed in relationship to the front door and porch columns. The proposed pipe handrail is
- 102 minimal and should not confuse the historic record.
- 103

HDC – January 10, 2008.

- 3 -

**Owner/ Address:** Lynn Hilkene, 510 West Liberty, Ann Arbor, MI 48103

**Applicant:** Frederick H. Herrmann Associates, Inc., 310 Depot Street, Ann Arbor, MI 48103

**Review Committee:** Commissioners Henrichs and Glusac visited the site.

Commissioner Henrichs – Agrees with staff report and recommendations. The existing rear addition is in keeping with the scale and mass of the neighborhood, and appears to possibly have had some windows switched and/or modified and may be out of scale. We may want to discuss the trellis. Some of the trim on the addition is mismatched, but appears to be fifty years old or more. I would agree with staff that we shouldn't allow the kitchen bay window and infill.

Commissioner Glusac – Also concurs with the staff findings. The elements proposed for the infill piece around the west side of the porch and the window box would not be appropriate – it would just interfere with the historical elements of the house. The scale of the addition is appropriate.

**Applicant Presentation:** Mr. Frederick H. Herrmann was present to speak on behalf of the application. The one outstanding issue most important to the owner is the garden window which would allow additional light. He elaborated on the investigation they had conducted on the current window, its placing and what may have existed in the house previously. There are no existing closets on the first floor of the home, and a closet near the door is an important issue.

**Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:**

Commissioner Wineberg – Is there a railing proposed for the front porch, or just handrails? (B. Bona – Architect – No, just handrails. It's so close to grade that the railing is not required.)

**Audience Participation:** None.

**Discussion by the Commission:**

**MOTION (as amended per discussion that follows):**

Moved by Commissioner Glusac, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg, “**that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the portions of the application at 510 West Liberty Street in the Old West Side Historic District to:**

1. Add a second floor to the current one-story rear addition; and
2. Add a shallow two-story addition behind that;
3. Modify the windows on the additions;
4. Add a rear deck and pergola/trellis;
5. Add an exterior basement access stair;
6. Remove a concrete block chimney;
7. Remove the existing aluminum siding and restore/replace the underlying wood siding as necessary;
8. Remove existing aluminum siding from a non-original chimney and replace it with 4" exposure lap siding;
9. Replace a non-original attic window on the front elevation with the original window;
10. Replace the 60" wide front porch steps with a narrower set of wood steps; and
11. Add a 1 1/2" steel pipe handrail on both sides of the front steps, provided the following conditions are met:

HDC – January 10, 2008.

- 4 -

- 156  
157       **a) that the proposed garden window not be installed;**  
158       **b) the northwest corner of the porch is not enclosed; and**  
159       **c) the window from the west end of the front elevation (first floor) is not relocated and**  
160       **remains in place.**

161  
162       **Provided the above conditions are met, the work is generally compatible in exterior**  
163       **design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the**  
164       **surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation***  
165       **standards 2, 5, 6, 9, and 10."**

166  
167       ***(Discussion by the Commission on the windows and mullions.)***

168  
169       Commissioner Wineberg - Wants to delete the garden window and vote on it separately. You  
170       can't see it because of the bay window.

171  
172       Commissioner Glusac – Would support another window that doesn't protrude.

173  
174       Commissioner Henrichs – Window doesn't fit the character of the house.

175  
176       *(Discussion on the windows – Number of panes (looks 'busy'), existing homes from that area*  
177       *didn't have those panes.)*

178  
179       **MOTION TO AMEND**

180  
181       Moved by Commissioner Glusac, Seconded by Commissioner Henrichs, **"to remove the 3 fixed**  
182       **windows above the proposed trellis on the North Elevation"**.

183  
184       **On a Voice Vote – Motion to Amend – PASSED - UNANIMOUSLY**

185  
186       **Vote on ORIGINAL MOTION as AMENDED:**

187  
188       **On a Voice Vote – MOTION AS AMENDED - PASSED – UNANIMOUS**  
189       ***(Application Approved)***

190  
191  
192       **B - OLD BUSINESS – None.**

193  
194       **C - NEW BUSINESS –**

195  
196       **C-1 Recognition of Susan Wineberg's contributions to the Commission.**

197  
198  
199       Commissioner White read a proclamation for Commissioner Susan Wineberg for her services to  
200       the Commission and the community. Ms. Wineberg has served two three-year terms.

201  
202       **C-2 Discussion on 2008 Retreat Date.**

203  
204       Coordinator – Presented tentative dates and locations for this years' retreat.

156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207

HDC – January 10, 2008.

- 5 -

208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259

**Items for Discussion:**

Video – “Defensible Decision Making”  
Parliamentary Procedure – Training with Parliamentarian Pat Austin.  
Photo’s – before and after work that has come to the Commission in the last year.  
By-Laws – Annual Review.

**AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION – GENERAL**

Ellen Ramsberg – She stated that she is joining the Commission next month, filling Commissioner Wineberg’s seat. She commended Commissioner Wineberg on her contributions to Historic Preservation. She also expressed concern regarding seven houses on 5<sup>th</sup> street from William to Jefferson the may be slated for demolition – three of those houses were originally in the Historic Properties District (which is no longer in effect.) This is a possible great loss to us all.

**D - APPROVAL OF MINUTES –**

**D-1 Draft Minutes of the December 13, 2007 Regular Session –**

**MOTION**

Moved by Commissioner Wineberg, Seconded by Commissioner Giannola, **“that the Minutes of the December 13, 2007 Regular Session be accepted as presented.”**

**On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED - UNANIMOUS**

**E - REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

**PRESERVATION ALLIANCE MEETING -**

Commissioner Wineberg – Reported on a meeting that the Preservation Alliance group had regarding homes on Fifth Avenue (not Fifth Street - just south of the public library.) Nine Houses in all, seven will be demolished for an urban looking apartment building built right up to the sidewalk). These houses are no longer protected as the district was overturned on September 11, 2001. This will be on the Planning Commission Agenda on the 15<sup>th</sup>.

The Commission also discussed the proposed new hotel at Division and Washington (formerly called “Metro 202”.) Just to the west of it are several historic buildings owned and restored by Peter Heyden. They’re on the National and State Register. This is a controversial issue that was a Planned Unit Development. Our group is opposing this project as well. She invited everyone to join the Preservation Alliance.

**F - ASSIGNMENTS –**

**Monitor:**

510 West Liberty Street - Commissioner Glusac

*Commissioner Wineberg discussed with staff how her outstanding monitoring reports will be handled.*

HDC – January 10, 2008.

- 6 -

260  
261 Review Committee – For the February 11, 2008 Regular Session – Commissioner's  
262 Henrichs and White will meet Coordinator J. Thacher on Monday, February 8, 2008, tentatively at  
263 4:00 p.m.

264  
265 **G – STAFF ACTIVITIES REPORT**

266  
267 **G-1 Staff Activities Report – December 2007 –**

268  
269 There were 17 total applications; 16 of those or 94 percent were approved – 12 were reviewed  
270 by staff and 5 were heard by the HDC with 1 denial.

271  
272 Coordinator – Stated that the State Historic Preservation Office has notified us that a decision  
273 made by the HDC earlier this year is being appealed (207 West Jefferson – A non-approved  
274 egress window installed also without permits.)

275  
276 Went to Detroit to testify regarding this, making the record and historic preservation. We don't  
277 expect any information from the judge for about a month. The petitioner has two weeks following  
278 that to file his briefs concerning this issue. The judge will then look at this issue and his opinion  
279 will then be forwarded to SHPO in Lansing

280  
281 **H - CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS – None.**

282  
283  
284 **J - COMMUNICATIONS – None.**

285  
286 *The Meeting was adjourned at 8:05 p.m. without objection.*

287  
288 **SUBMITTED BY: Brenda Acquaviva, Administrative Service Specialist V, Planning and**  
289 **Development Services.**