

# **City of Ann Arbor**

*301 E. Huron Street  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>*



## **Meeting Minutes - Final**

**Thursday, October 10, 2019**

**7:00 PM**

**Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council  
Chambers**

**Historic District Commission**

**A      CALL TO ORDER**

*Chair John Beeson called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.*

**B      ROLL CALL**

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.*

**Present:** 6 - Robert White, John Beeson, Evan Hall, David Rochlen, Anna Epperson, and Jessica Quijano

**C      APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

**The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

**D      AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

**E      UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

**F      HEARINGS**

**F-1      19-1912      HDC19-158; 614 Second St; Single-Story Addition; OWSHD**

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners Anna Epperson and Dave Rochlin visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Applicants were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the**

application at 614 Second to remove a portion of the one-story wing on the back of the house and replace it with a new, wider one-story wing with an expanded roof deck, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, Residential Additions, and New Construction, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Setting, Building Site, and Windows.

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

**Nays:** 0

**F-2**      **19-1913**      HDC19-179; 415 W William St; Install Front Yard Generator; OWSHD

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

*REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:*

*Commissioners Anna Epperson and Dave Rochlin visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*PUBLIC HEARING:*

*Applicants were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Evan hall, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 415 West William Street, a contributing structure in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a generator and screening in front of the east side addition of the house, on the conditions: the screening walls obscure the unit but do not exceed the height of the windowsill on the northeast sides. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the amended motion carried. Vote: 6-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

**Nays:** 0

**F-3**      [19-1914](#)      HDC19-180; 515 W Madison St; Single-Story Addition; OWSHD

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

*REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:*

*Commissioners Anna Epperson and Dave Rochlin visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*PUBLIC HEARING:*

*Applicants were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Anna Epperson, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 515 W Madison Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a 374 square foot rear addition, rebuild the garage, and install a boulder retaining wall, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, Residential Additions, and New Construction, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Setting, and Building Site.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

**Nays:** 0

**F-4**      **19-1915**      HDC19-181; 204 Koch Ave; Second-Story Addition; OWSHD

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

*REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:*

*Commissioners Anna Epperson and Dave Rochlin visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*PUBLIC HEARING:*

*Applicants were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by David Rochlen, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 204 Koch Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add 363 square feet to an existing rear addition, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, Residential Additions, and New Construction, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Setting, Building Site, and Windows.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**Moved by Bob White, seconded by Dave Rochlen, that the application be Postponed until the November, 2019 HDC meeting. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

**Item Postponed**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

**Nays:** 0

**G      NEW BUSINESS**

**G-1      19-1917      Annual Election**

*Commissioner White provided the Nominating Report.*

**Moved by Bob White, seconded by John Beeson, that Evan Hall be**

elected to the position Historic District Commission Chairperson, and

that Anna Epperson be elected to the position of Historic District Commission Vice Chairperson, and

that Dave Rochlen be elected to the position of the Historic District Commission Secretary.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

**Nays:** 0

**G-2**      **19-1918**      Support for Historic Preservation Tax Credits

*Jill Thacher, City Planner/Historic Preservation Coordinator explained two bills (in the Michigan Senate and House of Representatives) were introduced earlier in 2019 to reinstate the Michigan historic preservation tax credits.*

*Chair Beeson read the Resolution before the Commission.*

**Ann Arbor Historic District Commission**

**A Resolution in Support of the Reinstatement of State Historic Tax Credits Senate Bill 54/ House Bill 4100**

**WHEREAS, the historic buildings, neighborhoods and places in Michigan villages, towns and cities distinguish each community and provide character and a sense of place that contribute significantly to the quality of life and the economic benefits enjoyed in and by each community; and**

**WHEREAS, the preservation and rehabilitation of historic buildings, places and neighborhoods contributes to the beauty, character, and economic vitality of Michigan communities; and,**

**WHEREAS, the labor-intensive nature of historic rehabilitation creates jobs and investment in local businesses and has been proven to generate more economic activity than equivalent investment in new construction; and**

**WHEREAS, demolition or destruction of historic buildings creates costs to Michigan and its communities by destroying the often-irreplaceable construction and ornamental materials of each structure and by adding significantly to landfills, whose makeup is estimated to be more than 40 percent building materials and waste; and**

**WHEREAS, development and redevelopment within established villages, townships and cities is encouraged by Governor Whitmer; and**

**WHEREAS, many public policies and financial and lending practices and policies create disincentives or barriers to the preservation, renovation and rehabilitation of historic buildings and resources and create a preferential financial environment for new construction; and**

**WHEREAS, Michigan has measured the economic impacts of the former Michigan Historic Tax Credit programs between their enactment in 1999 and their elimination in 2011 and seen significant positive direct impacts on the revitalization of neighborhoods and communities, the preservation and creation of affordable and market-rate housing, the creation of skilled local jobs, and the subsequent private investment in areas surrounding tax-credit-driven revitalization projects; and**

**WHEREAS, each \$1.00 of credit issued leverages \$11.37 in direct economic impact, such that the former Michigan Historic Tax Credit programs during their twelve-year history have leveraged \$251 million in Federal historic tax credits that otherwise would not have returned to Michigan, spurred \$1.46 billion in direct rehabilitation activity, and created 36,000 jobs; and**

**WHEREAS, the Michigan Legislature is presently considering Senate Bill 54 and House Bill 4100 that would reinstate an up-to-25 percent investment tax credit for owners of historic residential and commercial properties who substantially rehabilitate their properties;**

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission endorses and supports both Senate Bill 54 and House Bill 4100 and calls upon the Michigan Legislature to pass this**



important legislation and Governor Whitmer to sign it, in order to stimulate appropriate development and redevelopment and protect the historic character and quality of life of our communities.

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT a copy of this Resolution be forwarded to the Michigan Historic Preservation Network.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**The Commission unanimously approved the Resolution in Support of Historic Preservation Tax Credits. Vote: 6-0**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

**Nays:** 0

- G-3**      [19-1919](#)      City Council FY2021 Policy Agenda

**Received and Filed**

- G-4**      [19-1920](#)      Approval of Revised FY2019-2020 Meeting Schedule

*Jill Thacher, City Planner/Historic Preservation Coordinator, noted the change was due to Veterans Day, pushing the Review Committee Site Visits to the following Tuesday, November 12, 2019.*

**The Revised FY2019-2010 Meeting Schedule was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

**H**      **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

- H-1**      [19-1921](#)      Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes of September 12, 2019

**The September 12th, 2019 HDC meeting minutes were unanimously Approved with corrections.**

**I      REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

**J      ASSIGNMENTS**

**Review Committee: Tuesday, November 12, 2019 at Noon for the November 14, 2019 Regular Meeting**

*Bob White and John Beeson volunteered for the November HDC Review Committee, meeting at noon.*

**K      REPORTS FROM STAFF**

**19-1922**    September 2019 HDC Staff Activities

**Received and Filed**

**L      CONCERNS OF COMMISSION**

**M      COMMUNICATIONS**

**19-1923**    Various Communications to the HDC

**Received and Filed**

**Jill Thacher explained she is working with City Staff on design guidelines for up and coming small cell wireless towers/posts.**

**John Beeson and possibly Bob White noted they would be interested in attending the Center of the City Task Force meetings.**

**N      ADJOURNMENT**

**The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:45 p.m.**

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

John Beeson, Chair  
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner  
mg/