



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, June 8, 2017

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Bushkuhl called the meeting to order at 7:02 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 4 - Robert White, Benjamin L. Bushkuhl, Max Cope, and David Rochlen

Absent: 3 - John Beeson, Evan Hall, and Anna Epperson

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

None

E **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

None

F **HEARINGS**

F-1 **[17-0890](#)** HDC17-095; 717 W Huron Street - Enclose porch - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Cope and White visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Terri Marra, 717 West Huron Street, Ann Arbor, owner and applicant, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 717 West Huron Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to enclose the east side porch using clad windows and siding as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions and District or Neighborhood Setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Epperson

F-2 [17-0891](#) HDC17-094; 611 E William Street - Barrier Free Ramp - SSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Cope and White visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Barton Bryant, Redeemer of Ann Arbor, 7500 Brookville Road, Plymouth, co-applicant and owner, and Larry Cooper, Cooper Design, Architect working on the project were present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 611 East William Street, a contributing property in the Division Street Historic District, to install a new barrier-free lift in front of the building; and temporarily remove then reinstall a portion of the far east section of the courtyard wall and building foundation. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 1, 9 and 10, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for Barrier Free Accommodations.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Epperson

F-3 [17-0892](#) HDC17-096; 219 Crest - Rear Deck - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Cope and White visited the site as part of their review.

They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Sheri Osher, 219 Crest Avenue, Ann Arbor, owner and applicant, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Rochlen, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 219 Crest Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a wood or composite deck off the rear addition of the house as detailed in the applicant's submittal. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, material, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for Decks and Patios.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Epperson

F-4 [17-0893](#) HDC17-097; 508 Third Street - Rear Addition -- OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Cope and White visited the site as part of their review.

They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Larry and Katherine Bates, 5234 Echo Road, Bloomfield Hills, owners and applicants, were present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Rochlen, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 508 Third Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a one-story rear addition; add a 12' x 12' brick patio; remove two non-original windows on a rear addition and replace them with two windows in close proximity; replace a non-original window and door on the second-floor rear elevation with a centered French door; replace a non-original window in the original opening on the first-floor north elevation with a shorter window; replace a non-original second-story window on the south elevation with a shorter window; and replace the chain link fence with a black aluminum picket fence, on the condition that an additional Certificate of Appropriateness is obtained from staff for the height and design of the fence. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, architectural details, and residential patios, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Setting, and Windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Epperson

F-5 [17-0894](#) HDC17-098; 203 E Washington - Business Sign - MSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Cope and White visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

WAP Jon, 920 Catherine Street, Ann Arbor, applicant, was present to explain the application, show lighting colors, and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 203 East Washington in the Main Street Historic District to install new business signs and awnings as proposed. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for signs and lighting, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Vote on Signage:

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Epperson

Moved by Cope, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 203 East Washington in the Main Street Historic District to install 6 LED accent lights as discussed at the meeting, on the condition that all installation and new penetrations for hookup are done through mortar joints, not masonry units or stone. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for signs and lighting, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.

Vote on LED Lighting:

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Epperson

G NEW BUSINESS

G-1 **17-0897** HDC17-099; 514 W Madison - Historic Marker Request - OWSHD
Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Cope and White visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

M E M O R A N D U M

To: Historic District Commissioners

From: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

Date: June 8, 2017

Re: Historic Plaque for 514 W Madison Street

This month staff received one application for a historic building plaque for the house at 514 W Madison Street, between Third and Fourth Streets. This brick, two-story, mansard-roofed home appears in the 1894 and 1897 Polk City Directories with no named occupant, and in 1898 as the home of Emily and John Bonien, a laborer. Their last name is listed later as Bonnin (1910) and eventually, in 1920, as Bonin (at which point John is listed as the “assistant in charge of surveying instrument room, U of M”). It features a full-width front porch with a shallow mansard roof that is adorned with arrow and round wood shingles (arranged to form two rows of full circles). The base of the porch is rusticated block and the decking and stairs are poured concrete. The one-over-one double-hung windows are topped with shallow brick arches. The front and side elevations of the mansard roof feature small dormer windows with stylized pediments.

On May 11, 2012 a fire caused extensive burn damage to the second floor and attic, and smoke and water damage throughout the house. The former owner worked with staff for four years to accurately and sensitively repair exterior damage to the house, as well as to restore a number of original finishes and features of the house that had been modified or obscured over the years. In 2015 the HDC approved an application to install a third floor, rear-facing dormer for egress and to shorten a kitchen window. It is in the National Register Old West Side Historic District.

The Historic District Commission will consider all of the following when reviewing an application for a historic property plaque.

- a) The building must be at least fifty years old, as documented by a combination of records (title search, tax records, wills, etc.).*

b) *The building must have been maintained, over time, in its original condition, or must have undergone historically appropriate restoration or rehabilitation.*

c) *The building may not have historically inappropriate features, enclosures or repairs.*

d) *The principal facades of the building visible from the street or any public right of way must maintain integrity of form, materials, and architectural features consistent with the dominant period of the building.*

The house is 119 years old. It has maintained its historic integrity and has had no significant exterior changes. The current owners have installed a missing front porch column, which was the last piece of restoration work left over from the fire. The lack of alteration to the house is critical to understanding the architectural significance of the home. Its mansard style is rare in the Old West Side, and it is a lovely record of a moment in Ann Arbor's history.

The current owners, Zachary Moen & Shannon Fitzsimons, have supplied extensive and much appreciated deed research that is attached. Staff feels that a historic plaque is appropriate for the John & Emily Bonien House, located at 514 West Madison Street, based on the age of the house, the house's history, and the unaltered or restored appearance of its character-defining architectural features. Staff recommends adding circa to the date, since records do not reveal exactly when the Boniens moved in, though it was not later than 1898.

Moved by Cope, seconded by White, that the circa 1898 John & Emily Bonien House at 514 West Madison Street meets the criteria for a City of Ann Arbor Historic Building marker based on its age, historic and architectural significance, and contribution to the history of Ann Arbor.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Yeas: 4 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Epperson

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1 [17-0895](#) Minutes of the April 20th, 2017, HDC Meeting

The minutes were unanimously postponed to the next HDC meeting. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

H-2 [17-0896](#) Minutes of the May 11th, 2017, HDC Meeting

The minutes were unanimously postponed to the next HDC meeting. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

I **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

J **ASSIGNMENTS**

Review Committee: Monday, July 10, 2017, at 5pm for the July 13, 2017 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Bushkuhl volunteered for the July HDC Review Committee.

White commented that he needed to check his schedule and might be able to volunteer for the Review Committee.

Thacher noted that she could also check with Hall if he could make it.

K **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

L **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

M **COMMUNICATIONS**

[17-0899](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:20 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx
- Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

Ben Bushkuhl, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
mg/