



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Thursday, December 8, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Bushkuhl called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Staff Present: Historic Preservation Coordinator, Jill Thacher

Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 6 - Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, Benjamin L. Bushkuhl,
John Beeson, Evan Hall, and Max Cope

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

*The agenda was unanimously approved as presented with additions
under Item H.*

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

No speakers.

E **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

F **HEARINGS**

F-1 **16-1713** HDC16-282; 217 Third Street - Add Two Dormers - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

*Commissioners Ramsburgh and Beeson visited the site as part of their
review.*

Ramsburgh noted that the staff report is very clear and they reviewed all the items outlined during their site visit. She reported that the windows on the bump-out are clearly not original, and due to some piecing of the siding it was not clear what had been there earlier, but she believed the proposed window would be an appropriate solution. She said the dormers proposed for the rear part of the house will be nicely tucked in behind the front part of the house, adding that the chimney has no character defining elements, so its' removal is appropriate.

Beeson agreed with Ramsburgh, adding that they looked at other houses in the neighborhood, and the subject house will be in concert in scale with the other houses in the surrounding area, and the ramp will not easily be seen or be detracting from the resource in the slightest.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Martha MacKenzie, 1105 Chestnut Street, Ann Arbor, owner, and Richard Beeder, 217 Third Street, resident, were present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 217 Third Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct two shed dormers on the rear wing of the house, remove the chimney, remove a non-original window and patch the opening with siding, enlarge a window opening, add a new window in a new opening, replace a back door, and add a ramp along the south side of the house. The work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for roofs and windows, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for roofs, windows, porches, and neighborhood.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Cope

Nays: 0

F-2 [16-1714](#) HDC16-283; 521 Fifth Street - New Garage - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and Beeson visited the site as part of their review.

Beeson reported that the two walnut trees and the house itself are big features of the this typical Old West Side parcel. He was glad to see that the proposed garage would be sensitive to the two existing trees. He said during their site visit they tried to look at neighboring garages in the neighborhood and noted that they are one to one and a quarter stories and not that large. Beeson reported that there was a grade change also on the site, with the grade dropping off towards the neighbor's yard. He said the neighboring house on the north might see this garage as having a looming effect while the neighbors on the south side, where it steps back might not see it in that same way.

Ramsburgh added that the proposed garage would be better lined up, as most of the garages in the neighborhood are, and the proposed location is the most sensitive to the existing two trees.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Richard and Jinx Cooke, 521 Fifth Street, Ann Arbor, owners, were present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Marc Rueter, 515 Fifth Street, Ann Arbor, Architect for the project was also present to explain the project.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 521 Fifth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to demolish a non-contributing garage and construct a carport/garage. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site and neighborhood, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to residential accessory structures.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Cope

Nays: 0

F-3 [16-1715](#) HDC16-284; 444 Fifth Street - New Garage - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and Beeson visited the site as part of their review.

Ramsburgh read from the included report from Lorri D. Sipes, Preservation Architect, regarding the verification of the age of the existing garage on site, so the application can meet the guidelines.

Beeson agreed, adding that Lorri Sipes letter is definitively helpful in getting the facts about the garage and old foundations and how materials were used resourcefully when they built the current garage.

PUBLIC HEARING:

John Hostetler, 444 Fifth Street, Ann Arbor, owner, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 444 Fifth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to demolish a non-contributing garage and construct a new garage. The work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to residential accessory structures.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Cope

Nays: 0

F-4 **16-1716** HDC16-238; 221 Buena Vista Avenue - New Garage - OWSHD

Beeson recused himself from the hearing, and left the Council Chambers.

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and Beeson visited the site as part of their

review.

Ramsburgh reported that the staff report really points to all the aspects that they saw on that site visit day; Slauson School is 20 feet away from the property so there wouldn't be anything detrimental for that side. She said from the street it would look like a 1-car garage and an off-set ridge and the height would be just about the height as the garage that the Commission just approved. She said she looks forward to hearing the discussion since this garage is not typical of the Old West Side but is very contemporary looking and is also in the presence of houses that are not typical gabled houses of the Old West Side.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Lara Brown and John Wakerman, 221 Buena Vista Avenue, Ann Arbor, owners, were present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 221 Buena Vista Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a 19' x 20' workshop as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to residential accessory structures.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Cope

Nays: 0

Beeson was called to return to the meeting.

G **NEW BUSINESS**

G-1 **16-1717** HDC16-281; 1137 Traver Street- Historic Building Marker - BHD

This month staff received one application for a historic building plaque for the house at 1137 Traver. The Charles and Linda Waite House was constructed circa 1860 and is a contributing structure in the Broadway Historic District. The survey card and an article about the house that appeared in the winter 2015 Washtenaw County Historical Society Newsletter are attached to the application. The upright-and-wing house features a full-width front porch with Italianate brackets, wide board trim in the eaves, one-over-one windows, and a side wing with its own front porch. The side and rear walls, and the wing, are stucco.

The Historic District Commission will consider all of the following when reviewing an application for a historic property plaque.

- a) The building must be at least fifty years old, as documented by a combination of records (title search, tax records, wills, etc.).*
- b) The building must have been maintained, over time, in its original condition, or must have undergone historically appropriate restoration or rehabilitation.*
- c) The building may not have historically inappropriate features, enclosures or repairs.*
- d) The principal facades of the building visible from the street or any public right of way must maintain integrity of form, materials, and architectural features consistent with the dominant period of the building.*

The owner has done significant work on the house to restore the front façade, and intends to continue work on the rest of the house as his budget allows. The largest visual improvement was the removal of aluminum siding on the upper half of the front façade and the removal of stucco and installation of new wood siding on the lower half. The owner undertook substantial investigative work before beginning, and made framing repairs to the corner posts and other repairs as necessary. Comparing the survey photo to today's front façade shows the very positive results of these efforts. Staff's only slight concern is that the two street-facing doors are not appropriate for the house, but these are easily remedied and staff has every confidence that these will be on the list of future work.

Jill Thacher requested the agenda item to be postponed until January to allow the Review Committee to visit the site. She explained that they had run out of time, on their last tour and apologized to the applicant and homeowners.

A motion was made that the Hearing be Postponed until the next HDC meeting.

On a voice vote the item was unanimously approved.

Yeas: 6 - White, Ramsburgh, Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Cope

Nays: 0

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H [16-1747](#) Minutes of the July 14, 2016 HDC Meeting as Amended

The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission.

H-1 [16-1718](#) Minutes of the August 11, 2016 HDC Meeting

The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission.

I **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

Bushkuhl thanked Commissioner Jennifer Ross for her service on the Historic District Commission; he explained that she has resigned from the Commission.

Thacher explained that she has taken on a new job and moved to Detroit and can therefore no longer be on the Commission, since members must live within the City boundaries. She said Ross will certainly be missed.

Thacher asked the Commission and the public to pass along names of potential or interested Architectural Historians who might be interested in this position on the HDC Commission.

J **ASSIGNMENTS**

**J-1 Review Committee: Monday, January 9, 2017, at Noon for the January 12, 2017
Regular Meeting**

*Commissioners Cope and Beeson volunteered for the January Review
Committee.*

K REPORTS FROM STAFF

K-1 [16-1722](#) November 2016 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

K-2 [16-1723](#) Design Guidelines for Residential Signs

*Thacher provided an update on the guidelines, noting that details are
being reviewed by the City Attorney's office.*

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

M COMMUNICATIONS

M-1 [16-1724](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx
- Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.