



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Planning Commission, City

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Tuesday, March 21, 2017

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>) or on the 1st floor of City Hall on the Friday before the meeting. Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

1 CALL TO ORDER

Chair Ken Clein called the meeting to order at 7:03 p.m.

2 ROLL CALL

Planning Manager Brett Lenart called the roll.

Present 8 - Woods, Briggs, Clein, Milshteyn, Gibb-Randall, Trudeau,
Weatherbee, and Ackerman

Absent 1 - Mills

3 APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Moved by Woods, seconded by Weatherbee to remove Agenda Item 9-a; Hillside Memory Care Site Plan, 312 Glendale from the Agenda, and add the 1/18/2017 and 2/7/2017 CPC Draft Minutes. Passed unanimously on a voice vote.

4 INTRODUCTIONS

5 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

January 18, 2017 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes
 February 7, 2017 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes

The minutes were unanimously postponed to the next meeting. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion passed.

6 REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS

6-a City Council

Councilmember Ackerman reported on the Reinhart Commercial building which was approved by Council. He explained that the Planning Commission Memorandum on Active Uses will advance form bases recommendation from Downtown Premiums. He also reported that the Library Lot will be considered on April 17th.

Ackerman explained that the Hillside Memory Care project had incurred a procedural error and should not have been sent back to the Planning Commission.

6-b Planning Manager

Planning Manager Lenart provided a report on the upcoming Annual CPC Retreat.

6-c Planning Commission Officers and Committees

6-d Written Communications and Petitions

[17-0433](#) Various Correspondences to the City Planning Commission

Received and Filed

7 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)

Ethel Potts, 1014 Elder Blvd., Ann Arbor, said she had received about 50 emails today and she was prepared to speak on the Hillside Memory Care project; she would like to think that the new information has been

heard.

Morgan Penny, 1179 Freesia Court, Ann Arbor, spoke in opposition to the height of the proposed buildings at 1140 Broadway. She said the proposed height of 5-7 stories is too high compared to the surrounding area that is 2-3 stories.

8 PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING

None

9 REGULAR BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item

(If an agenda item is tabled, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a tabled agenda item will appear on a future agenda, please provide your email address on the form provided on the front table at the meeting. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org).)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. The first person who is the official representative of an organized group or who is representing the petitioner may speak for five minutes; additional representatives may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.)

(Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

- 9-a 17-0434 Item Withdrawn - Hillside Memory Care Site Plan for City Council Approval - A proposed 16,743 square foot single-story convalescent and memory care facility on this 2.64-acre site zoned R4B (Multiple-Family Dwelling District) located at 312 Glendale Drive. The facility will have 24 individual single bedrooms with 21 new parking spaces. The two existing houses on the site will remain. (Ward 5) Staff Recommendation: Approval**

Deleted from Agenda.

- 9-b 17-0435 Holiday Inn Express & Suites for City Council Approval - A proposal to demolish the existing building and construct a 64,518 square foot, 4-story hotel building, with 115 surface parking spaces on this 1.38-acre site, zoned O (Office), located at 3853 Research Park Drive. (Ward 4) Staff Recommendation: Approval**

City Planner Chris Cheng provided the staff report. He explained the site is zoned Office [O] and is surrounded by numerous zoning districts. He noted the former building on this site has been demolished. Six (6) landmark trees are on the site, which will be removed. Two (2) bio-retention swales are provided, and the underground stormwater system features infiltration. The proposed 4-story hotel meets all setback requirements and staff recommends approval of the project.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Jimmy Asmar, 3282 Northwestern Highway, Farmington Hills was present and available to answer any questions regarding the proposal.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed unless the item is postponed.

Moved by Woods, seconded by Milshteyn, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Holiday Inn Express & Suites Site Plan.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Ackerman asked for clarification on whether a hotel use is appropriate in an Office district.

Cheng responded that it was permitted.

Ackerman also asked about traffic circulation and sewer system offsets.

Cheng responded that the City's Traffic Engineer has approved the proposed site plan.

Milshetyn asked about the current market for more hotels in the area.

Asmar indicated that the market will support it.

Briggs asked about bike lanes on South State Street.

Cheng responded that he doesn't have a time frame for that review.

Briggs commented that this project doesn't appear to meet any of the sustainability goals of the City. She asked how the City could incentivize sustainability into development, as well as public art, and non-motorized improvements.

Clein asked if the petitioner exceeds State Energy Code perspectives.

Asmar responded that they do consider such measures if they meet a cost benefit perspective.

Robert Carmark, General Contractor for the petitioner, indicated it was a former access to a DTE substation.

Ackerman asked if the petitioner would be willing to share their energy data, to which the petitioner responded they would.

Clein asked about deferred parking spaces, and requested they consider that before it goes to City Council.

Weatherbee supported the potential to defer the trees.

Gibb-Randall indicated that from her lens the type of trees are very critical to consider.

Lenart confirmed the majority of trees being removed are Norway Maples.

Clein asked for the petitioner to consider deferring parking, and asked staff to consider these factors in the future when working through the review process.

On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote: 8-0

Yeas: 8 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Sarah Mills

- 9-c** [17-0436](#) 315-317 South Main Site Plan for City Council Approval - A proposed 32,813 square foot six-story building with ground floor retail and five floors of office space on this 0.19-acre site zoned D1(Downtown Core) with Main

Street Character Overlay District. Four private vehicle parking spaces and four class B bicycle spaces are proposed off the rear alley. The project has received a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic District Commission. (Ward 5) Staff Recommendation: Approval

Cheng provided the staff report. He pointed out the proposed motion should be amended to strike the inclusion of a development agreement, which is not required for this proposed development. Cheng explained that no premiums are being utilized so no parking is required. The ground floor is proposed as retail with office above, including rooftop terraces. Cheng reviewed the elevations as well as photographs of the site as it currently exists. He noted that first flush stormwater detention will be provided in the basement with infiltration.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed unless the item is postponed.

Moved by Milshteyn, Seconded by Weatherbee, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 315-317 South Main Site Plan.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

Ackerman stated that he appreciated the work of the Historic District Commission

Kevin Stansbury, Architect, for the project, estimates approximately 26,000 square feet of office space in the new building.

Ackerman asked if they had an estimate of the price per square foot, and the architect indicated he didn't have that.

Ackerman asked if pedestrian access will be maintained during construction.

Lenart indicated it would be maintained to the greatest extent possible.

Ackerman asked to ensure that Public Service's plans for the alley are considered during this project.

Lenart indicated he would address it in the package that goes to City Council.

Briggs asked about maintenance of parking spaces.

Stansbury indicated it was to provide flexibility.

Clein complimented the arrangement of the doors on Main Street; he asked for clarification of proposed materials.

Stansbury indicated it is brick on the front façade, block or painted block on the broad sides, and clad metal paneling. He said they are proposing a 16 foot first floor height.

Clein asked about energy efficiency standards.

Stansbury indicated approximately 40% of the terrace will be garden, and the building features rooftop mechanicals, with a heat pump that can be controlled by each suite.

Clein asked about waste and recycling.

Stansbury explained the proposed recycling and trash cart plan and storage.

Matthew Bush, Civil Engineer for the project, indicated there will be a total of 16 carts underneath the covered area, emptied 3 times a week.

Clein asked what 'first flush' is and why it's required.

Bush explained that it falls in an impervious area requirement to provide 'first flush', which infiltrates; 'first flush' is the first 1 inch of rainfall, by definition of City ordinance.

Woods asked about utilities.

Stansbury responded that new electrical work to serve the building will be underground.

Woods asked what the new building would see.

Stansbury said there are no windows on the 3-4 stories for fire-rating reasons.

Gibb-Randall asked about the relativity of the Streetscape Manual on the project.

Lenart indicated verification can be done prior to the project being forwarded to City Council.

On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote: 8-0

Yeas: 8 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Sarah Mills

10 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)

Andew Justice, Plymouth Michigan, asked if the Planning Commission is represented by Council and if so which member.

Clein said yes, pointing to Ackerman.

11 COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

Woods asked about the group of students in the audience.

They responded they were from a Planning Law class that requires attendance at a public meeting.

Clein reminded the Commission of the upcoming retreat.

12 ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Weatherbee, to adjourn the meeting at 8:20 p.m. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

Ken Clein, Chair
mg

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Channel 16 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Thursdays at 8:00 AM and Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website (www.a2gov.org).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.