



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes - Draft
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, February 8, 2024

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson David Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, February 8, 2024, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll

Present: 6 - Chair David Rochlen, Jessica Quijano, Kathryn Fortener, Benjamin Calderon, Chip Smith, and Steve Kaplan

Absent: 1 - Jennifer Ross

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Seeing no speakers Chair Rochlen closed the Public Comment.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

F. HEARINGS

F-1. [24-0149](#) HDC23-0227; 402 Second Street, Small Upper Addition, OWSHD

Attachments: 402 Second Street Staff Report with Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners David Rochlen and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present via Zoom to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Quijano seconded by Commissioner Smith that:

The Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 402 Second, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a 129 square foot second floor bathroom addition on top of an existing single-story rear wing; infill

a door opening on a post-1948 addition; and add a 6" x 6" vent on the south elevation. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions and roofs, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, residential additions, and roofs.

On a roll call vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. **Vote 6-0.**

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-2. [24-0150](#) HDC24-0001; 552 Fifth Street, Solar Panels, OWSHD

Attachments: 552 Fifth Street Staff Report with Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners David Rochlen and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was not present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Smith seconded by Commissioner Quijano that:

The Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 552 Fifth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a blackon-black solar array, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for roofs, energy efficiency, and mechanical systems, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to solar installations.

On a roll call vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 6-0.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-3. [24-0151](#) HDC24-0004; 1034 West Liberty, Rear Addition, OWSHD

Attachments: 1034 West Liberty Staff Report with Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners David Rochlen and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present via Zoom to respond to the Commission’s enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Fortener seconded by Commissioner Quijano that:

The Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1034 West Liberty, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a two-story rear addition with three skylights, a walkout basement, and a rear deck. Application is amended to specify that the rear railings will be vertical composite, that the shingles on the second story of the addition will be composite and that the roof line of the addition will be at least eight inches below the existing roof line of the rear gable. As proposed and amended, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions and roofs, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, residential additions, and roofs.

On a roll call vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried as amended. Vote 6-0.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-4. [24-0152](#) HDC24-0005; 805 Third, Rear Addition, OWSHD

Attachments: 805 Third Street Staff Report with Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners David Rochlen and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part

of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission’s enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Fortener seconded by Commissioner Calderon that:

The Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 805 Third Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove a rear deck and construct a single-story addition with a walkout basement and four skylights. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions and roofs, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, residential additions, and roofs.

On a roll call vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 6-0.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-5. [24-0153](#) HDC24-0006; 548 S First, Rear Addition, OWSHD

Attachments: 548 S First Staff Report with Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the

staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners David Rochlen and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission’s enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Quijano seconded by Commissioner Kaplan that:

The Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 548 South First Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add 199 square foot rear addition. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions and roofs, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, residential additions, and roofs.

On a roll call vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 6-0.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

G. NEW BUSINESS

None.

H. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

H-1. [24-0154](#) December 14, 2023 HDC Meeting Minutes

Attachments: December 14, 2023 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes.pdf

The December 14, 2023 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

I. **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

None.

J. **ASSIGNMENTS**

J-1. [24-0155](#) Review Committee: Monday, March 11, 2024 at noon, for the Thursday, March 14, 2024 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and Steve Kaplan volunteered for the Monday, March 11, 2024 HDC Review Committee.

K. **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

K-1. [24-0187](#) 2024 Historic District Commission Retreat

Historic District Coordinator Jill Thacher discussed choosing a date for the 2024 Historic District Committee Retreat. Saturday, April 27, 2024 was selected as a tentative date and will be revisited at the March 14, 2024 meeting.

L. **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

Commissioner Kaplan brought up a question regarding window placement on the 805 Third Street petition.

Commissioner Quijano noted the March 15, 2024 HDC meeting will be her last.

M. **COMMUNICATIONS**

M-1. [24-0156](#) Various Communication to the HDC

None.

N. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:15 pm

David Rochlen, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Courtney Manor, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.