



# City of Ann Arbor

## Formal Minutes

### Planning Commission, City

301 E. Huron St.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/  
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

---

Tuesday, April 18, 2017

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second  
floor, City Council Chambers

---

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: [cityclerk@a2gov.org](mailto:cityclerk@a2gov.org); or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>) or on the 1st floor of City Hall on the Friday before the meeting. Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

#### **1 CALL TO ORDER**

*Chairperson Ken Clein called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.*

#### **2 ROLL CALL**

*Planning Manager, Brett Lenart, called the roll.*

**Present** 8 - Woods, Briggs, Clein, Mills, Gibb-Randall, Trudeau,  
Weatherbee, and Ackerman

**Absent** 1 - Milshteyn

#### **3 APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

**Moved by Commissioner Weatherbee, seconded by Commissioner Woods to approve the Agenda as presented. Approved unanimously.**

#### **4 INTRODUCTIONS**

*None*

#### **5 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

5-a      [17-0543](#)      City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of January 18, 2017

**Attachments:**      1-18-2017 CPC Minutes with Live Links.pdf

**Moved by Commissioner Sarah Mills, seconded by Commissioner Eric Briggs to approve the minutes and forward to City Council. Approved unanimously.**

5-b      [17-0544](#)      City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of February 7, 2017

**Attachments:**      2-7-2017 CPC Minutes with Live Links.pdf

**Moved by Commissioner Sarah Mills, seconded by Commissioner Eric Briggs to approve the minutes and forward to City Council. Approved unanimously.**

**6      REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS**

6-a      **City Council**

*Councilmember Zach Ackerman reported that at last night’s City Council meeting, they had voted to approve the sale of the air rights of the Library lot parking structure with a 5-3 vote. Council had also placed a 180-day moratorium on all ground mounted solar panels in the front open space.*

6-b      **Planning Manager**

*Planning Manager Brett Lenart said he is anticipating a few other projects to come before the Council in the next month. Lenart stated that the Joint Council/Planning Commission meeting is tentatively scheduled for June 12th to get an update on the Allen Creek Greenway Master Plan.*

6-c      **Planning Commission Officers and Committees**

*Mills reported that tomorrow at 8:30 a.m. there would be an Allen Creek Citizen Advisory Committee meeting in Council Chambers.*

*Clein reported that the Ordinance Revisions Committee would be meeting in April.*

*Ackerman reported that Council has nominated its’ body for the*

*Affordable Housing Joint Committee and Human Services Advisory Board, whom will be scheduling their first meeting shortly.*

**6-d Written Communications and Petitions**

**17-0545** Various Correspondences to the City Planning Commission

**Attachments:** Newspaper Notice of Proposed Land Division.pdf, Email from Appleyard.pdf, Email from Barber.pdf, Email from Chobanian.pdf, Email from Cooper.pdf, Email from Keane.pdf, Email from Kennard.pdf, Email from Kerr.pdf, Email from Koral.pdf, Email from Lucas.pdf, Email from MacDonald.pdf, Email from Munson.pdf, Email from Pointer.pdf, Email from Stoll.pdf, Email from Vanderploeg.pdf, Email from Vanderploeg2.pdf, Email from Zaiantz .pdf, Emails between Godfrey and City.pdf

*Clein drew the Commission’s attention to the various email communications in the packet.*

**Received and Filed**

**7 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)**

**8 PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING**

**17-0546** Public Hearings Scheduled for the May 2, 2017 City Planning Commission Meeting

**Attachments:** 5-2-2017 Public Hearing Notice as Published.pdf

*Lenart read the Public Hearing notice as published.*

**Received and Filed**

**9 REGULAR BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item**

(If an agenda item is tabled, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a tabled agenda item will appear on a future agenda, please provide your email address on the form provided on the front table at the meeting. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website ([www.a2gov.org](http://www.a2gov.org).)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. The first person who is the official representative of an organized group or who is representing the petitioner may speak for five minutes; additional representatives may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.)

(Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

- 9-a      [17-0547](#)      Maxey Annexation & Zoning (2955 & 2965 Kimberley Road) for City Council Approval - A proposal to annex these 0.15-acre and 0.19-acre parcels from Pittsfield Township and zone them R1C (Single-Family Dwelling). (Ward 3) Staff Recommendation: Approval

**Attachments:**      2955 & 2965 Kimberley Road-Maxey A&Z Staff Report with Attachments.pdf

*Planning Manager Lenart provided the staff report.*

***PUBLIC HEARING:***

*Noting no public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed unless the item is postponed.*

**Moved by Mills, seconded by Trudeau, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Maxey Annexations and R1C (Single-Family Dwelling District) Zoning for 2955 and 2965 Kimberley Road.**

***COMMISSION DISCUSSION:***

*The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

*Woods asked about the possible reconfiguration of the lots facing Kimberley Road.*

*Brett explained that the owner has spoken of a reconfiguration where both lots would be coming off Kimberley Road, but no plan has been provided yet.*

*Mills asked what 'a lot of record' meant.*

*Lenart explained that it is a lot that was originally platted or an existing legal lot in the township that the City will recognize as a legal lot to build a single-family home on, even though the lot size doesn't meet the City's requirement, the City will allow the lot size from before it came into the City.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote: 8-0**

**Yeas:** 8 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Alex Milshteyn

- 9-b**      [17-0549](#)      Bibby Annexation and Zoning (465 Clarendon Drive) for City Council Approval - A proposal to annex this 0.32-acre parcel from Scio Township and zone it R1C (Single-Family Dwelling). (Ward 5) Staff Recommendation: Approval

**Attachments:** 465 Clarendon Drive - Bibby Annexation CPC Staff Report with Attachments.pdf

*Planning Manager Lenart provided the staff report.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Noting no public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed unless the item is postponed.*

**Moved by Trudeau, seconded by Mills, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Bibby Annexation and R1C (Single-Family Dwelling District) Zoning on 465 Clarendon Drive.**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

*Clein asked if the applicants requesting annexation are made aware of*

*the connection fees at the same time.*

*Lenart explained that the applicants are made aware at the time of connecting.*

*Woods asked for clarification about the parcel as shown on the maps.*

*Lenart said he believed there was a map error as there was no intention for a part of the parcel to remain in the township.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote: 8-0**

**Yeas:** 8 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Alex Milshteyn

- 9-c**      **17-0550**      143 Hill Street Planned Project Site Plan for Council Approval - A proposal to demolish two single-family residences (139 & 143 Hill Street) combine two lots, and build a four-unit apartment building. Seven parking spaces will be provided off Adams Street. Planned project modifications are requested for the front setbacks on Hill and Adams Streets. (Ward 4) Staff Recommendation: Approval

**Attachments:**      143 Hill St Staff Report with Attachments.pdf

*Planning Manager Lenart provided the staff report.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Bob Miller, 801 West Liberty Street, Ann Arbor, property owner, was present to answer any enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed unless the item is postponed.*

**Moved by Mills, seconded by Trudeau, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 143 Hill Street Planned Project Site Plan, a planned project with an arrangement of buildings that provides public benefits, subject to a decreased Hill Street front setback of 18 feet and combining the lots prior to issuance of any permits.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

*Ackerman asked the proximity of the proposed project to the floodplain.*

*Lenart responded that he wasn't sure exactly; however he was sure the floodplain wasn't on this property.*

*Ackerman asked if rain gardens were adequate for this size building and parking lot.*

*Lenart responded yes, it was determined to be adequate by the City's stormwater reviewers.*

*Ackerman asked about design and materials, noting the black and white sketches provided to the Commission were not very clear.*

*Miller said the hardiboard would be grey, as would the cement panels, with a metal trim around the panels, and the wood would likely be reclaimed wood.*

*Gibb-Randall asked about the flow of water over the site.*

*Kathy Keinath, P.E., reviewed the site with the Commission.*

*Weatherbee asked about potential traffic flow noting that the location is very close to the blind corner at Adams Street. She had concerns about Lift, Uber, and deliveries, stopping along Hill Street.*

*Lenart responded that City traffic reviewers had reviewed and approved the site plan; however, offered to bring precise answers to the Commission at a future date.*

*Weatherbee asked about bike parking and if there was the possibility to add more if tenants need them.*

*Miller said, sure, there is potential to add more bike parking if there is a need.*

*Weatherbee asked about snow removal on Adams Street, and where*

*excess snow would be piled.*

*Miller said he believed there was space in the landscape buffer area.*

*Weatherbee enquired about the raingarden maintenance and who would be responsible for making sure it works as planned.*

*Miller said it would be maintained by their regular maintenance.*

*Weatherbee asked about lighting, pointing out that the rear neighbor would be seeing vehicular traffic lights right into their home.*

*Miller said lighting will be on the building with one light in the parking lot.*

*Lenart added the photometric plan had been reviewed and the site light should be fine, and if not the applicant could add some screening.*

*Weatherbee asked if traditional porches had been considered for the front of the buildings.*

*Miller said the no, because they added a bump-out instead of the porches, which was design and intent.*

*Erica Briggs asked about the open space, percentage, and the community benefit being added.*

*Lenart answered that the minimum was 45% and this project is providing 54%.*

*Briggs stated that she felt there should be more bicycle parking in front of the building, since the area is heavily used by bicyclists.*

*Miller said the number of spaces greatly exceeds the number required by the zoning code.*

*Miller said the setback will make it a much better design and use.*

*David Lewis, Architect for the project, reviewed the project with the Commission related to the averaging rule of the City's zoning code, for setback.*

*Briggs asks staff about the intent of having a Planned Modification.*



*Lenart explained that the Planned Modification allows for some flexibility only in the dimensional standards; height and setbacks, in return for ordinance enhancements. Modifications cannot be used for use, or parking calculations, and in this project staff felt that the open space calculations felt compelling against the setbacks of these streets. Lenart added that if the Commission felt that the setback modification was not compelling enough, the required building setback per code along Hill Street would be approximately another 10 feet setback than the current proposed plan. He continued that the petitioner could likely meet the required Conflicting Landscape Buffer as well, leaving the project less desirable.*

*Briggs asked about required parking for the project.*

*Lenart explained that the petitioner is proposing one more parking space than is required per unit; seven spaces, whereas six is required.*

*Briggs asked if the project were reconfigured with less parking, could it be built without the need for a Planned Modification.*

*Lenart explained that if the Commission felt that the setback modification was not compelling enough, the required building setback (per code) along Hill Street would be approximately another 10 feet setback than the current proposed plan. He continued that the petitioner could likely meet the required Conflicting Landscape Buffer as well, leaving the project less desirable.*

*Briggs expressed she would rather see the one extra parking space removed to add more bicycle racks that would be a public benefit.*

*Miller responded that he was willing to add additional parking at any time after the project is built, noting that he based the parking needs from his own experience renting to students over several years. Miller said the students are more car centric and he felt stronger about having enough parking for them, than removing the extra space per unit.*

*Clein commented that the Commission needs to ask themselves what impact the removal of a space would have in this area, given that the area is very parking needy. He referred to his own experience with students who are away at campuses, all having vehicles parked, even if they didn't use them most of the time.*

*Woods said there are areas in the City that are more parking needy, and*

*she didn't feel the added parking space was a deal-breaker for her.*

*Woods asked for a clear explanation of the public benefit; was it the pedestrian experience that will be more pleasant with the sight-lines?*

*Lewis explained that the pedestrian experience of the sight-lines breaks up the fabric and places the building almost fronting on Adams Street with a parking behind.*

*Woods said the existing property looks a little rough.*

*Miller noted that he took over the property a year ago, from the previous owner whom had lived there since the 60's, and had let the property fall into disrepair. He clarified that he has cleaned up the property and removed accessory structures to help with the general condition.*

*Clein added that he bikes past these parcels and can vouch that the parcels have been improved.*

*Ackerman said the pedestrian crossing just south on Hill Street, is in need of painting and if signage could be added it would be most helpful and could be added to the Planned Project; he asked if the petitioner would possibly help fund such a project, working with City staff.*

*Miller said he would need to know the details before committing, but he said he would be happy to work with staff on the possibility.*

*Woods asked if a development agreement was required for this project.*

*Lenart said that a project of this size typically does not require an agreement, but if there were specifications needed he would not rule out an agreement.*

*Mills asked about the location for solid waste pick-up.*

*Miller said it would be on Adams Street.*

*Weatherbee spoke about the neighborhood not having a lot of bikes in the area and she wasn't sure why.*

*Mills asked about potential locations for bike storage.*

*Miller pointed out potential bike storage areas on the proposed green*

space; he also showed indoor bike storage hoops on the second floor for tenants.

Mills expressed that sometime in the near future it would be good for the Commission to review what qualifies as community benefits in Planned Modifications, as well as keeping in mind that this project is one of those projects made possible in an R4C district through the combination of lots.

Trudeau said that he is one of those bicyclists in town who carted his bike up a set of stairs and down into a basement in a multi-family housing and was most happy to have indoor storage for his bike in inclement weather.

Clein asked if an accessible route was required for this size project.

Lewis said an accessible parking route is only required if there are more than 20 units.

Clein asked if rain gardens will be enough for soil infiltrations on this site and what happens if they aren't.

Keinath said while they haven't done soil testing yet, they are confident the soils in this area will work; they will be replacing the top level soils, guaranteeing infiltration. She added that there are veins of great soil running throughout the City.

Clein asked if there is screening around the dumpster location.

Keinath said yes, pointing it out on the site plan.

Clein commented that the front of the building might look more inviting if there were a few chairs in the front. He liked the stoops in the front that were done in a contemporary way.

Gibb-Randall said there is not much data from the north side; but suggested they investigate so not to flood out their two neighbors.

Keinath agreed.

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote: 8-0**

**Yeas:** 8 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Alex Milshteyn

**10** **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)**

*David Lewis, Architect for 143 Hill Street, Ann Arbor, said his client is often looking for lots in the City for re-development. They have learned that the Conflicting Land Use Buffer has huge impact on lots of this size, and while he thinks the buffer is good when doing a 20-unit building, but not for smaller projects of this size, but it also hinders much re-development of these lots. He said there often just won't be physical space when contemplating where to put the parking. He said it would be helpful if the buffer were diminished to help with future development.*

*Clein thanked Lewis for his input.*

**11** **COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS**

*Mills thanked the public for their communications sent to them adding, "We read them!"*

*Briggs agreed. She also thanked the public for their communication on the solar ordinance.*

**12** **ADJOURNMENT**

**Moved by Trudeau, seconded by Weatherbee, that the meeting be Adjourn at 9:00 p.m. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

Ken Clein, Chair  
mg

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Channel 16 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Thursdays at 8:00 AM and Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website ([www.a2gov.org](http://www.a2gov.org)).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.