



# City of Ann Arbor

## Formal Minutes

### Planning Commission, City

301 E. Huron St.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/  
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

---

Tuesday, December 20, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second  
floor, City Council Chambers

---

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: [cityclerk@a2gov.org](mailto:cityclerk@a2gov.org); or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>) or on the 1st floor of City Hall on the Friday before the meeting. Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

#### **1 CALL TO ORDER**

*Chair Ken Clein called the meeting to order at 7:04 p.m.*

#### **2 ROLL CALL**

*Planning Manager Brett Lenart called the roll.*

**Present** 8 - Briggs, Clein, Mills, Milshteyn, Gibb-Randall, Trudeau,  
Weatherbee, and Ackerman

**Absent** 1 - Woods

#### **3 APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

**Moved by Mills, seconded by Milshteyn, to approve the agenda as presented. The agenda was unanimously approved.**

#### **4 INTRODUCTIONS**

*Chair Clein introduced the newest Planning Commissioner member, Erica Briggs, noting that Briggs was on the Commission a few years ago then left to pursue an advanced degree, and has now found the time to re-join the Commission.*

*Briggs said she is getting her PhD in Political Science at Michigan State University and she is excited to be back on the Commission.*

*Clein said the Commission is glad to have her back with her experience. He welcomed her!*

**5 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

**6 REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS**

**6-a City Council**

*Councilmember Ackerman reported that at last night’s Council meeting they approved the Weber Conditional Zoning and Area Plan at 2857 Packard Road; the conditions dealt with privacy concerns from the neighboring residents and the character of the neighborhood. He thanked the Planning Commission for the work they did on the request, and he was grateful to push them in the direction with conditions involved in the re-zoning.*

**6-b Planning Manager**

*Planning Manager Lenart introduced the Draft Capital Improvements Plan (CIP) to the Commission, noting that a full presentation, public hearing, and adoption will be scheduled for the January 18th meeting. He asked the Commission to take their time in reviewing the draft and forwarding any questions or comments that they have on the plan.*

*Lenart further reported on the Sustainable Ann Arbor Series, with the next event on January 12th at 7 p.m. at the Ann Arbor District Library Downtown branch.*

*He suggested cancellation of the January 4th Planning Commission meeting due to on-going plan reviews of projects.*

**16-1790** Draft Capital Improvements Plan (CIP) for Fiscal Years 2018-2023

**6-c Planning Commission Officers and Committees**

*Clein reported that the Ordinance Revisions Committee [ORC] met last week where they got to review a substantial draft of the Zoning Ordinance Reorganization Project [ZORO]. He said the lengthy document is organized in a way that is more helpful and easier to use. He said the document will eventually make its way to the Planning Commission for review and adoption.*

*Lenart added that the draft ZORO document has been made available to the public and can be found on the City's ZORO webpage.*

**6-d Written Communications and Petitions**

[16-1791](#) Various Correspondences to the City Planning Commission

**Received and Filed**

**7 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)**

*None*

**8 PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING**

*None*

**9 REGULAR BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item**

(If an agenda item is tabled, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a tabled agenda item will appear on a future agenda, please provide your email address on the form provided on the front table at the meeting. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org).)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. The first person who is the official representative of an organized group or who is representing the petitioner may speak for five minutes; additional representatives may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.)

(Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

9-a      16-1792    20 City Initiated Annexations Proposed for Zoning

The following residential parcels are proposed to be zoned R1C (Single-Family Dwelling):

- 2200 Dexter Ave
- 2020 Dexter Ave
- 2106 Dexter Ave
- Vacant (parcel # I-09-30-250-007)

The following residential parcels are proposed to be zoned R1D (Single-Family Dwelling):

- 849 Wickfield Ct
- 855 Wickfield Ct
- 865 Wickfield Ct
- 869 Wickfield Ct
- 875 Wickfield Ct
- 879 Wickfield Ct
- 885 Wickfield Ct
- 889 Wickfield Ct
- Vacant (parcel # I-09-16-390-008)
- Vacant (parcel # I-0916-390-011)

The following utility owned parcels are proposed to be zoned M1 (Limited Industrial):

- 2001 Dhu Varren
- 1101 Huron River Dr
- 561 S. Maple Rd
- 2997 Fuller Rd
- 2004 Pontiac Tr
- US-23 and Earhart (I-09-23-180-004)

Staff Recommendation: Approval

*City Planner, Jeff Kahan, presented the staff report.*

*Staff recommends that the petitions be approved because the parcels are within the City’s ultimate service boundary and the proposed zoning districts are consistent with the uses and intent of the M1, R1C, and R1D zoning districts and are compatible with surrounding zoning districts.*

*Staff from Planning & Development Services and Systems Planning*

*have worked over the past few years to initiate the annexation and zoning of 20 parcels in Ann Arbor Township. City Council passed a resolution in 2011 directing staff to begin a process of annexing township islands within the City's ultimate service boundary consistent with agreements reached with Ann Arbor, Scio and Pittsfield Townships in the 1990's. The primary intent of the annexation effort is to reduce the duplication of public services and provide services more efficiently.*

*Over 500 township island parcels still exist between the three townships within the City's ultimate service area. Staff filed an application with the State Boundary Commission in 2015 to annex these 20 parcels. The annexations were approved in October 2016. Now that the parcels have been annexed, City zoning designation must be established.*

*Staff recommends M1 (Limited Manufacturing) for the 6 scattered utility owned parcels since uses such as substations are a permitted principal use of the M1 zoning district. Staff recommends R1C for the residential parcels on Dexter Avenue where R1C is the surrounding zoning district. Staff recommends R1D for the rear parcels along Wickfield Court where the parent parcels are zoned R1D. The Wickfield Court parcels were never annexed when the parent parcels were annexed. These parcels are too small to create separate buildable lots.*

*In the early 1990's the City of Ann Arbor entered into an agreement with Ann Arbor Township to identify the ultimate service boundary for the City of Arbor. The agreement also included language indicating that the Township would no longer contest City initiated annexations after 2007. City Planning & Development Services staff have been working with staff from Systems Planning to develop a process to annex approximately 550 township islands within the ultimate service area that are in Ann Arbor, Pittsfield, and Scio Township. In 2011, staff produced a report in 2011 that summarized the background of this issue and City Council passed a resolution directing staff to begin a process of annexing these township island parcels. The 20 parcels represent the first batch of petitions that were submitted by the City to the Boundary Commission.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Noting no public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed unless the item is postponed.*

**Moved by Mills, seconded by Milshteyn, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve 1101 W. Huron River Drive, 2001 Dhu Varren Road,**

**561 S. Maple Road, 2997 Fuller Road, 2004 Pontiac Trail, and US-23 & Earhart (Parcel I-09-23-180-004) for rezoning to M1 (Limited Industrial).**

*The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion please see available video format]*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote:8-0**

**Yeas:** 8 - Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Wendy Woods

**Moved by Mills, seconded by Milshteyn, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve 2200 Dexter Avenue, 2020 Dexter Avenue, 2106 Dexter Avenue, and 2202 Dexter Avenue for rezoning to R1C (Single Family Dwelling).**

**On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote:8-0**

**Yeas:** 8 - Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Wendy Woods

**Moved by Mills, seconded by Milshteyn, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the vacant parcels at the rear of 845 Wickfield Court, 849 Wickfield Court, 855 Wickfield Court, 859 Wickfield Court, 865 Wickfield Court, 869 Wickfield Court, 875 Wickfield Court, 879 Wickfield Court, 885 Wickfield Court, 889 Wickfield Court for rezoning to R1D (Single Family Dwelling).**

**On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote:8-0**

**Yeas:** 8 - Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Wendy Woods

**9-b**      [16-1793](#)      The Collegian North Site Plan for City Council Approval; 1107 South University Avenue - A proposal to demolish the existing buildings at 1107, 1111, 1115 and 1119 S. University Ave. and construct a 113,000-square foot, 11-story building. Retail uses are proposed on the first two floors and residential apartments are proposed for the upper floors. (Ward 1) Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Planning Manager, Brett Lenart, provided the staff report.*

*Existing Conditions – The subject site is four adjacent lots having a combined lot area of 16,562 square feet (0.4 acre), zoned D1 (Downtown Core base district) and South University character overlay district, and Primary street frontage designation. The site also has frontage on the East University pedestrian mall. The assembled site contains adjoining two-story buildings that house the Ulrich’s Bookstore. All existing buildings will be demolished. There are no natural features on this site.*

*Proposed Development – The proposed building is 150 feet tall and has 12 stories, plus a partial basement level for mechanical systems and bicycle storage. Retail space is planned for the street level and a portion of the second floor. Residential apartments are offered for the third floor and above. Building services and utilities are located at the rear (north) and will be accessed by a pedestrian alley along the north side of the site to Church Street.*

*The proposed footprint is generally rectangular but with a cutout at the southwest corner to accommodate an existing building that is not part of the development. Passers-by will perceive the building as a two-story base supporting a slightly recessed, ten-story flag shaped tower. The west wing has, however, seven stories and the east wing has nine.*

*Area, height and placement, plus off-street parking data is provided in the comparison chart below. Other development details include:*

- *Parking – No off-street parking is proposed. The petitioner will enter into a contract for 50 permits in the public parking system for the premium floor area included in the development.*

- *Access – The site has frontage on East University Avenue pedestrian mall and an easement to use it for access to the proposed storefronts. It also has frontage on South University Avenue and access to Church Street across an easement over the adjacent 1121 South University Avenue.*
- *Storm Water Management – Storm water management for the 100-year storm volume is proposed underneath the building.*
- *Streetscape Improvements – The South University Streetscape Improvement Project will begin in the spring of 2016. Because the proposed development also intends to begin around the same time, the developer will be responsible for installing the improvements from the west end of the streetscape to Church Street with materials furnished by the Downtown Development Authority as part of this site plan development.*
- *Apartment Units – 43 apartments are proposed including four, five and six-bedroom units. No studio, one or two-bedroom apartments are planned.*
- *Retail Spaces – At least two, and up to four, retail spaces are proposed, providing 20,000-square feet of total retail space.*

#### *PLANNING BACKGROUND:*

*Staff finds the proposed development to further the majority of goals articulated in each applicable element of the City Master Plan. In particular, it achieves several of the goals in the climate and energy, community, and land use and access theme areas in the Sustainability Framework. It is consistent with the goals of the Downtown Plan, the Transportation Plan and the Non-motorized Transportation Plan and Update.*

#### *SERVICE UNIT COMMENTS:*

*Planning – Staff’s comments regarding compliance with city codes, ordinances and plans were addressed by the petitioner. Staff find the proposed development to meet zoning and off-street parking regulations and, as mentioned above, further the majority of goals in the City Master Plan. Upon the submittal of a boundary survey as required by Engineering, there are no unresolved issues.*



*A draft development agreement will be prepared for necessary improvements not addressed on the site plan such as contracts for permits in the public parking system and coordination and responsibilities for installing or repairing streetscape improvements adjacent to the site.*

*Engineering – A boundary survey must be provided as part of the site plan. Impacts to the sanitary sewer system are being modeled, further information will be forthcoming, and as a result some specific provisions may need to be included in the development agreement.*

*Downtown Development Authority – Staff have provided suggested language for the development agreement to address coordination and responsibilities for the streetscape improvements which will be delayed because of this project as well as on-street metered parking and parking permit contracts.*

*Parks – Staff suggested a park contribution of \$25,420.00 based on 41 proposed dwelling units (revised to \$26,660 for 43 proposed dwellings) for improvements to a downtown park. The petitioner is still considering their response.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Sean Havera, South University-North, LLC, Hughes Properties, 30100 Telegraph Road, Suite 220, Bingham Farms, introduced his development team and was available to respond to enquiries of the Commission.*

*Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed unless the item is postponed.*

**Moved by Weatherbee, seconded by Milshteyn, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve The Collegian North Site Plan and Development Agreement, subject to providing a boundary survey before scheduling for City Council action and combining the lots prior to issuance of any permits.**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion please see available video format]*

*Commissioners questioned the impact of the Design Review Board on the project, Floor Area Ratio [FAR], parking, bike parking, LEED certification, solid waste and recycling locations and access, alley improvements and maintenance, potential retail space, energy efficiency aspects, canopy options, and project timeframe. The Commission had concerns about the 50 permit parking spots that would be relocated due to this project.*

*Tom Dillenbeck, Hobbs + Black Architects, 100 N State Street, Ann Arbor, Architect for the project explained the revisions made due to The Design Review Board's Review. Originally it was a more blocked building, the DRB requested them to look at massing; they amended the plans to provide a taller center tower and reduce height of the building wings. They worked with them to select bricks and colors, worked to add additional windows and treatment to the north façade of the building, adding punched windows, the 2-story street wall base was discussed, they set street the wall back from property line approximately 5 feet, which provides some relief and flexible space for seating, avoiding door obstructions. They are using a high percentage of glass, and have added rooftop patios.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote:8-0**

**Yeas:** 8 - Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Wendy Woods

**10 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)**

**11 COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS**

*Mills said the City needs to reevaluate our parking requirements.*

*Weatherbee said it needs to consider Uber, Lyft, and delivery services.*

**12 ADJOURNMENT**

**Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Weatherbee, to adjourn the meeting at 9:15 p.m. The motion was unanimously approved.**

Ken Clein, Chair  
mg

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Channel 16 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Thursdays at 8:00 AM and Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website ([www.a2gov.org](http://www.a2gov.org)).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.