



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Planning Commission, City

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Tuesday, November 1, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>) or on the 1st floor of City Hall on the Friday before the meeting. Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

1 **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Clein called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

2 **ROLL CALL**

Present 8 - Woods, Clein, Briere, Mills, Milshteyn, Gibb-Randall,
Trudeau, and Weatherbee

3 **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was unanimously approved.

4 **INTRODUCTIONS**

5 **MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

6 **REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER,
PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN
COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS**

- 6-a City Council
- 6-b Planning Manager
- 6-c Planning Commission Officers and Committees
- 6-d Written Communications and Petitions

[16-1500](#) Various Correspondences to the City Planning Commission
Received and Filed

7 **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)**

8 **PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING**

[16-1501](#) Public Hearings Scheduled for the November 15, 2016 City Planning Commission Meeting
Chair Clein read the public hearing notice as published.
Received and Filed

9 **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

10 **REGULAR BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item**

(If an agenda item is tabled, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a tabled agenda item will appear on a future agenda, please provide your email address on the form provided on the front table at the meeting. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org.)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. The first person who is the official representative of an organized group or who is representing the petitioner may speak for five minutes; additional representatives may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.)

(Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

- 10-a** **16-1496** South Maple Apartments (1110 & 1132 S Maple) Site Plan for City Council Approval - A proposal to develop 70 apartments in two 3-story buildings and other required improvements such as parking and storm water management and including planned project modifications for setbacks and landscape modifications to the conflicting land use buffer. Separate petitions have also been submitted to annex this 4.9-acre parcel into the City and to zoning it R4B (Multiple-Family Dwelling) Ward 5. Staff Recommendation: Approval

Alexis DiLeo presented the staff report.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no public speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing unless the item is postponed.

Moved by Woods, seconded by Trudeau, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the South Maple Avalon Apartments Planned Project Site Plan with Modifications to conflicting land use buffer requirements of Chapter 63 (Landscaping and Screening Ordinance), subject to providing affordable housing for lower income households and minimum of 60% open space.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

Mills enquired about the purpose of the very large canopy proposed over the front property and if there would be programming of front porch.

David Esau, Cornerstone Design Inc., 310 Depot Street, Suite 2, Ann Arbor, Architect for the project, explained the primary reason is to keep

the building further away from the existing adjacent single-story houses.

Mills said if a porch half as deep would meet the requirement, she would propose reducing the depth of the porch.

Wendy Carty-Saxon, Avalon Housing, Inc., 1327 Jones Drive, Suite 102, Ann Arbor, said no specific programming of the front porch was planned.

Gibb-Randall asked if the retaining wall could be tied into a building foundation to potentially save trees.

Kathy Keinath, PE, 11245 Boyce Road, Chelsea, Engineer, said they will look into this possibility.

Clein asked about the sidewalk on Maple.

Clein commented that the architecture is kind of severe; he asked about the breakdown of units.

The petitioner explained that their mix of units would primarily be 63 one-bedroom and 7 two-bedroom units.

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion please see available video format]

Moved by Mills, seconded by Briere, to Amend motion to include a project modification from maximum setback of up to a 15 foot planned project modification from the required maximum front yard setback.

VOTE ON AMENDMENT:

On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried. Vote: 6-2

Yeas: 6 - Kenneth Clein, Sabra Briere, Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, and Julie Weatherbee

Nays: 2 - Wendy Woods, and Alex Milshteyn

VOTE ON MAIN MOTION:

On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried. Vote: 8-0

Yeas: 8 - Wendy Woods, Kenneth Clein, Sabra Briere, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, and Julie Weatherbee

Nays: 0

- 10-b** [16-1497](#) Carlberg Annexation and Zoning of 2501 Victoria Avenue - A proposal to annex this 0.174-acre site from Pittsfield Township and zone it R1C (Single-Family Dwelling). Ward 3. Staff Recommendation: Approval

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no public speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing unless the item is postponed.

Moved by Briere, seconded by Gibb-Randall, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 2501 Victoria Avenue Annexation and R1C (Single-Family Dwelling District) Zoning.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried. Vote: 8-0

Yeas: 8 - Wendy Woods, Kenneth Clein, Sabra Briere, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, and Julie Weatherbee

Nays: 0

- 10-c** [16-1498](#) DuBuc Annexation and Zoning of 2935 Devonshire Road - A proposal to annex this 0.72-acre parcel from Ann Arbor Township and zone it R1A (Single-Family Dwelling) for the purpose of construction of one single-family house. Ward 2. Staff Recommendation: Approval

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no public speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing unless the item is postponed.

Moved by Woods, seconded by Trudeau, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the DuBuc Annexation and R1A (Single-Family Dwelling District) Zoning at 2935 Devonshire Road.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried. Vote: 8-0

Yeas: 8 - Wendy Woods, Kenneth Clein, Sabra Briere, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, and Julie Weatherbee

Nays: 0

10-d **16-1499** DuBuc Annexation and Zoning of 2945 Devonshire Road - A proposal to annex this 0.59-acre parcel from Ann Arbor Township and zone it R1A (Single-family Dwelling) for the purpose of construction of one single-family house. Ward 2. Staff Recommendation: Approval

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no public speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing unless the item is postponed.

Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Mills, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the DuBuc Annexation and R1A (Single-Family Dwelling District) Zoning at 2945 Devonshire Road.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried. Vote: 8-0

Yeas: 8 - Wendy Woods, Kenneth Clein, Sabra Briere, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, and Julie Weatherbee

Nays: 0

11 **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)**

12 **COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS**

13 **ADJOURNMENT**

Moved by Gibb-Randall, seconded by Mills to Adjourn meeting at 8:06 p.m. Unanimously approved.

Ken Clein, Chair
mg

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Channel 16 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Thursdays at 8:00 AM and Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website (www.a2gov.org).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.