



Approved Minutes

January 21, 2016

Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors

Ann Arbor District Library, 343 South Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 6:30 p.m.

Board: Mike Allemang, Jack Bernard, Eli Cooper, Larry Krieg, Eric Mahler

Absent with Notice: Gillian Ream Gainsley, Sue Gott, Charles Griffith, Stephen Wade

Staff: Gwyn Belcher, Matt Carpenter, Ron Copeland, Bill De Groot, Dawn Gabay, Mary Stasiak, Phil Webb, Chris White, Michelle Whitlow, Reggie Whitlow

Local Advisory Council: Rebecca Burke

Recording Secretary: Karen Wheeler

Chairman Eric Mahler declared that a quorum was present, and called the meeting to order at 6:43 p.m.

1.0 Public Hearing

There was no public hearing.

2.0 Communications and Announcements

Eric Mahler appointed Larry Krieg Acting Secretary.

Jack Bernard announced the Ann Arbor Center for Independent Living's 40th [Anniversary Celebration](#) on March 12, 2016.

3.0 Public Time – Comment on Agenda Items

Jim Mogensen appeared before the board. Mr. Mogensen commented on the A-Ride agreement and the bus stops presentation reported on in the PDC meeting summary. Mr. Mogensen suggested placing an accessible passenger shelter at Chidester Place. Mr. Mogensen indicated that the time zone on the website is incorrect.

Michelle Barney appeared before the Board. Ms. Barney suggested that some drivers on the #11 route are leaving time points early, and requested that management look into training. Ms. Barney raised a concern that people may be confused about the new routing, and requested a one-page information sheet that can be shared. Ms. Barney suggested that more A-Ride sedans are needed so that ambulatory passengers won't have to ride in vans. Ms. Barney indicated that problems continue with booking advance reservations, and trip details not being thoroughly transmitted to A-Ride drivers.

Carolyn Grawi from the Ann Arbor Center for Independent Living appeared before the Board. Ms. Grawi commented on the proposal to move the provision of A-Ride lift service away from union employees to non-union drivers at RideCorp. Ms. Grawi requested that the drivers providing the service get enough training. Ms. Grawi indicated that some A-Ride trip information details are missing on the driver's tablet, which is problematic when less experienced drivers don't know where passengers are waiting. Ms. Grawi requested more A-Ride rides per hour, and expansion of the Will Call policy to include additional services such as restaurants and hair dressers.

Rebecca Burke appeared before the Board. Ms. Burke commented on the A-Ride Will Call policy. Ms. Burke suggested that changing the terms would require a policy vote.

No one further appearing, Mr. Mahler declared Public Time closed.

4.0 Review and Approval of Minutes of December 17, 2015

Larry Krieg moved approval of the minutes as written with support from Mike Allemang. The motion carried. Eli Cooper abstained.

5.0 Board and Staff Reports

5.1 Chief Executive Officer

Matt Carpenter welcomed Gwyn Belcher, AAATA's new Manager of Human Resources. Mr. Carpenter reported that construction activity is scheduled to begin on the Ypsilanti Transit Center in the next few weeks, and is expected to last 10-20 days. Mr. Carpenter reported that new materials detailing the service expansion will be distributed through various public channels. Mr. Carpenter announced that a new class of Motor Coach Operators graduated from training in early January.

5.2 Planning and Development Committee

Larry Krieg reported on the Planning and Development Committee (PDC) meeting. The committee discussed three main topics: the impact of the closure

of M-14 planned for March through August, the Bus Stop and Shelter program, and the Connector. Mr. Krieg shared details of the M-14 construction project. Mr. Krieg made a formal request of WATS staff for a traffic simulation analysis to determine where the majority of congestion will be, in the event AAATA may need to reroute buses or make other service adjustments on surface roads which will likely be more crowded.

PDC received an update on the Connector project; a proposed high capacity transit line from the northeast to south side of Ann Arbor, and connecting the University of Michigan (UM) campuses and downtown Ann Arbor. The project has started up again following a hiatus. During the hiatus UM was determined to be a main beneficiary. UM recently made a commitment to fund a minimum of 75% of the expense for the next phase of the project. Next steps include issuance of a request for proposals for a consultant for environmental and planning work, and AAATA connecting with the Federal Transit Administration regarding possible grant funding. A public relations firm has been engaged to solicit input and garner support for the project.

PDC received a presentation on the bus stop and shelter program from Jeff Murphy. Mr. Murphy reported on the requirements for bus stops and passenger shelters. The committee discussed bus shelters on Fourth Avenue near the Blake Transit Center and the need to provide more shelter for passengers while maintaining shelter-to-curb clearance requirements.

Mr. Krieg reported on the Regional Transit Authority (RTA) Board meeting. A regional flexible route was announced. The route is a cooperative experiment between Suburban Mobility Authority for Regional Transportation (SMART) and the Detroit Department of Transportation (DDOT). The three-year pilot project will serve the Woodward and Gratiot corridors. Mr. Krieg announced that Sarah Pressprich Gryniewicz, AAATA's Business Analyst, was elected Chair of the RTA's Providers Advisory Committee.

5.3 Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee

Mike Allemang reported on the Performance Monitoring and External Relations (PMER) Committee meeting. The committee considered four action items: A-Ride Service Delivery, A-Ride Expense Adjustment, a change in the contract for CAD/AVL Consulting Services, and Janitorial Contract Award. The committee recommended the four items for award approval.

PMER had a robust discussion about a revised calculation of the fare for third parties. A decision on the revised structure is needed by March for the Ann Arbor Downtown Development Authority to consider go!pass funding in their next budget cycle, and prior to the MRide agreement expiration in July. The

committee will discuss third party fares again in February, and expects to bring a recommendation to the full board for consideration. The committee discussed the board-adopted Unrestricted Net Assets Policy which calls for maintaining 2.5 months of operating expenses for emergencies. Reserves are expected to fall below the 2.5 month threshold due to new bus purchases. The committee is scheduled to revisit the matter in February.

Staff presented the financial and performance reports for the first three months of the fiscal year. Mr. Allemang reported that ridership is down from last year due mainly to losses of UM and go!pass riders. Mr. Allemang noted that if those two fare categories are removed, ridership is up slightly. Mr. Allemang noted that Mr. Carpenter reported on ridership in a recent news article. In February staff will present ridership data broken into three categories: UM, go!pass and all other. The committee will discuss whether the alternate look at ridership data is useful.

5.4 Local Advisory Council

Rebecca Burke reported on the Local Advisory Council meeting. Ms. Burke reported on A-Ride Will Calls which are advance return trips, available for sedan service, for medical or shopping appointments without a specific pick-up time. Ms. Burke suggested that A-Ride passengers work with service providers to manage trips within A-Ride parameters. Ms. Burke reported that the LAC supported the proposed A-Ride service delivery model.

5.5 Washtenaw Area Transportation Study

Larry Krieg reported on the Washtenaw Area Transportation Study (WATS) Policy Committee meeting. Mr. Krieg formally requested a traffic study regarding the M-14 closure, and WATS agreed to complete the study. The committee discussed a draft of the Unified Work Plan that involves AAATA and WATS. Mr. Krieg agreed to share the draft Plan with the Board, and encouraged Board members to review the Plan. Mr. Krieg requested that another AAATA representative attend the February policy committee meeting as he will be out of town.

6.0 Question Time

Jack Bernard complimented staff for work on the bus shelter program. Mr. Bernard suggested that the criteria for 50 passengers per day and having an Adopt-A-Stop partner to place a shelter be soft rules, and not hard rules. Mr. Bernard asked whether AAATA could work more directly with the City on paving and creating sidewalks for places that ought to have a stop to make additional bus stop locations more accessible.

Eli Cooper reported on work completed to close sidewalk gaps under the City's Non-Motorized Transportation Program. Mr. Cooper added that a Pedestrian Access and Safety Taskforce for the City recommended program prioritization for sidewalk gaps which included analysis of AAATA bus stops and proximity to sidewalks and sidewalk gaps. Mr. Cooper reported that City staff have coordinated with AAATA staff and will continue to do so. Efforts will continue to meet the most important and urgent needs, consistent with a multi-modal strategy based on the availability of federal and state funding.

Larry Krieg commented on the City's willingness to add sidewalks when funding is available. Mr. Krieg referred to other jurisdictions where AAATA operates which have many fewer sidewalks, and where some of the biggest service expansion will take place. Mr. Krieg suggested working toward obtaining local and state funding to support a solution that adequately addresses the needs of all communities.

7.0 Old Business

Mr. Carpenter introduced the resolution on the A-Ride Service Delivery Recommendation. The recommendation is a mixed service model of contracting out the delivery of service, maintenance, and same-day reservations, and AAATA retaining advance reservation call taking.

Jack Bernard moved the following resolution with support from Mike Allemang. Mr. Carpenter read the resolution into the record.

7.1 A-Ride Service Delivery Recommendation

Resolution 10/2016

APPROVAL OF CONTRACT AWARD FOR ARIDE PARATRANSIT SERVICES

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority's (TheRide) primary consideration is to continue to provide A-Ride service for people with disabilities and seniors without interruption and with consistently high quality service, and

WHEREAS, staff evaluated long-term operating alternatives including complete operation of the service by TheRide, complete contracted service, and a mixture of directly operated and contracted service, and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the TheRide Board of Directors accepts A-Ride Service Delivery Model Technical Memo, and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Board of Directors direct the CEO to operate a mixed model of paratransit operations within the annual approved budget, and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the TheRide Board of Directors authorizes the CEO to negotiate and enter into a contract for up to a three year term for the operations of paratransit services.

Board members commented on the resolution. Larry Krieg went on the record stating that it is critical to maintain oversight of the call center to ensure that call takers are providing the highest level of service possible, and treating customers as the number one concern. Mr. Krieg indicated that living wage should be included in the contract.

Eli Cooper requested information on the mix of sedans vs. lift equipped vans in the mixed model fleet.

Mr. Carpenter indicated that it is believed that having both sedans and lift equipped buses operated by same contractor will result in efficiencies of deployment of the fleet in a more efficient way, and more consistent availability of vehicles. Mr. Carpenter added that the call takers will be supervised by managerial staff noting that it is helpful to have specific details in order to track problems that may have occurred. Mr. Carpenter confirmed that living wage is a matter of policy.

Mr. Bernard applauded the efforts of staff in putting the recommendation together. Mr. Bernard noted concerns raised about passengers communicating with call takers and drivers not receiving complete trip information. Mr. Bernard requested an update on this element of service at a future meeting.

Eric Mahler complimented staff for including Impacts on Sustainability in the Issue Brief. Bill De Groot responded to a question from Mr. Mahler on the budgetary impact of the contract.

The motion passed unanimously.

8.0 New Business

Mr. Carpenter introduced the recommendation for an A-Ride Resolution Amendment. In May 2015 the Board awarded a contract for paratransit service for a not-to-exceed annual amount of \$2Million. Service has been successful and because of growing ridership, the contract will exceed the \$2Million amount. The resolution is a request for consideration to amend the original resolution to increase the contract amount by \$700,000. Mr. Carpenter noted that the FY2016 budget is believed to have the funding to support the increase. Staff will monitor growing ridership and inform the board, if any challenges emerge.

Mike Allemang moved the following resolution with support from Larry Krieg.

8.1 A-Ride Resolution Amendment

Resolution 11/2016

**APPROVAL OF CONTRACT AMENDMENT AND BUDGET AMENDMENT
FOR ARIDE PARATRANSIT SERVICES**

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority's (TheRide) primary consideration is to continue to provide A-Ride service for people with disabilities and seniors without interruption and with consistently high quality service, and

WHEREAS, the Board of Directors approved Resolution 22/2015, and

WHEREAS, TheRide Board of Directors authorized the CEO to negotiate and enter into a contract with the next responsive and responsible proposer, Blue Cab Company (wholly owner of RideCorp), beginning May 1, 2015 for up to a three year contract term, with the award amount not-to-exceed an annual amount of \$2,000,000, subject to annual negotiation in subsequent years, and

WHEREAS, ridership on subcontracted sedan service has increased since August 2015 to the point where an adjustment to the contract award amount is necessary, and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the TheRide Board of Directors amend Resolution 22/2015 to increase the \$2,000,000 contract award to \$2,700,000, and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Board of Directors direct the CEO to report on the FY 2016 operating budget implications.

Board members commented on the resolution. Mr. Carpenter confirmed that the additional \$700,000 being requested is believed to be sufficient, and the matter would not have to go back to the board. Mr. Carpenter added that staff are discussing how to contextualize and present the issue of increasing paratransit ridership to the Board. The matter will be brought to the board for consideration.

Mr. Cooper noted the difference in cost between providing a \$4 fixed-route trip and a \$31 demand responsive trip. Mr. Cooper suggested redoubling efforts to provide mainstreaming support and services to increase accessibility to maximize the utilization of existing fixed-route services.

The motion passed unanimously.

8.2 Routine Contract Approvals

Michelle Whitlow introduced the resolution for a change in contracting award of consulting services for the CAD/AVL project.

Eli Cooper moved the following resolution with support from Larry Krieg.

8.2.1 Change in Contract Award of Consulting Services for CAD/AVL Project

Resolution 12/2016

**APPROVAL OF CONTRACT AWARD FOR CONSULTING SERVICES
FOR COMPUTER AIDED DISPATCH
AND AUTOMATED VEHICLE LOCATION (CAD/AVL) NEEDS**

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) Board of Directors previously approved Resolution 15/2014, authorizing the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to execute a contract to TranSystems of Boston, MA for Consulting Services for CAD/AVL needs, and

WHEREAS, on December 17, 2015, the TranSystems employee that has provided AAATA a high level of quality for this service since early 2014, informed AAATA that he has chosen to move to a different firm; IBI Group of Boston, MA, and

WHEREAS, AAATA is approaching the final stages of the Fixed Route portion of the CAD/AVL Project implementation, and will soon proceed to Mini Fleet implementation, and

WHEREAS, consistency of consulting services at this stage of the project is critical for the successful implementation of the CAD/AVL system, and

WHEREAS, TranSystems and IBI Group are both in agreement to terminate the contract with TranSystems and allow the employee to take AAATA's CAD/AVL project with him to IBI Group, and

WHEREAS, contracting directly with IBI Group is the most cost-effective means of ensuring timely project completion,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the AAATA Board of Directors authorizes the CEO to negotiate and execute a contract for Consulting Services for CAD/AVL needs with IBI Group of Boston.

Mr. Carpenter confirmed that transitioning the contract from one company to another would not cause a delay in the CAD/AVL project nor any or cost increase. Ms. Whitlow

added that the remaining amount of the contract would be transferred to the new contractor.

The motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Whitlow introduced the resolution to award a contract for janitorial services noting that the previous contract was terminated for cause.

Larry Krieg moved the following resolution with support from Jack Bernard.

8.2.2 Janitorial Contract

Resolution 13/2016

APPROVAL OF CONTRACT AWARD FOR JANITORIAL SERVICES

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) issued Request for Proposal (RFP) # 2016-03 "Janitorial Services" for the purpose of identifying a firm to provide janitorial services at the Main Facility, Blake Transit Center and the Ypsilanti Transit Center, and

WHEREAS, on December 17, 2015 AAATA Board of Directors authorized the CEO to purchase janitorial services from RNA Facilities Management of Ann Arbor, MI for a three-year period with an option to extend such contracts for two additional one-year periods beginning December 1, 2015, and

WHEREAS, AAATA subsequently determined that RNA is not in adherence to current contractual terms for janitorial services resulting in a Breach of Contract, and

WHEREAS, this resulted in unsanitary conditions, and a threat to the health and safety of our employees and customers, and

WHEREAS, AAATA's purchasing procedures allows The Authority to negotiate with the next responsive and responsible proposer for these services,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the AAATA Board of Directors rescinds its resolution #7/2016, dated December 17, 2015, and authorizes the CEO to negotiate and enter into a contract with the next responsive and responsible proposer, JNS Facilities Maintenance LLC, of Ann Arbor, MI beginning January 22, 2016 for a three year contract term, with two (2) one-year renewal options.

The motion passed unanimously.

9.0 Public Time

Jim Mogensen appeared before the Board. Mr. Mogensen commented on the MRide Agreement, third party fares, and reasons for discounting fares. Mr. Mogensen suggested that while it may be difficult to track transfers for MCards, he hopes that an analysis would include what the MRide contract would be for, if the discount wasn't taken. Mr. Mogensen commented on an Ann Arbor News article, service increases and declining ridership. Mr. Mogensen cautioned the Board to track the impact on the budget for the transit agency, if UM ridership continues to decline.

Michelle Barney appeared before the Board. Ms. Barney commented on changes in ridership and long-term planning. Ms. Barney suggested including a provision for more A-Ride service in the next millage due to an aging population. Ms. Barney was complimentary of the new call notification service when an A-Ride vehicle is approaching. Ms. Barney indicated that some A-Ride drivers don't have detailed trip information due to size constraints on display screens.

Carolyn Grawi from the Ann Arbor Center for Independent Living (AACIL) appeared before the Board. Ms. Grawi commented on new bus stops suggesting that every stop should be accessible. Ms. Grawi commented on the standardized paint schemes on A-Ride vans and sedans that are easily recognizable. Ms. Grawi suggested that one contractor deploying one set of trip orders could increase ride sharing. Ms. Grawi suggested the importance of providing more access to transit services for those who are transit dependent. Ms. Grawi extended an invitation to the AACIL 40th Anniversary event on March 12.

Leon Bryson appeared before the Board. Mr. Bryson thanked AAATA for providing transit service for the community. Mr. Bryson commented on a recent MRide article in which Mr. Carpenter suggested that declining ridership is due to lower gas prices. Mr. Bryson suggested the reasoning is a "shot in the dark", and AAATA's work should be focused on determining the needs of the community and providing efficient and effective service. Mr. Bryson further suggested that the current hub and spoke system is ineffective, and the cause for declining ridership. Mr. Bryson indicated that there should be more of an environmental focus to reduce fossil fuel usage.

No one further appearing, Mr. Mahler declared Public Time closed.

10.0 Adjourn

Jack Bernard moved to adjourn the meeting with support from Eli Cooper. The motion passed unanimously, and the meeting adjourned at 8:25 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,
Larry Krieg, Acting Secretary