

# FEE PROPOSAL

Request for Proposal

Citywide Drainage Analysis  
for Gravel Roads

City of Ann Arbor

RFP #23-40

Due: August 17, 2023

By 11:00 a.m.



## SUBMITTED TO:

City of Ann Arbor  
c/o Customer Service  
301 E. Huron Street  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104

## PREPARED BY:

Hubbell, Roth & Clark, Inc.  
James F. Burton, PE  
(248) 454-6300  
jburton@hrcengr.com

555 Hulet Drive  
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48302



ENGINEERING.

ENVIRONMENT.

EXCELLENCE.

# FEE PROPOSAL

The key staff members delineated in Section A of this document are included by Title in the separate Fee Proposal document.

Wage rates shown in the separate sealed Fee Proposal document are reflective for 2023. We propose annual rate increases of 3% or less for subsequent years.

## BUDGETING

Year 1 – 26% of gravel roads - \$325,000

Year 2– 27% of gravel roads - \$217,000

Year 3– 17% of gravel roads - \$165,000

Year 4 – 28% of gravel roads – \$195,000

**Project Contingencies** – Work as Directed by the City - \$100,000

We are recommending the City hold contingencies for this project for use as directed by the City for additional levels of public outreach, producing renderings, assisting with grant applications, gathering more detailed survey, obtaining more soil borings, and advancing elements of design past the concept CIP stage.

**Total Project Budget** - \$1,000,000

### Cost Proposal

Year 1 and 2 are not to exceed without authorization for the scope identified.

Years 3 and 4 are budgeted with guaranteed staff rates.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

YEAR 1

Task Description	J. Burton		J. Balint		B. Tarpinian		Support								Total Hours	SUB TOTAL COST		
	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost				
<b>TEAM 1</b>																		
Kick off meeting	8	\$ 1,400	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,080	8	\$ 1,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	32	\$ 4,760		
Tier 1 interactions (14 meetings)	14	\$ 2,450	28	\$ 4,480	14	\$ 1,690	14	\$ 1,750	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	70	\$ 10,570		
Gather historic information and break down per Study Area	4	\$ 700	16	\$ 2,560	40	\$ 5,400	8	\$ 1,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	68	\$ 9,660		
Project management (12 months)	24	\$ 4,200	48	\$ 7,680	48	\$ 6,480	12	\$ 1,500	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	132	\$ 19,860		
Task Description	S. Roznowski		R. Graham		M. Kluczynski		J. Dancer		T. Cameron		Cadd		Lidar Unit Costs		Total Hours	SUB TOTAL COST		
	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost				
<b>TEAM 2</b>																		
Mobile Lidar all 13 miles	0	\$ -	0	\$ -	0	\$ -	2	\$ 380	10	\$ 1,320	\$ -	\$ -	1	\$ 9,200	\$ -	13	\$ 10,900	
Process limited data for Study Area 1	0	\$ -	0	\$ -	0	\$ -	2	\$ 380	40	\$ 5,280	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	42	\$ 5,660	
Create base drawings for 1-2 streets to test	0	\$ -	0	\$ -	4	\$ 668	2	\$ 380	2	\$ 264	8	\$ 864	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	16	\$ 2,176	
Complete all base drawings after field verification test	2	\$ 470	4	\$ 800	4	\$ 668	0	\$ -	0	\$ -	80	\$ 8,640	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	90	\$ 10,578	
Task Description	C. Turner		B. Cousino		P. Klaver		Support								Total Hours	SUB TOTAL COST		
	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost				
<b>TEAM 3</b>																		
Obtain City stormwater model	4	\$ 840	8	\$ 1,560	8	\$ 1,680	8	\$ 1,160	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	28	\$ 5,240		
Review model in Study Area 1	4	\$ 840	24	\$ 4,680	16	\$ 3,360	0	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	44	\$ 8,880		
Research and recommend climate resilience parameters	4	\$ 840	16	\$ 3,120	16	\$ 3,360	16	\$ 2,320	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	52	\$ 9,640		
Create toolkit for possible solutions	4	\$ 840	16	\$ 3,120	40	\$ 8,400	40	\$ 5,800	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	100	\$ 18,160		
Test proposed recommendations	4	\$ 840	16	\$ 3,120	80	\$ 16,800	16	\$ 2,320	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	116	\$ 23,080		
Task Description	J. Burton		J. Balint		R. Graham		B. Cousino		J. Darnell		GIS/ B. Tarpinian		M. Kluczynski		N. Grewe		Total Hours	SUB TOTAL COST
	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost		
<b>TEAM 4</b>																		
Create GIS tool for collecting visual and anecdotal information	\$ -	\$ -	4	\$ 640	4	\$ 720	4	\$ 780	\$ -	\$ -	24	\$ 3,240	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	36	\$ 5,380	
Take base maps and GIS tool into field, walk 1-2 streets to test	4	\$ 700	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560	8	\$ 1,120	8	\$ 1,080	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	44	\$ 7,180	
Update other Teams on revisions as needed	\$ -	\$ -	4	\$ 640	2	\$ 360	2	\$ 390	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	8	\$ 1,390	
Field investigations for entire area	4	\$ 700	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560	8	\$ 1,120	8	\$ 1,080	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	44	\$ 7,180	
Meet with Tier 4 Stakeholders to review in field	\$ -	\$ -	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560	\$ -	\$ -	12	\$ 1,620	12	\$ 2,004	12	\$ 1,860	60	\$ 7,904
Task Description	J. Burton		J. Balint		R. Graham		B. Cousino		J. Darnell		B. Tarpinian		M. Kluczynski		N. Grewe		Total Hours	SUB TOTAL COST
	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost		
<b>TEAM 5</b>																		
Identify areas for recommended drainage solutions	\$ -	\$ -	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560	8	\$ 1,280	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	32	\$ 5,560	
Evaluate and recommend opportunities to alleviate drainage issues	\$ -	\$ -	16	\$ 2,560	16	\$ 2,880	8	\$ 1,560	4	\$ 640	16	\$ 2,160	16	\$ 2,672	16	\$ 2,480	92	\$ 12,472
Evaluate road drainage and determine if modification of existing stormwater syst	\$ -	\$ -	16	\$ 2,560	16	\$ 2,880	16	\$ 3,120	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,080	8	\$ 1,336	8	\$ 1,240	80	\$ 12,256
Meet with Tier 2 Stakeholders to discuss draft findings and recomm	4	\$ 700	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	28	\$ 4,980	
Develop strategic plans for each identified study area that include a	4	\$ 700	16	\$ 2,560	16	\$ 2,880	16	\$ 3,120	4	\$ 640	40	\$ 5,400	24	\$ 4,008	16	\$ 2,480	136	\$ 19,308
Prepare Draft written report for the proposed stormwater improve	4	\$ 700	24	\$ 3,840	16	\$ 2,880	16	\$ 3,120	\$ -	\$ -	40	\$ 5,400	8	\$ 1,336	16	\$ 2,480	124	\$ 17,276
Meet with Tier 2 Stakeholders	4	\$ 700	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	28	\$ 4,980	
Prepare Final written report	4	\$ 700	16	\$ 2,560	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560	\$ -	\$ -	16	\$ 2,160	4	\$ 668	4	\$ 620	60	\$ 9,088
Task Description	J. Burton		J. Balint		J. Pines		S. Plummer		B. Tarpinian		Support				Total Hours	SUB TOTAL COST		
	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost				
<b>TEAM 6</b>																		
Complete the City PR Toolkit	\$ -	\$ -	2	\$ 320	2	\$ 300	2	\$ 300	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	6	\$ 920	
Refine Stakeholder list	\$ -	\$ -	2	\$ 320	2	\$ 300	2	\$ 300	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	6	\$ 920	
Prepare overall project materials in collaboration with the City	2	\$ 350	4	\$ 640	12	\$ 1,800	8	\$ 1,200	\$ -	\$ -	16	\$ 2,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	42	\$ 5,990	
Prepare specific Study Area materials	2	\$ 350	4	\$ 640	12	\$ 1,800	8	\$ 1,200	4	\$ 500	16	\$ 2,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	46	\$ 6,490	
Meet with Tier 3 Stakeholders	4	\$ 700	4	\$ 640	4	\$ 600	4	\$ 600	\$ -	\$ -	4	\$ 500	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	20	\$ 3,040	
Plan and execute an "open house" virtual meeting with stakeholders	2	\$ 350	8	\$ 1,280	16	\$ 2,400	8	\$ 1,200	4	\$ 500	16	\$ 2,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	54	\$ 7,730	
Plan and execute street walks with the Tier 4 stakeholders with tech	2	\$ 350	2	\$ 320	12	\$ 1,800	8	\$ 1,200	\$ -	\$ -	8	\$ 1,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	32	\$ 4,670	
Plan and execute an "open house" virtual meeting with stakeholders	4	\$ 700	8	\$ 1,280	12	\$ 1,800	8	\$ 1,200	8	\$ 1,000	16	\$ 2,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	56	\$ 7,980	
Set up virtual "office hours" to schedule one on one meetings with p	4	\$ 700	24	\$ 3,840	8	\$ 1,200	\$ -	\$ -	24	\$ 3,000	16	\$ 2,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	76	\$ 10,740	
Document all interactions with the public.	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	40	\$ 6,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	40	\$ 5,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	80	\$ 11,000	

TOTAL \$ 313,598  
 Max 5% Markup on Subs \$ 10,600

TOTAL \$ 324,198



**YEAR 2 and BASIS for YEARS 3&4**

Task Description	J. Burton		J. Balint		B. Tarpinian		Support										Total Hours	SUB TOTAL COST
	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost	Hours	Cost		
<b>TEAM 1</b>																		
Kick off meeting	8	\$ 1,400	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,080	8	\$ 1,000									32	\$ 4,760
Tier 1 interactions (14 meetings)	14	\$ 2,450	28	\$ 4,480	14	\$ 1,890	14	\$ 1,750									70	\$ 10,570
Project management (12 months)	24	\$ 4,200	48	\$ 7,680	48	\$ 6,480	12	\$ 1,500									132	\$ 19,860
<b>TEAM 2</b>																		
Process limited data for Study Areas		\$ -		\$ -		\$ -	2	\$ 380	40	\$ 5,280							42	\$ 5,660
Complete all base drawings after field verification test	2	\$ 470	4	\$ 800	8	\$ 1,336	2	\$ 380	2	\$ 264	50	\$ 5,400					68	\$ 8,650
<b>TEAM 3</b>																		
Review model in Study Area 1	4	\$ 840	16	\$ 3,120	40	\$ 8,400	20	\$ 2,900									80	\$ 15,260
Test proposed recommendations	4	\$ 840	24	\$ 4,680	40	\$ 8,400	16	\$ 2,320									84	\$ 16,240
<b>TEAM 4</b>																		
Field investigations for entire area	4	\$ 700	4	\$ 640	4	\$ 720	4	\$ 780	8	\$ 1,120	8	\$ 1,080	8	\$ 1,336	8	\$ 1,240	48	\$ 6,376
Meet with Tier 4 Stakeholders to review in field		\$ -	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560		\$ -	12	\$ 1,620	12	\$ 2,004	12	\$ 1,860	60	\$ 7,904
<b>TEAM 5</b>																		
Identify areas for recommended drainage solutions		\$ -	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560	8	\$ 1,120		\$ -		\$ -		\$ -	32	\$ 5,400
Evaluate and recommend opportunities to alleviate drainage issues	2	\$ 350	12	\$ 1,920	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560	4	\$ 560	16	\$ 2,160	16	\$ 2,672	16	\$ 2,480	82	\$ 10,662
Evaluate road drainage and determine if modification of existing storm	2	\$ 350	12	\$ 1,920	8	\$ 1,440	16	\$ 3,120	8	\$ 1,120	8	\$ 1,080	8	\$ 1,336	8	\$ 1,240	70	\$ 10,366
Meet with Tier 2 Stakeholders to discuss draft findings and recommen	2	\$ 350	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560		\$ -		\$ -		\$ -		\$ -	26	\$ 4,630
Develop strategic plans for each identified study area that include a s	2	\$ 350	16	\$ 2,560	8	\$ 1,440	16	\$ 3,120	4	\$ 560	32	\$ 4,320	16	\$ 2,672	24	\$ 3,720	118	\$ 15,022
Prepare Draft written report for the proposed stormwater improvemen	2	\$ 350	24	\$ 3,840	8	\$ 1,440	16	\$ 3,120		\$ -	6	\$ 810	8	\$ 1,336	8	\$ 1,240	72	\$ 10,896
Meet with Tier 2 Stakeholders	4	\$ 700	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560		\$ -	16	\$ 2,160		\$ -		\$ -	44	\$ 7,140
Prepare Final written report	4	\$ 700	16	\$ 2,560	8	\$ 1,440	8	\$ 1,560		\$ -	16	\$ 2,160	4	\$ 668	4	\$ 620	60	\$ 9,088
<b>TEAM 6</b>																		
Refine Stakeholder list		\$ -	2	\$ 320	2	\$ 300	2	\$ 300		\$ -		\$ -		\$ -		\$ -	6	\$ 920
Prepare specific Study Area materials	2	\$ 350	4	\$ 640	8	\$ 1,200	4	\$ 600	4	\$ 500	8	\$ 1,000		\$ -		\$ -	30	\$ 4,290
Meet with Tier 3 Stakeholders	4	\$ 700	4	\$ 640	4	\$ 600	4	\$ 600		\$ -	4	\$ 500		\$ -		\$ -	20	\$ 3,040
Plan and execute an "open house" virtual meeting with stakeholders	2	\$ 350	8	\$ 1,280	12	\$ 1,800	4	\$ 600	4	\$ 500	8	\$ 1,000		\$ -		\$ -	38	\$ 5,530
Plan and execute street walks with the Tier 4 stakeholders with techn	2	\$ 350	2	\$ 320	8	\$ 1,200	4	\$ 600		\$ -	8	\$ 1,000		\$ -		\$ -	24	\$ 3,470
Plan and execute an "open house" virtual meeting with stakeholders	2	\$ 350	8	\$ 1,280	8	\$ 1,200	4	\$ 600	8	\$ 1,000	12	\$ 1,500		\$ -		\$ -	42	\$ 5,930
Set up virtual "office hours" to schedule one on one meetings with pro	2	\$ 350	24	\$ 3,840	8	\$ 1,200		\$ -	24	\$ 3,000	12	\$ 1,500		\$ -		\$ -	70	\$ 9,890
Document all interactions with the public.		\$ -		\$ -	40	\$ 6,000		\$ -		\$ -	24	\$ 3,000		\$ -		\$ -	64	\$ 9,000

YEAR 2 SUB TOTAL \$ 210,554

Max 5% Markup on Subs \$ 6,600

TOTAL \$ 217,154

Average Year 3 and 4 Budgets (each) \$180,000

Hubbell, Roth & Clark, Inc.

2023 Hourly Rate Schedule

Prepared for:

City of Ann Arbor

<u>Category</u>	<u>Billable Rates</u>	
Principal	150.00	- 197.00
Sr. Associate/Managing Engineer	176.00	- 213.00
Associate/Managing Engineer	142.00	- 176.00
Manager	134.00	- 180.00
Supervisor	109.00	- 148.00
Sr. Project Engineer/Architect/Surveyor	139.00	- 180.00
Project Engineer/Architect/Surveyor	119.00	- 138.00
Staff Engineer/Architect/Surveyor	111.00	- 119.00
Senior Project Analyst	132.00	- 154.00
Project Analyst	106.00	- 119.00
Staff Analyst	111.00	- 111.00
Graduate Engineer/Architect I/II	84.00	- 114.00
Technical Specialist	116.00	- 116.00
Sr Designer	133.00	- 141.00
Designer	125.00	- 135.00
Cadd Technician	66.00	- 125.00
Sr. Survey Office Technician	116.00	- 116.00
Survey Party Chief	92.00	- 130.00
Survey - Field Technician	69.00	- 72.00
Project Representatives	108.00	- 150.00
Sr. Construction Observer	82.00	- 105.00
Construction Observer I/II	68.00	- 103.00
Construction - Office Technician	80.00	- 87.00
Testing Coordinator	92.00	- 92.00
Testing Technician	63.00	- 79.00
Administrative Support**	64.00	- 138.00

Wage rates shown above are reflective for 2023. Rates will be increased an average of 3% in future years.

Billable rates for Hubbell, Roth & Clark, Inc. include Unemployment and Payroll taxes, contributions for Social Security, Retirement benefits, Medical and Life insurance benefits, normal printing cost, telephones, fax, computer time, mileage, other overhead costs and profit.

Allowable Reimbursable expenses will be invoiced at our cost which is defined as the direct costs plus 10%.

\*\* This Category includes Computer, Reproduction and Administrative Staff.

---

**SPICER GROUP, INC.**

**STANDARD HOURLY RATES**

**Ann Arbor – Citywide Drainage Analysis for Gravel Roads**

*Effective January 2023*

---

Project Assistant.....	\$102.00
Crew Chief .....	\$144.00
Project Surveyor .....	\$190.00
CAD Designer .....	\$140.00
CAD Technician .....	\$108.00
LiDAR Technician .....	\$132.00
Design Engineer .....	\$144.00
Project Engineer .....	\$167.00
Project Manager .....	\$200.00
Principal Engineer .....	\$235.00

*Overtime rates for hourly workers will be charged at 1-1/2 times the above rates.*

*Standard Hourly Rates are subject to a 5% annual rate increase.*

## Labor Billing Rates

Effective January 1, 2023

<u>Category</u>	<u>Rate \$/hr.*,**</u>
Executive/Sr. Scientist	260
Officer/Sr. Scientist	245
Senior Engineer/Scientist	225
Senior Project Engineer/Scientist II	210
Senior Project Engineer/Scientist I	195
Project Engineer/Scientist III	175
Project Engineer/Scientist II	155
Project Engineer/Scientist I	145
Engineer/Scientist	130
Environmental Specialist	125
Clerical/Ast. Project Mgr.	90

\*Hourly billable rates do not include direct billable costs such as supplies, equipment and computer user fees, rental costs, reproduction, postage, laboratory charges, subcontractors, subconsultants, and 10% administrative fee on direct costs.

\*\*Specific litigation technical support services, including depositions and testimony, are billed at 150% of the above labor rates.



THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK



### **Bloomfield Hills**

555 Hulet Drive  
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48302  
248-454-6300 | Fax: 248.454-6312

### **Delhi Township**

2101 Aurelius Road, Suite 2  
Holt, MI 48842  
517-694-7760

### **Detroit**

Buhl Building, Suite 1650  
535 Griswold Street Detroit, MI 48226  
313-965-3330

### **Grand Rapids**

1925 Breton Rd SE, Suite 100  
Grand Rapids, MI 49506  
616-454-4286

### **Howell**

105 West Grand River Ave.  
Howell, MI 48843  
517-552-9199

### **Jackson**

401 S. Mechanic Street, Suite B  
Jackson, MI 49201  
517-292-1295

### **Kalamazoo**

834 King Highway, Suite 107  
Kalamazoo, MI 49001  
269-665-2005

### **Traverse City**

1501 Cass Street  
Traverse City, MI 49684  
231-714-5007

### **Troy**

629 E Elmwood  
Troy, MI 48083  
248-454-6300

## **OUR OFFICES**



## **REACH OUT TO US**

248-454-6300  
[www.hrcengr.com](http://www.hrcengr.com) 