



City of Ann Arbor

Meeting Minutes - Final

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, March 11, 2021

7:00 PM

Electronic Meeting

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 978 6401 4515

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Evan Hall called the meeting to order at 7:01 pm, stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, March 11, 2021 electronic meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission.

The meeting is being held electronically to protect public health and safety due to the COVID-19 virus and to comply with orders issued by the governor, the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services, and/or the Washtenaw County Health Department.

We intend to conduct this meeting similarly to an in-person meeting. However, please be patient if there are technical issues. Public comment will be via telephone only. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting id # 978 6401 4515 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Others participating in the meeting:

Planning Manager, Brett Lenart

Present: 7 - John Beeson, Evan Hall, David Rochlen, Jessica Quijano, Kathryn Fortener, Chair Anna Epperson, and Robert White

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as amended; Item F-6 (310 S Ashley) will not be heard tonight but the public hearing will be held as it was advertised. On a voice vote and a show of hands, the Chair declared the motion carried.

D. PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Tom Stulberg, 1202 Traver Street, Ann Arbor, spoke about possibly living in the oldest schoolhouse in the State of Michigan; also spoke about an upcoming public hearing on Accessory Dwelling Units and that there are Historic District standards for new accessory structures.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

E-1. [21-0492](#) HDC21-006; 100 S Main St; New Windows, Business Signs; MSHD

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff Memo. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and Jessica Quijano visited the site as part of their review for last month's agenda hearings. They were available if any Commissioners had questions.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicants were available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by John Beeson, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 100 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install three edge-lit wall signs as shown in the amended submission. The work as amended is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and

relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for signs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 7 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and White

Nays: 0

F. HEARINGS

F-1. [21-0493](#) HDC21-031; 1223 Traver; Garage Status Determination; BHD

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Mary Underwood, spoke of her love living in her historic structure; I was able to build another studio in my rear yard that may enable me to age in

place; city's historic buildings are facing threats in the face of density; I hope the commission finds the garage a non-contributing structure; or allows it to be moved off site; Can the committee help accommodate this young family preserve a historic structure?

Tom Stulberg, spoke of not having more data to provide; In addition to living at 1202 Traver, and being a part owner of 1206 Traver, and several rental properties on Pontiac Trail, said he didn't want to tell the Commission how to do their job, and he had faith in them that whatever they decide he and his partners would support.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the single-car garage at 1223 Traver Street in the Broadway Historic District be classified as a contributing structure because of its presence during the period of significance for the Broadway Historic District and the historic integrity of its design, massing, characteristics and materials.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7 – 0

Yeas: 7 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and White

Nays: 0

F-2. [21-0494](#) HDC21-033; 540 S Seventh; Remodel Addition; OWSHD

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathy Fortener, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 540 S Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to do the following work on the addition: lift the roof approximately 2 feet and add a dormer to its rear elevation; modify or move several windows; install a double slider on the rear elevation; and replace the lap siding and corner boards. In addition, add an egress window to the second-floor rear (west) elevation. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for new additions and windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 7 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and White

Nays: 0

F-3. [21-0495](#) HDC21-034; 121 & 123 E Liberty; New Storefront; MSHD

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 121 and 123 East Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to replace three storefronts and several display windows. The work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 9 and the guidelines for storefronts.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 7 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and White

Nays: 0

F-4. [21-0496](#) HDC21-035; 216 N State; Garage Rebuild; OFWHD

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by John Beeson, seconded by Bob White, that the single-car garage at 216 N State Street in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District be classified as a contributing structure because of its presence during the period of significance for the Old Fourth Ward Historic District and the historic integrity of its design, massing, characteristics and materials. Further, it is determined that the garage is deteriorated beyond repair and shall be replaced with a replica garage using matching materials in matching dimensions located on the same footprint or shifted up to 3 feet to meet zoning requirements. Elevation drawings and details must be approved by staff and a majority of the officers of the HDC before staff may sign off on a building permit for the replica garage.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7 – 0

Yeas: 7 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and White

Nays: 0

F-5. [21-0497](#) HDC21-036; 106 N Fourth; Addition; MSHD

STAFF REPORT:

Commissioner Anna Epperson had a conflict of interest on this

application and was removed from the meeting (to the waiting room during the electronic meeting)

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioner John Beeson visited the site as part of his review. He reported his findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by John Beeson, seconded by Bob White, that the Historic District Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 106 North Fourth Avenue, a contributing property in the Fourth/Ann Historic District, to add two floors to the single-story rear wing, build a roof deck, install a window in a boarded opening on the first floor north elevation, and perform restoration work, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, especially those for all addition, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2 and 9 and the guidelines for alterations for a new use, additions, windows, and district/neighborhood setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, and White

Nays: 0

Recused: 1 - Chair Epperson

- F-6.** [21-0498](#) HDC21-037; 310 S Ashley; Chimney; MSHD - POSTPONED UNTIL APRIL 8, 2021 HDC MEETING
Commissioner Anna Epperson returned to the meeting.

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher explained discussion of this agenda item will take place at the April 8, 2021 HDC meeting.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Postponed Indefinitely

- F-7.** [21-0499](#) HDC21-039; 204 W Jefferson; Window Replacement; OWSHD

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners John Beeson and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

New Roof:

Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the portion of the application at 204 W Jefferson Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install an asphalt roof over the existing asphalt roof, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 2 and 9, and the guidelines for roofs.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Vote on New Roof:

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 7 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and White

Nays: 0

Glass Block Window:

Moved by Anna Epperson, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the portion of the application at 204 W Jefferson Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, for the prior installation of glass blocks in an arch-topped window opening on the west elevation, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for windows and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 2, 5, 6 and 9, and the guidelines for windows.

Vote on Glass Block Window:

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion failed. 7 - 0.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 7 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and White

Moved by Anna Epperson, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission finds that installing glass blocks in an original window opening does not qualify for a certificate of appropriateness, and that the property owner is ordered to restore the window to its former condition by installing an arch-topped wood sash with clear glass within 60 days. Before installation, the owner must apply for and receive a building permit that includes window specifications. Staff will examine the window specifications for compatibility during the building permit review and will sign off on the building permit only if the window specifications meet the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7 – 0

Yeas: 7 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and White

Nays: 0

G. NEW BUSINESS

G-1. [21-0500](#) Staff Approvals for DTE Gas Meters

Moved by Bob White, seconded by David Rochlen, that the

Ann Arbor Historic District Commission adopt the following RESOLUTION

WHEREAS, The Michigan Local Historic District Act, Being MCL 399.205(10), authorizes the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission to “delegate the issuance of certificates of appropriateness for the specified minor classes of work to its staff or another delegated authority,” and “the commission shall provide to the delegated authority specific written standards for issuing certificates of appropriateness”; and

WHEREAS, The Ann Arbor City Code Section 8:414 Administrative Approval authorizes the Historic District Commission to delegate the issuance of certificates of appropriateness for specified minor classes of work to its staff, and says the commission shall provide specific written standards for issuing certificates of appropriateness under this subsection;

RESOLVED, That the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission authorizes staff to review and issue, upon receipt of a complete application, a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to the DTE Gas Company in all locally-designated historic districts for the purpose of installing new exterior gas meters and associated leads, provided that the following conditions are met:

- 1. The meter must be installed at the rear of a building, or in another location not visible from the public right way. If DTE shows that the foregoing are not feasible, the meter may be installed beyond the front 1/3 of the side elevation of the building, and behind the first basement window, if applicable.**
- 2. The meter must be near grade and not physically attached to the exterior of a historic building (e.g. located on a separate support post).**
- 3. Directional drilling must be used to install gas leads in order to minimize surface disturbance in historic neighborhoods, unless DTE shows it is not feasible for the specific property.**
- 4. If applications for individual properties are combined (e.g. by block) the combined submission may describe the meter size, appearance, and method of installation once (if applicable to all properties in the submission), provided that the submission specifically states the meter installation location for each property and for a side elevation, include a plot plan showing that it is beyond the front 1/3 of that elevation and beyond the first basement window, if applicable.**
- 5. If applications for individual properties are combined, DTE remains obligated to pay the application fee for each property.**

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the resolution adopted unanimously. Vote: 7 – 0

Yeas: 7 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and White

Nays: 0

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [21-0266](#) January 14, 2021 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

The January 14, 2021 HDC meeting minutes were unanimously approved and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J. ASSIGNMENTS

J-1. **Review Committee: Monday, April 5, 2021 at noon for the April 8, 2021 Regular Meeting**

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Kathryn Fortener volunteered for the April 5, 2021 HDC Review Committee at 5:00 pm.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

K-1 [21-0501](#) February 2021 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

M. COMMUNICATIONS

M-1 [21-0502](#) Various Communication to HDC

Received and Filed**N. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 10:41 pm.

Written comments may be submitted until 4:00 pm on the meeting day using the City's eComment system, which is available alongside the agenda at <http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

Public kiosks are now installed in the lobby and basement of City Hall to allow members of the public to attend and participate in electronic meetings.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

Evan Hall, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
mg/