



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Final

City Planning Commission

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Tuesday, March 21, 2023

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Shannan Gibb-Randall called the meeting to order at 7:00pm, in Council Chambers at City Hall of Ann Arbor.

2. ROLL CALL

Deputy Planning Manager, Hank Kelley, called the roll.

Others present: Planning Manager Brett Lenart, Deputy Planning Manager Hank Kelley, City Planner Chris Cheng, City Planner Matt Kowalski, and City Planner Alexis DiLeo [via Zoom].

Present 8 - Mills, Gibb-Randall, Sauve, Abrons, Hammerschmidt, Disch, Clarke, and Wyche

Absent 1 - Lee

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Moved by Commissioner Lisa Sauv , seconded by Commissioner Ellie Abrons, to Approve the Agenda as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried unanimously.

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

No Minutes to approve.

5. REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS

5-a. City Council

Councilmember Lisa Disch reported from the March 20, 2023 City Council Meeting, that Council approved 415 West Washington PUD Zoning on a first reading.

5-b. Planning Manager

Deputy Planning Manager Kelley reported Downtown Premiums returning to the Planning Commission April 4, 2023 with updated recommendations and considerations.

5-c. Planning Commission Officers and Committees

Commissioner Sauv  reported the Ordinance Review (ORC) Committee discussion included a petition to add event spaces and other evaluations of Office District.

5-d. Written Communications and Petitions

23-0476 Various Communications to the Planning Commission

Attachments: Comm from 3-7-2023 CPC WS Mtg, Angela B.pdf, Benton .pdf, Braun Court.pdf, Campbell, Lee.pdf, Chambers.pdf, Dickerson.pdf, Dumas.pdf, Gerstein.pdf, Haig.pdf, Henyard.pdf, Koberstein.pdf, Linn.pdf, Lucchesi.pdf, Matujec.pdf, Maxim.pdf, Natural Gas Ban Opposition 2023.pdf, Palmer.pdf, Pearson.pdf, Roca-Campana.pdf, Rosenbaum.pdf, Thompson.pdf, Thomson.pdf, Tomsic.pdf, Tyler.pdf, Zechar.pdf, JBM CPC MEMO 721 Forest Planning comments.pdf, Rev3_20220228_PUD Community Benefits_721 Forest.pdf

Received and filed.

6. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)

Adam Goodman, resident, spoke on concerns of downtown premiums.

Scott Trudeau, 526 N Main, spoke on downtown density/premiums and University of Michigan land acquisition adjacent to downtown.

Ken Garber, 28 Haverhill, spoke to urge gas ban and stated green interventions are needed to prevent climate change.

Shane Thomas Salvatore Guenther, resident, spoke in favor to increase number of university housing units.

Alex Lowe, 3340 Fernwood Avenue, spoke in favor of more housing downtown and to reduce carbon dioxide (Co2) output.

Noting no additional public speakers, Chair Gibb-Randall closed Public Comment.

7. PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT REGULAR MEETING

23-0477 Public Hearings Scheduled for Tuesday, April 4, 2023 Planning Commission Meeting

Attachments: 4-4-2023 Notice of Public Hearing.pdf

Hank Kelley reported one upcoming Public Hearing scheduled on 4/4/2023 for 2929 Plymouth Road. University of Michigan Credit Union presenting Site Plan and Special Exception Use, proposing to build a 4,740 square foot building containing three drive through lanes and 22 parking spaces on a one acre site. Property current zoned Office, Special Exception Use requested for three drive through teller lanes.

8. REGULAR BUSINESS - Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing, and Commission Discussion of Each Item

8-a. **23-0501** Platt Road Townhomes Site Plan for City Planning Commission approval, Wetland Use Permit, and Landscape Modification - 3680, 3696, 3746, and 3788 Platt Road. Staff Recommendation: Approval

Attachments: Platt Rd Townhomes Staff Rpt2.pdf, 3680 3696 3746 and 3788 Platt Rd Zoning.pdf, 3680 3696 3746 and 3788 Platt Rd Aerial.pdf, Platt Road Townhomes Site Plan #2.pdf, Platt Road Townhomes DA #2- Copy.pdf

PROJECT PRESENTATION:

Andy Milia, Development Consultant, Trowbridge Holdings, and Anthony Randazzo, Principal, Trowbridge Holdings, John Curry, Civil Engineer, and Phil Jarratt, Architect, provided a review on the proposed project.

STAFF REPORT:

City Planner, Chris Cheng, provided the staff report on the agenda item.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Phil Houn, 3154 Williamsburg, spoke in opposition of project, expressed traffic and construction concerns and impact on animals and nearby wooded area with proposed project.

Ken Garber, 28 Haverhill, suggested staff calculate greenhouse gas emissions of proposed project. Suggested support of gas ban ordinance.

Scott Trudeau, 526 North Main Street, spoke in support of project, suggested considering balance of commuter impacts and impacts of using gas in projects. Support higher density construction to bring people into the City limits.

Alex Lowe, resident, spoke in support of project. Supported access to parks and stated support for townhomes since they are energy efficient compared to single-family homes.

Caller, resident, spoke in opposition of project expressing concerns for an increase of traffic around Platt Road.

James D'Amour, resident, spoke in support of electrification or as close to it as we can. Expressed interest in impacts and connectivity to parks.

Noting no additional public speakers, Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Hearing.

Moved by Commissioner Donnell Wyche seconded by Commissioner Lisa Disch, that

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission approves the Platt Road Townhomes Site Plan and recommends approval of the Development Agreement, as the site plan complies with all applicable requirements of the Unified Development Code, and other applicable laws, ordinances, standards, and regulations and based upon the following conditions:

- All parcels must be combined before issuance of any Building Permits.
- Final approval from the Washtenaw County Water Resource Commissioner.

The Planning Commission approves the Wetland Use Permit for the Platt Road Townhomes project site plan.

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the proposed landscape modifications according to Chapter 55 Unified Development Code, Section 5.20.10B, to require one tree for Right of Way screening every 45 feet.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format].

On a roll call voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 8-0.

Yeas: 8 - Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, Sara Hammerschmidt, Lisa Disch, Sadira Clarke, and Donnell Wyche

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Wonwoo Lee

- 8-b.** [23-0492](#) 721 South Forest PUD Rezoning and Site Plan for City Council Approval - A petition to rezone the 1.2-acre parcel from R4C (Multiple-Family Residential) zoning to PUD (Planned Unit Development) zoning. The Site Plan proposes one 12-story building containing 228 residential units with 744 bedrooms and associated residential amenities. The site will contain 10 surface parking spaces and 93 spaces within the building. The existing building will be demolished. Staff Recommendation: Denial

Attachments: 721 S Forest Staff Report v.1.pdf, 721 S Forest-Sup Regs, Draft 3-15-23.pdf, 721-Forest_Site Plan_v1 (1).pdf, Verve AA PUD Architecture_v1 (2).pdf, 721 S Forest Ave Zoning Map.pdf, 721 S Forest Ave Aerial Map.pdf, 721 S Forest DA 2023 - v.1.pdf, 721 S Forest Master Plan analysis

PROJECT PRESENTATION:

Ryan Bumb, Subtext, provided a review of the proposed project.

STAFF REPORT:

City Planner, Matt Kowalski, provided the staff report on the agenda item.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Marc Gerstein, 1321 Forest Court, spoke in opposition, concerned proposal uses PUD to circumvent zoning. .

Jennifer Biers, 722 S Forest, spoke in opposition, concerned with impacts to historic architecture.

Eleanor Linn, 1321 Forest Court, spoke in opposition, concerned with height and density compared to surroundings.

Lindy Jurgens, represents 722 S Forest, spoke in opposition, concerned with impacts to neighborhood character.

Adam Goodman, 400 Virginia Avenue, spoke in support, stating project would add needed affordable housing.

Scott Trudeau, 526 N Main, spoke in support, stating project would provide more housing.

John Markewicz, representing 1331 Hill Street spoke in opposition, stated project is too immense compared to what is in the area.

Adam Jaskiewicz, 1430 Las Vegas Drive, spoke in support, stated project will add much needed housing.

Caller, 521 Snyder Avenue, spoke in support; City is in a housing crisis and homes are desperately needed.

Daniel Adams, 1016 Daniel Street, spoke in support, City needs housing

Ellen Ramsburgh, resident, spoke in opposition, concerned with buffers to adjacent properties.

Caller, 3505 Charter Place, spoke in support, but stated parking wasn't

needed. Sustainability is high, affordable housing contribution is high.

Erich Zechar, 2435 Prairie Street, spoke in support, stating if we don't build student housing here, will have to be built somewhere and start to get sprawl causing driving.

Meredith Kahn, 817 Pomona Road, spoke in support, asked Commission to vote in favor because of benefits to the City and residents. Approval reflects urgency of climate emergency.

Alex Lowe, Ward 3, spoke in support, suggested asking for more - reduce setbacks to get additional units. Need more bicycle parking, class B and e-bike chargers. Need more stories and a higher building.

Luis Vasquez, Ward 1 909 Barton Drive, spoke in support, saying project meets criteria and many City goals.

SE Strongman, resident, spoke in support, stated need for student housing - project doesn't solve every issue, but not building new, won't either.

Noting no additional public speakers, Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Hearing.

Moved by Commissioner Donnell Wyche, seconded by Commissioner Lisa Disch, that:

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 721 South Forest Planned Unit Development (PUD) Zoning District and Supplemental Regulations,

and

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve 721 South Forest Planned Unit Development (PUD) Site Plan and Development Agreement.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format].

On a roll call voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair

declaring the motion carried. Vote 6-2.

Yeas: 6 - Shannan Gibb-Randall, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, Lisa Disch, Sadira Clarke, and Donnell Wyche

Nays: 2 - Sarah Mills, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Absent: 1 - Wonwoo Lee

- 8-c.** **23-0505** 121 Catherine Street Site Plan for Planning Commission Approval and Development Agreement. Staff Recommendation: Approval with Conditions

Attachments: 2023-3-21 Staff Report SP22-2020.pdf, 2023-3-21 Site Plan SP22-2020.pdf, 121 Catherine St Zoning Map.pdf, 2023-3-21 Zoning Aerial Maps SP22-2020.pdf, 2023-3-16 Draft Development Agreement SP22-2020.pdf

PROJECT PRESENTATION:

Jennifer Hall, Executive Director Ann Arbor Housing Commission, and Jack Schroder, Architect, provided a review of the proposed project.

STAFF REPORT:

City Planner, Alexis DiLeo, provided the staff report on the agenda item.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Angela Davis, 118 W Kingsley Street, spoke in support, giving back to this area is significant to many people. Project gives back to many diverse cultures in City so we may thrive as one.

Adam Goodman, 400 Virginia, spoke in support, appreciate we are offering affordable housing in a nice area, not just near highways. This is permanent supportive housing. Stated displeasure with parking, there is a lot of parking in Kerrytown.

Scott Trudeau, 526 N Main Street, spoke in support, welcomes new neighbors and appreciate small step to repair damage that has been done.

Adam Jaskiewicz, 1430 Las Vegas Drive, spoke in support, helps address housing and climate crisis in desirable area with amenities.

Caller, 5th Ward, spoke in support, appreciate hard work, wishes building

were twice as tall.

Caller, 5th Ward, spoke in support, excited about commitment to house most vulnerable. We need affordable housing downtown.

Kirk Westphal, 3505 Charter Place, spoke in support, looks well laid out and attractive addition. There are hundreds of parking spots in area. Seems like an environmental justice issue.

Amanda Carlisle, 1619 Waltham Drive Washtenaw Housing Alliance, spoke in support, project location is ideal for housing, employees and patrons.

Luis Vazquez, resident, spoke in support, perhaps project should be taller. We really need projects like this.

Alex Lowe, 3rd Ward resident, spoke in support, provided a brief history of project site since the 1900s.

Caller, 837 W Huron Street resident, spoke in support, would like to see façade that better matches historic nature of neighborhood.

Noting no additional speakers, Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Hearing.

Moved by Commissioner Sarah Mills seconded by Commissioner Donnell Wyche, that:

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission approves the 121 Catherine Street Site Plan and Development Agreement subject to addressing outstanding service unit comments, summarized as:

- 1. Clarify plan for street trees.**
- 2. Confirm wrong-way exiting vehicle sight distance and provide bumpout at end of loading zone.**
- 3. Revise sequence of construction regarding curbing and first course of asphalt.**
- 4. Provide details of recycle compactor dumpster and add protection bollards for electrical equipment.**
- 5. Propose and detail a public access easement, note the need for a**

temporary grading easement, clarify limits of restoration in alley, and note ownership of certain features in right-of-way.

6. Sanitary mitigation approval.

7. Note necessary compliance for green roof.

8. Adjust width of sidewalk/amenity zone, and street tree and streetlight spacing.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format].

On a roll call voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 8-0.

Yeas: 8 - Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, Sara Hammerschmidt, Lisa Disch, Sadira Clarke, and Donnell Wyche

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Wonwoo Lee

9. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)

Scott Trudeau, 526 N Main, appreciates optimism of Comprehensive Plan, please listen to real people and developers trying to make things happen.

Angela Davis, 118 W Kingsley, we have a housing crisis, affordable housing is a must.

Alex Lowe, 3340 Fernwood Avenue, wants our City to grow as a City and to do it carefully, but quickly.

10. COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

None.

11. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Commissioner Lisa Sauvé, seconded by Commissioner Ellie Abrons, to adjourn the meeting at 11:12 pm. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried unanimously.

Shannan Gibb-Randall, Chairperson

/courtney manor

eComments for the Commission may be left via our Legistar calendar page (column to the very right)
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Persons requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting.

Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>). Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

(If an agenda item is postponed, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a postponed agenda item will appear on a future agenda please contact Planning staff. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org))

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.) Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>. The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150

City Planning Commission regular meetings have transitioned to a hybrid meeting model. The City of Ann Arbor highly encourages the public to participate in public meetings, either in-person or remotely.

The City of Ann Arbor has existing COVID-19 safety rules that are required of visitors entering city facilities. If you choose to attend a meeting in-person, the following safety rules are expected to be observed. These include:

- City Hall is mask-friendly to all guests at all times.

- Masks will be required for all meeting participants and guests when the local CDC Community Level in Washtenaw County is high. Check the current level for Washtenaw County through the CDC's website [here](#).

- Please do not attend if you are sick for any reason, including having symptoms or a diagnosis of COVID-19, or have recently been in close contact with someone with COVID-19. Several other attendance options are available when you are sick or in quarantine, or simply for your convenience.