

It is the mission of the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority to provide useful, reliable, safe, environmentally responsible, and cost-effective public transportation options for the benefit of the Greater Ann Arbor Community.

Approved Minutes

May 16, 2012

Ann Arbor Transportation Authority

Board of Directors Meeting and Annual Planning Retreat

Holiday Inn Express, 600 Briarwood Circle, Ann Arbor, Michigan 12:00 p.m.

Board Members Present: Jesse Bernstein, Eli Cooper, Anya Dale, Sue Gott (arrived 1:42pm), Charles Griffith, Roger Kerson, David Nacht

Staff Present: Michael Benham, Terry Black, Ron Copeland, Dawn Gabay, Jan Hallberg, Sarah Gryniewicz, Michael Ford, Ed Robertson, Mary Stasiak, Elizabeth Tibai, Phil Webb, Chris White

Recording Secretary: Karen Wheeler

Chairman Jesse Bernstein declared that a quorum was present and called the meeting to order at 12:25 p.m. Mr. Bernstein announced that the annual retreat portion of the meeting would follow regular board meeting business.

1.0 *Communications and Announcements*

Michael Ford announced that an action item related to the FY2013 budget was removed from a prior version of the meeting agenda as the budget process is part of the normal course of board business.

2.0 *Public Time – Comment on Agenda Items*

Thomas Partridge appeared before the Board. Mr. Partridge encouraged the Board to convert AATA into a countywide transportation system. Mr. Partridge commented on the agenda item to award a contract for Rideshare and Vanpool Matching and Administration Software suggesting that preferential treatment is being given to vanpool riders over services offered to senior citizens and people with disabilities. Mr. Partridge announced his candidacy for the Michigan House of Representatives noting that his agenda will include interconnected public transportation service.

No one further appearing, Mr. Bernstein declared public time closed.

3.0 *Review and Approval of Minutes*

3.1 *Review and Approval of Minutes of April 19, 2012*

Eli Cooper moved approval of the minutes as written with support from Anya Dale. David Nacht abstained. The motion carried: Dale, Cooper, Griffith, and Kerson – Yes. [Sue Gott was not present for the vote.]

3.2 *Review and Approval of Minutes of April 26, 2012*

David Nacht moved approval of the minutes as written with support from Charles Griffith. Anya Dale abstained. The motion carried: Cooper, Griffith, Kerson, and Nacht - Yes. [Sue Gott was not present for the vote.]

4.0 *Board and Staff Reports*

4.1 *Report on Recommendation to Award Three Year Bus Shelter Contract to Duo-Gard*

Chris White referred to a memorandum and resolution detailing a recommendation to award a contract for bus shelters to Duo-Gard. Three proposals were received in response to the Request for Proposals. Duo-Gard was the highest rated technically and had the lowest price. Mr. White displayed photos of and described the two main shelter styles.

4.2 *Report on Request for Approval of Updated Procurement Manual*

Phil Webb reported on a resolution to approve an updated Procurement Manual. The manual codifies standards, includes compliance with state and federal regulations and Board policies to guide purchasing. Mr. Webb noted the inclusion of the following new items: Living Wage Policy adopted by the Board in 2009, recommendations from auditors, a new approval process for new vendors, and an ethics policy and annual disclosure form.

4.3 *Report on Recommendation to Award Five Year Contract for Rideshare and Vanpool Matching and Administration Software*

Mary Stasiak reported on a recommendation to award a contract for Rideshare and Vanpool Matching and Administration Software. Four bids were received in response to the Request for Proposals. The contract is expected to exceed \$100,000 over the five year term of the agreement. The costs will be covered by Congestion Mitigation/Air Quality (CMAQ) funding which is programmed.

The meeting transitioned to the Retreat phase.

4.4 *Staff Presentations*

Michael Ford provided an overview of staff presentations for the retreat portion of the meeting stating that the goal was to identify priorities to move the agency forward for the next fiscal year. The full presentation can be accessed at the following link: www.theride.org/pdf/Board/Minutes/2012BrdRetreat.ppt.

Fulfilling the Vision

Mr. Ford kicked off the presentation with comments on fulfilling the vision for the organization. Mr. Ford reminded attendees of the “Ball of Confusion”, a mass of transportation projects identified, but not prioritized, nearly three years ago. Mr. Ford reported on the 30 year plan for countywide service developed with an unprecedented outreach effort to engage county residents and include their input in the plan. Mr. Ford noted that the plan includes a short-term (five year) implementation program.

Investing in the Future Today; New Service Initiatives

East Ann Arbor Health Center, Work Transportation Improvements and Night Ride – Chris White presented details of the new initiatives already implemented including extended service to East Ann Arbor Health Center, Work Transportation Improvements between Ann Arbor and Ypsilanti including extended Night Ride Service. Mr. White reported on ridership, on-time performance and funding sources for the services.

Mr. White responded to a question on the longevity of JARC funds related to expanded Night Ride Service. Mr. White indicated that the monies are currently a continuing funding source. In the event JARC funds became unavailable in future years, it would be necessary to identify an alternate funding source.

AirRide – Dawn Gabay reported on details of a new public-private partnership between AATA and Michigan Flyer to provide public transportation service between Ann Arbor and Detroit Metropolitan Airport (DTW). The service launched on April 1, 2012 with 12 daily round trips. Ms. Gabay reported on the schedule, stops, and fares and provided a brief description of the details of each community partnership. Ms. Gabay displayed photographs of the bus stops at DTW noting regional connectivity, and reported on ridership which more than doubled from 408 in Week 1 to 965 in Week 4. Ms. Gabay thanked Al Thomas, AATA Specialized Services Coordinator, for his work on the project. Ms. Gabay also thanked David Nacht for his persistence and pushing for the service for many years.

VanRide – Mary Stasiak reported on VanRide Commuter Vanpool Service under contract to VPSI. Ms. Stasiak reviewed the responsibilities in the contract for VPSI and AATA, reported on details of the VanRide fleet and rider fees which are expected to cover the operating costs. Ms. Stasiak reported on the campaign to promote the service and displayed images of the creative concept. Ms. Stasiak indicated that there were three vanpools in the works to begin soon.

Investing in the Future Today; Amenity Improvements

Website Redesign – Mary Stasiak provided an update on the website redesign. The new site is expected to be launched in summer 2012. Ms. Stasiak reported on training for the site, upcoming user testing and custom module development. Ms. Stasiak noted that the AirRide website, MyAirRide.com, launched in March and includes new design elements. Ms. Stasiak indicated that the Getdowntown.org website is scheduled to move to the new platform in fall 2012.

Bus Garage Expansion – Terry Black reported on the Bus Garage Expansion addition of 21,000 square feet. The addition will alleviate overcrowding and allows for future growth. The project was scheduled to be complete near the end of May 2012.

Blake Transit Center – Mr. Black provided an update on the Blake Transit Center reconstruction project reporting on details of the new 12,000 square foot facility. Mr. Black displayed design photos of the new facility and reviewed design elements. Mr. Black reported on the project schedule which calls for construction planned to begin in September 2012 and be completed in June 2013.

Mr. Black responded to a question about an upcoming vendor open house to host prospective contractors including Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) companies. The event was planned to highlight awareness of the project and to further the DBE initiative. A question was raised about including amenities for newspapers and beverages. Mr. Black indicated that is still being considered.

Boarding Location Improvements – Chris White reported on boarding location improvements at the Central Campus Transfer Center (CCTC), Washtenaw Avenue Transfer Center and bus stop improvements. The CCTC has 600 AATA boardings daily and 5,000 UM boardings per day and more than 1,000,000 pedestrian crossings per year. Plans for improvements this summer include installation of static information, making the electronic signs functional, and installing a signal crossing.

Mr. White responded to a question about additional information to be included on the signs which will be next bus, detours and delays. In response to a question about safety due to the high volume of pedestrians, Mr. White indicated that has not been an issue due to vehicles traveling at such low speed. The intent is to keep the speed of vehicles at very low levels.

Mr. White reported on the Washtenaw Avenue Transfer Center bus pull off completed in November 2011. A temporary shelter was installed due to expiration of the contract with the shelter vendor. A new contract is in the works and a permanent shelter is expected to be completed this summer.

Mr. White displayed photos of boarding location improvements. The improvements included concrete installation to improve accessibility at 127 bus stops in the last three years. Staff is continually looking for opportunities to partner with jurisdictions to take advantage of opportunities to make improvements. Mr. White reported on the Adopt-A-Stop program to get property owners cleaning shelters and removing snow. There has been significant growth in the program; from 7 partners in 2005 to 120 partners in 2012.

Scorecard: Ridership, Budget, and Rider Survey

Ridership – Chris White reported on AATA annual riders from 2002-2011. Totals range from just over 4,000,000 riders in 2002 to just under 6,000,000 in 2011; a trend similar nationwide. Mr. White noted strong growth this fiscal year and compared trends over fiscal years 2010, 2011 and through the first six months of FY2012. Ridership on the

Washtenaw Route increased 8% overall this year. A combination of the economy and a fare increase in May 2009 caused a decline in ridership on demand response service.

Budget – Phil Webb reported that expenses are \$573,000 under budget for the first six months of the fiscal year. This is due to AirRide only being in service for six months of the year and TMP education expenses being less than anticipated. Some budgeted positions have also been vacant for a portion of the fiscal year. Mr. Webb confirmed the current projection is to breakeven at fiscal year-end despite a budgeted deficit.

Survey of Users of TheRide – Chris White reported on highlights of a Rider Survey taken on-board buses taken in October 2011. A similar survey was conducted in 2009. The results of the two surveys were compared.

Some of the categories reported on included: Frequency of using TheRide, Trip Purpose (with work and school trips dominating the category), Modal Choice, Change in Use of TheRide, Number of Trips (37% of riders are making 80% of trips); Mode to the Bus Stop, Employment, Age of Riders (55% of people are under 29 years old which closely reflects the age cohort of the Washtenaw County population), Income, Use of Cell Phones and Use of Social Media.

Rider Satisfaction – Mr. White reported on rider satisfaction. There was improvement in each of the customer satisfaction measures over the past two years.

Service Improvement Priorities – Mr. White reported on feedback on how to improve current service (more frequent service, shorter trip times, service to more destinations and service to Metro Airport). Mr. White responded to an inquiry about a survey question to ascertain why more people are using the service which accounts for the recent ridership increases. Mr. White indicated that a question had not been included, but could be included in a future survey.

Organization – Michael Ford commented on the information presented by staff thus far in the meeting indicating that the organization is on the right track. Ridership is up, expenses are under budget, new services have been launched and customers have given a good report. Mr. Ford referred to the Transit Master Plan countywide process where new relationships have been forged and existing ones strengthened, and the work and processes have been inclusive responsive, engaging and transparent. Mr. Ford thanked the board for their time, effort and leadership through the emerging countywide process.

Countywide Transit Five Year Transit Program

Five Year Transit Program – Michael Benham made a presentation on the Five Year Transit Program. Mr. Benham reviewed the organization of the document and shared details of services to be provided under the Five Elements of Service in the plan: Demand Responsive Transit, Express Bus Service, Local Community Service, Park and Ride and Urban Bus Network and Enhancements. For each element, the type and hours of service were reviewed, as well as detailed maps displayed.

Mr. Benham responded to a question on how late service would be extended, indicating midnight. Current service stops at 10:30 p.m. Mr. Benham noted that weekend service hours will be expanded and reported that service details for each district, as well as the benefits, are being communicated to each community.

Mr. Benham reported that the plan touches briefly on financial issues and includes an analysis consistent with the Financial Task Force report. Mr. Benham indicated that additional public comment on services may change the costs noting that the second round of District Advisory Committee meetings would conclude within the week. Mr. Benham referred to next steps for the program including the final Five Year Transportation Program scheduled for Board review by mid-June.

Governance and Funding – Sarah Gryniwicz reported on governance development and the work of leadership and advisory committees. Ms. Gryniwicz outlined the process of transitioning from an Act 55 Authority to an Act 196 Authority and discussed the need to refine the program to finalize a budget. Two funding options were identified. Ms. Gryniwicz provided a brief update on federal and state legislation indicating that the TMP project team will continue to work with legislators and the Governor’s representative on emerging and pending legislation.

“4-Party” Public Transportation Agreement and Articles of Incorporation – Michael Ford reported on progress on the “4-Party” Public Transportation Agreement. Mr. Ford reported that Ann Arbor City Council approved the Agreement on March 5, and on May 15 the City of Ypsilanti adopted the agreement and Articles of Incorporation. Mr. Ford noted that there were some amendments by Ypsilanti on the Transportation Agreement that will need to be worked out with Ann Arbor and added that the Articles need to go before Ann Arbor City Council as well. The Transportation Agreement and Articles will also need concurrence from the County Board of Commissioners. Mr. Ford pointed to two resolutions under New Business and requesting the Board’s support of the Transportation Agreement and Articles of Incorporation.

Following the presentations, Mr. Bernstein opened the floor to Board members for questions about the presentations and discussion about priorities for the coming fiscal year.

Staff responded to clarifying questions and received suggestions related to the presentation. Suggestions included investigating multilevel intercept structure parking, with mixed land use near the highway, versus larger surface parking lots in the Washtenaw Avenue corridor. The idea was supported with the notion that transit oriented development could attract younger residents and an aging population looking for a more dense town center.

A suggestion was made to place more of an emphasis on medium and long-range projects (and what activities might take place now) to support projects in the future, such as rail or high capacity transit. Michael Benham noted that the plan includes a list of projects that have not yet been prioritized and agreed that there needs to be development activity now to keep the projects going from a planning perspective. Michael Ford indicated that funding for the next phase of the Connector Study was being pursued.

A suggestion was made to more closely associate TheRide with AirRide Service in materials.

Michael Benham responded to a request to clarify the methodology used for express bus services and to cost estimating in the Program. Mr. Benham indicated that standard costs of the region were used which are reflective of labor costs. The staff team reviewed the information and then a subgroup of the Financial Task Force went deeper to make sure that unit costs are accurate and credible.

There was a discussion around the evaluation of new service and metrics to be used to determine if a service is working or not working. Jesse Bernstein responded that staff will continue to provide the same reports and then build baselines from the new service. It was suggested that new service for which pilot funding ends would need to be successful to continue operations.

Michael Ford indicated that close monitoring of new service is essential noting that development of an ongoing “dashboard” of performance was under consideration.

Board members commented further on plans for the coming year including the prospect of a new governing structure. It was noted that there is a good sense of what is possible for service expansion for the next five years that is locally fundable. The importance of maintaining the 30 year vision, including planning for rail (that will require support from the State), was also noted.

A suggestion was made to work on messaging in terms of planning versus implementation; to develop the right messaging and language to identify what the Board cares about and set aside priorities to manage expectations effectively. It was also suggested that there be more recognition of the benefits to the taxpayers of Ann Arbor of some of the outlying services including reduced congestion on the roads and in parking structures, and reduced air pollution. Another note was the importance of fairly allocating the costs of countywide service to ensure that riders and employers benefitting from services are paying the primary share of those services. It was also suggested that an effort be made to reduce the percentage (95%) of the 70,000 employees who commute in their cars into Ann Arbor; to identify the financial means, as a community, to have 50 people travel together.

Michael Ford made a commitment to respond to the questions and suggestions made by Board members and provide a report to a board committee.

4.5 *Chief Executive Officer Report*

There was no report.

4.6 *Local Advisory Council Report*

There was no report.

5.0 *New Business*

Eli Cooper moved the following resolution with support from Anya Dale.

5.1 *Award of Three Year Bus Shelter Contract to Duo-Gard*

WHEREAS, a strategic and important part of Ann Arbor Transportation Authority’s (AATA) vision is to provide transportation services to enhance the quality of life for Washtenaw County residents, and

WHEREAS, an important aspect of accessing AATA's transportation services depends upon the convenience of its boarding areas and the public amenities available there to accommodate, protect, and shelter the waiting public, and

WHEREAS, AATA publicly sought proposals from companies to provide shelters and benches at bus stop locations yet to be determined, and the Duo-Gard Company was selected as the lowest priced and most highly technically rated responsible bidder to manufacture and install such shelters and benches for the use of AATA's passengers, now therefore

IT IS RESOLVED, that the Chief Executive Officer is authorized to negotiate and enter into a contract with the Duo-Gard industries, Inc. to manufacture and install an estimated 60 bus shelters and 126 benches over a three year period for a total price not to exceed \$390,000 (with an option to extend such contract for two additional one-year periods, not to exceed five years in total), and

IT IS FURTHER RESOLVED, that such shelters and their installation shall be paid for utilizing existing and future Federal and/or state capital grant funds intended for that purpose.

Eli Cooper commented on a previous contract with Duo-Gard, a local vendor, characterizing their work as "absolutely wonderful".

The motion carried with four Yes votes: Cooper, Dale, Gott, and Griffith. [Kerson and Nacht were absent from the room during the vote.]

Anya Dale moved the following resolution with support from Roger Kerson.

5.2 *Accept and Approve Procurement Manual 2012*

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority has a fiduciary duty to properly expend and account for public funds, along with legal procurement requirements imposed upon it by the State of Michigan and the U. S. Government, and

WHEREAS, in order to provide for an orderly and equitable procedure for purchasing goods and services; to fulfill its public obligations to properly use and care for its funds; and to comply with laws and regulations issued by governmental jurisdictions; AATA has established and utilizes a written Procurement Manual, and

WHEREAS, that Procurement Manual has been reviewed, revised, and updated in 2012 in order to reflect the latest purchasing procedures, requirements, and guidelines, now therefore

IT IS RESOLVED, that AATA's **Procurement Manual 2012** is hereby adopted and is approved for use in purchasing goods and services by and for the Authority, and

IT IS FURTHER RESOLVED, that the **Procurement Manual 2012** will be updated and revised as required, or as necessary, to guarantee its continued compliance with public policy and state and federal laws and regulations; and that when major updates are

made to the ***Manual***, they shall be submitted to the Board of Directors through the Performance Monitoring/External Relations Committee for approval.

The motion carried with five Yes votes: Cooper, Dale, Gott, Griffith, and Kerson. [Nacht was absent from the room during the vote.]

Eli Cooper moved the following resolution with support from Charles Griffith.

5.3 *Approve Five Year Contract for Rideshare and Vanpool Matching and Administration Software to Ecology and Environment, Inc.*

WHEREAS, a strategic and important part of Ann Arbor Transportation Authority's (AATA) vision is to provide transportation services to enhance the quality of life for Washtenaw County residents, and

WHEREAS, an important aspect of promoting AATA's alternative transportation services depends upon the ability of drivers and riders to easily identify potential rideshare and vanpool partners through web-based software, and

WHEREAS, AATA publicly sought proposals from companies to provide rideshare and vanpool matching and administration software and related services, and the Ecology and Environment, Inc. was selected as the lowest priced and most highly technically rated responsible bidder to implement such software, now therefore

IT IS RESOLVED, that the Chief Executive Officer is authorized to negotiate and enter into a contract with the Ecology & Environment, Inc. to purchase, implement and maintain the rideshare and vanpool matching software over a five year period for a total price not to exceed \$125,000, and

IT IS FURTHER RESOLVED, that such software shall be paid for utilizing existing and anticipated Federal Congestion Mitigation/Air Quality capital grant funds intended for that purpose.

Jan Hallberg responded to questions on details of the contract. Eli Cooper endorsed moving forward and integrating Vanpool service as a complement to areas not accessible to the fixed-route bus system.

The motion carried with six yes votes: Cooper, Dale, Gott, Griffith, Kerson, and Nacht.

Anya Dale moved the following resolution with support from David Nacht.

5.4 *Approve "4-Party" Public Transportation Agreement*

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority (AATA) Board of Directors (the Board) wishes to expand public transportation services throughout Washtenaw County so as to enhance the quality of life of its residents and to promote the local economy, safeguard the environment, and strengthen all the county's communities, and

WHEREAS, to accomplish the goal of providing county-wide services, AATA desires to transform itself from a Michigan Act 55 Authority into a Michigan Act 196 Authority, and

that transformation involves the recognition and acceptance of their role in this process by AATA, the City of Ann Arbor, the City of Ypsilanti, and the County of Washtenaw (collectively referred to as the “Four Parties”), and

WHEREAS, to acknowledge their acceptance of the need to transfer assets and liabilities of the Act 55 Authority over to the Act 196 Authority in a timely, orderly, responsible, and prudent manner, an agreement known as the “Four Party” Public Transportation Agreement has been drafted for adoption by the members of the Four Parties group, now

IT IS RESOLVED, that, acting as one of the members of the Four Parties, the AATA Board hereby approves and adopts the Public Transportation Agreement, contingent upon its adoption by all the other members of the Four Party group, and contingent upon any additions, deletions, or other amendments that may be attached to the agreement during its adoption process, and

IT IS FURTHER RESOLVED, that AATA shall continue to work diligently toward the eventual fulfillment of the Four Party Agreement and the establishment of a Michigan Act 196 Authority.

Board members discussed the resolution and whether it would be necessary to bring the Agreement back to the Board (or through legal counsel), if other governing boards made subsequent changes to the agreement. The Board reached consensus on not re-voting on changes to the Agreement, unless the changes impact AATA.

Michael Ford clarified next steps indicating approval was needed from Ann Arbor City Council based on an amendment made by Ypsilanti City Council. Then approval will be sought from Washtenaw County. It was hoped that the agreement would be approved by all of the parties in June.

The motion carried with six Yes votes: Cooper, Dale, Gott, Griffith, Kerson, and Nacht.

David Nacht moved the following resolution with support from Charles Griffith.

5.5 *Endorse and Recommend Articles of Incorporation for a Michigan Act 196 Authority*

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority (AATA) Board of Directors (the Board) wishes to expand public transportation services throughout Washtenaw County so as to enhance the quality of life of its residents and to promote the local economy, safeguard the environment, and strengthen all the county’s communities, and

WHEREAS, to accomplish the goal of providing county-wide services, AATA desires to transform itself from a Michigan Act 55 Authority into a Michigan Act 196 Authority, and that transformation involves the County of Washtenaw (County) acting as a catalyst in the process by filing Articles of Incorporation (Articles) for a Michigan Act 196 Authority with the State of Michigan, and

WHEREAS, the successful implementation of an Act 196 Authority requires both specific actions and the cooperation of various local governmental entities known collectively as the Four Parties, and those actions and the requisite cooperation is currently being sought, and

WHEREAS, a set of proposed Articles to effect the incorporation of an Act 196 Authority has been written on behalf of the Board by AATA Staff and has been reviewed as to its language and content by AATA's legal counsel, now therefore

IT IS RESOLVED, that the Board endorses the proposed Articles of Incorporation for an Act 196 Authority, along with any revisions or amendments that may be made to the document during Washtenaw County's adoption process, providing those changes are minor in nature and are approved by the Board, and

IT IS FURTHER RESOLVED, that the proposed Articles shall be forwarded to the County of Washtenaw with the recommendation that they be used by the County in filing for the incorporation of an Act 196 Authority with the State of Michigan.

Charles Griffith commented on the process undertaken to develop the Articles by a subcommittee he served on.

The motion carried with six Yes votes: Cooper, Dale, Gott, Griffith, Kerson, and Nacht.

6.0 *Public Time*

Vivienne Armentrout appeared before the Board. Ms. Armentrout commented on the Five Year Program suggesting that attention be paid to Appendix E. Ms. Armentrout commented on her attendance at rider forums where changes to specific routes in Ann Arbor were discussed. Ms. Armentrout suggested that if the citizens of Ann Arbor are being asked to fund 75% of the effort, there should be an addendum issued with more information about routes. Ms. Armentrout commented that the Ann Arbor DAC is not functioning well, has been sparsely attended and there has not been a chance for meaningful discussion. Ms. Armentrout also suggested looking carefully at how the DAC was designed to function and how meetings are conducted.

Thomas Partridge appeared before the Board. Mr. Partridge commented on the retreat format suggesting an opportunity to better connect with the public by increasing the accessibility of meetings, including u196 board meetings. Mr. Partridge suggested that meetings need to have full broadcast video stream and include conversations to address serious ongoing problems with bus, Paratransit and senior ride services. Instead of money going to planning computer access to where buses and vans are, a system should be available so that senior ride and disabled riders can have access to information on the status of their rides via the Internet. Mr. Partridge suggested that there needs to be instant report cards, not monthly or quarterly reports, on where the system is.

No one further appearing, Mr. Bernstein declared Public Time closed.

7.0 *Adjourn*

Charles Griffith moved to adjourn the meeting with support from Eli Cooper. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 4:07 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Charles Griffith, Secretary