



# City of Ann Arbor

## Meeting Minutes - Final

### Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

---

Thursday, April 8, 2021

7:00 PM

Electronic Meeting

---

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at [a2gov.org/watchCTN](http://a2gov.org/watchCTN)

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 978 6401 4515

#### **A. CALL TO ORDER**

*Welcome to the Thursday, April 8, 2021 electronic meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission.*

*The meeting is being held electronically to protect public health and safety due to the COVID-19 virus and to comply with orders issued by the governor, the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services, and/or the Washtenaw County Health Department.*

*We intend to conduct this meeting similarly to an in-person meeting. However, please be patient if there are technical issues. Public comment will be via telephone only. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting id # 978 6401 4515 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at [www.a2gov.org/watchctn](http://www.a2gov.org/watchctn).*

#### **B. ROLL CALL**

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.*

*Others participating in the meeting:*

*Administrative Assistant, Kristen VanderLugt.*

**Present:** 6 - John Beeson, Evan Hall, David Rochlen, Kathryn Fortener, Anna Epperson, and Robert White

**Absent:** 1 - Jessica Quijano

**C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote and a show of hands, the Chair declared the motion carried.

**D. PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

*None*

**E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS****F. HEARINGS****F-1. 21-0673 HDC21-079 1533 Broadway; Addition; BHD*****STAFF REPORT:***

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

***REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:***

*Commissioners Anna Epperson and Kathy Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

***PUBLIC HEARING:***

*The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by David Rochlen, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1533 Broadway Street, a contributing property in the Broadway Historic District, to construct an addition, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the**

**guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, and White

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Quijano

**F-2.      [21-0674](#)    HDC21-085    514 Sixth; Addition; OWSHD**

*STAFF REPORT:*

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

*REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:*

*Commissioners Anna Epperson and Kathy Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*PUBLIC HEARING:*

*The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Anna Epperson, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 514 Sixth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct an addition and other work as proposed, with the following condition: that cementitious siding**

on the new addition is installed with the smooth side out. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, and White

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Quijano

**F-3.      [21-0675](#)    HDC21-067    526 Sixth; New Meter; OWSHD**

***STAFF REPORT:***

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

***REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:***

*Commissioners Anna Epperson and Kathy Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

***PUBLIC HEARING:***

*The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by David Rochlen, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 526 Sixth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the east elevation of the house, as shown in the application. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, and White

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Quijano

**F-4.**      [21-0676](#)      HDC21-077    1034 W Liberty; New Meter; OWSHD

*STAFF REPORT:*

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

*REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:*

*Commissioners Anna Epperson and Kathy Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*PUBLIC HEARING:*

*The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Kathryn Fortener, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1034 W Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the west elevation of the house as shown in the application, on the following condition: that the meter be post mounted. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, and White

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Quijano

**F-5.      [21-0677](#)      HDC21-082    1048 W Liberty; New Meter; OWSHD**

*STAFF REPORT:*

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

*REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:*

*Commissioners Anna Epperson and Kathy Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*PUBLIC HEARING:*

*The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by John Beeson, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1048 W Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the west elevation of the house as shown in the application, on the following condition: that the meter be post mounted. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, and White

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Quijano

**STAFF REPORT:**

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners Anna Epperson and Kathy Fortener noted that they couldn't review the chimney because they couldn't get on the roof and it couldn't be seen from the street.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Will Hathaway, Attorney, spoke on behalf of the owners, explaining the situation of the renovation project that began in the spring on 2020 and how their roof and their neighbor's roofing material had meshed together during the 150 or so years since the buildings were built. He explained that they became aware of the illegal built wall on top of their building at 310 S Ashley that had been constructed by their neighbor's (312 S Ashley) contractor ; during the construction of the wall, they had removed their functioning chimney and partly covered the flue opening with the concrete wall. 312 S Ashley's contractor then rebuilt the chimney in a different location (8 inches away) without the knowledge or permission of the owners of 310 S Ashley. 312 S Ashley's contractor also cut a notch into the stone parapet of 310 S Ashley, without permission, in order to tie in the construction of the new stone wall. The top of the parapet was then covered with a piece of metal, which extends onto their property.*

*Sam Kafaei, KGB Consturction, spoke about a 6-inch "common wall" built over the two buildings, with the chimney belonging to 310 S Ashley, collapsing during construction, and subsequently rebuilt.*

*Mark Sasic (?) Attorney for KGB Construction, West Bloomfield, Michigan, spoke against the characterization of his client and the situation, put before the HDC by Hathaway. He stated that KGB tried to rebuild the chimney, but the other property owner decided to withhold their permission and his client isn't going to trespass in order to build it, so he felt his client is being penalized. He said the chimney isn't visible from the right-of-way or street so he expressed their only concern should rest with the age of the previous brick chimney and the approval or denial of the existing chimney.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*



**Moved by David Rochlen, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 310 S Ashley Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to replace a brick chimney with a metal chimney, as built. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for roofs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 2, 5, 6, and 9, and the guidelines for roofs.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a voice vote the Chair declared the motion denied. Vote: 0-6**

**Yeas:** 0

**Nays:** 6 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, and White

**Absent:** 1 - Quijano

**Moved by Anna Epperson, Seconded by Robert White, that the Commission finds that the completed chimney work does not qualify for a certificate of appropriateness. The property owner shall restore the chimney to the condition the chimney was in before the inappropriate work or modify the work so that it qualifies for a certificate of appropriateness. The property owner is required to contact staff within 30 days to discuss a proposed remediation plan and timeline for completion.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 0**

**Yeas:** 6 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, and White

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Quijano

**G. NEW BUSINESS**

**G-1. [21-0679](#) 2021-2022 HDC Meeting Schedule**

**Moved by John Beeson, Seconded by Bob White, to approve the July 1, 2021 through June 30, 2022 Historic District Commission Meeting Schedule with the November 18, 2021 HDC meeting omitted from the schedule. Without objection the motion was approved unanimously.**

**Yeas:** 6 - Beeson, Chair Hall, Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, and White

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Quijano

**H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**H-1. [21-0503](#) February 11, 2021 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes**

**Moved by Bob White, Seconded by Anna Epperson, to approve the February 11, 2021 HDC meeting minutes and forwarded to City Council. Without objection the motion was approved unanimously.**

**I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

**J. ASSIGNMENTS**

**J-1. Review Committee: Monday, May 10, 2021 at 5pm for the May 13, 2021 Regular Meeting**

*Commissioners Kathryn Fortener and John Beeson volunteered for the May, 2021 HDC Review Committee at 5:00 pm.*

**K. REPORTS FROM STAFF**

**K-1.      [21-0681](#)      March 2021 HDC Staff Activities**

*Jill Thacher asked if any Commissioners were interested in attending this year's virtual Historic Preservation Network Conference.*

*Anna Epperson and Bob White said they were interested.*

**Received and Filed**

**L.      CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

*John Beeson noted he'd forwarded a concern to Jill Thacher.*

*Jill Thacher explained that a City Rental Inspector discovered unapproved demolition work being done on a garage on Mulholland Avenue, and the City's Building Department has put a stop work order on the project, providing them with 30 days in which to return the garage to its previous condition or go through the HDC process for approval to demo.*

**M.      COMMUNICATIONS****M-1.      [21-0682](#)      Various Communications to the HDC**

*None*

**Received and Filed**

**N.      ADJOURNMENT**

*The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 10:04 pm.*

Written comments may be submitted until 4:00 pm on the meeting day using the City's eComment system, which is available alongside the agenda at <http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

Public kiosks are now installed in the lobby and basement of City Hall to allow members of the public to attend and participate in electronic meetings.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

Evan Hall, Chairperson  
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner  
mg/