

City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>



Meeting Minutes - Final

Thursday, July 11, 2019

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council
Chambers

Historic District Commission

A CALL TO ORDER

Commissioner Evan Hall called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm.

B ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 4 - Evan Hall, David Rochlen, Anna Epperson, and Jessica Quijano

Absent: 2 - Robert White, and John Beeson

C APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Thacher requested that New Business be moved ahead of Hearings.

Hearing no objections the agenda was unanimously Approved as amended.

G NEW BUSINESS

G-1 19-1329 Election of Vice-Chair

Nominations for Evan Hall as Vice Chair, and Anna Epperson as Secretary were received.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by David Rochlen to appoint Evan Hall as Vice Chair of the Historic District Commission. On a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Jessica Quijano, to appoint Anna Epperson to the position of Secretary. On a voice vote the motion passed unanimously.

D AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

None

E UNFINISHED BUSINESS

F HEARINGS

F-1 [19-1321](#) HDC19-080 403 W Liberty Street; Modify Roofline; OWSHD

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Janet Muhleman, 403 W. Liberty Street, Ann Arbor, owner, along with builder, David Turowski, 9621 Dexter Chelsea Road, applicant, were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, Seconded by David Rochlen, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 403 West Liberty, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to modify a dormer on the roof above the attic stairwell, using alternative Number 2, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for roofs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for District or Neighborhood Setting and Roofs.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Chair Beeson

F-2 [19-1323](#) HDC19-092 420 W Liberty Street; A/C and Line-sets; OWSHD

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Phil Klintworth, 318 E. Willis Road, Saline, Church Trustee, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Anna Epperson, Seconded by Jessica Quijano, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 420 West Liberty Street, a contributing structure in the Old West Side Historic District to install nine air conditioning condensers with line sets in gutters, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and

discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Chair Beeson

F-3 [19-1324](#) HDC19-101 321 Eighth Street; Rear Addition; OWSHD

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Nick Durrie, 1240 Jewett, Unit 2B, Ann Arbor, applicant, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, Seconded by David Rochlen, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 321 Eighth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a single-story rear addition; a mudroom; and a second floor addition on top of an existing kitchen, on the following conditions: a staff approval is applied for and received for windows on the addition that are wood or wood clad, and meet the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, and that the existing vertical cornerboard at the south elevation on the second floor and the frieze board on the south elevation one-story wing is retained. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the

house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Setting, Building Site, and Windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Chair Beeson

F-4 [19-1325](#) HDC19-105 112 S Main Street; New Signs; MSHD

Moved by David Rochlen, Seconded by Jessica Quijano, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 112 S Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install a pedestrian scale bracket sign on the front façade; a wall sign near the back door on the alley; and a window sign on the back door. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for signs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the

motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Chair Beeson

F-5 [19-1326](#) HDC19-108 203-205 N Ingalls Street; Replace Windows; OFWHD

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Anna Epperson, Seconded by Jessica Quijano, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 203-205 N Ingalls Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to replace the sashes on 22 windows with replica wood sashes, as proposed. The Commission finds that the replacement of the original windows was inappropriate because it did not meet The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard number 6 and the guidelines for windows and energy retrofitting. The owner shall remove the replacement windows and install replica sashes within eight months of this decision date.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Chair Beeson

F-6 [19-1327](#) HDC19-110 425 W Washington Street; New Garage; OFWHD

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

David Atkinson, 425 West Washington Street, owner, and Doug Selby, Meadowlark Builders, 3250 W Liberty Road, Ann Arbor, were present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Motion on Egress Window Well:

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Anna Epperson, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the portion of the application at 425 West Washington Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a timber egress window well and window, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to egress windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON EGRESS WINDOW WELL:

None

Vote on Egress Window Well:

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted for egress window well.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission expressed concern with the height, scale, and mass of the proposed garage.

Epperson said a sloped shed roof would be closer in relationship to the existing historic structure as well as to the historic nature of the site, the neighborhood, and the setting. She said there is a repetition on the rhythm along Third Street, and in coming down to this corner, this proposed garage structure, being more like a house in size and design, would be more prominent than the neighboring house, facing that street, and would thereby take it out of the neighborhood setting and doesn't meet the historic district guidelines.

Quijano agreed, adding that it doesn't meet the scale and is visually incompatible because of the proposed size and location on the lot, thereby diminishing the character of adjacent structures.

Rochlin explained that a proposed garage must meet the standards of the Historic District Commission when a site, such as this one, is located in a historic district. He said when looking at the rendering of the proposed garage in relation to the neighbor's house, it looks like a small house, and not a garage. He expressed wanting the structure to be flush, not with the low massing porch, but with the facade of the neighbor's house, which is not possible on this size lot. He explained that the size of the garage seems to be blocking the view, and is incompatible with the setback of the neighboring house; it will destroy the historic relationship between these two homes, by putting the proposed garage structure so close to the sidewalk.

Hall said the staff report was very helpful in reviewing the guidelines the Commission follows.

Motion on Garage:

Moved by Anna Epperson, seconded by David Rochlin, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the portion of the application at 425 West Washington Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a one-and-a-half car garage, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to residential accessory structures.

Vote on Garage:

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion defeated. **Vote: 0-4**

Request for garage was denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 4 - Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Absent: 2 - White, and Chair Beeson

ROLLCALL

Thacher explained that Vice Chair Hall would hand over the meeting to Secretary Epperson, while he removed himself during the Public Hearing on F-7. She noted there could be no discussion or action on the item due to a lack of quorum, but since the public hearing had been advertised, anyone wanting to speak could do so for the record, and the item would be continued to the following HDC meeting.

Vice Chair Hall excused himself from the Chambers.

Present: 3 - David Rochlen, Anna Epperson, and Jessica Quijano

Absent: 3 - Robert White, John Beeson, and Evan Hall

F-7 **19-1328** HDC19-111 544 Sixth Street; Rear Addition; OWSHD

Secretary Anna Epperson opened the public hearing.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing continued at a following HDC meeting.

Continuance at next HDC meeting due to lack of a quorum.

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1 [19-1330](#) Minutes of the June 13, 2019, HDC Meeting

The June 13, 2019 HDC meeting minutes were approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

Quijano commented that she had missed Monday's meeting at Cobblestone in order to be on the HDC Review Committee.

Thacher noted that she had followed up with information about porch work at Cobblestone Farm. She said the responsible party applied for HDC approval, which she was able to review and approve at the staff level, because the work was replacing same for same on a non-original porch.

J ASSIGNMENTS

Review Committee: Monday, August 5, 2019 at 5 PM for the August 8, 2019 Regular Meeting

There was question on the correct date for the August HDC meeting.

Anna Epperson volunteered for the August Review Committee. Staff would follow-up with John Beeson and Bob White on their availability.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF

[19-1331](#) June 2019 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSION**M COMMUNICATIONS****M-1 [19-1332](#) Various Communications to the HDC**

Thacher reviewed the Old West Side News front page article, clarifying the topic of mini-splits, and that what was shown in the picture would not be allowed in Ann Arbor's historic districts.

Received and Filed

N ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:40 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/watchctn on "Watch CTN" page.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2ctn.viebit.com or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

Evan Hall, Vice Chair
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
mg/