



City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Action Minutes

Energy Commission

Tuesday, April 9, 2019

6:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St,
Second floor, City Council Chambers

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Appleyard called the meeting to order at 6:10 PM.

ROLL CALL

Present: 10 - Charles Hookham, Mark Clevey, Shoshannah Lenski, Wayne Appleyard, Noah Levin, John Mirsky, Carlene Colvin-Garcia, Jack Eaton, Jeff Hayner, and Jay Zocher

Absent: 3 - Brigit Macomber, Mike Shriberg, and Charlotte Jameson

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

A motion was made by Mirsky, seconded by Colvin-Garcia, that the agenda be Approved. On a voice vote, the chair declared the motion carried.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Mirsky, seconded by Colvin-Garcia, that the minutes be Approved. On a voice vote, the chair declared the motion carried.

PUBLIC INPUT

No public input.

ENERGY REPORT - NEWS FROM THE ENERGY OFFICE AND COMMISSIONERS

Staff MacDonald informed the commission that crowd funding campaign for the Fire Station 6 solar installation is now live at patronicity.com/firestationsolar. Staff MacDonald informed the commission that

the installation will incorporate volunteers, and welcomed any one interested in volunteering to contact the Energy Office.

Staff MacDonald informed the commission of two additional solar Power Hours informing the residents of energy efficiency upgrade and solar installation opportunities. The Power Hours had solar installers and energy efficiency contractors available to connect with residents. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the initial solar Power Hour had 47 attendees. Staff MacDonald informed the commission that the Power Hours will be held on Thursday, April 11 at 6 PM at Slauson Middle School, and Monday, April 29 at 6 PM at Cobblestone Farm.

Staff MacDonald informed the commission of the upcoming Sustainability Forum focusing on Race and Class Equity. The forum will be held on April 18 at 7 PM at the Downtown Library.

Staff MacDonald informed the commission of the Ann Arbor Earth Day at the Leslie Science and Nature Center on April 28 from 12 - 4 PM. The event is family-oriented.

Staff MacDonald informed the commission of the Mayor's Green Fair on Main Street on June 14th from 6 - 9 PM. The event has had tables relating to sustainability.

Chair Appleyard informed the commission that the University of Michigan has decided to purchase 200,000 megawatt hours of clean, green renewable energy beginning in 2021 from DTE's MI Green Power program. Chair Appleyard informed the commission that with the purchase, University of Michigan will meet their 25% reduction in greenhouse gas emissions by 2025 target. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that University of Michigan President Mark Schlissel stated that the University of Michigan will meet their 25% reduction target by 2025 with the signing of the contract.

Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that at the University of Michigan President Mark Schlissel's Town Hall event discussed whether the University would be responsible and accountable for greenhouse gas emissions generated from University-related travel, such as commutes, University-paid travel, hospital visits, etc. Commissioner Mirsky shared that President Schlissel indicated that the University should be accountable for those emissions to a degree, and sharing responsible with individuals and the City.

Commissioners Clevey, Hookham, and Lenski discussed whether University of Michigan purchases their own natural gas or purchased from DTE, and whether DTE could offer a program similar to MI Green Power for natural gas, such as an option to purchase from certified or monitored wellheads. Commissioner Lenski informed the commission that DTE does have a sustainability program that is working on natural gas, and looking at the supply chain to encourage best available controls at the well head to reduce emissions. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the topic was discussed that the University town hall event, and that President Schlissel had discussed such a program. Commissioner Mirsky shared that President Schlissel was committed not just to reducing University emissions but also in the rest of the region, and that University procurement practices could drive better practices in the

industry. Commissioner Mirsky shared that the town hall discussed the University's central power plant, which will be powered by natural gas.

Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that at the town hall event, President Schlissel made clear that the University was not going to divest.

Commissioner Hookham discussed capping non-viable wells to eliminate methane leaks, associated carbon dioxide, and the complexity of the problem.

Commissioner Colvin-Garcia informed the commission that there will be an Electric Vehicle Ride and Drive at the Michigan Agency Energy Office in Lansing on April 17 from 9 am - 1 pm hosted by the Greater Lansing Area Clean Cities Coalition, along with various other organizations. There will be an electric school bus, which will be one of the models purchased through the statewide consortium of schools paid for by the VW Settlement funds, as well as a Tesla Motorhome prototype.

Dark Money Resolution

Commissioner Mirsky moved that the resolution be considered, seconded by Zocher, and opened for discussion.

Commissioner Lenski discussed focusing on actions at the municipal level and in the control of the City of Ann Arbor to maximize impact. Commissioner Lenski discussed that the resolution advising City Council to advise the state on questionably constitutional actions. Commissioner Lenski discussed the symbolic nature of the resolution which focused on vilifying an industry.

Commissioner Lenski proposed language for consideration, which reads: "Whereas contributions by state utilities to political issue advocacy, or so called dark money, 501(c)(4) or 527 organizations have recently come to light following a settlement between the Michigan Public Service Commission and one of the state's largest utilities, Whereas these contributions allow utilities and other companies to advocate about issues of significance to their customers and communities with limited or no transparency, Whereas utilities' products are fundamental to the health, safety, and welfare of communities, and are among the largest contributors to greenhouse gas emissions, with electricity generation contributing 28% of all US GHG emissions, Whereas the unique nature and impacts of the utility industry are already recognized by national and state law as reflected in the fact that the industry is regulated, requiring greater transparency and disclosure of financials and other activities that most industries, Whereas transparency about the advocacy positions of companies in this unique position is key to the ability of the state to effectively regulate and the citizens to themselves advocate for policies in their best interests," with the same resolution as proposed. Commissioner Lenski discussed the difference in tone while maintaining the result of the proposed resolution.

Commissioner Clevey proposed a friendly amendment to the resolution, which combines the language read by Commissioner Lenski with the last "Resolved" clause of the proposed language.

Commissioner Mirsky discussed the first "Resolved" clause in the context of the

resolution, which only address EIOUs, followed by the second "Resolved" clause addressing a larger context of transparency and disclosure broadly.

Commissioner Clevey proposed a second friendly amendment to the resolution, which combines the language read by Commissioner Lenski with the two "Resolved" clauses of the proposed language.

Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that he and Councilmember Hayner sit on the Policy Agenda Committee, which is the City Council Committee that drafts the legislative agenda. Councilmember Eaton suggested that the "Resolved" clause of the proposal address that committee, and add to their agenda of policy items, replacing references to City Council in the "Resolved" clause. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that the suggested action would increase efficiency. Commissioners Clevey and Mirsky discussed changing language to replace references to City Council with the Policy Agenda Committee.

Commissioner Mirsky proposed postponing action on the resolution regarding alternative language until the next meeting to review alternative language.

Councilmember Hayner discussed differences in the tone of two versions. Councilmember Hayner discussed the broad nature of the issue.

Councilmember Eaton moved that the discussion be tabled while copies of the proposed language were procured.

Chair Appleyard, Commissioner Mirsky, and Councilmember Hayner discussed the settlement between the Michigan Public Service Commission and Consumers Energy.

Commissioner Lenski discussed the specification of EIOUs, or Electric Investor-Owned Utilities. Chair Appleyard and Commissioner Mirsky discussed removing the specification of "Electric." Commissioner Hookham discussed that the implications of the resolution could be broader than the electric industry or the gas industry. Commissioner Hookham and Commissioner Mirsky discussed language referencing elected officials.

Commissioners Lenski and Clevey discussed language regarding the "Resolved" clauses, adding in prohibitive language.

Commissioner Mirsky recommended that the commission withdraw the motion to approve the resolution, and postpone to the next meeting once a draft is finalized. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that he will inform the Policy Agenda Commission of the topic of the resolution.

A motion was made by Commissioner Mirsky, seconded by Commissioner Clevey, that the resolution be postponed to the next commission meeting. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

COMMITTEE UPDATES

Staff MacDonald informed the commission of the addition of the Solar Access Ordinance subcommittee, which replaced the 100% Clean and Renewables subcommittee, which is now working groups.

Staff MacDonald informed the commission that the working groups are working with Commissioner Hookham regarding hydroelectric dams and Larry Kerber regarding peak shaving, solar potential, and existing efficiencies. Staff MacDonald informed the commission that the working groups meet on an ad hoc basis individually as commissioners express interest. Commissioner Mirsky suggested that the working groups define time-bound targets. Chair Appleyard informed the commission that the 100% Clean and Renewable solar working group is currently trying to install solar on Fire Station 6 before the end of May. Staff MacDonald discussed Power Purchase Agreement models for funding the solar installation, and discussions of Chart House from their experience. Staff MacDonald and Mark Clevey discussed pursuing a fair process for bids for the installation and PPA.

Solar Access Ordinance

Commissioner Hookham informed the commission of the timeline of a solar access solution around November 2019. Commissioner Hookham informed the commission of established SMART goals: a committee formed in April, and inquired for interest from commissioners. Chair Appleyard and Commissioner Clevey expressed interest in joining the committee. Commissioner Hookham discussed balancing growth and development with protecting existing investment.

Lighting Ordinance

Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the intention of the committee is to provide a final draft of the ordinance to Planning, and the Design Review Board and Historic Commission who both received earlier drafts. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the committee plans to move the ordinance through both the Energy Commission and Environmental Commission to go before City Council, likely within in the next two months.

Commissioner Clevey and Commissioner Mirsky discussed what lighting is subject to the ordinance, which includes new and major renovations, and the potential for a timeline for bringing existing lighting up to the ordinance-specified requirements. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the ordinance does not apply to lights owned by the University of Michigan or in the public right-of-way, including street lighting and pedestrian cross walks, which are subject to the Orange Book. Commissioner Mirsky discussed potentially addressing lighting governed by the Orange Book as a separate action from the Lighting Ordinance.

Councilmember Eaton discussed incorporating guidelines from the ordinance into Requests for Proposals for lighting via a resolution to begin reflecting requirements in City lighting purchasing. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the Lighting working group will have the capacity to begin

looking at addressing lighting covered by the Orange Book. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that while lighting addressed in the Lighting Ordinance also impacts pedestrian safety, the largest impact lies in lighting governed by the Orange Book.

Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that he and Councilmember Griswold attended a Sierra Club presentation on Dark Skies, and that Councilmember Griswold was a strong supporter of those concepts.

Staff MacDonald, Commissioner Mirsky, and Councilmember Hayner discussed distributing the latest draft with the commission.

Commissioner Mirsky and Councilmember Hayner discussed whether a resolution would be necessary for the City to begin incorporating guidelines into purchasing. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that not all guidelines in the ordinance would be applicable or appropriate to public street lights and pedestrian crossings. Councilmember Eaton shared that he could ask City Administrator Lazarus if a resolution is required to inform City lighting purchases. Commissioner Clevey discussed that the objective of shielding lighting in the Dark Skies Ordinance may need to be changed for public right-of-way lighting.

Councilmember Eaton and Commissioner Mirsky discussed the timeline of the City's recent contract with lighting. Commissioner Clevey and Councilmember Hayner discussed whether the contract contains a modification clause, and the feasibility of specifying streetlight heads that are compliant with Dark Skies objectives. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the working group will evaluate if there is any ability to adjust the current contract.

Energy Audit Disclosure Ordinance

Staff MacDonald informed the commission that the committee met and discussed the disclosure and shared information from Portland, OR regarding their ordinance.

EV Readiness Ordinance

Commissioner Zocher informed the commission that the committee reviewed the work plan prepared by the Office of Sustainability, and separating out specific EV Readiness ordinance objectives. Commissioner Zocher informed the commission that the infrastructure-based ordinance has a target timeline of within 12 months.

Councilmember Hayner informed the commission that constituents have asked for additional EV charging infrastructure downtown, specifically in the Forest Street Parking Structure, and working with the Downtown Development Authority. Chair Appleyard informed the commission that the parking structure may have limitations in capacity. Commissioner Hookham discussed challenges retrofitting sites for EV charging. Chair Appleyard informed the commission that Dave Konkle is familiar with the parking structure's capacity, and that the commission could reach out for information. Staff MacDonald

informed the commission that it was suggested to bring on a representative of the Downtown Development Authority to the committee.

Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that the City has urged the DDA to consider more solar installations. He informed the commission solar is being considered for the expansion in the Ann Street Parking Structure and that the DDA has promised that the expansion will have the structural capacity of solar panels. Chair Appleyard discussed challenges with purely intermittent solar power for EV charging. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that the DDA installed a small solar pilot a few years ago. Councilmember Hayner informed the commission that the County leases a portion of the parking structure, and may be interested in charging their electric vehicles at that location. Commissioner Clevey informed the commission that the County is currently developing an Environmental Climate Action Plan, and looking at those options. Chair Appleyard discussed solar access implications at that location.

Outreach to Schools

Commissioner Colvin-Garcia informed the commission that in December 2018 the Ann Arbor Public School's Board of Education adopted the Board Policy 8000, which is the numerical code for their Environmental Sustainability Section they are adding to their policy. Commissioner Colvin-Garcia shared the public statement from the Ann Arbor Public Schools: "Climate change is real and increasing and caused by human activity, and the Ann Arbor community is committed to practices that support a healthy environment for present and future generations, and the district has the responsibility to help prepare current and future generations to respond to climate change through the reduction of harmful human activities, the promotion of human activities that restore the environment, and the development of strategies to adapt to climate change. The district will support the prioritization of environmental sustainable education that prepares present and future generations to become thoughtful stewards of the environment and developing student leaders prepared to succeed in an uncertain climate change future, and maintaining and operating district buildings and grounds that reduce the impact of human activities, promote the restoration of the environment, and adapt to climate change, and building and enhancing partnerships that support the Ann Arbor community's environmental principles. The superintendent and/or designees will report annually to the Board of Education on activities relating to this policy."

Commissioner Colvin-Garcia informed the commission that in May 2018 the district formed the environment and sustainability advisory committee, on which she served. In March, the committee created a list of recommended comprehensive sustainability actions, broken into short-term, medium-term, and long-term priorities, and based on four different categories that the district has prioritized, including environmental sustainability education, student leaders, district buildings and grounds, and partnerships. These recommendations will be presented to the school board in an upcoming meeting.

Commissioner Colvin-Garcia informed the commission that the solar power project at the Ann Arbor STEAM school has reached the \$10,000 mark in donations and grants, and in order to meet a June 30 deadline in spending

grant funds, the school district will put up bids for an expandable solar array to be built on the school roof. Commissioner Colvin-Garcia informed the commission that students will be able to access data from the solar panel operation.

Commissioner Mirsky and Commissioner Colvin-Garcia discussed the intention to assign metrics and funding allocations to the recommended actions.

Commissioner Clevey and Commissioner Colvin-Garcia discussed if the commission should acknowledge the action from the district through a resolution. Commissioner Colvin-Garcia informed the commission that she will prepare a resolution.

Report from Environmental Commission

Staff MacDonald informed the commission that Commissioner Mirsky needs to be reappointed as the liaison to the Environmental Commission. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that he is willing to serve as the liaison.

A motion was made by Clevey, seconded by Chair Appleyard, that Commissioner Mirsky be appointed as the Energy Commission's representative to the Environmental Commission. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the primary work has been to break into three working groups on natural features, water issues, and solid waste. He informed the commission that each working group has defined specific goals and metrics and presented to and accepted by the Environmental Commission. He informed the commission that the goals will be shared with City Council.

Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the next Solid Waste Advisory Committee will meet on April 23 to receive recommendations from the City for the Solid Waste Management Plan Update, with dialogue in a May meeting, and recommendations finalized and presented by the beginning of July.

PUBLIC INPUT

No public input.

ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA

Dark Money Resolution
Ann Arbor Public School District Environmental Sustainability Resolution
Greenhouse Gas Inventory Update
Update on Residential Energy Efficiency Program from DTE

Councilmember Hayner presented an idea from constituents for a Bulb Mobile helping residents upgrade lightbulbs to more energy efficient options and sharing information on other upgrades. Commissioner Hayner discussed applicability to the Sustaining Ann Arbor Together Grant. Chair Appleyard informed the commission that DTE performs free inhouse energy efficiency evaluations and distribute energy-saving solutions, including LEDs. Commissioner Lenski discussed the importance of strategizing actions to build on, but not replicate, programs offered by DTE. Commissioners Clevey and Mirsky suggested that the constituents attend the presentation at the next commission meeting, and sign up for a free home energy consultation. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that funding for the program can deplete in the fall, and that presently is an opportune time to take advantage of the resource.

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Appleyard adjourned the meeting at 7:26 PM.

All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to:

City Clerk's Office
301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Requests made with less than two business days' notice may not be able to be accommodated.

Visit www.a2energy.org for community energy information in Ann Arbor,
or
www.a2gov.org/energy to learn more about the City's Energy Programs

Regular meetings shown Live and replayed on CTN Channel 16 and at
www.a2gov.org/ctn