

City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>



Meeting Minutes - Final

Thursday, June 13, 2019

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council
Chambers

Historic District Commission

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairperson John Beeson called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm.

B **ROLL CALL**

Chairperson Beeson called the roll.

Present: 5 - Robert White, John Beeson, Evan Hall, David Rochlen,
and Jessica Quijano

Absent: 1 - Anna Epperson

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

E **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

F **HEARINGS**

19-1173 HDC19-080 403 W Liberty; Modify Roofline; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented a brief staff report, explaining the owner has requested additional time to verify measurements necessary for the roof bumpout modifications to function as needed. She noted that earlier plans approved by the Commission won't work in the space.[See attached in agenda packet]

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

**Moved by Bob White, seconded by Dave Rochlen, that the application be Postponed until the July 2019 HDC meeting. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried. VOTE: 5-0
Postponed**

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Epperson

[19-1174](#) HDC19-084 415 W Madison; New Deck and Gazebo; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Rolf Berg and Linda Yelicich, 415 W. Madison Street, Ann Arbor, applicants and owners, were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Evan Hall, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 415 W Madison, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to expand a deck and construct a gazebo in the proposed design, on the condition that they are constructed of wood. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for residential patios and decks and residential accessory structures, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10 and the guidelines for District or Neighborhood Setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Epperson

19-1175 HDC19-086 335 S Seventh; Window Modifications; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

James Bevilacqua, Meadowlark Builders, 3250 West Liberty, Ann Arbor, applicant, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Dave Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 335 S Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace, move, and install new windows as proposed, or for the historic south window opening centered on the exterior electrical meter or interior french doors. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, and 9, and the guidelines for building site and windows, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the amended motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Epperson

19-1176 HDC19-088 315 Mulholland; Modify Garage; OWSHD

Commissioner Dave Rochlen excused himself, leaving the Chamber, due to a possible conflict of interest.

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

Beeson noted that most of the other garages in the neighborhood were smaller in size, similar to the existing garage on this site.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Andrew Herscher, 315 Mulholland Street, owner and applicant for the project, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission. He said he believed that very few original garages remained on Mulholland Street, thereby removing the rhythm that once existed. He said there were shed-roofed garages built before 1945 as well as a gabled additions built after 1945 and he felt they meshed together without any distinction already.

Beeson asked if Herscher objected to lowering the proposed height of the proposed new garage.

Herscher said the current garage was useless and could only be used for

storage, since the current loft was only 4 feet high, couldn't be weatherproofed or rodent proofed. He said he would like to have a garage that could be used and possibly habitable.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Evan Hall, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 315 Mulholland Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to raise the roof 36", add a window in the front gable, remove a bump on the rear elevation and replace it with a new person door and window, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the garage and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 , 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site and district or neighborhood setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Beeson said there are more than three other parcels on Mullholland that have garages in the same massing and size as the existing garage structure, but there are no garages that match the proposed 11-foot tall garage. Beeson stated the proposed application does not meet Applicable Regulations, Standard 10, of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Beeson noted that the existing garage is not decrepent or falling down; it is still intact with no visible rot. The only deficiency of the existing garage is the seemingly undersized ridge and framing that was added to the original structure.

Hall concurred with the findings, noting that he did not take any issue with putting a window in the back of the structure, or other work that could make the space habitable, but he did take issue with the proposed height.

Beeson said the walls are still in tact; there is no definitive notion of rotting on the building, that they could detect during the site visit, the ship-lap is still intact, and the ship-lap is acting as sheathing, and in terms of over-all

weatherproofing, a good gabled roof on this structure, like what is on there now, would shed the water.

Beeson concluded, that from the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, raising the roof by 36 inches as proposed would not be compatible with the existing neighborhood accessory structures on the street.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion defeated. Vote: 0-4

Request denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 4 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, and Quijano

Absent: 1 - Epperson

Recused: 1 - Rochlen

19-1177 HDC19-090 120 W Washington; New Storefront; MSHD

Commissioner Roachlen returned to the Chamber to rejoin the meeting.

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Applicants were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 120 West Washington Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District to replace the storefront at 118 and 120 West Washington and 117 South Ashley, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material

and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts and windows, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts and building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Epperson

19-1178 HDC19-095 505 Second; Rear Bathroom Addition; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Veronica Pieniasek, Zac Cruse Construction Company, applicants, were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Dave Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 505 Second Street, a contributing property in the Old

West Side Historic District, to construct an 87 square foot bathroom addition off the rear southeast corner of the house, and replace a non-historic casement window with a pair of large double-hung windows, wood or aluminium-clad wood, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for District or Neighborhood Setting and New Additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the amended motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Epperson

G NEW BUSINESS

19-1179 530 North Division Status Reconsideration

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

PUBLIC HEARING:

Doug Selby, Meadowlark Builders, 711 Fountain Street, Ann Arbor, owner, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission. He provided a detailed account of findings on the property as well as the history of the Old Fourth Ward.

Matthew Grocoff, 217 S. Seventh Street, Ann Arbor, spoke in support of sustainability and green energy, noting he is an avid historic

preservationist. He spoke about the need to preserve our planet for our children. Grocoff spoke in support of Doug Selby's proposed to create an energy efficient structure that will save and preserve energy at 530-532 North Division Street.

Jeff Crockett read a letter dated June 10, 2019, from Norman and Ilene Tyler, 126 N Division Street, Ann Arbor, since they were unable to attend the meeting (See communications to the HDC in the packet). Tyler's note that the property in question is deemed a 'Contributing Resource' in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, and that its status was changed from 'Complimentary' to 'Contributing' when Chapter 103 was updated in 2008, without an in-depth examination to confirm its structural or historic integrity. They conclude that the findings support HDC action to change the status of 530-532 N Division Street from Contributing to Non-contributing.

Christine Crockett, 506 E Kingsley Street, Ann Arbor, President of the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, spoke in support of Doug Selby, his sincerity in working with the neighborhood, and his plans to make the structure green. She expressed support for changing the status of 530 - 532 N Division Street as proposed, and making it a structure that the neighborhood can be proud of for generations to come. She expressed support for changing the status of 530-532 N Division Street, from a Contributing to a Non-contributing resource in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District since the structure's architectural style is undefined and has no outstanding architectural features, having been altered significantly since it was constructed.

Ray Detter, Vice Chairperson of the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, spoke in support of changing the status of the building at 530 - 532 N Division Street from Contributing to Non-contributing. He noted that four of the original Old Fourth Ward Historic District founding members are in support of this change, as is their Association, given that they have carefully reviewed, discussed, studied all the documents/reports/findings provided by the City as well as the owner.

Jan Culbertson, A3c-Collaborative Architecture, FAIA, LEED AP BD + C, spoke in support of Doug Selby, his integrity in working with the neighborhood as well as his work in creating, his office building, in the Ann Arbor 2030 District, into a net-zero sustainable building.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Evan Hall, seconded by Bob White, that the property at

530-532 North Division Street, in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, be designated as a non-contributing resource based on field study, previous surveys, historic documentation, and information provided by the owner, because it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's National Register criteria.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

White said he supports this project.

Quijano said the findings presented at the meeting by the owner and applicant had convinced her to support the proposed status change.

Hall and Beeson agreed.

Rochlen said he felt it was a possibility to bring together two buildings with historic integrity, but it's obvious that that did not happen in this situation. He said he is convinced that any historic context is gone, and any historic integrity doesn't exist in this building.

The Commission expressed support to change the status of the structure.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Re-Classification Approved

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Epperson

H **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

[19-1181](#) Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes of May 9, 2019

Without objection the HDC meeting minutes were approved and forwarded to City Council.

I **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

Commissioner Bob White provided a report from the Michigan Historic Preservation Network Annual Conference he attended in Holland, Michigan.

Commissioner Jessica Quijano provided a brief report from Cobblestone Farms.

J **ASSIGNMENTS**

Review Committee: Monday, July 8, 2019 at 5 PM for the July 11, 2019 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen volunteered for the July HDC Review Committee.

K **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

[19-1182](#) May 2019 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L **CONCERNS OF COMMISSION**

Bob White expressed support for the Commission to send a resolution of support for tax credits to the State of Michigan Legislature for on-going discussions on bringing back tax credits for historic rehabilitation work.

The Commission agreed.

The Commission agreed that Bob White should provide the Nominating Committee report at the July HDC meeting.

M **COMMUNICATIONS**

M-1 [19-1183](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:58 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

John Beeson, Chair
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
mg/