



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, April 20, 2017

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Historic District Commission Chair Ben Bushkuhl called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 5 - Robert White, Benjamin L. Bushkuhl, John Beeson, Evan Hall, and David Rochlen

Absent: 2 - Ellen Ramsburgh, and Max Cope

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

E **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

E-1 **[17-0558](#)** HDC17-029: 508 Third Street - Rear Addition - OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher reviewed the following Memo containing revisions made to the application since the previous staff report.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Katherine and Larry Bates, 508 Third Street, Ann Arbor, applicants, were present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

M E M O R A N D U M

*To: Historic District Commission
From: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator
Date: April 20, 2017
Re: 508 Third Street HDC Application*

In response to the comments from Commissioners at the March 9, 2017 HDC meeting, the following changes have been made to the HDC application at 508 Third Street.

- 1) The roof shape has been changed from a side-facing gable to a hip. This change is appropriate, and results in a much less obtrusive addition.*
- 2) The window in the upper floor of the south side elevation has been shifted to the center of the wall. This is an appropriate location.*
- 3) The proposed new window in a new opening under the front porch on the north elevation has been removed from the application.*
- 4) Remove chimney.*

Staff feels that all of these changes are appropriate, and result in a stronger application.

The Historic District Commission's concern that the footprint of the house exceeds the size recommended by the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines has not been addressed (see sheet A12). The sum of all additions after the period of significance remains at 76% of the footprint of the house from the period of significance (1944 and earlier). The Design Guidelines state that a maximum of 50% is appropriate. Staff's opinion is that the footprint of the sum of the additions is too large, and that this portion of the application should not be approved.

Additional information on the proposed fence was not included, but this can be taken care of at the staff level.

For the Garage and Roof:

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 508 Third Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add dormers to the front and rear of the modern garage; install eight clad wood windows on the garage; replace the garage door; move a person-door from the side to the front of the garage; and put a new asphalt roof on the house and garage, as proposed. This portion of the application is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, architectural details, residential patios, and residential fencing, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for District or Neighborhood Setting and Windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted for the Garage and Roof.

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Ramsburgh, and Cope

For the Addition and Fence:

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 508 Third Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a one-story rear addition and 12' x 12' brick patio; remove one vinyl slider door and one double-hung vinyl window on the second floor rear elevation and replace them with a casement clad wood window; on the north elevation replace two modern double-hung windows with three new clad wood double-hung windows; on the west elevation add a new double-hung window in

a new opening on the filled-in porch wall; remove the chimney and replace the fence. This portion of the application is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, architectural details, residential patios, and residential fencing, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Setting, and Windows.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion defeated. Vote: 0-5

Request was Denied for the Addition and Fence.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 5 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Rochlen

Absent: 2 - Ramsburgh, and Cope

F **HEARINGS**

F-1 **17-0559** HDC17-045; 233 Crest Street - Rear Addition - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Jenny Charnizon, 233 Crest Street, Ann Arbor, owner, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 233 Crest, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to

remove a rear addition from 1989 and construct a 556-square-foot two-story addition, and to install a basement egress window on the south elevation near the back corner of the house, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions and Windows, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Setting, and Windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Ramsburgh, and Cope

F-2 [17-0560](#) HDC17-054; 526 Fifth Street - New Patio - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Nancy Bauer, applicant, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 526 Fifth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a paver patio in the rear yard as proposed. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the house and the surrounding area, and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 9 and the guidelines for building sites, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for residential patios.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Ramsburgh, and Cope

F-3 [17-0561](#) HDC17-047; 537 Detroit Street - New Garage - OFWHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Zaki Alawi, Michigan Rentals, owner, and applicant, Rob Fowler, 5550 Fox Run, Saline, were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 537 Detroit Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to demolish a non-contributing garage and construct a two-car garage, on the following condition: cementitious siding is installed with the smooth side out, and grass is restored between the driveway and house. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to residential accessory structures.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion defeated. Vote: 0-5

Request was Denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 5 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Rochlen

Absent: 2 - Ramsburgh, and Cope

F-4 [17-0562](#) HDC17-032; 510 Lawrence - Replace Window with Door -- OFWHD
Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Rob Fowler, 5550 Fox Run, Saline, applicant, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission approve the application at 510 Lawrence, a non-contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to remove a vinyl first-floor window on the south elevation and replace it with a full-lite door, on the following condition: that the window opening is bricked in with a minimum 1" recess from the face of the wall to maintain a visual record of the opening location. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for windows, neighborhood setting, doors, and building site, and the Ann Arbor Historic Guidelines for porches.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

F-5 [17-0563](#) HDC17-044; 403 W Mosley - Replace Two Windows - OFWHD

Jill Thacher noted that the applicant had requested a postponement until May 2017 HDC meeting.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, to grant a postponement until the May 8, 2017 HDC meeting.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0 Item Postponed

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Ramsburgh, and Cope

G **NEW BUSINESS**

G-1 **17-0564** HDC 2017 Awards Nominees

M E M O R A N D U M

To: HDC Members

From: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

Date: April 20, 2017

Re: 2017 HDC Award Nominees

The HDC Awards Committee finalized the list of nominees for 2017 awards. At the April 20 HDC meeting, please consider making a motion to approve these nominations, all of which staff agrees are worthy of recognition.

BICENTENNIAL AWARD

1. UM Bicentennial

CENTENNIAL AWARDS

2. Nickels Arcade-Centennial

3. Beth Israel Congregation-Centennial

SPECIAL MERIT AWARDS

4. Ann Arbor Muffler Sign- 1957

5. 544 Detroit- New construction in a historic district

6. Memorial Award to Kingsbury Marzolf, who was instrumental in creating the Historic District Commission and its first historic district (Division St.) and taught Architectural history at the UM School of Architecture

REHABILITATION AWARDS

7. 435 S. First- removal of siding, restoration of 1840s/1850s house.
8. 301 S. Main- new copper windows and major investment and high quality workmanship on this 1871/1908 building first known as Binder's Orchestration Hall.
9. 1533 Broadway- great job in restoring this 1943 building

PRESERVATION AWARDS

10. 1611 Broadway- beautiful Tudor Revival with copper gutters and downspouts. The Waterman house.
11. 1733 Jackson-Sherri Smith house built in 1924 for Reuben Hoffstetter, owner of Walk-Over Boot Shop
12. 1410 Hill St- To Frank and Julie Casa for their 40 years of stewardship of the Freer house designed in 1898 by Pond and Pond. It's the last owner-occupied house on Hill St. except for the Baldwin house.
13. 837 S. Main- Julie Weatherbee and Robert Droppelman bought this 1919 house in 1996.
14. 412 W. Jefferson- 1905/1907 house lovingly maintained by Ginny Hannon and John Koch. Notice the 2-track driveway.
15. 408 Awixa-Al Gallup home from 1926 owned by Louisa and Al Pieper who are the second owners. They have the plans in their possession as they are the second owners.
16. 109-119 E. Ann- Hoban Block well maintained by the Bilakos family for many decades. Bob Seger's song "Down on Main Street" was referring to these buildings (when there was a lot of black music happening at Clint's Club etc.
17. 448 Fifth- Barb and David Hall purchased the Dupper House (ca. 1902) in 1985 and have been on the Old West Side Homes tour three times!
18. 2935 Hickory Lane- 1962 Metcalf designed for Ralph Moyer and wife. Now home of Cynthia and Ed Yao who have lived here for many

years and had Metcalf design an addition for them

Moved by White, seconded by Beeson, to accept the HDC 2017 Award Nominees as presented to the Commission. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried. Vote 5-0

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Ramsburgh, and Cope

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J ASSIGNMENTS

J-1 Review Committee: Monday, May 8, 2017, at 5pm for the May 11, 2017 Regular Meeting

Bob White and Ben Bushkuhl volunteered for the May HDC Review Committee.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF

Thacher reported on the Inglis House and Study Committee.

K-1 [17-0565](#) March 2017 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

M COMMUNICATIONS

M-1 [17-0566](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx
- Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

Ben Bushkuhl, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
mg/