



# City of Ann Arbor

## Formal Minutes

### Planning Commission, City

301 E. Huron St.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/  
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

---

Wednesday, January 20, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second  
floor, City Council Chambers

---

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: [cityclerk@a2gov.org](mailto:cityclerk@a2gov.org); or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>) or on the 1st floor of City Hall on the Friday before the meeting. Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

#### **1 CALL TO ORDER**

*Chair Woods called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.*

*(New technology issues and a power outage delayed the meeting until 7:20 p.m.)*

#### **2 ROLL CALL**

**Present** 7 - Woods, Clein, Briere, Peters, Franciscus, Mills, and  
Gibb-Randall

**Absent** 2 - Bona, and Milshteyn

#### **3 APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

**Moved by Clein, seconded by Mills, that the Agenda be Approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

#### **4 INTRODUCTIONS**

#### **5 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

5-a [16-0075](#) City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of November 4, 2015

**Moved by Mills, seconded by Peters that the Minutes be approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

5-b [16-0076](#) City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of November 17, 2015

**Moved by Mills, seconded by Peters that the Minutes be approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

**6 REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, INTERIM PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS**

**6-a City Council**

*Briere reported that City Council is beginning to gear up for the budget review and will be holding a working session that will allow them talk about the next fiscal year and staffing at the City and the opportunity for focusing on the Master Plan. She said they have budgeted for a complete review of the City’s overall Master Plan so it is her hope that they begin to do that in the next fiscal year. She said Council was informed a few days ago that the City has hired a new Community Services Area Administrator and that job is extremely important to us, since that person oversees Planning, Building and Development, Parks and Recreation as well as Human Services. She said when he assumes his position we will see it as an opportunity to move forward on a number of fronts that are currently pending and when Mr. Derek Delacourt starts it is her pious hope that we begin the active job of recruiting a new Planning Manager.*

*She reported that last night, Council voted to move forward with negotiations for the sale of the Library lot and they postponed the Woodbury Club Site Plan in part because as of late on Friday the developer offered to give a conservation easement to the City for the wetlands that are on the eastern most parcel. She said while many would be excited to see that occur, there are details that need to be worked out so they postponed the item until their first meeting in March.*

**6-b Planning Manager**

*Alexis DiLeo report that the Accessory Dwelling Unit project has kicked off and there are a series of coffee talks/sessions as well as a general community meeting scheduled for February. She noted that the dates and places were available on the Planning webpage at [www.a2gov.org/adu](http://www.a2gov.org/adu). She said work continues on the Downtown Premiums evaluations and amendments.*

**6-c Planning Commission Officers and Committees**

*Peters reported that last week there was a DDA partnerships committee meeting, adding that one of their focuses for the coming year will be affordable housing. He said they are also working on a transportation management plan and getting feedback on where it is being used and demanded but also looking at parking needs on a wider area.*

**6-d Written Communications and Petitions**

[16-0077](#) Various Correspondences to the City Planning Commission

**Received and Filed**

**7 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)**

**8 PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING**

[16-0078](#) Public Hearings Scheduled for February 2, 2016 Planning Commission Meeting

*Chair Woods read the public hearing notice as published.*

**Received and Filed**

**9 UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

**9-a** [16-0079](#) Banyan Court Site Condominium Site Plan for City Council Approval-1654 South Maple Road - A proposal to develop 8 single family homes and a private street as a site condominium on a 2.75-acre parcel in the R1C district. Three landmark trees are proposed to be removed, an alternatives analysis is provided. (Ward 4) Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Alexis DiLeo provided the staff report.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Noting no public speakers the Chair closed the public hearing unless the item is postponed.*

**Moved by Clein, seconded by Mills, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Banyan Court Site Condominium Site Plan and Development Agreement, subject to receiving approval by the Water Resources Commissioner and prior to scheduling for City Council action.**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*Clein asked about the character and profile of the detention pond.*

*DiLeo said she believed it would be a shallow pond with no fencing required.*

*Kathy Keinath, Perimeter Engineering LLC, 11245 Boyce Road, Chelsea, explained there are two components to the storm water management; detention as well as retention. She said they learned from the Washtenaw County Water Resource Commissioner that they could not increase the amount of water running off the site because of flooding downstream in the Lansdowne subdivision. She said they were allowed to contain the amount of the existing volume and any increase to that volume required them to retain it on the site. She said there is about a half acre of bio-retention area and it is designed to pond at a maximum of 8 inches and has very gentle 1 in 5 slopes leading down to it.*

*Clein asked if the area would be described as a wetland.*

*Keinath said no, explaining that they are removing 3 feet of existing material and replacing it with a planting mix that will be 3 feet deep. She said the intent as the water flows into that area, is that it will infiltrate and they don't intend large amounts of water to be ponding.*

*Clein asked what vegetation would go into the area.*

*Keinath said the landscape plan shows some shrubs and trees with the majority being turf that could be mowed. She commented that they had held lengthy discussions with the County on what types of planting*

*material needed to go back into the pond area. She said it was determined that grass would be the most tolerant to the fluctuations of water as well as the drought that it might experience. She said perennials could die off if they don't get watered for an extended period of time. She said their hope for that area is that the water that accumulates will immediately infiltrate and they will never have 8 inches of water ponding.*

*Clein asked if the intent was for the area to be a used area for the residents as well.*

*Keinath said yes.*

*Gibb-Randall questioned the discussions with the Washtenaw County Water Resource Commissioner's office if they suggested turf grass which only gets to have 5-6 inch deep roots. She said they would need to do sod since seeds are not allowed, which means they are stuck with one type, Kentucky Blue Grass, which seems to go counter to the intent of their rules that native plants do a way better job of penetrating and breaking up those soils.*

*Keinath said it was one of the materials they found acceptable for planting in this area, clarifying that they had not suggested it; she further explained that they would be removing all of the clay soils in that area and new sandy top soil type soils would be brought in and turf is one of the acceptable plantings for this use. She said on the western side there are also evergreens planted and in the middle a grouping of deeper rooted plants as well.*

*Gibb-Randall said she suggested there be a distinction between what was acceptable and what they felt would be the best way, since in her own experience in dealing with very difficult soils, if there aren't deep rooted plants that will penetrate down through that 3 feet it will just sit on top of the clay pan. She said it is acceptable by the WCWRC office but she didn't think it was their intent and they would have much better efficacy if it were converted to something that actually had a chance of penetrating deeper than the 5 or 6 inches of a Kentucky Blue Grass. She explained that she sees these situations become very difficult to mow, because it is sitting under water, and the clay is not letting it go down and because there are no plants to facilitate that, it sits.*

*Keinath said there are a few plantings.*

*Gibb-Randall said she fears the water is going to sit, the grass is not*

*going to survive and they will have unstable ground that will fill up the sump with sediment and wash down, so if there is some way to guarantee that there is total vegetative cover, overtime, it would be helpful since she has not seen lawn as an effective cover as a bio-retention partner with soils that are really difficult. She said it is up to the developer, as to what they want it to be, noting that her concern is vegetation not surviving because of the conditions created and therefore you have unstable ground and sedimentation getting off the site unless it is cleaned regularly. She stated while the proposed plan is allowed, it would be up to the developer to decide how they proceeded based on what they wanted for that area.*

*Keinath said she would bring her concerns back to their landscape architect to look at alternative possibilities for planting layout.*

*Clein added that the Development Agreement that goes along with this project puts the main responsibility and inspection of the storm water system on the developer and then on the condominium association after the developer has excited the property, so if the annual inspections show it isn't working it will fall back on the people who are buying these houses to spend money to replace it. He said while they might not consider it their problem, the Commission would hate to see that happen to people in the community; that they move into something and then get stuck with something else that they are not anticipating. He said he too had some concerns for how the proposed turf would work.*

*Clein asked about light standards.*

*Keinath said there was a photometric plan included in the full site plan; she believed there were 5 or 6 lights and they were not real tall. She said they were proposed to be positioned next to driveways on the sidewalk side of the street.*

*Peters said he echoed the concerns over the turf grass options and the ability to effectively mitigate the run-off from the site.*

*Woods asked if there were any plans to have a walking path around the half acre area they had been discussing.*

*Keinath said they had talked about it but haven't shown anything on the site plan at this time, because they have no current plans to put a formal pathway around the area.*

*Woods asked if there would be plantings around the edges of the ponding*

area.

*Keinath said yes, there are proposed plantings along the highway, the south side, and a wall along the north side with planting in front of it.*

*Mills asked about the house models shown on the site plan and what they might expect to get.*

*Keinath said there were three models shown in the revised site plan, one having the garage set back, and any one of the lots could have any one of the three model units on it depending on the buyer and what they would like built on the lot.*

*Mills asked which three of the five shown models would be the ones referenced. She noted that the third and fourth lots in have a big landmark tree in the front and which other models could fit there.*

*Keinath said the plan is showing some of the units in mirror image, but there are only three models, and that all of the units would work on the lots with trees. She stressed that the trees were a selling point so they would do whatever they could to save the trees.*

*Mills said she was neutral on the garage-forward aspect of the plans, but wanted to be sure she understood what they would be getting from the plan.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Yeas:** 7 - Wendy Woods, Kenneth Clein, Sabra Briere, Jeremy Peters, Sofia Franciscus, Sarah Mills, and Shannan Gibb-Randall

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 2 - Bonnie Bona, and Alex Milshteyn

**10 REGULAR BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item**

**11 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)**

*Woods thanked the local high school students for attending the meeting and learning about the Planning Commission and the City's processes.*

**12**      **COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS**

*Clein asked about the mentioned budget discussions.*

*Briere said in the 2016 fiscal year they budgeted \$200,000 to do the Allen Creek Master Plan and in 2017 they projected that they would budget \$ 250,000 to do a City wide Master Plan. She said Council hopes this can happen but with the change over at leadership positions in the Community Services Department it may be that it won't happen in 2017 but it is their expectation, this minute, that it will be incorporated in the 2017 budget. She said no one thinks that the work can be completed in 2017, but the hope is that it can be initiated.*

**13**      **ADJOURNMENT**

**Moved by Franciscus, seconded by Peters that the meeting be adjourned at 8:45 p.m. The meeting was unanimously adjourned.**

Wendy Woods, Chair  
mg

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Channel 16 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Wednesdays at 10:00 AM and Sundays at 2:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website ([www.a2gov.org](http://www.a2gov.org)).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.