

City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St.

Ann Arbor, MI 48104

<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>



Meeting Minutes - Final

Monday, December 18, 2023

7:00 PM

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16,
ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council
To sign up for public comment, call the City Clerk's Office
between 8am - 5pm at 734-794-6140 on the day of the meeting.

City Council

Public commentary can be made in person or by calling Zoom at:
877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099

Enter Meeting ID 942 1273 2148

CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Christopher Taylor called the meeting of the Ann Arbor City Council to order at 7:05 p.m. in the Guy C. Larcom, Jr. Building, 2nd Floor Council Chambers, 301 E. Huron Street.

MOMENT OF SILENCE

Council stood for a moment of silence.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Mayor Taylor led Council in the recitation of the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL OF COUNCIL

Present: 10 - Mayor Christopher Taylor, Councilmember Erica Briggs, Councilmember Linh Song, Councilmember Jen Eyer, Councilmember Travis Radina, Councilmember Cynthia Harrison, Councilmember Ayesha Ghazi Edwin, Councilmember Chris Watson, Councilmember Dharma Akmon and Councilmember Jennifer Cornell

Absent: 1 - Councilmember Lisa Disch

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

A motion was made by Councilmember Eyer, seconded by Councilmember Briggs, that the Agenda be approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried.

AC COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE CITY ADMINISTRATOR

City Administrator Milton Dohoney Jr. presented the following written reports for information of Council:

AC-1 [23-2074](#) Agenda Response Memo and eComments - December 18, 2023

Received and Filed

AC-2 [23-2111](#) City Administrator's Report - December 18, 2023

Received and Filed

AC-3 [23-2113](#) Economic Development Report

Received and Filed

INT INTRODUCTIONS

INT-1 [23-1953](#) Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) Update

Matt Carpenter, CEO of AAATA, provided an update to City Council from the AAATA.

Received and Filed

PUBLIC COMMENTARY (3 MINUTES PER SPEAKER, 45 MINUTES TOTAL)

*** (SPEAKERS ARE NOT PERMITTED TO GRANT THEIR RESERVED TIME TO AN ALTERNATE SPEAKER)**

*** ACCOMMODATIONS CAN BE MADE FOR PERSONS NEEDING ASSISTANCE WHILE ADDRESSING COUNCIL**

**TO PARTICIPATE ONLINE, CALL ZOOM AT: 877 853 5247 or 888 788 0099
ENTER MEETING ID 942 1273 2148**

PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

- 1. Adam Goodman - East Medical Center Drive Bridge Rehabilitation and Widening Project (CA-6); Plymouth Road TC1 Rezoning (C-1) (phone)**

Adam Goodman, resident, spoke about the East Medical Center Drive project and the Plymouth Road TC-1 rezoning.

- 2. Kathy Griswold - East Medical Center Drive Bridge Rehabilitation and Widening Project (CA-6) and the Public Right-Of-Way (in person)**

Kathy Griswold, resident, spoke about lighting at pedestrian crossings.

3. **Brandon Dimcheff - Plymouth Road TC1 Rezoning (C-1); UDC Amendment: Personal Scale SES (C-3) (phone)**

Brandon Dimcheff, resident, spoke in support of TC-1 zoning.

4. **Eric Ivancich - Plymouth Road TC1 Rezoning (C-1) (Zoom)**

Eric Ivancich, resident, spoke in support of the proposed TC-1 rezoning of Plymouth Road.

5. **Mike Stroup - Plymouth Road TC1 Rezoning (C-1) (phone)**

Mike Stroup, of Grand Rapids, representing the owner of one of the proposed properties to be included in the proposed TC-1 rezoning, asked that his client's parcel be removed from the ordinance, stating it wasn't originally part of the proposal.

6. **Alex Lowe - Plymouth Road TC1 Rezoning (C-1) (Zoom)**

Alex Lowe, resident, spoke about the proposed TC-1 rezoning on Plymouth Road.

7. **Wendy Lawrence - Anti-Semitism and Feeling Safe in Ann Arbor (in person)**

Wendy Lawrence, resident, spoke about anti-Semitism in Ann Arbor.

8. **Kamal Aggour - Ceasefire in Gaza (in person)**

Kamal Aggour, resident, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

9. **Asma Azimi - To Put Forth a Ceasefire Resolution (phone)**

Asma Azimi, of Canton, was not present.

10. **Fadwa Ashur - Ceasefire Resolution Put Forth by Community (Zoom)**

Fadwa Ashur, resident, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

11. **Malak Elshafei - Reinstate Ceasefire Resolution (phone)**

Malak Elshafei, resident, was not present.

12. Tasneem Madani - Ceasefire Resolution & the Rise of Islamophobia and Anti-Semitism in Ann Arbor (in person)

Tasneem Madani, of Superior Township, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza and thanked Councilmember Briggs for her support.

13. Abraham Raskind - Reasons Why Ann Arbor Should Call for a Ceasefire (phone)

Abraham Raskind, resident, was not present.

14. Kristine Abouzahr - Resolution for Palestine (in person)

Kristine Abouzahr, resident, urged Council to support a resolution that was more balanced for both sides in the Middle East.

15. Dylan Cohen - In Support of Introducing a Ceasefire Resolution (in person)

Dylan Cohen, U-M student, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

16. Dr. Muzammil Ahmed - Ceasefire Resolution (phone)

Dr. Muzammil Ahmed, of Canton, MI, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

17. Waseem Ostwani - Ceasefire Resolution (in person)

Waseem Ostwani, a U-M pediatrician, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

18. Adam Baruch - Thanking City Council for Removing Resolution (in person)

Adam Baruch, resident, thanked Council for removing the resolution regarding Gaza from the agenda.

19. Eileen Freed - Civil Discourse (in person)

Eileen Freed, resident, spoke about anti-Semitism and the lack of civil discourse in the world and the community.

CC COMMUNICATIONS FROM COUNCIL

COUNCILMEMBER GHAZI EDWIN

Councilmember Ghazi Edwin spoke about the Gaza resolution, stating it was pulled from the agenda to allow for more time and additional input from all sides.

COUNCILMEMBER BRIGGS

Councilmember Briggs spoke about the Gaza resolution and why it was removed from the agenda.

COUNCILMEMBER AKMON

Councilmember Akmon acknowledged all of the public speakers in the audience. She addressed the difficulty of the situation here and in the Middle East.

COUNCILMEMBER RADINA

Councilmember Radina spoke about the war in Gaza and the proposed resolution.

MC COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE MAYOR**MC-1 [23-1868](#) Appointments - Confirmations**

Mayor Taylor requested confirmation of the following appointment that was presented to City Council for consideration at the December 4, 2023 Regular Session:

*Leslie Science & Nature Center Board of Directors
Therese Perlowski - Partial Term
Term Ending: May 31, 2025*

A motion was made by Councilmember Cornell, seconded by Councilmember Briggs, that the Appointment be approved. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried.

CA CONSENT AGENDA

Passed on consent agenda

A motion was made by Councilmember Song, seconded by Councilmember Watson, that the following Consent Agenda Items be approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried unanimously, thus satisfying the eight-vote requirements of CA-1, CA-2, CA-4, CA-9 and CA-10.

- CA-1** [23-2015](#) **Enactment No: R-23-443**

Resolution to Approve the Sale of the South Parcel of the Maisel Buy-Protect-Sell Property to Kristen Muelhauser for \$204,000.00 **(8 Votes Required)**

- CA-2** [23-2014](#) **Enactment No: R-23-444** **Approved**

Resolution to Approve the Sale of the North Parcel of the Maisel Buy-Protect-Sell Property to Matthew Demmon for \$122,000.00 **(8 Votes Required)**

- CA-3** [23-1947](#) **Enactment No: R-23-445** **Approved**

Resolution to Approve Amendment No. 1 to the Professional Services Agreement with Trace Analytical Laboratories, Inc. for Certified Laboratory Water and Wastewater Testing Services (Amendment \$160,000.01, Contract Total \$235,000.00)

- CA-4** [23-1989](#) **Enactment No: R-23-446** **Approved**

Resolution to Approve a Construction Contract with Erie Construction LLC for the Barton Nature Area Border to Border Trail Project and Appropriate Funding (\$1,287,382.00) **(8 Votes Required)**

- CA-5** [23-1988](#) **Enactment No: R-23-447** **Approved**

Resolution to Approve An Agreement between the City of Ann Arbor and Washtenaw County, by the Washtenaw County Parks and Recreation Commission Regarding Responsibilities and Cost Allocation for the Construction of the Barton Nature Area Border to Border Trail Project

- CA-6** [23-1977](#) **Enactment No: R-23-448** **Approved**

Resolution to Approve a Construction Contract with C.A. Hull Co., Inc. for

the East Medical Center Drive Bridge Rehabilitation and Widening Project
(\$10,173,757.03)

CA-7 [23-1852](#) **Enactment No: R-23-449** **Approved**

Resolution Approve a Construction Contract and to Ratify an Emergency Best Source Purchase Order with E.T. MacKenzie Company for Repairs to the Sanitary Sewer Main on Hilltop Dr. (\$224,812.20)

CA-8 [23-2005](#) **Enactment No: R-23-450** **Approved**

Resolution to Approve a General Services Agreement and to Ratify an Emergency Best Source Purchase Order with Schindler Elevator Corporation for the Water Plant Freight Elevator Jack Replacement (\$446,104.00)

CA-9 [23-1794](#) **Enactment No: R-23-451** **Approved**

Resolution to Accept a Sanitary Sewer Easement at 1300 S. Maple Road from Grace Bible Church (**8 Votes Required**)

CA-10 [23-1795](#) **Enactment No: R-23-452** **Approved**

Resolution to Accept a Water Main Easement at 1300 S. Maple Road from Grace Bible Church of Ann Arbor, Michigan (**8 Votes Required**)

CA-11 [23-2019](#) **Enactment No: R-23-453** **Approved**

Resolution to Approve a Professional Services Agreement with Elevate Energy for Administration of the Residential Rebate Program (\$600,000.00)

CA-12 [23-2021](#) **Enactment No: R-23-454** **Approved**

Resolution To Approve a Professional Services Agreement with Walker-Miller Energy Services, LLC for Administration of the Home Energy Advisor Program (\$900,000.00)

CA-13 [23-2017](#) **Enactment No: R-23-455** **Approved**

Resolution to Approve the Renewal of the City's Contract with Blue Cross Blue Shield of Michigan (BCBSM) to provide administrative claims processing services for Group Medical and Group Pharmacy benefits, and related Stop-Loss Insurance through BCS Insurance Company for the City's Health Care Plan on Behalf of Employees and Retirees and Their

Dependents, and to Authorize the City Administrator to Execute the Necessary Documentation (\$2,050,146.00)

CA-14 [23-2001](#) **Enactment No: R-23-456** **Approved**

Resolution to Approve the City's Contract with Delta Dental Plan of Michigan, Inc., for Claims Administration Services relating to the City's Dental Plan through December 31, 2026 (\$707,455.00 in 2024, \$735,753.00 in 2025, and \$765,183.00 in 2026)

CA-15 [23-2002](#) **Enactment No: R-23-457** **Approved**

Resolution to Authorize Payments to Unum Life Insurance Company of America and to Renew Associated Group Term Life, Accident, and Disability Insurance Policies for City Employees and their Eligible Dependents, and to Authorize the City Administrator to Execute the Necessary Documentation (\$615,000.00 in 2024, \$615,000.00 in 2025)

CA-16 [23-2006](#) **Enactment No: R-23-458** **Approved**

Resolution to Approve the Collective Bargaining Agreement between the City of Ann Arbor and Teamster Civilian Supervisors, effective January 1, 2024 - December 31, 2026

CA-17 [23-2012](#) **Enactment No: R-23-459** **Approved**

Resolution to Approve the Collective Bargaining Agreement between the City of Ann Arbor and the Command Officers Association of Michigan, effective January 1, 2024 - December 31, 2027

CA-18 [23-2013](#) **Enactment No: R-23-460** **Approved**

Resolution to Approve the Collective Bargaining Agreement between the City of Ann Arbor and Police Service Specialists, effective January 1, 2024 - December 31, 2026

PH PUBLIC HEARINGS (3 MINUTES PER SPEAKER)

FOR ZOOM MEETINGS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

PH-1 [23-1930](#) An Ordinance to Add Chapter 75 (Leaf Blowers) to Title VI of City Code (ORD-23-35)

A public hearing was conducted on the proposed amendment to Add Chapter 75 (Leaf Blowers) to Title VI of City Code (ORD-23-35). Notice of public hearing was published December 7 2023.

The following persons were present to speak at the hearing:

The owner of Three Brothers Lawn Care expressed concern about the availability of commercial electric blowers. He stated this ordinance will require a major investment from lawn companies.

Jeff Hayner, Ward 1, stated he supports the concept, but has concerns about the implementation.

Ken Garber, resident, thanked Council for this ordinance.

A Ward 2 resident stated they are a public health professional and support the ban due to health and environmental concerns.

Adam Jaskiewicz, resident, spoke in support of the ordinance.

Joan Lowenstein, resident, spoke in support of the proposed ordinance, stating it is good for the environment.

Alex Lowe, Ward 3, spoke in support.

John Callewaert, Ward 2, spoke in support of the proposed ordinance.

There being no further comment, the Mayor declared the hearing closed.

Held and Closed

PH-2 **[23-1696](#)** An Ordinance to Amend the Zoning Map, Being a Part of Section 5.10.2 of Chapter 55 of Title V of the Code of The City of Ann Arbor, Zoning of 5.9 Acres from TWP (Township District) to R4A (Multiple-Family Dwelling District), 2520 Pontiac Trail and 2540 Pontiac Trail (CPC Recommendation: Approval - 9 Yeas and 0 Nays) (ORD-23-34)

A public hearing was conducted on the proposed amendment to Chapter 55 of Title V of the Code of The City of Ann Arbor, Zoning of 5.9 Acres from TWP (Township District) to R4A (Multiple-Family Dwelling District), 2520 Pontiac Trail and 2540 Pontiac Trail (CPC Recommendation: Approval - 9 Yeas and 0 Nays) (ORD-23-34). Notice of public hearing was published November 30, 2023.

The following persons were present to speak at the hearing:

Jeff Hayner, Ward 1, spoke in opposition to the proposed ordinance.

Ken Garber, resident, spoke in opposition to the proposed ordinance.

A resident of the Old West side expressed concern about the project and the fact that it was not fully electric.

Alex Lowe, Ward 3

Luis Vazquez, resident, spoke in support.

There being no further comment, the Mayor declared the hearing closed.

Held and Closed

PH-3 [23-1982](#) Enactment No: R-23-461 Held and Closed

Held and Closed

Resolution to Approve The Village of Ann Arbor Site Plan at 1710 Dhu Varren Road (CPC Recommendation: Approval - 9 Yeas and 0 Nays).

A public hearing was conducted on the proposed Resolution to Approve The Village of Ann Arbor Site Plan at 1710 Dhu Varren Road. Notice of public hearing was published November 30, 2023.

The following persons were present to speak at the hearing:

Rich Fein, Ward 5, representing the Citizens Climate Lobby, spoke in opposition.

A Ward 5 resident, representing the Citizens Climate Lobby

Jeff Hayner, Ward 1, spoke in opposition.

Ken Garber, resident, urged Council to postpone action and work with the Office of Sustainability to improve the project.

Alex Lowe, resident, expressed concerns.

Luis Vazquez, resident, stated the project needs electrification.

There being no further comment, the Mayor declared the hearing closed.

A APPROVAL OF COUNCIL MINUTES

A-1 [23-2023](#) Work Session of December 1 and Regular Session Meeting Minutes of December 4, 2023

A motion was made by Councilmember Watson, seconded by Councilmember Ghazi Edwin, that the Work Session of December 1 and Regular Session Meeting Minutes of December 4, 2023 be approved. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried.

B ORDINANCES - SECOND READING

B-1 [23-1930](#) An Ordinance to Add Chapter 75 (Leaf Blowers) to Title VI of City Code (ORD-23-35)

A motion was made by Councilmember Cornell, seconded by Councilmember Eyer, that the Ordinance be adopted on Second Reading. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried.

B-2 [23-1696](#) An Ordinance to Amend the Zoning Map, Being a Part of Section 5.10.2 of Chapter 55 of Title V of the Code of The City of Ann Arbor, Zoning of 5.9 Acres from TWP (Township District) to R4A (Multiple-Family Dwelling District), 2520 Pontiac Trail and 2540 Pontiac Trail (CPC Recommendation: Approval - 9 Yeas and 0 Nays) (ORD-23-34)

A motion was made by Councilmember Song, seconded by Councilmember Radina, that the Ordinance be adopted on Second Reading. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried.

DB New Business - Boards and Commissions:

DB-1 [23-1982](#) Enactment No: **R-23-461** **Approved**

A motion was made by Councilmember Watson, seconded by Councilmember Radina, that the Resolution be approved. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried.

Resolution to Approve The Village of Ann Arbor Site Plan at 1710 Dhu Varren Road (CPC Recommendation: Approval - 9 Yeas and 0 Nays).

C ORDINANCES - FIRST READING

C New Business - Staff:

- C-1** [23-1973](#) An Ordinance to Amend Chapter 55 (Unified Development Code), Rezoning of 53 Parcels in the Plymouth Road Area to TC1 (Transit Corridor District), City-Initiated Rezoning, (CPC Recommendation: Approval as Amended - 7 Yeas and 0 Nays) (ORD-23-36)

A motion was made by Councilmember Watson, seconded by Councilmember Song, that the Ordinance be approved on First Reading.

Councilmember Briggs moved the following amendment, supported by Councilmember Cornell:

Amend the ordinance and map to remove the 8 parcels that were not included in the original staff recommendation to the Planning Commission. In the ordinance, those parcels are identified as parcels 46 through 53.

The proposed amendment was considered friendly by the Body.

Amended

A motion was made by Councilmember Watson, seconded by Councilmember Song, that the Ordinance be approved as amended on First Reading and should be returned by 1/22/2024. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried.

Enactment No: ORD-23-36

- C-2** [23-1983](#) An Ordinance to Amend Sections 5.15, 5.16 and 5.37 of Chapter 55 (Unified Development Code) of Title V of the Code of the City of Ann Arbor (Banquet Hall, Personal Services, Veterinary Uses) CPC Recommendation: Denial (5 yes, 0 no) (ORD-23-37)

A motion was made by Councilmember Briggs, seconded by Councilmember Watson, that the Ordinance be approved on First Reading and should be returned by 1/22/2024. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried.

Enactment No: ORD-23-37

- C-3** [23-1990](#) An Ordinance to Amend Sections 5.16 of Chapter 55 (Unified Development

Code) of Title V of the Code of the City of Ann Arbor (Personal Scale SES)
CPC Recommendation: Approval (8 yes, 0 no) (ORD-23-38)

A motion was made by Councilmember Watson, seconded by Councilmember Radina, that the Ordinance be approved on First Reading and should be returned by 1/22/2024. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried.

Enactment No: ORD-23-38

C-4 [23-2034](#) An Ordinance to Amend Section 9:158 of Chapter 112 (Non-Discrimination) of Title IX of the Code of the City of Ann Arbor to Prohibit City Contractors’ Inquiry Into Job Applicants’ Criminal History Until After Conditional Offer of Employment; and Require City Contractors to Document Efforts to Employ Local Persons for City Construction Contracts (ORD-24-01)

Deleted from Agenda

D MOTIONS AND RESOLUTIONS

DC New Business - Council:

DC-1 [23-1808](#) **Enactment No: R-23-462** **Approved**

A motion was made by Councilmember Watson, seconded by Councilmember Radina, that the Resolution be approved. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried.

Resolution to Recommend Approval of Issuance of a Downtown Development District Liquor License to Michigan Theater Foundation, Inc.

DC-2 [23-2109](#) **Enactment No: R-24-016** **Deleted from Agenda**

Deleted from Agenda

~~Resolution Denouncing Rising Hate and Discrimination in Ann Arbor and End to Violence in Gaza and Israel~~

DS New Business - Staff:

DS-1 [23-2112](#) **Enactment No: R-23-463** **Approved**

A motion was made by Councilmember Harrison, seconded by

Councilmember Song, that the Resolution be approved. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried.

Resolution to Appoint Andre Anderson as the City of Ann Arbor Police Chief

CLOSED SESSION UNDER THE MICHIGAN OPEN MEETINGS ACT, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO, LABOR NEGOTIATIONS STRATEGY, PURCHASE OR LEASE OF REAL PROPERTY, PENDING LITIGATION AND ATTORNEY/CLIENT PRIVILEGED COMMUNICATIONS SET FORTH OR INCORPORATED IN MCLA 15.268 (C), (D) (E), AND (H).

A motion was made by Councilmember Song, seconded by Councilmember Ghazi Edwin, that Council enter into Closed Session under MCL 15.268 (h) to discuss attorney client privileged communications. On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Mayor declaring the motion carried and the meeting adjourned in Closed Session at 9:48 p.m.:

Yeas: 10 - Mayor Taylor, Councilmember Briggs, Councilmember Song, Councilmember Eyer, Councilmember Radina, Councilmember Harrison, Councilmember Ghazi Edwin, Councilmember Watson, Councilmember Akmon and Councilmember Cornell

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Councilmember Disch

MEETING RECONVENED

A motion was made by Councilmember Watson, seconded by Councilmember Song, that the meeting reconvene. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried and the meeting reconvened in Open Session at 10:38 p.m.

E & F CLERK'S REPORT OF COMMUNICATIONS, PETITIONS AND REFERRALS

E The following communications were referred as indicated:

Passed on consent agenda

A motion was made by Councilmember Cornell, seconded by Councilmember Briggs, that the Clerk's Report of Communications, Petitions and Referrals be approved as presented. On a voice vote,

the Mayor declared the motion carried.

- E-1 [23-2044](#) Jessica Letaw- Resignation from the Downtown Development Authority
- E-2 [23-2045](#) RISK FUND CLAIMS REPORT - NOVEMBER 2023
- F **The following minutes were received for filing:**
- F-1 [23-1187](#) June 8, 2023 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes
- F-2 [23-1352](#) July 13, 2023 Historic District Meeting Minutes
- F-3 [23-1509](#) August 17, 2023 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes
- F-4 [23-1591](#) Building Board of Appeals Meeting Minutes for August 17, 2023
- F-5 [23-1686](#) September 27, 2023 ZBA Meeting Minutes
- F-6 [23-1733](#) September 19, 2023 PAC Meeting Minutes
- F-7 [23-1736](#) October 3, 2023, City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes
- F-8 [23-1836](#) Environmental Commission Meeting Minutes 10.26.23
- F-9 [23-1902](#) Ann Arbor Housing Commission Board Meeting Minutes October 18, 2023
- F-10 [23-1916](#) Minutes of the October 19th, 2023 Renters Commission Meeting
- F-11 [23-1951](#) ICPOC October 2023 Meeting Minutes

F-12 [23-1994](#) Council Liquor License Review Committee Meeting Minutes of July 19, 2023

F-13 [23-2030](#) Audit Committee Meeting Minutes - January 19, 2023

G COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE CITY ATTORNEY

None.

PUBLIC COMMENT - CONTINUED (3 MINUTES EACH - IF NECESSARY)

***THIS SECTION IS FOR SPEAKERS WHO SIGNED UP FOR PUBLIC COMMENTARY BUT WERE UNABLE TO SPEAK AT THE BEGINNING OF THE MEETING DUE TO THE 45-MINUTE TIME LIMIT.**

FOR ZOOM MEETINGS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

20. Zainab Rights - Moral Duty to Pass the Ceasefire (in person)

Zainab Rights, a local journalist, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

21. Jessica Anderson - Encouraging City Council to Put Forward a Ceasefire Resolution (in person)

Jessica Anderson, of Pittsfield Charter Township, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

22. Gretchen Keppel-Aleks - Energy Efficiency (in person)

Gretchen Keppel-Aleks, resident, was not present.

23. Murad Idris - Ceasefire Resolution (in person)

Murad Idris, resident, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

24. Rima Mohammad - Community Concerns (in person)

Rima Mohammad, of Pittsfield Charter Township, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza, expressing

disappointment that the resolution was rescinded from the agenda.

- 25. Karthik Ganapathy - Ceasefire Resolution Put Forward by the Ann Arbor Community (in person)**

Karthik Ganapathy, resident, was not present.

- 26. Yamaan Saadeh - Family Members Living in Gaza (in person)**

Yamaan Saadeh, resident, spoke about their personal experience in Gaza.

- 27. Muhammad Saifudin - Ceasefire Resolution (in person)**

Muhammad Saifudin, resident, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

- 28. David Lauer - Hatred Has No Place in this World (in person)**

David Lauer, resident, spoke about human rights.

- 29. Amir M. Naddaf - Encouraging City Council to Put Forward a Ceasefire Resolution (in person)**

Amir M. Naddaf, of Pittsfield Charter Township, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

- 30. Cora Galtern - Ceasefire (phone)**

Cora Galtern, resident, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

- 31. David Gurk - Incentives for New Building Electrification (in person)**

David Gurk, resident, was not present.

- 32. Henry Herskovitz - Holocaust Education in AAPS (in person)**

Henry Herskovitz, resident, spoke about the history of the Holocaust.

- 33. Danyah Aljammal - Ceasefire for Gaza (in person)**

Danyah Aljammal, of Ann Arbor Township, read a poem related to the conflict in Gaza.

34. Tahani Othman - Ceasefire Resolution (phone)

Tahani Othman, resident, was not present.

35. Aaron Mariasy - Ceasefire Resolution (in person)

Aaron Mariasy, resident, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

36. Henry Mackeen-Shapiro - Importance of Signing Ceasefire Resolution (Zoom)

Henry Mackeen-Shapiro, resident, spoke about Zionists in Ann Arbor.

37. Alex Sepulveda - In Support of a Ceasefire Resolution (phone)

Alex Sepulveda, representing Jewish students, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

38. David Ezekiel - Speak in Support of Introducing a Ceasefire Resolution (in person)

David Ezekiel, resident, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

39. Stephen Aronson - The Middle East (in person)

Stephen Aronson, resident, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

40. Lauren Sharp - Ceasefire Resolution (in person)

Lauren Sharp, representing Jewish Voices for Peace, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

41. Edward Trager - Ceasefire in Gaza (in person)

Edward Trager, resident, thanked Council for bringing the resolution for Gaza forward.

42. Dr. Omer Abid - Urge City Council to Demand on Immediate Ceasefire and Immediate and Unrestricted Humanitarian Aid at the Precise Daily Level the UN Says is Necessary (in person)

Dr. Omer Abid, of Grand Blanc, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.

43. **Gregory McClure - Support for a Community-Led Ceasefire Resolution (in person)**
Gregory McClure, resident, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.
44. **Mozhgan Savabieasfahani - We Are Against Military Aid to Israel (in person)**
Mozhgan Savabieasfahani, resident, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza, stating what is happening is a genocide.
45. **Anam Shah - Fair Ceasefire Resolution (in person)**
Anam Shah, of Canton, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.
46. **Basit Zafar - Ceasefire Resolution in Gaza and Hate Speech and Discrimination in Ann Arbor (in person)**
Basit Zafar, resident, thanked the Council Members for their support of the resolution.
47. **Raven Marin - Ceasefire in Palestine (in person)**
Raven Marin, of Ypsilanti, urged Council to support a resolution asking for a ceasefire in Gaza.
48. **Shima Sadaghiyani - Ceasefire Resolution (in person)**
Shima Sadaghiyani, resident, was not present.
49. **Decky Alexander - Community Perspective on the Israel-Gaza War (in person)**
Decky Alexander, resident, spoke about the proposed resolution regarding Gaza, stating it is not a local issue for City Council to consider.
50. **Kristen Hayden - Ceasefire Resolution That Was Taken Off the Agenda (phone)**
Kristen Hayden, Ward 2, spoke in support of the proposed resolution regarding a ceasefire in Gaza.
51. **Josh Whinston - Ceasefire Resolution (in person)**
Josh Whinston, resident, thanked Council for discussing Gaza, stating he

would prefer they did not pass a resolution.

52. Rima Hassouneh - Ceasefire Resolution for Gaza (in person)

Rima Hanouneh, resident, spoke in support of the proposed resolution regarding a ceasefire in Gaza.

53. Sophie Alzaim - Ceasefire in Gaza (phone)

Sophie Alzaim, of West Bloomfield, spoke in support of the proposed resolution regarding a ceasefire in Gaza.

54. Blaine Coleman - We Are Against Military Aid to Israel (in person)

Blaine Coleman, resident, spoke in support of the proposed resolution regarding a ceasefire in Gaza.

55. Tracey Taeger - Palestine (in person)

Tracey Taeger, of Macomb Township, was not present.

56. Sarah Emeritz - Ceasefire Resolution Put Forth by the Community (in person)

Sarah Emeritz, of Ypsilanti, spoke in support of the proposed resolution regarding a ceasefire in Gaza.

57. Faiz Syed - A Gaza Ceasefire (in person)

Faiz Syed, resident, spoke in support of the proposed resolution regarding a ceasefire in Gaza.

58. Michael Mueller - In Support of Ceasefire Resolution Put Forth by the Community (in person)

Michael Mueller, resident, spoke in support of the proposed resolution regarding a ceasefire in Gaza.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Councilmember Song, seconded by Councilmember Watson, that the meeting adjourn. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 12:25 a.m.

COMMUNITY TELEVISION NETWORK (CTN) COMCAST CHANNEL 16, AT&T CHANNEL 99:

LIVE: MONDAY, DECEMBER 18, 2023 @ 7:00 P.M.

REPLAY: FRIDAY, DECEMBER 22, 2023 @ 8:00 P.M.

REPLAYS SUBJECT TO CHANGE WITHOUT NOTICE

Community Television Network live televised public meetings are also available to watch online live and on-demand from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/watchctn <<http://www.a2gov.org/watchctn>>, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Cable: Comcast Cable channel 16 or AT&T UVerse Channel 99

Videos are also available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to:

City Clerk's Office
301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Requests made with less than two business days' notice may not be able to be accommodated.

A hard copy of this Council packet can be made available upon request during regular business hours.