



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Final

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, June 10, 2021

7:00 PM

Electronic Meeting

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 978 6401 4515

A. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chairperson, Anna Epperson, called the meeting to order at 7:01 stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, June 10, 2021 electronic meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission.

The meeting is being held electronically to protect public health and safety due to the COVID-19 virus and to comply with orders issued by the governor, the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services, and/or the Washtenaw County Health Department.

We intend to conduct this meeting similarly to an in-person meeting. However, please be patient if there are technical issues. Public comment will be via telephone only. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting id # 978 6401 4515 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 5 - David Rochlen, Kathryn Fortener, Anna Epperson, Robert White, and Jennifer Ross

Absent: 2 - John Beeson, and Jessica Quijano

B-1. Introduction of New Commissioner - Jennifer Ross

Vice Chair Epperson introduced the newest and returning Historic District Commission member, Jennifer Ross. She thanked outgoing Commissioner Evan Hall, noting the Commission will greatly miss him and appreciate his many years of great service on the Commission.

Commissioner Ross provided a brief introduction explaining that she was a returning member to the Commission having served from 2011 through 2016. Ross is an architectural historian, working in the field for 20 years; she currently serves as staff for the Detroit Historic District Commission and Planning Department, where she's been in that role since 2012.

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Moved by Vice Chairperson Anna Epperson to add a new item under New Business; G-2 'Discussion and Potential Action on Relocation of Gas Meters'. And correction of F-12 to read 545 Sixth Street; Gas Meter. Seconded by Secretary Dave Rochlen.

The Agenda was unanimously approved as amended.

D. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

None

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS**F. HEARINGS****F-1. 21-1116 HDC21-164 630 W Liberty; Paver Driveway; OWSHD**

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was not present.

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 630 West Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to pave the driveway with pavers as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for paved areas and landscape features, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

F-2. [21-1117](#) HDC21-178 606 S Ashley; Solar Array; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the

Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathryn Fortener, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 606 South Ashley Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a black-on-black solar array on the south-facing roof, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for roofs, energy efficiency, and mechanical systems, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to solar installations.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

F-3. [21-1118](#) HDC21-196 530 Elizabeth; Masonry Fence; OFWHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jennifer Ross, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 530 Elizabeth Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to build a granite field stone wall, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for fencing and walls, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 9 and the Guidelines for Setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

F-4. [21-1119](#) HDC21-052 509 Fourth; Gas Meter; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 509 Fourth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the south side elevation, three feet from the front corner of the house, utilizing the existing penetration for the vent, as shown in the application. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

F-5. 21-1120 HDC21-075 639 Fifth; Gas Meter; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to

the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Anna Epperson, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 639 Fifth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the north elevation, 7' from the front corner of the house, as shown in the application, and mounted as low as possible from the ground. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4 – 1

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, and White

Nays: 1 - Ross

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

F-6. [21-1122](#) HDC21-118 532 Fifth; Gas Meter; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathryn Fortener, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 532 Fifth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the north side elevation, three feet from the northeast corner of the house, as shown in the application, and that the existing vent opening in the sill be used instead of adding an additional penetration. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

F-7. [21-1124](#) HDC21-144 913 W Liberty; Gas Meter; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 913 W Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the west (side) elevation, 2' from the front corner of the house, as shown in the application. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

F-8. 21-1125 HDC21-172 520 Sixth; Gas Meter; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jennifer Ross, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 520 Sixth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the south side elevation, one foot from the front corner of the house, as shown in the application. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion denied. Vote: 0 - 5

Application denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 5 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, White, and Ross

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

F-9. [21-1126](#) HDC21-173 537 Second Street; Gas Meter - POSTPONED

Agenda item has been postponed until a future meeting in order to obtain the property owner's signature.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

F-10. [21-1127](#) HDC21-185 610 W Madison; Gas Meter; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathryn Fortener, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 610 West Madison Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the west elevation, behind the bay window on the house, with the condition that it be documented as such and submitted to staff for review and approval. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

F-11. [21-1128](#) HDC21-188 519 Fourth St; Gas Meter; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 519 Fourth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the south side elevation, two feet from the front corner of the house, as shown in the application. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and

Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

F-12. [21-1129](#) HDC21-190 545 Sixth Street; Gas Meter; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 545 Sixth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the north side elevation, one foot from the front corner of the house at an existing valve and regulator, as shown in the application. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The

City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

F-13. [21-1130](#) HDC21-191 554 Sixth; Gas Meter; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jennifer Ross, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 554 Sixth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a gas meter on the front elevation, one foot from the southeast corner of the house, as

shown in the application. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 3 – 2

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 3 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, and White

Nays: 2 - Epperson, and Ross

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

G. NEW BUSINESS

G-1. [21-1132](#) Election of Officers

ANNUAL ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Commissioner Bob White provided the Nominating Report;

*Anna Epperson as Historic District Commission Chairperson,
Dave Rochlen as Historic District Commission Vice Chairperson,
Jessica Quijano as Historic District Commission Secretary.*

Moved by Anna Epperson, seconded by Bob White, to nominate the following HDC Officers;

**Anna Epperson as Historic District Commission Chairperson, and
Dave Rochlen as Historic District Commission Vice Chairperson,
and
Jessica Quijano as Historic District Commission Secretary.**

The Commission and Staff thanked the Officers for their service to the City.

Yeas: 5 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

G-2 Discussion and Potential Action on Relocation of Gas Meters

The Commission discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Discussion and Potential Action on Relocation of Gas Meters

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Anna Epperson, seconded by Bob White, that Staff may approve relocating an existing gas valve and regulator location for a meter if it's converted into a post mount and that they be mounted as close to the ground as possible (possibly below the water table) and when there is no additional bollard piece added to the re-installation.

On a roll call vote the Chair declared the motion unanimously approved by the Commission.

Yeas: 5 - Secretary Rochlen, Fortener, Epperson, White, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Beeson, and Quijano

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [21-1133](#) April 8, 2021 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

The April 8, 2021 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council .

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**J. ASSIGNMENTS**

- J-1. **Review Committee: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 5pm for the July 8, 2021 Regular Meeting**
Commissioners David Rochlen and Jennifer Ross volunteered for the July 6, 2021 HDC Review Committee.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

- K-1. [21-1135](#) May 2021 HDC Staff Activities
Received and Filed

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**M. COMMUNICATIONS**

- N-1. [21-1136](#) Various Communications to the HDC
Received and Filed

N. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 10:25 pm.

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

Public kiosks are now installed in the lobby and basement of City Hall to allow members of the public to attend and participate in electronic meetings.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

Anna Epperson, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
/mg