

CITY OF ANN ARBOR DEVELOPERSEC INVESTORS | ADVISORS

2010 MAR 29 PM 12: 23

March 28, 2010

Honorable Mayor Hieftje and City Council Members City of Ann Arbor 100 N. Fifth Avenue Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Dear Mayor Hieftje and City Council Members,

We are proud to present to you The Moravian, a project that meets all the standards required for its approval. We have toiled for more than two years working with the City and numerous constituent groups. Multiple iterations of this project have been developed with numerous revisions being made along the way during which we have complied with every request made of us and direction provided to us by the City.

Accompanying this letter for your review and consideration is information summarizing a number of important characteristics of The Moravian. Also included is factual information about the project to clear up some often heard but inaccurate claims about the merits of the project. We encourage your approval of this project for a number of reasons, including the following:

- The City's experts have confirmed the project meets both the letter of the law and the spirit and intent of all the requirements and standards of the PUD ordinance.
- The citizen body (the City Planning Commission) tasked with evaluating the same also overwhelmingly confirmed the project meets all the requirements and standards of the PUD ordinance.
- The Moravian clearly exceeds the City's long standing standards for PUD approval, as demonstrated through the City's administration of the PUD ordinance over many years, which is documented in the enclosed comparative chart.
- This project has received resounding and unprecedented community support for a private development.
- The Moravian will result in a number of beneficial effects for the City, many of which are listed in the enclosed summary of benefits.

We look forward to your approval of our project on April 5, 2010 and welcome any questions you have in the mean time.

Best regards,

Jeffrey P. Helminski (248) 763-8370

PHlminsky"

Accompanying Information

INFORMATION	AB
PUD Comparative Analysis Summary	.1
Facts About The Moravian	2
List of Community Supporters	. 3
Sample Letters and Expressions of Support	. 4
Benefits of The Moravian	. 5
Architectural Renderings of The Moravian	. 6

.

Moravian Comparison to Similar PUDs Deemed To Have Met The Standard For Public Benefit Provided vs Variance Requested

Lane		Kingsley	The	The Glen Ann Place The Moravian			Moravian
Attribute			Gallery	3.5			1
Permitted Height (feet)	Attributo			C1	D46		-
Approved Height (feet) 5 Increase in Height 7.50%		30	30			20	variance
State	1			ì	i		
Permitted Density							36%
Approved Density 54 123 N/A 32 62 54 178 73159 N/A 11579 26336 Affordable Units 8 18.5 N/A 6.4 12 Affordability above min, requirement 0% 036 N/A 036 29% infinite Permitted FAR 29,520 59,202 3,670 9,979 66,962 Approved FAR 59,800 199,642 43,296 28,860 74,408 55 Far 3655 607% 472% 52,860 74,008 5 Increase in FAR 103% 7379 10894 139% 119% 39% Benefits not shared by all projects Sincrease in FAR 103% 7379 10894 139% 119% Fincrease in FAR 103% 7379 10894 139% Fincrease in FAR 103% 7379 139% Fincrease in FAR 103% 7379							30/8
## Increase in Oensity ## Affordable Units ## Affordable Units ## 18.5 N/A 6.4 12 ## Affordablity above min. requirement ## 29,520 59,202 3,670 9,979 66,962 ## Approved FAR 59,800 199,642 43,296 28,860 74,408 ## Far 365% 607% 472% 521% 200% ## Increase in FAR 20,30% 237% 1080% ## Increase in FAR 20,30% 237% 1080% ## Benefits not shared by all projects ## Affordable Contribution	1	1		_		1	
Affordability above min. requirement nin. requirement Permitted FAR 29,520 59,202 3,670 9,979 66,962 Approved FAR 59,800 199,642 43,296 8 Far 365% 607% 472% 521% 200% % lockease in FAR Benefits not shared by all projects Sok Greenbelt contribution - not specified as a requirement in Sup. Regs. or Dev. Agmt. Agmt. Agmt. Agmt. 18.5 N/A 0.4 12 19. 29% 10. 10. 29% 10. 10. 29% 10. 10. 29% 10. 10. 20%		617%					32%
Permitted FAR Permitted Pageon Permitted FAR Permitted Pageon Permitted FAR Permitted	Affordable Units	8	18.5	encern attendersterners av anatheir	1		
Approved FAR 59,800 365% 607% 472% 521% 200% 607% 61000 607% 607% 607% 607% 607% 607% 607% 6		0%	0%	N/A	0%	29%	Infinite
% Far 365% 607% 472% 521% 200% % Increase in FAR 103% 237% 1080% 189% 11% 3% Benefits not shared by all projects None Greenbelt contribution - not specified as a requirement in Sup. Regs. or Dev. Agmt. Agmt. Agmt. Solve Greenbelt contribution - not specified as a requirement in Sup. Regs. or Dev. Agmt. Agmt. Agmt. Benefits not shared by 350K Greenbelt contribution - not specified as a requirement in Sup. Regs. or Dev. Agmt. Agmt. Benefits not shared by 350K None Greenbelt contribution - not specified as a requirement in Sup. Regs. or Dev. Agmt. Agmt. Benefits not shared by 350K None Greenbelt contribution - not specified as a requirement in Sup. Regs. or Dev. Agmt. Agmt. Benefits not shared by 350K None Greenbelt contribution - not specified as a required) - LEED Certification - Renewable Energy - Helps achieve Mayor's Green Energy Usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public	Permitted FAR	29,520	59,202	3,670	9,979	66,962	
## Increase in FAR 10.3% 23.7% 10.80% 11% 3%	' '	· 1	1 1	43,296	28,860	74,408	
Benefits not shared by all projects \$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc			SW-Search Color (Color Color C				
all projects Greenbelt contribution - not specified as a requirement in Sup. Regs. or Dev. Agmt. - Renewable Energy - Helps achieve Mayor's Green Energy Challenge of 20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public			CHARLEST CHARLEST CONTRACTOR	AND DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPERT	Anne contract of the contract		3%
contribution - not specified as a requirement in Sup. Regs. or Dev. Agmt. - Renewable Energy - Helps achieve Mayor's Green Energy Challenge of 20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public		· ·	None	None	None		
- not specified as a requirement in Sup. Regs. or Dev. Agmt. - Renewable Energy - Helps achieve Mayor's Green Energy Challenge of 20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public	an projects						
specified as a requirement in Sup. Regs. or Dev. Agmt. - Renewable Energy - Helps achieve Mayor's Green Energy Challenge of 20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public							
in Sup. Regs. or Dev. Agmt. - Renewable Energy - Helps achieve Mayor's Green Energy Challenge of 20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public						. equil eu	
or Dev. Agmt. - Renewable Energy - Helps achieve Mayor's Green Energy Challenge of 20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public		requirement				-LEED	
Agmt. - Renewable Energy - Helps achieve Mayor's Green Energy Challenge of 20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public						Certification	
Energy - Helps achieve Mayor's Green Energy Challenge of 20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public						Donoughla	
- Helps achieve Mayor's Green Energy Challenge of 20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public		Agmt.					
Mayor's Green Energy Challenge of 20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public						<u>.</u>	
Energy Challenge of 20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public							
Challenge of 20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public			·			1	
20% renewable energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public							
energy usage by 2015 - Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public						_	
- Brownfield Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public							
Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public				٠		by 2015	
Redevelopment - Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public							
- Eliminates Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public							
Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public						Redevelopment	
Industrial zoning - Floodplain improvements - Creates public						- Eliminates	
- Floodplain improvements - Creates public							
improvements - Creates public						zoning	
improvements - Creates public			Ī			- Floodplain	
- Creates public						-	
						·	
						hair share	

•

•

v

The Facts About The Moravian

Clarifying the inaccurate claims made about The Moravian

Claim:

The Moravian will result in a net loss of affordable housing stock.

Fact:

The Moravian will result in a net gain of 12 units of high quality, perpetually restricted, sustainable/green, affordable housing.

None of the existing housing on site is affordable housing according to the standards of the Community Development Office.

Housing that may appear "affordable" in price alone is often only so due to the poor condition or outdated nature of the property.

The affordable housing provided at The Moravian is more affordable than its rental rate alone would indicate due to the energy efficiency of the units which will lower utility costs for the residents.

Affordable units at The Moravian are guaranteed to remain affordable in perpetuity. This is not the case for un-restricted units that may appear affordable based on their current rental rates but could be lost or converted to more expensive housing in the future.

Claim:

The Moravian doesn't meet the standard for public benefit that previous PUD's have.

Fact:

The Moravian significantly exceeds the level of benefit provided compared to any prior PUD while requesting just a fraction of the level of variance.

The PUD comparison chart provides specifics.

Claim:

Because The Moravian has been submitted under the PUD Ordinance, its approval by the City is discretionary.

Fact:

The PUD Ordinance, like any other law, has a set of standards by which it must be administered. Although some aspects of the PUD Ordinance have more discretion afforded to them than some other laws, the standards are not discretionary or arbitrary.

The City of Ann Arbor has a long standing and well established history of administering the PUD Ordinance in a manner that has clearly defined the minimum standards for the PUD ordinance.

Claim:

The Moravian's application as a PUD is simply an attempt to avoid the R4C zoning.

Fact:

Half of the properties included in The Moravian are zoned Industrial and half are zoned R4C.

This mixed zoning is precisely a condition intended to be accommodated via a PUD.

Rezoning as a PUD would make non-conforming existing uses conforming.

Not one of the parcels underlying The Moravian could be redeveloped in conformance with the existing zoning. Every one of them would require a variance to be redeveloped.

City staff has confirmed The Moravian meets both the letter of the law and the spirit and intent of the PUD ordinance.

Claim:

The Moravian is out of scale with the neighborhood.

Fact:

City Staff and the Planning Commission have found The Moravian to be in scale with its surrounding.

The City has had an existing definition of this neighborhood and its very specific boundaries since at least 1999. The Moravian is located in Neighborhood # 022 which is titled the South Central neighborhood. This neighborhood includes structures such as Ashley Mews, Baker Commons, The Perry School and many other structures significantly larger or taller than The Moravian.

The Neighborhood around The Moravian includes much more than just the former single family, now primarily multiple-family, structures immediately to the north of the site.

According to the staff report prepared by the City's experts in such matters:

"The proposed architectural design compliments the context and character of the neighborhood."

"The Moravian's mass has been broken down through architectural details and offers a reasonable transition between the existing nonresidential buildings on East Madison Street, the industrial uses on the south side of East Madison Street, and the residential buildings to the north on South Fourth and South Fifth Avenues."

"The site will serve as a bookend and frame for the South Fourth and Fifth Avenue blocks and is compatible with the scale and style of East Madison Street."

This is a mixed use and mixed zoning area with residential, industrial, commercial and office uses and zoning in close proximity to each other.

Approximately 90% of residential properties in the blocks adjacent to The Moravian are rentals. Only three are truly single family homes.

Claim:

The Moravian is inconsistent with the Central Area Plan (CAP).

Fact:

City Staff and the Planning Commission have found The Moravian to be consistent with the overall goals of the CAP.

The use is specifically what is called for in the master plan, that being multiple-family residential.

The Central Area Plan, in discussing the primary intended uses, describes this location as an area "where higher density development such as apartments and group quarters is appropriate".

Consistency with Sections of the CAP:

Housing and Neighborhoods

- The primary issue addressed in the neighborhood preservation section of the master plan is protecting established residential areas form commercial and institutional expansion.
- The Moravian does precisely this by reaffirming the site as residential with a higher value residential use.
- The Moravian eliminates the existing threat of commercial expansion posed by the Industrial zoning that exists on half of the properties.
- The Moravian redevelops this property into an asset very unlikely to be acquired for future redevelopment by the University as they have often done in the past and as they previously attempted to do with the properties across S. Fifth Ave. from this site.
- The Moravian replaces converted single family homes not suited for multiple-family use.
- The Moravian minimizes adverse parking impacts.
- The Moravian promotes an attractive residential area and aims to serve both the current and future population's housing needs
- The Moravian provides affordable housing opportunities
- The Moravian increases the diversity of people, housing types, lifestyles and income levels in the downtown area
- The Moravian provides mixed income housing opportunities

Downtown

- The Moravian increases housing units and people living in the downtown area
- The Moravian increases pedestrian activity creating a stronger 24 hour presence
- The Moravian increases the range of the population for which there are affordable housing options in the downtown area
- The Moravian provides an opportunity for lifestyle choices that will reduce reliance on automobiles

- Redevelopment

- The Moravian enhances residential use amid opportunity for commercial and institutional pressure
- The Moravian provides residential uses close to the downtown core and will increase activity during weekends and evenings which promotes greater downtown liveliness

Circulation and Parking

- The Moravian reduces congestion
- o The Moravian results in no additional parking in neighborhoods

Claim:

The Moravian shouldn't be approved because a portion of it is in a floodplain.

Fact:

The Moravian's design and the storm water system actually <u>improves</u> the floodplain characteristics.

The Moravian increases the floodplain capacity of the site by over 100%

The Moravian reduces peak hour flows by over twenty fold and retains on-site and even some off-site storm water for approximately 24 hours in a major storm event.

Claim:

The Moravian shouldn't be approved because the FEMA flood maps haven't been updated yet.

Fact:

The data for the new FEMA maps has been finalized and is known. The administrative process of publishing the maps is all that remains to be done.

The City's floodplain coordinator has reviewed The Moravian based on the updated and now accurate topographic information included in the new FEMA maps. He has verified The Moravian meets or exceeds all applicable standards.

Claim:

The Moravian hasn't complied with the requirements of the Citizen Participation Ordinance.

Fact:

The Moravian is not subject to the Citizen Participation Ordinance; however The Moravian has voluntarily complied with all of the requirements of the Citizen Participation Ordinance, which City Staff has confirmed.

The Moravian development team has held more neighborhood meetings than required and continues to have an open-door policy regarding future meetings with concerned or interested residents.

One of the neighborhood meetings, that was held at the apartment of Newcombe Clark, was coordinated by a resident of the area and not by the development team. Mr. Clark's apartment is frequently used for gathers such as fund raisers, exhibitions and other public events for local non-profit and other organizations.

Claim:

The architectural renderings depicting the project are out of scale.

Fact:

The renderings and the photographs with the new building superimposed on them are accurately represented.

Neumann Smith, the project Architect, is one of the most highly decorated and most well respected architectural firms in the State. They are experts in their field and develop these types of renderings on a regular basis. The drawings are intended to portray the relative height and scale of the project to the existing conditions.

Great effort has gone into designing a building that gives the visual appearance of lessened height and size through the use of the site's topography, a variety of building materials and colors, physical relief and other architectural techniques. It is confirmation of having achieving that goal if the building appears shorter than might initially be expected.

The representation of the relative heights has been verified to ensure accuracy.

Claim:

The Moravian should not be approved because other approved projects have not yet been built.

Fact:

The construction status of other projects is not one of the ordinance standards The Moravian must satisfy.

The Moravian, unlike some other projects is able to be financed even in today's economy and the team pursuing The Moravian has the capacity to make that happen. There is construction financing available for rental apartments through both conventional sources and the Department of Housing and Urban Development.

The Moravian targets a non-luxury market which is chronically undersupplied in the downtown Ann Arbor market and remains an attractive investment space for debt and equity financiers alike.

As a statement of The Moravian team's financial capabilities and belief that The Moravian exceeds the standards for PUD approval as confirmed by City Staff and the Planning Commission, the properties underlying The Moravian were recently purchased.

Claim:

The Moravian will cause traffic problems and accidents on South Fifth Ave.

Fact:

The City traffic engineers have reviewed the traffic that would be generated by The Moravian and concluded there will be no significant impact. In fact, based on City standards, the volume of trips it will generate does not reach a level that warrants a full traffic study.

Claim:

Sustainable characteristics of The Moravian have no beneficial effect on the public.

Fact:

The construction of The Moravian will eliminate leaching of volatile organic compounds from the contaminated soil into the Huron River Watershed

The Moravian will eliminate an estimated 636 metric tons of greenhouse gasses annually. This is the equivalent of approximately 129 vehicles being taken off the streets of Ann Arbor.

Claim:

The Moravian will only attract students as tenants.

Fact:

The Moravian is targeted at the young professional market and has been designed to have flexible units that will appeal to a broad range of future tenants.

The Moravian is envisioned to attract residents that include University employees, young professionals working in downtown or elsewhere who desire an urban environment, graduate students, visiting professors, medical residents, retired graduates of the University, recent graduates of the University, service workers employed by downtown businesses and others.

Claim:

The Moravian will block out the sun from surrounding properties.

Fact:

The Moravian uses an L-shaped design and the advantageous topography to almost entirely eliminate any shading effect beyond that which existing structures in the area have on each other.

In some cases, The Moravian will have less shading effect on its neighboring properties than existing single family homes on 5th Avenue do on their neighbors.

Claim:

The Moravian shouldn't be approved because there are high vacancy rates in nearby houses for rent.

Fact:

The occupancy rate of other properties is not one of the ordinance standards The Moravian must satisfy.

The market segment targeted by The Moravian is a very different market than that targeted by old houses being listed for rent. The Moravian's target market seeks high quality, newer and sustainable apartment living wired for the latest technology with professional onsite management, security and other features not offered by an older, single family home.

Community Supporters of The Moravian PUD

Peter Schork, Owner, Café Habana, President, Ann Arbor State Bank

William J. Davis Jr., Owner, Arbor Springs Water

Ken Fischer, Resident 2115 Melrose Avenue, President University Musical Society, Executive Committee member of Ann Arbor SPARK, participant in Washtenaw County's Community Success process, cabinet member of Washtenaw United Way, board member of the Cultural Alliance of Southeastern Michigan, and member of the Arts Alliance's Cultural Leaders Forum

Ellie Sarras, former director of Main Street Association

DTE Energy, Downtown Ann Arbor's largest employer

Joe Ferrario, Resident 2969 Heather Way, President of multiple manufacturing businesses

David Crouse, VP of Engineering, Sithe Global, Resident and downtown employer

Kristne McCardle, Creative Director, Ann Arbor Film Festival

Kevin Hawkins, Resident 439 Third St.

Peter Baillia, Resident 1979 McKinley

Nick Contaxes, Resident 522 Hill St.

Bill Krebaum, Resident 408 S. Fourth Ave. #6

Mike Forgacs, Resident 112 N. 7th Street

Molly McFarland, Resident 1611 1/2 Jackson Ave.

Kyle Mazurek, Resident 2020 Pauline Street, Apt. 2A

Wendy Johnston, Owner Poshh (clothing boutique)

Laurie Blakeney, Resident, 530 N Ashley, Owner Ann Arbor School of Yoga

Britten Stringwell, Local Artist, The Yellow Barn Organizer

Sava Lelcaj, Owner of Sava's Café and downtown employer of over 60 people

Laurie Prager, Resident, Board Member UMMA

Brianna Fritz, Resident, Campaign Manager for Carsten Honke

Sam Valenti IV, Resident 113 1/2 W. Liberty, Owner Ghostly International

Jesse Bernstein, Resident 3552 Frederick Dr

Patrick Macoska, Resident 1916 Sunrise Street

Angela Kujava, Resident

Conan Smith, Resident 234 8th St.

Alan Aldworth, Resident, 4800 Gullane Drive

Amanda Uhle, Executive Director, 826michigan, 115 East Liberty Street

Andrea Steves, Resident N Main St.

Renee Greff, Owner Arbor Brewing Company

Andrew Hauptman, Resident

Peter Sparling, Executive Director, Peter Sparling Dance

Andy Labarre, Congressman John Dingle's local representative

Eve Aronoff, Owner, Eve Restaurant & resident, 2345 S. Circle Dr.

Catherine Hauptman, Owner, Bluestone Realty Advisors

David McNamara, Resident, Owner Tree Top Realty

Donald Harrison, Executive Director Ann Arbor Film Festival

Stephen Palms, downtown employee

Roger Hewitt, Owner Zanzabar, Red Hawk, Revive and Replenish

Gale Redding, Board Member, Main Street Association & downtown employee

Al McWilliams, Resident, Owner Quack Media (Downtown employer)

Greg Lobdell, Owner Blue Tractor & Vinology Restaurants

Brad Tobin, Director of Development, Michigan Theater

Caroline Gagnoue, Owner Connor O'Neil's

Lee Berry, CFO Michigan Theater

John Balback, Resident

Ryan Kucsera, Resident

Linda Brown, Downtown employee, Columbia Asset Management

Fulter Hong, Manager, Google

Louis Callaway, Board Member Michigan Theater

Matt Turner, President and CEO, Amherst Fund, 401 E. Stadium St.

Marsha Chamberlin, Resident, Executive Director Ann Arbor Art Center

William Milliken, President, Milliken Realty Company

Gene Ragland

Russ Collins, Director Michigan Theater

Rob Cleveland, CEO, ICON Creative Technologies Group, 220 Felch St.

Stewart W. Beal, President, Beal Properties

Patrick J. Cavanaugh, Resident, VP United Bank & Trust

Jim Ryans, Resident 350 Pinewod St.

Edward Surovell, Owner, Edward Surovell Realtors

Rebecca Lopez Kriss, Resident

Geoff Gaedner, Resident 1979 McKinley

Main Street Area Association

Rick Williams, 543 S. Fourth Ave. (adjacent property owner)

Rita Filippini, Resident 1395 Millbrook Trail, Owner Brazamerica & Gentle Laser Body Care

Neil Loney, Owner, Rogow & Loney P.C.

Elisabeth Magiera, Resident 2926 Leslie Park Circle, Owner, Copernicus European Delicatessen

David William Minehart, Resident 411 S. Fifth Ave.

Valerie Sathe Brugeman, Resident 1537 McIntyre

Fernanda Quadros, Resident 3081 Signature St.

Monica Sendor, Resident 616 Lawrence

Cristine Santanna, Resident 2141 Glencoe Hills #11

Doug McClure, Resident 5425 Scio Church Rd.

Robert A. Boonin, Resident 1545 Chapleau Dr.

Nancy Shore, Resident 2020 Winewood Ave.

Stephen D. Schmier, Resident 645 N. 4th Ave. Unit D

Jane Lumm, Resident 3075 Overridge Dr.

Ed Shaffran, downtown landlord and employer

Jim Zamberlin, Resident 1403 W. Huron St.

Jeffrey C. Higgins, Resident

Hongbin Chen, Resident 3705 Fox Hunt Dr.

James H. Getty, Resident 1124 Kay Pkwy

Joshua Brugeman, Resident 1537 McIntyre

Sarah Ryans, Resident 350 Pinewood St.

Stephanie Hopkins, Resident 306 S. Main Street, Apt. 2B

Deb Pearson, Marketing Director, Bluestone Realty Advisors

James Ahnert, Resident 655 Barber

Jon Keller, Owner J. Keller Properties

Barbara A. Roberts, Resident 2441 Bunker Hill

Jeff Wenzinger, Resident

Stephanie Rieke, External Relations Director, UMMA

Arnold Geldermans, Resident 2559 Antietam

Richard Carlisle, Resident 2935 Exmoor Rd.

Vita M. Ciemiorek, Resident 2605 Fenwick Ct.

John Langs, local business owner, 206 S. Fifth Ave.

Gretchen Meyer, Resident 1726 Fair St. Unit 1

Jeremy Peters, Resident, Head of licensing Ghostly International, downtown employee

Jason Costello, 111 N. Ashley, Owner Cabrio Properties, downtown employer

Luz Glover, Oxford Companies, Ann Arbor employee

Maura Thomson, Resident 2321 Devonshire, Director, Main Street Association

Dan Glazer, Owner/Manager Café Habana

Laurie Gendron, William Davidson Institute at the UofM

Kiff Hamp, Resident 306 S. Main St.

Saad Saffo, Owner Happy's Pizza at Main and Madison Streets

Matthew Neagle, Resident 1239 White Street

James Behm, resident and downtown employee

Jen Hepler, Owner Salon Vox

Carrie Hensel, Owner Inner Circle Media & resident 2430 Powell Ave.

Tony Lupo, Resident and downtown employee

Jeff Meyers, Resident

Evelyn Lossia, Property owner 600 S. Main Street

Jacob Smith, Resident 837 E. University

Victor Munoz, Resident 3131 Creek Drive

Dear Ann Arbor Planning Commission Members,

I understand that a hearing will be held tomorrow regarding the Moravian apartment project PUD request. I am now traveling out of state and will be unable to attend the hearing, but would like to register my support for this project.

As a resident of the neighborhood, I am familiar with the proposed site and the surrounding area, since I enjoy walking in the vicinity. There are many good things to be said about the project, but I would like to focus on a couple of points:

- 1) The proposed apartment building will be a big improvement on the present structures occupying the site, both in terms of visual aesthetics, and the manner in which the residents will affect the neighborhood. In walking by the site on several occasions, I observed that the houses are more or less rundown and unattractive. They are not architecturally distinguished, even if brought into good repair. The current use appears to fit the "student ghetto" category. For instance, on one walk, along Madison between Fourth and Fifth Avenues, I observed that a young man was sunbathing within a few feet of the sidewalk with music playing loudly. On another occasion while walking south on Fourth Ave., I heard the sound of drumming in the distance and at first assumed it was the U-M band at practice. As I approached Madison, however, I began to hear electric guitars and realized that a rock band was practicing in the garage of the of the very unattractive industrial-type building on Fourth Ave. just north of Madison. I have no problem with people sunbathing or enjoying loud music (when not annoying others), but would note that such behaviors do not enhance the prospects of restoring the neighborhood to a family-friendly or owner-occupied condition. The very same young people could occupy apartments in the Moravian, but their potentially annoying behavior would be confined within the apartment and would be far less likely to spill out onto the streets.
- 2) An attractive multi-story structure such as the proposed Moravian will serve as an excellent buffer, shielding the neighborhood to the north from the nearby industrial and U-M athletic plant facilities to the south. With the opportunity for a fairly large number of students, young professionals, and working singles to live at The Moravian, there will be less pressure for them to occupy single rooms or small apartments in the houses that were once single-family homes in the nearby area. With possibly less demand for single rooms in the houses to the north, there may be a much greater likelihood that the houses will be restored to owner-occupied and/or single-family status. While I understand that the present owners of such rental properties may see this prospect as a threat to their economic interests (and who may therefore be inclined to object to The Moravian), in reality, the reverse could well be true if the area becomes more attractive to affluent households who might like to purchase and restore such properties.

The environmental, tax-base and economic benefits that would result from the construction of The Moravian are very significant and, I think, well set out by others. So, for all these reasons, I strongly support the granting of the PUD as requested for The Moravian.

Sincerely,

Bill Krebaum

408 S. Fourth Ave. #6 Ann Arbor, MI 48104 September 18, 2009

Dear Mayor John Hieftje, City Council Members and Planning Commission Members,

I am writing to express my support for The Moravian and to encourage you to approve this project.

I currently wear several hats in the community that require me to think a lot about our future. I am a longtime Ann Arbor resident who respects and honors the history of our community and seeks to keep it healthy, diverse, and distinctive going forward. I write this letter as a private citizen, but my view is informed by my roles as President of University Musical Society, Executive Committee member of Ann Arbor SPARK, participant in Washtenaw County's Community Success process, cabinet member of Washtenaw United Way, board member of the Cultural Alliance of Southeastern Michigan, and member of the Arts Alliance's Cultural Leaders Forum.

I have sought to inform myself about The Moravian. It represents the kind of project that we should get behind because it addresses in a positive way many issues we face as a community. It will provide a housing option in the downtown area that young professionals can afford. Housing in this location will further increase the number of customers who will frequent current downtown businesses and will encourage new businesses that are necessary to keep our downtown vibrant. The Moravian will also provide a greater supply of downtown rental units which will increase the diversity of downtown residents, including restricting 15% of the building as workforce affordable housing. Its occupants will be able to walk not only to downtown but to virtually all of the principal theaters owned by the community and the University of Michigan, an attribute that offers both environmental and audience development benefits. From what I've been able to see and learn for myself, I believe The Moravian is appropriately located in a mixed use neighborhood, and those developing it are committed to making the building environmentally friendly in a variety of ways.

Sincerely,

Ken Fischer 2115 Melrose Avenue Ann Arbor MI 48104

Joseph D. Ferrario

Mayor John Hieftje City of Ann Arbor 100 N. Fifth Avenue Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Dear John,

You and I corresponded several years ago on a neighborhood matter that has subsequently been resolved to the satisfaction of all concerned. Thanks again for your help.

I am writing now to express my support for The Madison and to encourage you, the Planning Commission, and the Council to approve this project. I am sure you are familiar with the long list of benefits of this project to Ann Arbor, and particularly downtown Ann Arbor, that have been brought forward by others. I will not follow the script in this letter, but rather give you my observations on the challenges facing Ann Arbor as well as the entire state of Michigan, and the significance of projects like The Madison.

You should know that I have lived in Ann Arbor for almost fifteen years. I have been president or general manager of several small manufacturing businesses in and around Ann Arbor in challenging turn-around or growth assignments. In that time, I have consulted and continue to consult with troubled businesses, emerging businesses, U of M Tech Transfer, Spark, GLEQ, and many other local jobs and business formation initiatives.

Throughout my experiences in the community, I have learned what helps and what hinders capital formation and job creation. It is not corporate income tax, the SBT, infrastructure, real estate tax abatements, or others in the litany of complaints of under achieving businesses. It is always the TALENT...and the talent is fleeing from our community and from the entire state.

Anything we can do to prevent this flight will contribute to our success, if not our survival, in the economy of the world. Anything that makes Ann Arbor attractive and livable to our highly mobile children should be among our highest priorities. Those who want to keep Ann Arbor as it has always been are, in fact, shrinking Ann Arbor. There is no status quo ante in community development in this new century. To stand still is to fall behind. The stadium can be reconfigured only so high, and peripheral retail sprawl only so widely, and only so much real estate tax revenue can be foregone, before we must turn to the center of our town and transform it into a city where our best and brightest will want to live and work.

I hope you, the Planning Commission, and the Council will seriously consider and approve The Madison, an initiative representing thoughtful growth for our city.

De Sui

Sincerely,

Joe

2969 Heatherway

City of Ann Arbor C/O Mayor John Hieftje City Council Planning Commission 100 N. Fifth Avenue Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Dear Mayor John Hieftje, City Council Members and Planning Commission Members,

I sometimes think our policy makers don't remember what made Ann Arbor the wonderful city it has become. Many of you (us) moved here years ago when the big draw was moving to a city that was "young, intellectually thriving and hip". If we who have benefited our entire adult lives by living in such a stimulating environment don't take action now to insure young people can afford to live here we are writing a death sentence to the town we love. We must support projects like The Madison. We <u>must find</u> ways to assist young residents and new businesses a way to thrive in our downtown. Why should we bus folks into our fancy little town to serve tables, be retail clerks or clean offices? Talk about a class war!

I miss having a department store (Kline's, Jakes' and others) and a Hardware Store (Schlenkers) and a paint store (Andersons,), and a drug Store (Lucky Drug) not to mention the little dress shops etc that just couldn't keep up with the times and make it in downtown Ann Arbor. Let's change this trend now, before it is too late!

I am writing to express my support for The Madison and to encourage you to approve this project. It will increase workforce affordable housing options in the downtown area, provide housing opportunities attractive to young professionals which are significantly lacking in the downtown area and it will increase the supply of sustainable/green housing options. The Madison is appropriately located in a mixed use neighborhood, close to downtown, and provides a number of important community benefits in addition to those mentioned above.

Yours Truly,

Laurie Blakeney
Downtown home owner – 530 N. Ashley
Downtown Business owner – The Ann Arbor School of Yoga at 420 W. Huron

October 5, 2009

City of Ann Arbor C/O Mayor John Hieftje City Council Planning Commission 100 N. Fifth Avenue Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Dear Mayor John Hieftje, City Council Members and Planning Commission Members,

My name is Molly McFarland and I reside at 1611 1/2 Jackson Rd., Ann Arbor, Michigan. As a 27 year old, young professional in the community, I have struggled in the past with locating affordable housing close to downtown where I work. I have also seen countless friends and colleagues finding themselves with long commutes and eventually deciding to find jobs and social networks "closer to home". Their loss is a detriment to the city as a whole and perpetuation of the generation gap widening in our community. I came to Ann Arbor because of its reputation as a walkable, urban, and connected community with youthfulness, vibrancy, and culture. Without these qualities, I too would look to other places such as Chicago, Austin, Madison, etc. as possibilities for relocation.

I am writing to express my support for The Moravian and to encourage you to approve this project. It will increase workforce affordable housing options in the downtown area, provide housing opportunities attractive to young professionals which are significantly lacking in the downtown area and it will increase the supply of sustainable/green housing options. The Moravian is appropriately located in a mixed use neighborhood, close to downtown, and provides a number of important community benefits in addition to those mentioned above.

Yours Truly,

Molly McFarland

From: Robert Cleveland [mailto:rob.cleveland@iconicweb.com]

Sent: Monday, October 05, 2009 2:01 PM

To: planning@a2gov.org
Subject: Moravian

Planning Commission Members:

I understand tomorrow night the planning commission will consider the Moravian project again. As an Ann Arbor business owner and property owner, I want to encourage the commission to approve this project, as it stands now, based on three key facts:

- 1. Property owners in and near the Main Street corridor have seen their values deteriorate considerably in the last 2 years. A new real estate project adjacent to the downtown area would instill confidence again with buyers, lenders and property owners. As a property owner on the edge of Ann Arbor's downtown, we see a project like the Moravian as a way to extend the "downtown" footprint beyond the space between Washington and Williams. Projects that expand our definition of the downtown environment push lenders rethink the value of these outerlying areas. As qualified valuations increase, so does the opportunity for us to invest in our facilities and improve the accommodations.
- 2. As an employer in the area, we rely on a constant stream of young, educated talent to fill jobs that are increasingly focused on sectors beyond manufacturing. Our agency needs professional, young talent who understand the digital space but, despite having the UofM in our backyard, our recruitment from the University has been marginal. There are a number of factors at play here. One major issue, though, is a clear lack of housing options between cheap student housing and expensive condo or home options. Our interns are consistently shipping out of Ann Arbor because the City has little to offer graduates in their twenties in terms of lifestyle and community. The Moravian can play a role in convincing our young, professional talent to stay in Ann Arbor and work closely with employers like ICON who have made a commitment to keep their business near the downtown area.
- 3. Business owners rely on local, recurring traffic more than transient or visiting business. As a co-owner of Grange on Liberty, our business sees the spikes and valleys brought in by graduation, football games and other major events. But these one-time shots are only a part of the customer base. Equally important are the local residents who live in the condos and apartments downtown, with the disposable income to become "regulars" at the restaurant. Projects like Moravian that instigate downtown living can help support businesses like ours during the long stretches in between major events. I can imagine we're not alone in this regard.

I understand the opposition to this project and their fight to maintain the character and culture of our community. But it seems that the Moravian has been substantially scaled back compared with its original plan.

With that, it may be time to lend a voice to broader community interests and consider that Ann Arbor is more than a collection of historic homes and buildings. We are a community of collective interests that must grow and live

together. If the planning commission draws the line on what now is a modest project, surely those with plans to grow here in Ann Arbor, from young professionals to property/business owners and developers, will look elsewhere to realize their goals.

With Best Regards,

Rob Cleveland

CEO ICON Creative Technologies Group 220 Felch Street Ann Arbor, MI 48103 phone://734.239.3586 fax:// 734.786.3335

http://www.iconicweb.com



October 15, 2008

City of Ann Arbor C/O Mayor John Hieftje City Council Planning Commission 100 N. Fifth Avenue Ann Arbor, Mi 48104

Dear Mayor John Hieftje, City Council Members and Planning Commission Members,

As head of a new business in the downtown Ann Arbor area (see attached article), I am writing to express my support for The Madison development plan and to encourage you to approve this project. I have reviewed the project plan and believe it will increase workforce affordable housing options in the downtown area, provide housing opportunities attractive to young professionals which are significantly lacking in the downtown area and it will increase the supply of sustainable/green housing options.

As a local resident and head of a business office, I am someone that is directly benefitting from the wonderful mix of Ann Arbor business, commercial and residential properties. On any given day, I can choose not to drive and that is a huge "quality of life" advantage in my opinion.

I believe The Madison is appropriately located in a mixed use neighborhood, close to downtown, and provides a number of important community benefits in addition to those mentioned above.

Respectfully,

David C. Crouse, P.E. V.P. Engineering & Construction





ANN ARBOR NEWS

Blackstone affiliate opens in Ann Arbor Power plant company has projects worldwide

Thursday, July 24, 2008 BY STEFANIE MURRAY The Ann Arbor News

A power plant development company backed by private equity juggernaut The Blackstone Group recently opened an office in downtown Ann Arbor.

The site is the fourth North American office for Sithe Global Management Inc. and is being run by David Crouse, Sithe vice president of engineering and construction. The main office is in New York City, and others are in Houston and Toronto.

Sithe is involved in building independent natural gas-fueled and coal-fred power stations in Canada and Italy, as well as in NewMexico, Pennsylvania, Arizona and Nevada. The Pennsylvania plant is considered a renewable energy project because it uses waste coal.

Crouse said he expects to add three more Canadian projects and also touted a hydroelectric plant in Uganda that Sithe is working on.

Ann Arbor was chosen in part because Crouse lives here. He worked for Sithe Energies Inc. between 1992 and 2001, then joined DTE Energy Services in Ann Arbor. Blackstone bought an 80 percent stake in Sithe for \$70 million in 2005 and committed to helping invest \$500 million in the company. Crouse rejoined a restructured Sithe in 2006.

"Initially I was working out of my home, but our projects are to the scale now where we are staffing up and (needed) an office;" Crouse said. "I can find good talent here in Ann Arbor and office space is cheaper. We are very small right now, but once I know we have these projects going on in Canada, I'll bring more people on board."

Sithe identifies sites for and develops large independent electric power plants in markets that need energy worldwide. Prior to Blackstone's purchase, the company had developed more than 50 power plant projects in nine countries since 1986, with investments totaling more than \$5 billion.

Crouse's job is to take a project through construction, then turn it over to plant operators. Three plants are under construction, and 11 are in late stage development, he said. None are in Michigan.

After a power plant is built, Sithe will sell the energy it creates to other utilities and governments.

Sithe's local office, 101 N. Main St., is about 1,500 square feet, said Newcombe Clark of Bluestone Realty



Advisors, who handled the deal. The company has room to expand there, Clark said.

Since its inception in 1987, Blackstone has invested in 120 companies across a range of industries and locations, according to the company's Web site. At the end of March, it had \$30.0 billion of assets under management and equity investments in 47 companies.

"A big part of the challenge we have in the Midwest and certainly in Michigan is the (availability) of all types of investment capital ... for companies that are trying to grow," said Mke Finney, president of local economic development group Ann Arbor Spark. "So having a marquee private equity company decide to locate in our community is a very positive sign."

©2008

@ 2008 Michigan Live. All Rights Reserved.

From: Rene Greff [mailto:rene@arborbrewing.com]

Sent: Monday, October 05, 2009 1:03 PM

To: planning@a2gov.org **Subject:** affordable housing

Dear Planning Commissioners,

As a long-time advocate for more affordable housing options in the downtown, I hope that you will support the Moravian. In addition to increasing the stock of affordable housing, this project also meets a number of other goals near and dear to my heart as a downtown business owner and former DDA member including: removing blighted buildings and cleaning up a brownfield, incorporating green and sustainable construction and systems, creating live/work opportunities and increasing residential density, providing their own parking rather than placing a burden on the public system, creating urban park space, improving the pedestrian experience and floodplain, and adding much needed revenue to the city's budget. I believe that the developers of this project have gone above and beyond the strict requirements to meet a number of goals important to the city and the community.

Thank you for your consideration of this project.

Rene

Rene Greff Home Office 734-340-6793 Cell Phone 734-678-7620

Arbor Brewing Company 114 E Washington St Ann Arbor, MI 48104 734-213-1393 www.arborbrewing.com

Corner Brewery
720 Norris St
Ypsilanti, MI 48197
734-480-2739
www.cornerbrewery.com

From: Maura Thomson
To: planning@a2gov.org

Sent: Monday, October 05, 2009 2:35 PM

Subject: Moravian project support

Planning Commissioners - My name is Maura Thomson, I am an Ann Arbor resident, 2321 Devonshire Road, and an employee of the Main Street Area Association. As a resident concerned about the ever shrinking City tax base and as a professional deeply concerned about the vitality of downtown Ann Arbor I would like to show my support for the Moravian project.

Downtown Ann Arbor must work towards increasing density. There is a relationship between the concentration of people and the conveniences and other kinds of diversity present in a downtown. We must have a significant core of residents to encourage a better retail and other desirable developments in the downtown area. Affordable housing will be the key to keeping and growing the population of young professionals and to enticing employers to consider locating in downtown Ann Arbor.

Increased private development is essential to building the tax base of a City consumed by University projects. The tax burden carried by Ann Arbor residents threatens to strip all economic and social diversity left in this City.

It is imperative that development in downtown Ann Arbor become more than just an exercise in futility.

Thank you for your time and dedication to our City. Maura Thomson



October 15, 2008

City of Ann Arbor C/O Mayor John Hieftje City Council Planning Commission 100 N. Fifth Avenue Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Dear Mayor John Hieftje, City Council Members and Planning Commission Members,

I am writing to express my support for The Madison and to encourage you to approve this project. As a business owner and employer based in downtown Ann Arbor (in fact, only two blocks from the proposed site) I feel strongly that affordable, environmentally responsible housing is critical to the City's success. My company operates 150,000 square feet of commercial property in downtown Ann Arbor. These properties provide space for 25 businesses that includes retailers, restaurants and offices employing literally *hundreds* of people. The success of these businesses depends on a vibrant city that is attractive to a talented workforce and a critical mass of downtown residents. A talented workforce demands housing that is affordable, near their places of employment, near cultural and entertainment venues and is developed in a responsible manner. This is exactly what The Madison delivers to this community.

The Madison is appropriately located in a mixed use neighborhood, close to downtown, and provides a number of important community benefits in addition to those mentioned above. I strongly recommend that the Planning Commission and The Council consider what this city is demanding.

Sincerely,

Jason Costello President

Cabrio Properties

Dear Mayor John Hieftje, City Council Members and Planning Commission Members,

I am writing to express my support for The Madison and to encourage you to approve this project. It will increase workforce affordable housing options in the downtown area, provide housing opportunities attractive to young professionals which are significantly lacking in the downtown area and it will increase the supply of sustainable/green housing options. The Madison is appropriately located in a mixed use neighborhood, close to downtown, and provides a number of important community benefits in addition to those mentioned above.

As a young creative who is trying to make his way with his business in the city, I feel it is of the utmost importance that we support projects like these that will help grow a base of consumers, employees for new startups, and help strengthen our local city economy. Supporting projects like this will only serve to strengthen, attract, and retain the young and skilled workforce our city needs to survive.

Yours Truly,

Jeremy Peters

Co-Owner, Quite Scientific Records 544 North Main Street, Ann Arbor, MI

Director of Publishing and Licensing, Ghostly International 255 East Liberty, Suite 271, Ann Arbor, MI

BENEFITS OF THE MORAVIAN PUD

The Moravian meets all the standards of the PUD Ordinance and provides the following community benefits.

Brownfield Redevelopment: This contaminated site will be addressed and an appropriate due care plan will be implemented.

Affordable Housing: Over 19% of The Moravian will be restricted as workforce affordable housing which is 29% more affordability than required.

<u>Sustainability:</u> The Moravian will utilize a geothermal heating and cooling system and be LEED certified by the US Green Building Council. The Moravian will reduce Greenhouse gas emissions by an estimated 636 metric tons annually, the equivalent of removing 129 vehicles from the roadways. The Moravian is a major step forward towards meeting the Mayor's Green Energy Challenge.

Elimination of M1 Industrial Zoning & Preservation of Residential Neighborhood: The Moravian will eliminate the threat of commercial expansion into the adjacent residential areas posed by these industrial zoned properties thereby addressing the number one problem statement in the Central Area Plan.

<u>Floodplain Improvements:</u> The Moravian is designed to increase the floodplain storage capacity by well over 100% and reduce peak flow volumes by more than twenty fold. This is a significant improvement in an area noted for flooding issues.

<u>Increased Tax Revenue:</u> The Moravian will increase tax revenue by over \$200,000 annually at a time when the City's budget is projected to have a significant deficit.

<u>Live/Work Opportunities:</u> Live/Work spaces have been created to provide a unique downtown living opportunity. The Live/Work commercial spaces will provide residents of the building a truly vehicle free lifestyle opportunity and active the corner of Fourth and Madison.

<u>Improved Public Safety:</u> The existing structures on the site of The Moravian having outdated electrical systems and no fire protection will be replaced with fire suppression, security cameras, modern building systems, secured parking and controlled access to the building. The area as a whole will benefit from reduced fire risk, improved lighting and more eyes and feet on the streets creating an overall safer environment for residents and emergency responders.

<u>Public Openspace:</u> The Moravian, in conjunction with the Parks Department, will create a park space on site which is important in this area of the city that lacks public openspace. The maintenance responsibilities will rest with the owners of The Moravian thus eliminating any City financial responsibility while providing public park space.

Remove Blighted and Obsolete Industrial Building: The elimination of this neighborhood eyesore will enhance the quality and appearance of the area.

Onsite Parking: Off street vehicle parking will be provide, much of it in a secure, covered parking level and bicycle parking will be provided at a ratio that exceeds the requirement by 750%. Additional on-street parking spaces will also be created due to the elimination of existing curb cuts.

<u>Improved Pedestrian Experience:</u> The pedestrian experience along Madison St. will be improved tremendously with significant landscaping that exceeds the standard requirements and the creation of additional greenspace, significantly improved quality of greenspaces and activating features such as the park space, live/work spaces and public sitting areas.

<u>Downtown Housing:</u> The addition of new downtown housing units is needed to maintain and enhance the vitality of the downtown area.

<u>Customers for Downtown Merchants:</u> The creation of more downtown housing will significantly enhance the customer base for downtown merchants and help provide the critical mass necessary to attract retailers that serve the everyday needs of downtown residents.

<u>Reduced Vehicle Trips Into the City:</u> Increasing in town housing, particularly in this walkable location, will reduce commuter vehicle trips into the City each day.





