	Sent Time	<u>To</u>	<u>From</u>	<u>cc</u>	Redactions	Reasons for Redaction
1	7:16	Jeff Hayner	Matthew Horning			
2	7:16	Erica Briggs	Matthew Horning			
3	7:16	All City Council Members	Jacqueline Beaudry		Email Address	Privacy
4	8:15	Tom Crawford	Jeanice Swift	Julie Grand; Rebecca Lazarus; Linh Song		
5	8:20	Julie Grand	John Godfrey	Travis Radina	Address, Email Address	Privacy
6	8:38	Travis Radina	Missy Stults		Email Address	Privacy
7	8:40	Lisa Disch	Missy Stults	Zachary Waas Smith		
8	8:40	Travis Radina	Richard Sheridan		Phone Number	Privacy
9	9:01	All City Council Members	Jacqueline Beaudry			
10	9:02	Julie Grand	Michael Fahy		Email Address	Privacy
11	9:14	Elizabeth Nelson	Curt Mark			
12	9:16	Erica Briggs	Eric Sturgis		Phone Number	Privacy
13	9:17	Lisa Disch	Eric Sturgis		Phone Number	Privacy
14	9:35	Ali Ramlawi	Sue Symington			
15	9:39	Jeff Hayner	Sue Symington			
16	10:00	Jacqueline Beaudry	Travis Radina			
17	10:01	All City Council Members	Sue Symington			
18	10:06	Teresa Gillotti	Anna Foster	Glenn Nelson; City Council; Tom Crawford; Greg Pratt; Zackary Ackerman; Anna Erickson; Eleanor Pollack; Gerard Markey	Email Address, phone number	Privacy
19	10:06	All City Council Members	Kai Petainen			
20	10:12	Energy Commission; Missy Stults; Anna Stefanopoulou; Simi Barr; Gergory Bolino; Jane Chen; Wayne Appleyard; Joshua MacDonald	Carlene Colvin-Garcia			
21	10:56	Jacqueline Beaudry	Jen Eyer	Christopher Taylor		
22	11:19	Jacqueline Beaudry	Christopher Taylor			
23	11:21	Christopher Taylor	Jacqueline Beaudry			
24	11:22	Jen Eyer	Jacqueline Beaudry	Christopher Taylor		
25	11:23	Travis Radina	Jacqueline Beaudry	Linh Song		
26	11:37	Jeff Hayner	Jacqueline Beaudry			
27	11:55	All City Council Members	Kate Flewelling		Email Address	Privacy

From: Song, Linh
To: Beaudry, Jacqueline

**Subject:** CA-9

**Date:** Tuesday, December 22, 2020 12:00:15 AM

Hello Jackie,

Are we going back to discuss CA-9 after public comments? I assume so?

Linh Song, MSW Ward 2 Ann Arbor City Council From: <u>Kate Flewelling</u>
To: <u>CityCouncil</u>

**Subject:** Fwd: Complaint regarding Recent Board Statement and Lack of Return to School Plan

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 11:55:31 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Below please find my email to the school board. I would appreciate the City Council's support in getting our youngest kids back to school.

Thanks, Kate Flewelling

Begin forwarded message:

From: Kate Flewelling

**Date:** December 20, 2020 at 11:54:04 AM EST

**To:** boardofed@a2schools.org

Subject: Complaint regarding Recent Board Statement and Lack of Return

to School Plan

### Board-

I was absolutely dismayed to read the offensive statement put out by the Board on December 16th. I remain dismayed at the utter failure to plan for or implement in-person education for elementary school.

My husband and I moved to Ann Arbor 3 years ago for the purpose of having our older son start school in the Ann Arbor Public School system. We sought on the values, the diversity and the commitment to a first-class public education. I have for the last 2 years co-run the biggest school fundraiser at Burns Park, the Burns Park Run. I also volunteered for the Safe Routes to School Committee and volunteered in the library and art room. I am an attorney for a health system in Northern Michigan and my husband is a physician (you will find his name on the letter that the Board has received). We have a 3rd grader at Burns Park and had a kindergartner last year. Unfortunately, after AAPS announced its commitment to virtual learning, we had to move our now-1st grader to private school. Not only is virtual learning and immense struggle for a K-1 student who can't read, we saw the joy and engagement draining from him every day of the spring and we knew we could not risk a year of virtual for him. It is one thing to make up for substantive learning losses, but I don't think you can easily re-engage a kid who loses their love of learning and school. This is all to say we are committed and involved members of the AAPS community, and for that reason feel compelled to spend our time

and energy trying to change current state.

Let me start with return-to-school. The biggest failure of the Board is that you continue to first ask "is it safe to return to school?" That is not the first question to ask. The first question is "is it essential to return to school." And if so, for whom and how essential is it. In other words, how much risk should we be willing to take on for this to happen? That is how every other part of our lives have been approached. The pandemic was a very accurate litmus test of what in life must go on - i.e. life saving surgeries, ER visits, grocery stores, pharmacies, etc.

Why you as a Board continue to insist, by the transitive property, that inperson education is not essential is absolutely beyond me. The ground swell of parents, the letter from hundreds of physicians - they are all emphatically telling you that virtual education is NOT education. And education is ESSENTIAL. Therefore, if education is essential, and education cannot be done virtually, it must be done in person. I believed that this summer and I believe it even more now that there is plenty of data showing it can be done very safely. I firmly believe the data shows that staff in schools are at much greater risk from the other activities they participate in (socializing, visiting restaurants, visiting family) than they would be from masking up and going in to school to teach (or clean the building, etc.). And, yes, there is of course some risk, but that risk is absolutely worth taking because, again, EDUCATION IS ESSENTIAL. We ask grocery store clerks and stock people to work in person. We ask our mail carriers to work in person. Our doctors, our nurses. I can keep going. Essential workers work and the rest of us do everything in our power to keep them safe by following the rules MDHHS puts in place. My husband has been going to work every day of this pandemic as a physician, so our family understands and lives this risk/benefit situation every day. We expect it of our education staff as well because AAPS has the resources to do elementary education safely.

If you needed more evidence of the failure of virtual learning, you have it with the NWEA scores. When we see the losses Ann Arbor students have experienced relative to their peers, it will be something I will expect the Board to take responsibility for and work to rectify in the coming months and years.

Now let's move on to the letter. I'm going to include quotes from the statement and my concern regarding them.

"Trustees believe it would be inappropriate to resume face-to-face instruction at a time when COVID infections are at or near their highest levels and the virus continues to disproportionately sicken and kill historically underrepresented and vulnerable members of our community." I disagree with this, but explain to me why you went all fall without opening schools when our numbers were super low? Why didn't you start

school at the beginning of August knowing that the winter would likely be worse so you should take advantage of the low numbers while we had them? And why are you implying that opening in-person elementary is going to exacerbate the racial and other disparities around COVID? There is absolutely no data to show that opening schools influences the infection rates in that manner, not to mention the fact that opening in-person school would never mean everyone has to attend.

"Too often the loudest voices calling for reopening are not from the families who face the highest risk." What does this even mean? It sounds a lot like you are trying to tell people that their voices don't matter if you deem them not those facing the highest risk. We will ignore the absolute racial undertone of that statement, and I'll simply say that no one is for forcing children to go to in-person school. There should absolutely be a virtual option, but insisting that no child should go to school because for some families at home is a better option is completely illogical and absolutely against your mission, which is to educate our children, regardless of their race or income status.

"Doing so would make our decision political, rather than based on best practices, and would erode public confidence in the safety of our buildings when we decide to return." No, you are a political body of elected officials, so everything you do is inherently political. The way to make this the least political decision would be to simply follow MDHHS guidelines and do what they say is safe, because most of those public health officials are appointed or hired, as opposed to elected, and THEY ARE ALSO PUBLIC HEALTH OFFICIALS, which, I will remind you, you are not.

"the Ann Arbor Public Schools Board of Education is committed to resuming in-person learning, starting with our youngest and most vulnerable learners, as soon as we believe we can do so safely and sustainably". This is a lie. You could have had outdoor kindergarten and first grade (or all of EL) for months with parent volunteers to take kids in when they needed to go to the bathroom. You have not since the day this pandemic started made any earnest attempt to bring kids back. You've failed to recognize the essential nature of in-person education and thus have never placed appropriate urgency to the task of getting these little kids and special education students back where they belong, in school.

"The Ann Arbor Public Schools Board of Education remains steadfast in its commitment to return to face-to-face instruction at the earliest moment that it is safe to do so". - So what does this mean about all of the other school districts who, despite having higher COVID numbers and rates, continue to provide in-person elementary when allowed by MDHHS? They can't have more resources than A2, we just gave you all a billion dollars. I don't think you are all privy to information they aren't? And what about MDHHS saying it is safe and okay for in-person elementary? Does MDHHS not know what it is talking about? I'm just unclear how everybody

else but Ann Arbor is making this happen yet you continue to insist with a straight face that it isn't possible.

I don't know why you chose to lash out at parents in that statement. It was both inappropriate and unnecessary and had very clear racial subtext that I was shocked to see in a communication from a school board.

As my husband said, I'm giving AAPS a 1 out of 4 for its failure to educate our children during the pandemic.

Best Regards, Kate Flewelling

Parent of a 3rd grader at Burns Park and a 1st grader who should be at Burns Park but who is attending a private school because you especially can't do virtual education if you can't read

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline To: Hayner, Jeff

Subject: FW: Approved October 19 with deadline Monday, December 21, 2020 11:37:42 PM Date:

FYI

## **Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk**

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104 734.794.6140 (O) 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401 ibeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline

**Sent:** Monday, December 21, 2020 11:37 PM To: Crawford, Tom <TCrawford@a2gov.org> **Subject:** Approved October 19 with deadline

## Resolution to Begin Filling Seats on the Council of the Commons ..Body

Whereas, The Ann Arbor City Council approved Resolution R-20-397 on October 5, 2020, which among other things described the initial makeup of the Council of the Commons, and encouraged the City to accelerate the process of planning and organizing;

Whereas, Resolution R-20-397 calls for City Council to select and appoint "two City Council members appointed and approved by City Council resolution"; and

Whereas, Resolution R-20-397 also calls for various other appointments to be made by these City Council representatives, and affirmed by City Council, which involves an application and nomination process, therefore;

RESOLVED, The two City Council members selected to serve on the Council of the Commons shall be:

- 1. Councilmember Ramlawi
- 2. Councilmember Hayner

and:

RESOLVED, The City Administrator is directed to add "The Council of the Commons" as an option on the application form for city boards and commissions, to allow for citizen-at-large position applications to be accepted;

RESOLVED, The City administrator is directed to publicize to all residents the opportunity to serve using any appropriate methods of public notice; and

RESOLVED, The applications for citizen-at-large positions will be accepted until

## Friday, December 11, 2020, with appointments for all remaining seats to be made on or before December 21, 2020.

## **Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk**

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall |301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104 734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401 jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.



EVERYWHERE \* EVERYONE \* EVERY DAY. a2gov.org/A2BeSafe

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline To: Radina, Travis Cc: Song, Linh

Subject: RE: DC-3: Water Shutoff Protection Act Date: Monday, December 21, 2020 11:23:55 PM

I've made the correction!

## **Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk**

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall |301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104 734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401 jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

From: Radina, Travis <TRadina@a2gov.org> Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 10:00 PM To: Beaudry, Jacqueline < JBeaudry@a2gov.org>

Cc: Song, Linh <LSong@a2gov.org>

**Subject:** DC-3: Water Shutoff Protection Act

Clerk Beaudry,

It looks like SB 241 is used interchangeably with HB 241 throughout the resolution (including in the title).

I'm not sure a formal amendment is needed, but this should be SB (Senate Bill) 241 throughout.

**Travis** 

## **Travis Radina**

Council Member, Ward 3 (he|him|his)

#### City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St. Ann Arbor, MI 48104 https://www.a2gov.org/ From: Beaudry, Jacqueline

To: Eyer, Jen

Cc: Taylor, Christopher (Mayor) Subject: RE: 2111 Packard vote

Date: Monday, December 21, 2020 11:22:46 PM

All set as it was a voice vote. I don't record individual votes unless a Roll Call. I also saw you return and make a motion for Yes.

#### **Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk**

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall |301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104 734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401 jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

From: Eyer, Jen <JEyer@a2gov.org>

**Sent:** Monday, December 21, 2020 10:56 PM **To:** Beaudry, Jacqueline <JBeaudry@a2gov.org> Cc: Taylor, Christopher (Mayor) <CTaylor@a2gov.org>

Subject: 2111 Packard vote

Hi Jackie,

I stepped away momentarily because I had a coughing fit and just missed the vote on 2111 Packard before returning. I would have voted yes. Not sure what can be done in a case like that, if anything!

Thanks,

Jen

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline To: Taylor, Christopher (Mayor)

Subject: RE: DC-3

Date: Monday, December 21, 2020 11:21:42 PM

All set!

## **Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk**

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall |301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104 734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401 jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

From: Taylor, Christopher (Mayor) <CTaylor@a2gov.org>

**Sent:** Monday, December 21, 2020 11:20 PM To: Beaudry, Jacqueline < JBeaudry@a2gov.org>

**Subject:** DC-3

Co sponsor too, plz

Christopher Taylor Mayor of the City of Ann Arbor 301 East Huron Street Ann Arbor, Michigan 48104 734-794-6161 he/him/his

Wear your Mask. That is all.

From: Taylor, Christopher (Mayor)
To: Beaudry, Jacqueline

Subject: DC-3

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 11:19:39 PM

Co sponsor too, plz

Christopher Taylor Mayor of the City of Ann Arbor 301 East Huron Street Ann Arbor, Michigan 48104 734-794-6161 he/him/his

Wear your Mask. That is all.

From: <u>Eyer, Jen</u>

To: <u>Beaudry, Jacqueline</u>
Cc: <u>Taylor, Christopher (Mayor)</u>

**Subject:** 2111 Packard vote

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 10:56:14 PM

## Hi Jackie,

I stepped away momentarily because I had a coughing fit and just missed the vote on 2111 Packard before returning. I would have voted yes. Not sure what can be done in a case like that, if anything!

Thanks,

Jen

From: <u>Carlene Colvin-Garcia</u>

To: EnergyCommission; Stults, Missy; Anna Stefanopoulou; Barr, Simi; Gregory Bolino; Jane Chen; Wayne Appleyard;

MacDonald, Joshua

**Subject:** Council passed 1st Reading of EV Readiness Ordinance!

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 10:12:05 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Vote on the 1st Reading was unanimously in favor of the EV Readiness Ordinance.

Will keep you posted on the date of the 2nd Reading, and opportunities to support this effort.

-Carlene

From: Kai Petainen
To: CityCouncil
Subject: happy holidays!

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 10:06:42 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Mayor Taylor and City Council,

Greetings from Canada! I'm in the last day of my mandatory 2-week COVID-19 quarantine. (I don't have COVID, this is the mandatory quarantine they put you in when you come to Canada) I just wanted to wish all of you a very happy new year and happy holidays, as we look forward to getting rid of 2020.

My best to you and yours...

-just kai

Ann Arbor, MI (but now in Canada for a moment)

From: A Foster
To: Teresa M. Gillotti

Cc: Glenn Nelson; CityCouncil; Crawford, Tom; Greg Pratt; Anna Erickson; Eleanor Pollack;

Markey, Gerard

Subject: Re: Regarding CA-11 and in Re: Action Request Regarding Agenda Item CA-11 "Poverty Exemptions" on the

December 21, 2020, Agenda

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 10:06:39 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

### Hi all,

Thank you so much for taking this issue up in council meeting tonight. I really appreciate your taking time to put the current (tabled/postponed) plan together and am really excited to hear more and discuss this at HHSAB in January (with Radina and Song!!). As always big high fives to all staff for your hard work and thank you to CMs.

-F

Written on a tiny keyboard; please excuse small imperfections.

On Dec 21, 2020, at 2:25 PM, Teresa M. Gillotti < gillottitm@washtenaw.org>wrote:

Good afternoon,

I noticed that the City's Assessor Gerard Markey was not on the e-mail thread, so am adding him here so he is aware of the conversation.

Thanks, Teresa

From: Glenn Nelson [mailto:

Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 1:31 PM

To: A. Foster

**Cc:** CityCouncil@a2gov.org; Tom Crawford Forward <TCrawford@a2gov.org>; Teresa

M. Gillotti <gillottitm@washtenaw.org>; Greg Pratt

; Anna Erickson

>; Eleanor

Pollack

**Subject:** Re: Regarding CA-11 and in Re: Action Request Regarding Agenda Item CA-11 "Poverty Exemptions" on the December 21, 2020, Agenda

**CAUTION:** This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Foster,

This background is very useful. Thank you! You raise good questions. I believe this discussion in emails well before the meeting allows plenty of time for staff to prepare informed answers. I hope this item is pulled from the consent agenda so everyone has the opportunity to hear remarks from staff and so Council Members can then discuss the a)adequacy of the proposed poverty exemption, b) plan to raise public awareness, and c) application process. Glenn

On Mon, Dec 21, 2020 at 10:03 AM A. Foster

wrote:

Hi all,

thank you Glenn for pointing this out and your thorough and detailed suggestions. As noted in the attachment from Teresa on legistar, HHSAB asked for a review of this exemption this summer and was Anne and Zach acted (very quickly) to formalize that request at the Council level through <u>R-20-286</u> (passed 7/6/2020) the resolved clauses of which were as follows:

RESOLVED, That the City Council directs the City Administrator to develop a plan to review and increase the utilization of the Poverty Exemption program. Ideas for such a plan could include:

- 1. Increase advertisement through multiple channels, such as the City of Ann Arbor website, water bills, tax statements, press releases, and AAATA ads;
- 2. Raise the income threshold to accommodate more households; and
- 3. Reduce the complexity of informational materials and application.

RESOLVED, That the City Council requests that the City Administrator, or a designee, meet with relevant stakeholders, such as the Housing and Human Services Advisory Board (HHSAB), in developing this plan; and

RESOLVED, That the City Council directs the City Administrator to deliver this plan by December 31, 2020.

From the text of CA-11, it is unclear to me if it is a response to that resolution or simply a perfunctory renewal with small increase. If it is the former, I would have liked to see significantly more information about the assessment of the current state of affairs and have had a full presentation with Q&A to HHSAB. If it is the latter I would like to hear some details about when HHSAB and council will hear the updated <u>plan</u>. I generally support Mr. Nelson's suggested amendments in the interim.

When HHSAB first started talking about this exemption, a few points really stuck with me. First, very few people in the city use this exemption (I believe the number was 7 last year). This begs the question "why?" A related matter is what impact expanding this program would have on city tax revenue. In one of the documents attached to CA-11 there is a note that expanding the program "represents a shift of that portion of the tax burden to the other taxpayers of the community and state." This seems a bit misleading (in the short term, I don't see why my taxes would go up) but I understand the point. At HHSAB, we

were interested in hearing an analysis of exactly what the (projected) impact on the city budget would be if, for example, we lifted the level to 2.5 the federal poverty line or increased the asset test to 100k, etc.

The second matter that stuck with me in that meeting was that the process (and the resulting decision letter) for applying for this exemption is a potential barrier for many. The form is not intuitive, the documentation needed is extensive, the decision letter opaque. HHSAB talked about a short "preapproval" form followed by a 1:1 interview as an alternative. Nothing about a review of the application process appears here.

Third, though a slip was included with the summer taxes advertising this program (yay!), a similar document wasn't in (my) winter taxes. I would like to hear more about what the city has learned about awareness of the program since July (for example, did a notable increase in applications happen after that flyer was included in the taxes this summer?) and plans to continue to spread awareness (or a rationale for why this isnt needed).

I agree with Glenn Nelson that CA-11 should be pulled for a conversation rather than include it in the consent agenda. I would like to hear if this is a simple renewal or addressing the concerns raised this summer and, if the former, would like to hear an update from staff about when a more full plan or report might be available.

Thank you all so much and happy solstice!

- Anna Foster (HHSAB and W-5)

On Sat, 19 Dec 2020 at 10:58, Glenn Nelson wrote:

To: Mayor Christopher Taylor, Council Members

Copy: Tom Crawford, City Administrator

Anna Foster, Co-Chair, Housing and Human Services Advisory Board

Teresa Gillotti, Director, Office of Community & Economic Development

John Hilton, Editor, Ann Arbor Observer Greg Pratt, Co-Chair, Housing and Human Services Advisory Board Ryan Stanton, Reporter, MLive

From: Glenn Nelson home/office mobile

I strongly urge two actions with respect to item CA-11 "Poverty Exemptions" on the December 21, 2020, Agenda.

1. Remove this item from the Consent Agenda so it will be considered as a separate action: Poverty Exemptions are an

important tool to achieve our community goals of equity and diversity. Council Members should take explicit action after deliberation rather than relegate this matter to a largely invisible slot in the Consent Agenda.

- 2. Amend, and subsequently pass, the resolution as follows:
  - Increase the income limits to 2.2 times the U.S Department of Health and Human Services poverty thresholds for households.
  - Direct the City Assessor's Office, working with others, to simplify the application process and to increase the dissemination of information about the poverty exemption and about service providers willing to help with preparation and submission of the application.

The following language for the "Body" of the resolution would accomplish the changes noted above if substituted for the Body of the resolution in the current Agenda.

Whereas, MCL 211.7u allows the principal residences of persons who, in the judgment of the Board of Review, by reason of poverty, are unable to contribute toward the public charges be eligible for exemption in whole or in part from taxation under this act;

Whereas, MCL 211.7u(4) states the governing body of the local assessing unit shall determine and make available to the public the policy and guidelines the local assessing unit uses for the granting of exemptions; the guidelines shall include but not be limited to the specific income and asset levels of the claimant and total household income and assets;

Whereas, MCL 211.7u(2)(e) stipulates the governing body of the local assessing unit must choose income guidelines that equal or exceed the federal poverty guidelines updated annually by the U. S. Department of Health and Human Services;

Whereas, the City Council is dedicated to making housing in Ann Arbor more affordable for lower income households and recognizes the cost of property taxes is a major factor that causes lower income households to leave Ann Arbor and that deters them from purchasing homes in Ann Arbor:

Whereas, the City Council is dedicated to increasing diversity in Ann Arbor, recognizes that economic diversity is an important dimension of diversity, and acknowledges the burden of property taxes is one factor causing low income homeowners to choose jurisdictions other than Ann Arbor;

Whereas, the City Council aspires for the City of Ann Arbor to be a

leader in promoting economic diversity and providing affordable housing for low income households; the City Council recognizes nearby jurisdictions, such as Chelsea, Dexter, Saline, Pittsfield Township, and others, currently make more effective use of the poverty exemption (see data addendum); and the City Council wishes to become a leader in the use of poverty exemptions to attain its equity and diversity goals; and

Whereas, The City Council last approved the series of guidelines in 2020 developed by the Ann Arbor City Assessor and Board of Review which conformed to MCL 211.7u;

RESOLVED, the City Council adopts revised Poverty Exemption Guidelines for eligibility for 2021 for the Ann Arbor Board of Review to implement which establish poverty income levels not to exceed 2.2 times the Federal Poverty Income Standards for households as annually determined by the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services;

RESOLVED, the City Council adopts a household asset test of \$50,000 for eligibility for the Poverty Exemption; included assets shall not include the principal residence and the standard mode of transportation;

RESOLVED, the City Council directs the City Assessor's Office to work with the Office of Community & Economic Development and the Housing and Human Services Advisory Board to simplify substantially the application process and to increase markedly the dissemination to potential qualifiers of information about the poverty exemption and of service providers willing to help with preparation and submission of the application.

RESOLVED, these guidelines shall supersede any previously adopted Poverty Exemption Guidelines.

Data Appendix
Income Thresholds for Eligibility In Selected Jurisdictions and
Household Sizes

Methodological Note: Based on the County Treasurer's Report of Poverty Exemption Guidelines (see <a href="https://www.washtenaw.org/DocumentCenter/View/4013/2020-Poverty-Exemption-Guidelines-PDF">https://www.washtenaw.org/DocumentCenter/View/4013/2020-Poverty-Exemption-Guidelines-PDF</a>) there is a one year lag from poverty measurement to its use in the local poverty exemption calculations. For example, the 2020 local Poverty Exemption Guidelines are based on the 2019 Federal Poverty Guidelines. Thus, the federal poverty guidelines used in the calculation of the poverty exemption underestimate actual poverty thresholds in the year of the exemption.

## 4-Person Household

Poverty exemption in 2020 (based on 2019 federal poverty thresholds)
City of Dexter \$51,500
City of Chelsea 47,638
City of Saline 47,638
Pittsfield Township 47,638
City of Ann Arbor 39,320

Recommended in this resolution for Ann Arbor in 2021 \$57,640 (based on 2.2 times the 2020 federal poverty threshold)

## 2-Person Household

Poverty exemption in 2020 (based on 2019 federal poverty thresholds)
City of Dexter \$33,820
City of Chelsea 31,284
City of Saline 31,284
Pittsfield Township 31,284
City of Ann Arbor 29,620

Recommended in this resolution for Ann Arbor in 2021 \$37,928 (based on 2.2 times the 2020 federal poverty threshold)

## Sources for Federal Poverty Thresholds

#### 2019:

https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2019/02/01/2019-00621/annual-update-of-the-hhs-poverty-guidelines

## 2020:

https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2020/01/17/2020-00858/annual-update-of-the-hhs-poverty-guidelines

A. Foster
Doctoral Student

Educational Studies: Policy, Leadership, and Innovation School of Education | University of Michigan

From: sue symington
To: CityCouncil
Subject: Now What?

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 10:01:44 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

City water rates will increase, yet voting on the rezoning of the Ellsworth Road property to a PUD, with a possible tax abatement to the developer, doesn't make sense to us citizens struggling and DON'T qualify for Barrier Busters.

Thank you, Sue Symington

Sent via the Samsung Galaxy S8+, an AT&T 5G Evolution capable smartphone

From: Radina, Travis

To: Beaudry, Jacqueline

Cc: Song, Linh

Subject: DC-3: Water Shutoff Protection Act

Date: Monday, December 21, 2020 10:00:20 PM

## Clerk Beaudry,

It looks like SB 241 is used interchangeably with HB 241 throughout the resolution (including in the title).

I'm not sure a formal amendment is needed, but this should be SB (Senate Bill) 241 throughout.

Travis

--

## **Travis Radina**

Council Member, Ward 3 (he|him|his)

## City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St. Ann Arbor, MI 48104 https://www.a2gov.org/ 
 From:
 sue symington

 To:
 Hayner, Jeff

 Subject:
 Water Rate Discussion

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 9:39:49 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Thank you for your thoughtful discussions supporting us who are on the line with water bill rate increases. Between water, sewage rate and recent tax increases, we're not sure how much longer this will be our home.

The resources Julie Grand and the Mayor speak of do not service the middle class, only if they really knew!!!

Sue Symington Ward 3

Sent via the Samsung Galaxy S8+, an AT&T 5G Evolution capable smartphone

From: sue symington
To: Ramlawi, Ali
Subject: water rate discussion

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 9:35:54 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Thank you for your thoughtful discussions supporting us who are on the line with water bill rate increases. Between water, sewage rate and recent tax increases, we're not sure how much longer this will be our home.

The resources Julie Grand and the Mayor speak of do not service the middle class, only if they really knew!!!

Sue Symington Ward 3

Sent via the Samsung Galaxy S8+, an AT&T 5G Evolution capable smartphone

From: <u>Eric Sturgis</u>
To: <u>Disch, Lisa</u>

Subject:Delaying 2nd Water rate increaseDate:Monday, December 21, 2020 9:17:51 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

I would encourage you to support delaying voting on the 2nd Water rate increase. We are in a pandemic, and people are struggling.

Thanks,

Eric Sturgis

--

Eric A Sturgis

From: <u>Eric Sturgis</u>
To: <u>Briggs, Erica</u>

Subject: Delaying vote for 2nd Water Rate increase Date: Monday, December 21, 2020 9:16:44 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

I would encourage you to support delaying a vote for the 2nd Water rate increase? I am already feeling overwhelmed with the rate increases.

Thanks,

Eric Sturgis

--

Eric A Sturgis

From: Curt Mark
To: Nelson, Elizabeth
Subject: That horrible feeling

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 9:14:36 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

When you realize you've got to spend the next two years prevaricating and posturing to hide your true self because you chose the wrong side from the start.

That was pathetic tonight. You want to keep playing, I'd give a very public slap to Ramlawi & Hayner. They're dead already.

Happy holidays

Sent from my iPad

Michael Fahy Grand, Julie Re: 2111 Packard Update onday. December 21, 2020 9:02:25 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Hello Julie.

Thank you for responding so promptly.

I am not sure I quite understand what is meant by "above average public output and outreach," but it is indeed the less-than-entirely-visible developers—whoever they are, and wherever they are, which is not necessarily here—who are the focus of concern. Please understand that I voted for you and do not mean to in any way cast doubt on your probity as a conscientious representative, and I apologize if I have given that impression. I guess (and I will hasten to confess an ignorance that most Americans share in terms of awareness of and involvement in politics at the local level) the proliferation of reportedly high price but dubious quality residential high rises in our city in recent years, has led many of us to question whether these developers are a force for good and whether the needs and quality of life of the residents of our community/communities are a paramount concern for them. I suspect not.

I am not sure what, if anything, can be done to arrest or attenuate the pace of this so-called development. I can at least share the conviction that the financial precariousness that the pandemic has imposed on the lives of many should warrant proceeding with such issues as the rezoning in question at a slower and more deliberative space. My personal circumstances are such that I have not had the resources to attend to the first reading, but I looking forward to virtually attending the second round.

Thank you again for you response. Please accept with this message my best wishes for the holidays for you and your family and good health in 2021.

With best regards,

Micahel

On Dec 21, 2020, at 6:36 PM, Grand, Julie < JGrand@a2gov.org > wrote

Hi Michael.

Thank you for sharing you concerns. The first reading arrived on our agenda this evening with typical notice, but significantly above average public input and outreach on the part of the developer on the front end. While I understand that we are approaching the holidays, no one is trying to sneak this past anyone.

Tonight is only a first reading. If passed, it moves onto second reading, which includes a public hearing at the second meeting in January. I welcome your participation at any point during this process.

Best. Julie

From: Michael Fahy

**Sent:** Monday, December 21, 2020 5:48 PM

To: Radina, Travis <<u>TRadina@a2gov.org</u>>; Grand, Julie <<u>JGrand@a2gov.org</u>>

Subject: Fwd: 2111 Packard Update

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

ar City Council Members Radina and Grand

I simply want to add my name to those concerned with the short notice, and scheduling right before the holiday, of the below First Reading of the zoning ordinance in question,. It impresses me as less than conducive to community input.

Sincerely,

Michael A. Fahv

Begin forwarded message



Hi Neighbors,

This morning, we received this email about the 2111 Packard zoning question coming before Council tonight, with extraordinarily short notice. This illustrates the problems information from the city and the developer. The change in zoning classification to C-3 would allow for this building, or any future building to be up to 55' tall, or 4 stories.

Please pass along if you know of others interested in this. I may have inadvertently missed someone

Very best, Irma

------ Forwarded message -----From: Luke Bonner < luke bonner@be
Date: Mon, Dec 21, 2020 at 8:15 AM Subject: 2111 Packard Update

To: Luke Bonner <|uke.bonner@bonnerag.com>
Co: Ryan Tobias <rtobias@triadrepartners.com>, John Myefski <JMyefski@myefski.com>

Good morning and happy holidays! This evening city council will be holding the First Reading on a zoning ordinance amendment of the 0.9 Acre parcel from P (Parking) to C3 (Fringe Commercial). State law requires two readings of an ordinance amendment prior to any final approvals. A second meeting will be required to hold both a second reading of the proposed re-zoning, and approval of the site plan I do not have the date for the second meeting. For convenience I have provided a link to the city council agenda item regarding this issue. Please forward to anyone you may think is interested in this project. As always, we have an email list of over 100 people, however it's not perfect. If you have any questions please contact me at your earliest convenience

http://a2gov.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4729270&GUID=29925BB7-5B45-4463-8CDD-8897437D23F1

Luke Bonner CEO Bonner Advisory Group 1054 S Main Street

Ann Arbor, MI 734-846-9746 <u>Luke.Bonner@BonnerAG.com</u> <u>www.BonnerAG.com</u> From: Beaudry, Jacqueline To: \*City Council Members (All) Cc: Crawford, Tom; Postema, Stephen

Subject: Substitute Ordinance

Date: Monday, December 21, 2020 9:01:17 PM Water Rates Ordinance Substitute.pdf **Attachments:** 

## **Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk**

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall |301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104 734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401 jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.



EVERYWHERE \* EVERYONE \* EVERY DAY. a2gov.org/A2BeSafe

# ORDINANCE TO AMEND SECTION 2:63 OF TITLE II OF THE CODE OF THE CITY OF ANN ARBOR

The City of Ann Arbor ordains:

<u>Section 1</u>. That Section 2:63 of Chapter 29 of Title II of the Code of the City of Ann Arbor be amended to read as follows:

## 2:63. - Water rates.

(1) The commodity charges for water service are as follows. The rates shown are per unit, one unit equals 100 cubic feet (1 CCF).

	Rates Effective January 1, 2021
	Residential 1
1—9 units	\$2.01
10—18 units	3.21
19—36 units	7.45
Over 36 units	15.96
	Residential 2
1-9 units	\$2.01
Over 10 units	3.21
	Non-Residential
All Units	\$4.34
	Multi-Family
All Units	\$2.42
	Water Only
All Units	\$9.90

## Customer Charge per Quarter

Customer Charge per Quarter	Effective January 1, 2021
5/8 " meter	\$ 23.69
¾" meter	25.44
1" meter	28.65
1½" meter	37.54
2" meter	47.52

3" meter	100.34
4" meter	130.98
6" meter	200.48
8" meter	291.72
10" meter	389.16

# Fire Service Charge per Quarter

Fire Service Charge per Quarter	Effective January 1, 2021
1" – 3" service	\$39.49
4" service or greater	78.99

Section 2. That this ordinance shall take effect on January 1, 2021.

From: Richard Sheridan
To: Radina, Travis

**Subject:** Re: Parking fee increase

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 8:40:55 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Travis -

I hope all is ok with your family.

Rich



#### Richard Sheridan

CEO, Chief Storyteller & Tour Guide

Office: 734.665.1847

Cell:

On Mon, Dec 21, 2020 at 11:57 AM Radina, Travis < TRadina@a2gov.org > wrote:

Hi Rich,

My apologies for the delay in response. I've had some family issues that have required much of my attention over the past couple of weeks.

I will look into this and get back with you. In my view, we should be taking whatever steps we can to encourage safe & physically distanced visitors to our downtown, especially now.

Travis

--

#### Travis Radina

Council Member, Ward 3

(he|him|his)

City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St.

Ann Arbor, MI 48104

https://www.a2gov.org/

From: Richard Sheridan < rsheridan@menloinnovations.com >

**Sent:** Tuesday, December 15, 2020 11:50 AM **To:** Radina, Travis < TRadina@a2gov.org>

**Subject:** Parking fee increase

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Travis -

I hope you are doing well, staying healthy and safe.

Menlo received notification of parking fee increases for downtown. I was shocked that this would come at a time like this. Seemed pretty tone deaf. Thoughts?

Rich



Richard Sheridan

CEO, Chief Storyteller & Tour Guide

Office: 734.665.1847

Cell:

 From:
 Stults, Missy

 To:
 Disch, Lisa

 Cc:
 Waas Smith, Zachary

**Subject:** RE: OOPS: previous email sent prematurely. Fw: Question about Lockwood

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 8:40:49 PM

#### Dear Council Member Disch -

Thank you for the question. No, I haven't had that ask been made of us directly. Thank you for flagging it. I'm copying Zach Waas Smith on our team who is a liaison with the planning and building department. Zach, can you circle up with Brett on the item flagged by CM Disch, below (in regards to Lockwood?)

Thank you both and happy new year, Missy

Missy Stults Sustainability and Innovations Manager City of Ann Arbor

From: Disch, Lisa <LDisch@a2gov.org>
Sent: Sunday, December 20, 2020 11:56 AM
To: Stults, Missy <MStults@a2gov.org>

Subject: OOPS: previous email sent prematurely. Fw: Question about Lockwood

From: Disch, Lisa

Sent: Sunday, December 20, 2020 11:53 AM
To: Stults, Missy < <a href="MStults@a2gov.org">MStults@a2gov.org</a>
Subject: Question about Lockwood

Dear Dr. Stults,

Ken Garber just reminded me of a detail from the Planning Commission meeting on Lockwood 2 that I wanted to follow up on.

"At 2:57:15 of the meeting video, Zach Ackerman asks Lockwood to provide a written cost comparison between building electrification and standard gas HVAC, if they end up going with the latter."

At 2:32:20 of the meeting video, Sarah Mills directs staff to ask the Office of Sustainability and Innovations to look at Lockwood.

I didn't see a memo with that cost comparison this in the Lockwood agenda materials (I may

have overlooked it)--did you review this question?

Thank you!

Lisa

# Lisa Disch | Ward One City Council Representative

City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron Street

Ann Arbor, MI 48107-8647

ldisch@a2gov.org | Watch City Council Live

At: https://www.a2gov.org/departments/communications/ctn/Pages/watch.aspx

From: Stults, Missy
To: Radina, Travis

Subject: RE: Opportunity to impact Green Rental Housing Date: Monday, December 21, 2020 8:38:55 PM

Thank you so much, Council Member Radina. Zach, please see below for an individual we should invite to join the Green Rental task force.

Thanks all and happy new year! Missy

Missy Stults Sustainability and Innovations Manager City of Ann Arbor

**From:** Radina, Travis <TRadina@a2gov.org> **Sent:** Sunday, December 20, 2020 11:00 PM **To:** Stults, Missy <MStults@a2gov.org>

Subject: FW: Opportunity to impact Green Rental Housing

FYI

--

#### **Travis Radina**

Council Member, Ward 3 (he|him|his)

#### City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St. Ann Arbor, MI 48104 https://www.a2gov.org/

From: Cara Thuringer	-
Sent: Thursday, Dece	mber 17, 2020 10:34 AM
<b>To:</b> Elliott Brannon	

Cc: Radina, Travis < TRadina@a2gov.org>; GEO Secretary < secretary@geo3550.org>

Subject: Re: Opportunity to impact Green Rental Housing

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Hello All,

I'm definitely interested in participating! Sorry for my slow response, I am just now giving my inbox some attention after finals week.

My interests in this committee are at the intersection of health and environment. Your house isn't "green" if you have a smart energy system but have mold growing in your bathroom due to poor ventilation. Green housing should be, by default, also healthy housing. For many student renters, their homes don't clear the bar for healthy housing, so there is a long way to go to get to green. While I'm not a green building expert, I spend a lot of my time thinking about the relationships between healthy, affordable housing and environmental justice. In my opinion, you can't divorce environmental health from sustainability.

Mr. Radina, how well does this align with your vision for the program?

Best Wishes.

Cara Thuringer
She/Her
M.S. Environmental Justice and Environmental Informatics
School for Environment and Sustainability
University of Michigan



#### Land Acknowledgment

"As we live and learn on these territories, we must keep in mind the community struggles for selfdetermination and colonial legacies of scholarly practices."

"We acknowledge that The University of Michigan, named for Michigami, the world's largest freshwater system and located in the Huron River watershed, was formed and has grown through connections with the land stewarded by Niswi Ishkodewan Anishinaabeg: The Three Fires People who are the Ojibwe, Odawa, and Potawatomi along with their neighbors the Seneca, Delaware, Shawnee and Wyandot nations."

To this day, the University of Michigan benefits financially from Anishinaabe lands that were ceded to the federal government in the 1817 "Treaty at the Foot of the Rapids".

With this statement, I acknowledge and denounce the violence, theft, and genocide inflicted on indigenous peoples to benefit settlers and colonial powers. These words are not enough, but may they serve a reminder that we all must take actions to restore the right relations and stand in solidarity with the Anishinaabeg, the first people of this land.

C	n Mon, Dec 14, 2020 at 9:20 AM Elliott Brannon	wrote:
	Thanks Amir! I thought I'd reach out to Travis direct	cly; I hope that's ok.
	Hi Travis,	
	I'm on the GEO Housing Caucus and also used to we haven't reached out to the tenants union yet, I'd be	•
	they have someone who is interested in serving on	the Green Rental Housing Steering Committee.

I've never been on a committee related to the city and was wondering what kind of commitment being on the Green Rental Housing Steering Committee would be? A student, Cara Thuringer, from the School for the Environment and Sustainability may also be interested (Cara, Ember told me that you may be interested in this). I'll let Cara respond with her level of interest and I will respond about being on the committee myself once I have a bit more information.

Thanks!

Best.

Elliott Brannon

On Wed, Dec 9, 2020 at 5:17 PM GEO Secretary < <a href="mailto:secretary@geo3550.org">secretary@geo3550.org</a> wrote:

Hey Elliott,

Hope you're well. AA City Councillor Travis Radina reached out to us with this opportunity for a GEO member to sit on the Green Rental Housing Steering Committee. I think we mentioned this briefly at SPAC, but there's more info below. Would you have any interest in this work? If not, do you have any suggestions for someone else?

Best, Amir

\_\_\_\_\_

Amir Fleischmann (he/him/his)
Secretary - secretary@geo3550.org

Graduate Employees' Organization AFT-MI Local 3550, AFL-CIO geo3550.org

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Radina, Travis" < TRadina@a2gov.org>

**Subject: Opportunity to impact Green Rental Housing** 

**Date:** December 8, 2020 at 7:53:53 PM EST

**To:** "president@geo3550.org" 
president@geo3550.org>, "veep@geo3550.org" 

veep@geo3550.org>, "secretary@geo3550.org" <secretary@geo3550.org>

Sumeet, Erin & Amir,

Our Office of Sustainability and Innovation is working to establish a Green Rental Housing Steering Committee. As you know, power is not equal between our tenant and landlord community in Ann Arbor, and we'd love to have strong tenant representation on the green rental housing work that we are advancing.

As I know that rental issues are very important to many of your members (and I hope to engage with all of you more around this topic as I begin exploring the future of a possible Renters Commission here in Ann Arbor), I wanted to reach out on behalf of our Sustainability and Innovations Manager to see if there was a GEO leader/member who may have an interest in serving on a Green Rental Housing Steering Committee and working to advance efforts to increase energy efficiency in rental housing units and to ensure that rental units within the city are moving us toward our A2Zero goals.

If you have one or two recommendations that I could pass along to Dr. Stults as she works to build this group that would be wonderful. If not, that is okay too, I just wanted to make sure that graduate students/GEO were included in the conversation if there is a desire to serve.

All the Best, Travis

--

#### **Travis Radina**

Council Member, Ward 3 (he|him|his)

#### City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St. Ann Arbor, MI 48104 https://www.a2gov.org/

\_\_

Elliott Brannon, MPH
(he/him) (What is this?)
MD/PhD Fellow
University of Michigan Medical School
Department of Learning Health Sciences

"We acknowledge that The University of Michigan, named for Michigami, the world's largest freshwater system and located in the Huron River watershed, was formed and has grown through connections with the land stewarded by Niswi Ishkodewan Anishinaabeg: The Three Fires People who are the Ojibwe, Odawa, and Potawatomi along with their neighbors the Seneca, Delaware, Shawnee and Wyandot nations."

From: John Godfrey
To: Grand, Julie
Cc: Radina, Travis

**Subject:** Re: 2111 Packard Update

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 8:20:24 PM

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Just to be clear, Julie, the advance notice that the city requires was woefully late and never reached most residents likely to be affected. Whatever the merits of the proposed project itself, on this important matter concerning effective communication and transparency with the public, I must disagree.

#### John

On Mon, Dec 21, 2020 at 6:41 PM Grand, Julie < JGrand@a2gov.org > wrote:

Thanks, John. I understand your concerns and don't view them as inconvenient. Given the outreach that has been done over the last year, I don't find that the timing of this first reading as a compelling reason to postpone a first reading when there are later opportunities for public engagement.

Julie

From: John Godfrey

Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 4:51 PM

To: Grand, Julie < JGrand@a2gov.org>
Cc: Radina, Travis < TRadina@a2gov.org>
Subject: Re: 2111 Packard Update

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

#### Hi Julie,

Yes, the developer has held several public meetings to explain the plan, and has been very forthcoming, but neighbors, particularly those concerned about the likely impact of added on-street parking and increase in cut-through traffic (which the cursory traffic study, such as it was, did not address), were unaware that Council was taking this up today. And, yes, a portion of the site is already zoned C3, but expanding the area under this zoning is not inconsequential. I don't think it's to the City's benefit if residents believe they are seen as inconvenient, and ultimately inconsequential, bystanders for decisions made by developers and city government.

Best,

John

On Mon, Dec 21, 2020 at 3:06 PM Grand, Julie < <u>JGrand@a2gov.org</u>> wrote: Hi John,

Thank you for writing. Tonight is just a first reading. The process for a rezoning is to have a first reading at council, followed by a second reading (assuming it passes) that includes a public hearing.

Many rezoning are tied to site plans, which we could certainly look into. This is also an unusual rezoning, in that much of the site is already zoned C3.

Finally, the developer has gone above and beyond what is required for outreach to the neighborhood. I have every confidence that they will continue to be in touch well in advance of the second reading.

Best, Julie

From: John Godfrey

Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 1:05 PM

**To:** Grand, Julie < <u>JGrand@a2gov.org</u>>; Radina, Travis < <u>TRadina@a2gov.org</u>>

Subject: Fwd: 2111 Packard Update

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Hi Julie and Travis,

We got this notice this morning that Council will be taking up rezoning for the 2111 Packard project at tonight's meeting. This is hardly adequate advance notice for a rezoning of potentially significant consequence. In the event that funding for the proposed apartment building falls through, which is always a possibility with these projects, the rezoning to C3 opens the door for a successor developer to propose a by-right project for a structure of up to 55 feet tall that would crowd the site and impinge directly on the immediate neighborhood, much like the storage facility that's been brought for approval to the Planning Commission for 2060 West Stadium. With such late notice for discussion of a project of this potential consequence, particularly at a meeting taking place so close to the seasonal holiday and with the added distraction of the pandemic, I urge that you postpone consideration until January to give ample time for sufficient notification.

Thanks for your consideration of this request,

# John Godfrey

----- Forwarded message ------

From: Luke Bonner < <u>luke.bonner@bonnerag.com</u>>

Date: Mon, Dec 21, 2020 at 8:15 AM

Subject: 2111 Packard Update

To: Luke Bonner < <u>luke.bonner@bonnerag.com</u>>

Cc: Ryan Tobias < <a href="mailto:rtobias@triadrepartners.com">rtobias@triadrepartners.com</a>>, John Myefski

<<u>JMyefski@myefski.com</u>>

Good morning and happy holidays! This evening city council will be holding the First Reading on a zoning ordinance amendment of the 0.9 Acre parcel from P (Parking) to C3 (Fringe Commercial). State law requires two readings of an ordinance amendment prior to any final approvals. A second meeting will be required to hold both a second reading of the proposed re-zoning, and approval of the site plan. I do not have the date for the second meeting. For convenience I have provided a link to the city council agenda item regarding this issue. Please forward to anyone you may think is interested in this project. As always, we have an email list of over 100 people, however it's not perfect. If you have any questions please contact me at your earliest convenience.

 $\underline{http://a2gov.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4729270\&GUID=29925BB7-5B45-4463-8CDD-8897437D23F1}$ 

Luke Bonner

**CEO** 

Bonner Advisory Group

1054 S. Main Street

Ann Arbor, MI

734-846-9746

Luke.Bonner@BonnerAG.com

www.BonnerAG.com

--

Assistant Dean Rackham Graduate School University of Michigan

tel 734.936.1647

\*For Scheduling\*

Contact: LaTasha Mitchell | <u>latashaw@umich.edu</u> | <u>734.936.1647</u>

--

Assistant Dean Rackham Graduate School University of Michigan

tel 734.936.1647

\*For Scheduling\*

Contact: LaTasha Mitchell | <u>latashaw@umich.edu</u> | <u>734.936.1647</u>

From: Swift, Jeanice
To: Crawford, Tom

Cc: <u>Grand, Julie; Lazarus, Rebecca; Song, Linh</u>

**Subject:** Re: City Schools

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 8:15:20 PM

Attachments: <u>image001.png</u>

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Thank you all - per Trustee Lazarus, we will send a zoom invite for 1pm tomorrow, Tuesday.

Appreciate the time for a conversation,

Jeanice



# Jeanice Kerr Swift

Superintendent of Schools

Ann Arbor Public Schools

p: (734) 994-2232

a: 2555 S. State Street Ann Arbor, MI 48104

w: a2schools.org e: swift@a2schools.org





On Mon, Dec 21, 2020 at 6:44 PM Crawford, Tom < TCrawford@a2gov.org > wrote:

1 pm is better for me tomorrow. I have a previous commitment at 10 a.m.



#### Tom Crawford, City Administrator

City of Ann Arbor | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 3rd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104 734.794.6110 (O) | Internal Extension 41102 tcrawford@a2qov.org | www.a2qov.org

From: Grand, Julie < <u>JGrand@a2gov.org</u>>
Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 6:33 PM

To: Lazarus, Rebecca < lazarusr@aaps.k12.mi.us >; Song, Linh < LSong@a2gov.org >;

Crawford, Tom < TCrawford@a2gov.org>
Cc: Jeanice Swift < wift@aaps.k12.mi.us>

Subject: Re: City Schools

Hi Rebecca,

Both of the Tuesday dates work for me, but unfortunately, the Wednesday do not. It was great to talk to you today. I truly appreciate the time.

Best,

Julie

From: Lazarus, Rebecca < lazarusr@aaps.k12.mi.us >

Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 5:09 PM

To: Song, Linh < LSong@a2gov.org >; Grand, Julie < JGrand@a2gov.org >; Crawford, Tom

<<u>TCrawford@a2gov.org</u>>

Cc: Jeanice Swift < swift@aaps.k12.mi.us >

**Subject:** City Schools

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Happy Holidays Julie, Linh, and Tom,

Thank you Julie and Linh for taking time to chat about the questions you are receiving from the A2R2 and physician groups. The Board appreciates Council not entertaining a resolution regarding in-person learning.

To assure the public is receiving a unified message, Dr. Swift and I would like to have a meeting via Zoom to answer any other questions you may have regarding our reasons for staying virtual in light of mounting public criticism. Please let us know if you are available to meet tomorrow or Wednesday at either 10am or 1pm. If these dates and times do not work, please give us a few other options.

Thank you and we look forward to hearing from you soon.

### Rebecca Lazarus

Trustee & Treasurer

Ann Arbor Public Schools

# Board of Education

Cell: 313.903.0080 . | . lazarusr@a2schools.org . | . www.a2schools.org

**CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE:** This email transmission may contain information that is privileged, confidential, and exempt from disclosure under applicable law. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained herein (including any reliance thereon) is STRICTLY PROHIBITED. Sender accepts no liability for any damages caused by any virus transmitted by this email. If you received this transmission in error, please contact Rebecca Lazarus a <a href="mailto:lazarusr@a2schools.org">lazarusr@a2schools.org</a> or (313) 903-0080 and delete the email and material from any computer immediately. Thank you.

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline To: \*City Council Members (All)

Subject: FW: Submission in Lieu of Public Commentary -- Poverty Exemption

Monday, December 21, 2020 7:16:40 PM Date:

FYI

#### **Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk**

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104 734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401 ibeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

From: Glenn Nelson

Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 6:57 PM **To:** Beaudry, Jacqueline <JBeaudry@a2gov.org>

Cc: Briggs, Erica <EBriggs@a2gov.org>; Crawford, Tom <TCrawford@a2gov.org> **Subject:** Re: Submission in Lieu of Public Commentary -- Poverty Exemption

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Thanks for this message.

Glenn

On Mon, Dec 21, 2020 at 6:53 PM Beaudry, Jacqueline < JBeaudry@a2gov.org > wrote:

#### Hi Glenn:

Council's priority for public comment (per Council Rules) is for speakers who haven't spoken at Reserved Time during the last two meetings to get the first spots. We had a lot of calls first thing this morning so once the list was reviewed for previous speakers, some earlier callers were dropped off in favor of those who haven't recently spoken. My apologies that you did not receive a call alerting you to this fact – we have limited people in the office right now due to the current closure.

Best,

Jackie Beaudry

#### **Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk**

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104 734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) | Internal Extension 41401 jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

From: Glenn Nelson <<u>gnelsonaa@gmail.com</u>>

Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 6:40 PM

**To:** Briggs, Erica < <a href="mailto:EBriggs@a2gov.org">EBriggs@a2gov.org</a>>

**Cc:** Beaudry, Jacqueline < <u>JBeaudry@a2gov.org</u>>

**Subject:** Re: Submission in Lieu of Public Commentary -- Poverty Exemption

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Erica,

Thanks for this message!

Glenn

On Mon, Dec 21, 2020 at 6:19 PM Briggs, Erica < EBriggs@a2gov.org > wrote:

Thanks Glenn. I'm sharing your note with our City Clerk too. I think the Clerk's office generally tries to provide a call back if you don't get on the list of speakers, so perhaps it was a small oversight the resulted in you not getting called back.

Also, thanks for your thoughts on CA-11.

---

Erica Briggs, Ward 5 City Council Representative

Email: <a href="mailto:ebriggs@a2gov.org">ebriggs@a2gov.org</a>
Cell: 734-355-3931

www.a2gov.org

From: Glenn Nelson

Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 5:50 PM

To: CityCouncil < CityCouncil@a2gov.org>; Crawford, Tom < TCrawford@a2gov.org>; Teresa M. Gillotti < gillottitm@washtenaw.org>; A. Foster

; Ryan J Stanton < RStanton@mlive.com>; Eleanor Pollack

**Subject:** Submission in Lieu of Public Commentary -- Poverty Exemption

This message was sent from outside of the City of Ann Arbor. Please do not click links, open attachments, or follow directions unless you recognize the source of this email and know the content is safe.

Mayor Taylor, Council Members, Tom Crawford,

I called the City Clerk's Office at 8:02 am to ask to be included in the Public Commentary. A person took my information and gave no indication I would not be included. I have not subsequently received any notice I would be "bumped", but I see my name is not on the list. I submit the notes I would have spoken from as a substitute for delivering them tonight. Please consider my view as you deal with item CA-11 "Poverty Exemptions".

#### Public Commentary to City Council on 12-21-20

My name is .....

Low income households in AA are currently under enormous stress due to a combination of

- 1. Unemployment and lower incomes due to COVID including disproportionately high rates of infection and death due to the service jobs occupied by many
- 2. High and rising property taxes, e.g., recent school bond and affordable housing millages which I supported but which I recognize place a burden on low income households

Many low income homeowners are having a great deal of trouble paying their mortgage and tax bills

- Response of some is to leave AA in order to lower their housing costs
- Others face foreclosure either tax or mortgage foreclosure and then leave AA after losing their home

These problems will be especially severe in 2021 as the COVID pandemic and weak economy persist this winter

These are very bad outcomes

- Equity is violated it is unfair for lower income households to bear the brunt of this crisis while
  many professional, middle and upper income households are affected very little beyond the need to
  wear masks, practice social distancing, and wash hands
- Diversity is eroded economic diversity is one of the important dimensions of diversity. The high cost of housing is driving low income homeowners out of AA

There is an urgent need to strengthen our property tax relief measures. The poverty exemption is an important tool to do this. Neighboring jurisdictions with less wealth than AA, such as Dexter, Chelsea, Saline, and Pittsfield Township, do more than we do.

In general terms, I ask you to show empathy for struggling low income homeowners.

Specifically, I urge you to

- 1. Remove item CA-11 from the consent agenda and give it the focused attention it deserves.
- 2. Increase the income limits for the poverty exemption to 2.2 times the federal poverty thresholds
- 3. Direct the responsible parties to raise public awareness of, and simplify the application process for, the poverty exemption.

From: Horning, Matthew
To: Briggs, Erica
Subject: Re: Audit Committee

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 7:16:27 PM

## Thanks CM Briggs!

From: Briggs, Erica < EBriggs@a2gov.org>

**Sent:** Monday, December 21, 2020 6:41:17 PM

**To:** Horning, Matthew <MHorning@a2gov.org>; Disch, Lisa <LDisch@a2gov.org>; Hayner, Jeff <JHayner@a2gov.org>; Griswold, Kathy <KGriswold@a2gov.org>; Song, Linh <LSong@a2gov.org>; Pollay, Susan <SPollay@a2dda.org>; Hall, Jennifer (Housing Commission) <JHall@a2gov.org> **Cc:** Crawford, Tom <TCrawford@a2gov.org>; Higgins, Sara <SHiggins@a2gov.org>; Kudej, Karleen

<KKudej@a2gov.org>

**Subject:** RE: Audit Committee

Any of these dates work for me.

---

#### Erica Briggs, Ward 5 City Council Representative

Email: <a href="mailto:ebriggs@a2gov.org">ebriggs@a2gov.org</a>
Cell: 734-355-3931
<a href="mailto:www.a2gov.org">www.a2gov.org</a>

From: Horning, Matthew < MHorning@a2gov.org> Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 2:55 PM

**To:** Briggs, Erica <EBriggs@a2gov.org>; Disch, Lisa <LDisch@a2gov.org>; Hayner, Jeff <JHayner@a2gov.org>; Griswold, Kathy <KGriswold@a2gov.org>; Song, Linh <LSong@a2gov.org>; Pollay, Susan <SPollay@a2dda.org>; Hall, Jennifer (Housing Commission) <JHall@a2gov.org> **Cc:** Crawford, Tom <TCrawford@a2gov.org>; Higgins, Sara <SHiggins@a2gov.org>; Kudej, Karleen

<KKudej@a2gov.org> **Subject:** Audit Committee

Good afternoon Councilmembers, Ms. Hall, and Ms. Pollay,

I would like to schedule a meeting of the Council's Audit Committee to review the DDA audit, the AAHC audit, the City audit, and the Single Audit. Our Auditor, Michael Rolka of Yeo & Yeo, is available Jan. 7, Jan. 21, and Jan 28. I would like to meet for about an hour and a half, starting around 5:30. Can you let me know which of these dates work for you? Once I hear back from you, I will get the meeting on our calendars.

Thanks, Matt

Matthew V. Horning Interim CFO & Financial Services Area Administrator

From: Horning, Matthew
To: Hayner, Jeff
Subject: Re: Audit Committee

**Date:** Monday, December 21, 2020 7:16:04 PM

# Thanks CM Hayner!

From: Hayner, Jeff <JHayner@a2gov.org>
Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 6:16:38 PM
To: Horning, Matthew <MHorning@a2gov.org>

Subject: RE: Audit Committee

Any of those work for me so just let me know. I have no council business scheduled on Thursdays.

Jeff Hayner

From: Horning, Matthew < MHorning@a2gov.org>

Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 2:55 PM

<KKudej@a2gov.org> **Subject:** Audit Committee

Good afternoon Councilmembers, Ms. Hall, and Ms. Pollay,

I would like to schedule a meeting of the Council's Audit Committee to review the DDA audit, the AAHC audit, the City audit, and the Single Audit. Our Auditor, Michael Rolka of Yeo & Yeo, is available Jan. 7, Jan. 21, and Jan 28. I would like to meet for about an hour and a half, starting around 5:30. Can you let me know which of these dates work for you? Once I hear back from you, I will get the meeting on our calendars.

Thanks, Matt

Matthew V. Horning

Interim CFO & Financial Services Area Administrator