

# **City of Ann Arbor**

*301 E. Huron Street  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>*



## **Meeting Minutes - Final**

**Thursday, January 9, 2020**

**7:00 PM**

**Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council  
Chambers**

**Historic District Commission**

**A**      **CALL TO ORDER**

*Vice Chair Anna Epperson called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm.*

**B**      **ROLL CALL**

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.*

**Present:** 6 - Robert White, John Beeson, David Rochlen, Anna Epperson, Jessica Quijano, and Kathryn Fortener

**Absent:** 1 - Evan Hall

**C**      **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

**The Agenda was unanimously approved with Item F-2 removed. On a voice vote, the Vice Chair declared the motion carried.**

**D**      **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

*No audience participation.*

**E**      **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

**F**      **HEARINGS**

**F-1**      **20-0038**      HDC19-229      448 Fifth Street; 6-foot Dormer; OWSHD

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners David Rochlen and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review and reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Commissioners David Rochlen and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review and reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*The Applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 448 Fifth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a dormer on the south-facing rear roof, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for roofs, windows, and district or neighborhood setting, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to roofs.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Beeson, Secretary Rochlen, Vice Chair Epperson, Quijano, and Fortener

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Chair Hall

**F-2**      [20-0039](#)      HDC19-233      804 South First Street; Basement Egress Window; OWSHD  
ITEM WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT

**Withdrawn**

**F-3**      [20-0040](#)      HDC19-227      252 Crest Avenue; Basement Egress Window; OWSHD  
*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the*

*staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners David Rochlen and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review and reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Commissioners David Rochlen and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review and reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*The Applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by John Beeson, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 252 Crest Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a new basement egress window and well, on the condition that the glass is recessed to the same depth as the existing window glass. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, especially those for windows and safety codes, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for windows, neighborhood setting, and health and safety.**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Beeson, Secretary Rochlen, Vice Chair Epperson, Quijano, and Fortener

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Chair Hall

**F-4**      [20-0041](#)      HDC19-237      300 South State Street; Mural; SSHD

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners David Rochlen and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review and reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Commissioners David Rochlen and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review and reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*The Applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Kathryn Fortener, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 300 South State Street, a contributing property in the State Street Historic District, to install a removable mural on the west façade of the building from ground level to the underside of the masonry banding on the north facade, through mortar joints, not masonry units, excluding the use of 'liquid nails'. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area, and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 10, and the guidelines for building sites and masonry, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for signs.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the amended motion carried. Vote: 6-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Beeson, Secretary Rochlen, Vice Chair Epperson, Quijano, and Fortener

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Chair Hall

**F-5**      **20-0042**      HDC19-236      1137 Traver Street; Rebuild Façade; BHD

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

*REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:*

*Commissioners David Rochlen and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review and reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*PUBLIC HEARING:*

*Commissioners David Rochlen and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review and reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*The Applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by John Beeson, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1137 Traver Road, a contributing property in the Broadway Historic District, to selectively demolish and replace portions of the north, south, and east walls of the 2-story section of**

the house; reconstruct the north porch; and remove the non-historic stucco, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 4, 5, 6 and 7 and the guidelines for building site, neighborhood setting, health and safety, windows, and wood.

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Beeson, Secretary Rochlen, Vice Chair Epperson, Quijano, and Fortener

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Chair Hall

**G** **NEW BUSINESS**

**H** **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**H-1**      **20-0043**      Minutes of the November 14, 2019, HDC Meeting

**The November 14th, 2019 HDC meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission. On a voice vote, the Vice Chair declared the motion carried.**

**I** **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

*David Rochlen reported that he'd visited Tuebingen, Germany in December where he'd met with Architects and dignitaries in Germany and received tours of amazingly restored and beautifully preserved buildings*

*built in the 1500s. He highly recommended the city as a worthy travel destination.*

**J      ASSIGNMENTS**

**Review Committee: Monday, February 10, 2020 at Noon for the February 13, 2020 Regular Meeting**

*Anna Epperson and John Beeson volunteered for the February 2020 HDC Review Committee.*

**K      REPORTS FROM STAFF**

**20-0044**    November-December 2019 HDC Staff Activities

**Received and Filed**

**L      CONCERNS OF COMMISSION**

*Quijano said while traveling to other cities, she's heard concerns brought about quality of neighborhoods eroding with an influx of AirBnBs, and she'd heard our City Council is looking at the issue. Quijano said the HDC might want to reflect on historic Guidelines and Standards if they are applicable.*

*Beeson noted that New Orleans, is one of those cities, and they have very strict historic rules; he mentioned his parents are moving out of the French Quarter specifically because of the increase in AirBnBs, which has affected the quality of the neighborhood in New Orleans.*

**M      COMMUNICATIONS**

**20-0045**    Various Communications to the HDC

**Received and Filed**

**N      ADJOURNMENT**

**The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9: 00 pm.**



These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

Anna Epperson, Vice Chair  
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner  
mg/