

Approved Minutes
October 21, 2009
Ann Arbor Transportation Authority
Board of Directors Meeting
ATA Headquarters, 2700 South Industrial Highway, 6:30 p.m.

Board Members Present: Paul C. Ajegba (Chair), Ted Annis, Jesse Bernstein, Charles Griffith, Sue McCormick David Nacht, Rich Robben

Staff Present: Terry Black, Shawn Brophy, Ron Copeland, Michael Ford, Dawn Gabay, Jan Hallberg, Ed Robertson, Phil Webb, Chris White

LAC Representative: Rebecca Burke

Recording Secretary: Karen Wheeler

Chairman Paul Ajegba declared that a quorum was present and called the meeting to order at 6:31 p.m.

1.0 Public Hearing – None Scheduled

There was no public hearing

2.0 Communications and Announcements

2.1 Presentations by Board Chair

Mr. Ajegba deferred this agenda item until later in the meeting.

2.2 Appointment of Committee Chairs and Members

Mr. Ajegba made the following Committee appointments for FY2010: Planning and Development Committee – Rich Robben, Chair; Sue McCormick and David Nacht, Members. Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee – Jesse Bernstein, Chair; Ted Annis and Charles Griffith, Members.

3.0 Public Time – Comment on Agenda Items

No one appearing, Mr. Ajegba declared Public Time closed.

4.0 Review and Approval of Minutes

4.1 Review and Approval of Minutes of September 23, 2009

Jesse Bernstein moved approval of the Minutes as written with support from Ted Annis. The motion passed unanimously.

5.0 Board and Staff Reports

5.1 Planning and Development Committee

Mr. Annis reported on his last meeting as Chair of the Planning and Development Committee and referred to the meeting summary contained in the Board packet. Mr. Annis announced that the Committee agreed that the work to design a countywide bus system should be outsourced to a third party consultant. The Committee recommended that staff undertake the effort to issue a request for proposals to hire a consultant.

5.2 Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee

Mr. Bernstein reported that as incoming Chair of the Performance Monitoring and External Relations (PMER) Committee, he would be working with Michael Ford and Chris White to determine how to handle the voluminous amount of paperwork generated by the committee.

Mr. Bernstein reported that the budget is on line to have a \$28,000 surplus at year-end and shared the details of the projected surplus. Mr. Bernstein also reported on the details of the Quarterly Service Standards including coverage, condition of buses, safety, and system productivity. Mr. Bernstein noted that standards are exceeded regularly in some of the categories, and suggested that it might be appropriate to reconsider some of the expectations and adjust the targets upward.

5.3 Chief Executive Officer

Michael Ford referred to the Chief Executive Officer's report contained in the Board packet.

5.4 Local Advisory Council

Mr. Ajegba reminded Board members of the LAC's request to have a Board member present at LAC meetings. Mr. Ajegba suggested that members of the Board could rotate the responsibility, if the Committee was open to meeting at an alternate time. Mr. Ajegba asked for input from the board. Mr. Annis suggested that holding LAC meetings just prior to Board meetings or Board Committee meetings might improve the ability for a Board member to attend. Board members discussed the suggestion. Mr. Ajegba asked Michael Ford to discuss the concept of an alternate meeting time with LAC leadership. Mr. Ford agreed to have the discussion and report to the Board.

5.4.1 LAC Executive Committee Appointments

David Nacht moved that the Board appoint Jody Slowins, Karen Wanza, and Joanne Weintraub to the LAC Executive Committee. Sue McCormick supported the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

5.5 Treasurer's Report

Mr. Annis announced that there was no Treasurer's Report for October, and that he would present a report in November.

6.0 Question Time

Mr. Nacht commented on the use of Preventive Maintenance funds for operating expenses in the FY2008-2009 budget. Mr. Nacht requested that staff present a detailed report on use of the funds. Mr. Bernstein agreed to take up a three-year review of the use of funds in PMER, and then present the information to the full Board.

7.0 Old Business

7.1 MRide Agreement Negotiations

Ms. McCormick reported that there were no updates since the Board approved a one-year extension to the agreement with adjustments to the current formula. Ms. McCormick indicated that there was a need to establish a schedule to continue negotiations. Mr. Nacht reported that a strategy to pass on some of the costs to students was met with concern by a U of M official who indicated that such a plan might result in reduced levels of ridership.

Mr. Annis noted that a report on U of M ridership by route was previously provided to the Board on a regular basis. Mr. Annis requested that staff resume the practice of presenting the information to the Board. Mr. Ford agreed to provide the information.

Mr. Ajegba recommended that Mr. Ford join the MRide Agreement negotiating team. Ms. McCormick and Mr. Nacht agreed with the recommendation.

8.0 New Business

Mr. Nacht moved the following resolution with support from Mr. Annis.

8.1 Consideration of Resolution Approving ARRA Program of Projects

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority is required by the Federal Transit Administration to adopt program of projects for the American Recovery and Rehabilitation Act of 2009 (ARRA), and

- ❖ WHEREAS, \$4,160,000 of the total allocation of ARRA funds to AATA of \$6,450,056 has previously been obligated, and
- ❖ WHEREAS, the remaining \$2,290,056 is required to be obligated by February, 2010, and

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority has reviewed the attached program of projects for the remaining funds,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority Board of Directors authorizes the submission of a grant application for the following program of projects to the Federal Transit Administration.

Mr. Nacht reported that the Planning and Development Committee considered the resolution and the committee had no concerns.

The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Bernstein moved the following resolution with support from Mr. Griffith.

8.2 Consideration of Resolution Authorizing Execution of Contract for Night Ride Service

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority issued Request for Proposal (RFP) # 2009-12 for the purpose of identifying a firm to provide night ride paratransit services, and

WHEREAS, AATA staff evaluated the proposals and determined that the proposal of Blue Cab Company was found to be the most responsive and responsible of the two (2) proposals received,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority Board of Directors authorizes the CEO to enter into a contract with Blue Cab Company for night ride paratransit services for a three-year period based on cost per vehicle service hour, with up to two one-year renewals under the same terms and conditions provided.

Mr. Bernstein reported that the PMER Committee accepted staff's recommendation. Mr. Annis noted that the contract had a three-year term and suggested that it might be appropriate to have a shorter contract period, as on demand service needs were scheduled for a review to identify deficiencies.

Dawn Gabay indicated that the ARide paratransit service contract that expires in June 2010 was scheduled for review, not the Night Ride contract. Mr. Ford added that staff

was taking steps to look at what a new ARide contract will look like, and that costs have been noted as a concern.

The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Bernstein moved the following resolution with support from Mr. Griffith.

8.3 Consideration of Resolution Authorizing Execution of Contract for Facility Camera Technology Upgrade

WHEREAS, the AATA has a duty and responsibility to provide safe and secure facilities for its employees, visitors, and customers; to assist law enforcement agencies in the identification and apprehension of persons of interest; and to help insurance providers in the accurate and speedy processing of damage claims, and

WHEREAS, the current security system utilized by AATA is reaching the end of its useful life, utilizes aging technology, and is difficult and cumbersome to operate and maintain, and

WHEREAS, considerable advancements have been made during the past decade in video security systems, data storage, system control, and image processing and handling technology, and

WHEREAS, a thorough evaluation of all proposals received for the project has shown that Security Corporation's proposal is the lowest priced responsive bid that fully meets the specifications set for the project by AATA, now therefore

IT IS RESOLVED, that the contract for upgrading AATA's security system is awarded to Security Corporation based upon its proposal for the project.

Mr. Bernstein reported that the camera technology upgrade was a great leap forward in security technology. Mr. Bernstein indicated that the PMER committee was in agreement with staff's recommendation to award the contract to Security Corporation, whose proposal included the most cameras with the best storage and resolution at the best price.

Staff responded to questions from Board members on the proposed contract indicating that capital funds were budgeted for the purchase; all three of AATA's facilities would have coverage; and the new Park and Ride lot at Plymouth Road will have coverage which will be paid for separately.

The Board engaged in a lengthy discussion during which Board members raised several concerns related to the details of letting the Request for Proposals and subsequent evaluation of the five proposals that resulted in the recommendation to award a contract to Security Corporation. The areas of concern included whether it was a sound policy decision to invest in more technology when AATA is already paying for contracted security; documentation indicating that only one of the five responding vendors

adequately addressed all of the specifications; whether the contractor had the benefit of information that others did not, given that the same contractor was awarded a bid at the Plymouth Road park and ride lot; and the overall legitimacy of the procurement process.

Staff responded to the concerns indicating that the current camera system was limited in its ability to provide real-time information, does not have adequate resolution for identifying individuals, was beyond economical repair, and that funds were not available to provide full time coverage for contracted security. Staff gave assurance that the proper procurement guidelines were followed.

Mr. Nacht moved to table the resolution. There was no support for the motion to table.

Board members continued their discussion around security options at the transit centers and how cameras, contracted personnel and the local police departments might be utilized to receive the highest possible level of security. It was recommended that staff engage in discussions with local police departments to determine if the camera system could be connected to the police department. Mr. Ford agreed to have discussions with local law enforcement. Mr. Bernstein noted that the PMER committee was scheduled to take up a thorough review of the procurement manual to make sure that appropriate standards are upheld. Mr. Ford agreed to check into the legitimacy of this particular procurement process and report to the Board.

Mr. Nacht withdrew the motion to table.

The motion carried on a 5-2 vote: Ajegba – Yes; Annis – Yes; Bernstein – Yes; Griffith – Yes; McCormick – Yes; Nacht – No; Robben – No.

8.4 CEO's FY 2010 Goals and Objectives

Mr. Ajegba reported that the Governance Committee discussed the proposed CEO FY 2010 Goals and Objectives presented by Mr. Ford which are separate from the goals and objectives of the organization. The committee agreed that Mr. Ford would present his goals to each of the Board committees for their review, and subsequently to the full Board for approval.

Mr. Ajegba invited Rebecca Burke to provide a report on the Local Advisory Council as she had not yet arrived when the report came before the Board earlier in the meeting. Ms. Burke announced that the LAC Executive Committee supported the appointment of the three individuals who made application for the Executive Committee. Mr. Nacht indicated that the Board had voted in the applicants earlier in the meeting.

Mr. Ajegba asked Ms. Burke to work with Mr. Ford to determine if the LAC would consider modifying their meeting schedule to meet prior to Board or Committee meetings to accommodate attendance by a Board member.

9.0 Public Time

Jim Mogensen appeared before the Board. Mr. Mogensen commented on an October 29 Board information session to discuss Act 196 conversion, indicating that he hoped the issue would be discussed in open session. Mr. Mogensen commented on the service change process and the impending proposed service changes. Mr. Mogensen suggested that productivity numbers could crash, if reductions are made to neighborhood service to accommodate service to a park and ride lot. Mr. Mogensen indicated that the budget for local service should not be reallocated to provide service for customers who live out of town and that over the long term this will cause the Authority trouble.

Thomas Partridge appeared before the Board. Mr. Partridge called for all AATA Board and administrative activities to be fully open to the public and for all public documents, as soon as they are typed up, to be placed on AATA's website to help the residents of the entire county and region to be able to inspect and study the documents. Mr. Partridge alleged that committee and Board meetings are not accessible to the public because the Board refuses to make arrangements to move its meetings to a date that does not conflict with the Washtenaw County Board of Commissioners meeting, and refuses to make arrangements to hold its meetings at the CTN studio located across the street from AATA headquarters.

Mr. Partridge called on the Board to end the practice of slander and libel which he claimed was taking place, if someone is at odds with particular views of Board members. Mr. Partridge noted that he was listed in a PDC meeting summary as being in attendance at the meeting and the document included his arrival and departure times. Mr. Partridge indicated that there was no reason for him to be named in the document without his approval, and that there was not any reason to list members of the public in attendance at any meeting, unless the individual sought to speak.

Sandra Holley appeared before the Board. Ms. Holley commented on the Board's discussion to consider the use of security cameras at the Ypsilanti Transit Center in lieu of security personnel. Ms. Holley noted that Ypsilanti has some high crime areas and indicated that there must be a physical presence. Ms. Holley reported on the details of a criminal situation near the YTC. Ms. Holley suggested that emergency telephone boxes that ring down directly to the Ypsilanti Police Department be investigated to increase security in the area.

Mr. Ajegba requested that staff investigate emergency telephones for the YTC and the Plymouth Road park and ride lot.

Carolyn Grawi appeared before the Board. Ms. Grawi handed Mr. Ford copies of a petition signed by consumers in the Research Park Drive area who wish to have a bus come down the road and a light installed. Ms. Grawi indicated that she continues to receive input on difficulty with catching buses in the Arborland area. Ms. Grawi suggested that AATA work toward a solution before winter which will only increase the unsafe condition. Ms. Grawi reminded meeting attendees that October is "Investing in

Ability” month and encouraged attendance at events at the University of Michigan and Eastern Michigan University. Ms. Grawi commented on an injury she sustained while using train service, and urged the Board and staff to look at the accessibility of bus stations, rail stations, and rail lines to ensure the safety of all passengers.

Mr. Annis reported that he recently spent time at the Ypsilanti Transit Center. Mr. Annis suggested that building a fence between the YTC and the adjacent parking lot would cut down escape routes for criminals. Mr. Annis endorsed the idea of placing security phones in the area.

Mr. Bernstein requested clarification of the special Board meeting scheduled for October 29. Mr. Ford announced that a special Board meeting open to the public, was scheduled for Thursday, October 29 at 5:00 p.m. to be held at Weber’s Inn in the Varsity Room. Mr. Ford indicated that he would present information on his proposed vision for the organization, Act 196, and Countywide service. Mr. Ajegba indicated that the Board would not take any action at the special meeting, and that any voting on issues decided upon would take place at the November Board meeting.

2.1 Presentations by Board Chair

Mr. Ajegba presented plaques of appreciation to David Nacht and Dawn Gabay for their service as Board Chair and Interim Executive Director respectively. Mr. Ajegba indicated that Mr. Nacht and Ms. Gabay were both very instrumental in helping AATA through some difficult times over the past few years.

10.0 Adjournment

Mr. Bernstein moved to adjourn the meeting with support from Ms. McCormick. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 7:55 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Charles Griffith, Secretary