

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES STAFF REPORT

For Planning Commission Meeting of June 18, 2019

SUBJECT: Weber PUD Zoning, Supplemental Regulations & PUD Site Plan (2857 Packard Road)

File Nos. SP19-016, Z19-008

PROPOSED CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MOTION

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Weber Rezoning Petition from R1E (Single-Family Residential) with conditions to PUD (Planned Unit Development) district and Supplemental Regulations.

PROPOSED CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MOTION

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Weber PUD Site Plan and Development Agreement conditioned upon submission of an ecological maintenance plan for the natural features be submitted and approved by the City.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the **PUD zoning petition** be **approved** because it complies with the PUD standards of Chapter 55, Section 5.29.10. The following public benefits will be provided:

- Management of storm water from off-site neighbors
- Preservation of natural features with a maintenance plan
- A minimum of 54% of open space

With the improvements proposed, the project does not have a detrimental effect on public utilities or surrounding properties. The disturbance proposed is the minimum necessary to allow a reasonable use of this constrained site, and the benefit of this development to the community will be substantially greater than any negative impacts. This proposal is generally consistent with the Master Plan: Land Use Element and is compatible with the surrounding zoning designations and land uses.

Staff recommends that the **PUD site plan petition** be **approved** because it complies with all local, state and federal ordinances, standards and regulations; it will not cause a public or private nuisance; and it will not have a detrimental effect on public health, safety or welfare; the development would limit disturbance of natural features to the minimum necessary to allow a reasonable use of the land.

LOCATION:

This site is located on the north side of Packard Road, east of Easy Street. This site is located in the South Area and located in the Malletts Creek Watershed.

SUMMARY:

This petition was originally heard as an Area Plan and Rezoning from R1C (Single-Family Residential Dwelling District) to R1E (Single-Family Residential Dwelling District) and approved by both City Planning Commission and City Council in September and November 2016.

In September of 2017, the site plan petition for construction of 51 single-family dwelling units was denied by City Planning Commission and later by City Council in November as this proposal did not limit the disturbance of natural features to the minimum necessary to allow a reasonable use of the land.

Since this denial, two citizen participation meetings for the 2857 Packard Planned Unit Development and site plan submittal were held at Tappan Middle School Media Center. The first meeting was held on March 21, 2019 and the [second meeting](#) was held April 11, 2019.

PROPOSED CHANGES:

The petitioner proposed changes from the original site plan submission to address natural features concerns. These issues and concerns include:

- Proposed townhouse residential units to cluster units
- A natural features maintenance plan

The following changes have been made to the PUD site plan.

Site Plan – The general layout from the previous site plan is the same with the number of units remaining at 51, a ring road accessing the units, and storm water detention basins located at the northeast and southwest areas of the site. The proposed units inside the ring road are no longer single-family detached units and instead are 26 two-story townhouse units in four buildings. This style of housing product requires rezoning from R1E, Single-Family Detached, to PUD, Planned Unit Development, to allow for townhouse units.

The revised townhouse layout preserves 37 more woodland trees (376 inches at DBH) and 5 additional landmark trees (182 inches at DBH) compared to the previously denied site plan. The Natural Features Chart below compares the previously denied site plan to the currently proposed PUD Site Plan.

A crushed limestone pathway has been added between the townhouse buildings connecting the east side of the site to the west side park.

NATURAL FEATURE	NATURAL FEATURES EXISTING CONDITIONS	NATURAL FEATURES IMPACTS PUD Site Plan (Current)	NATURAL FEATURES PRESERVED PUD Site Plan (Current)	NATURAL FEATURES IMPACTS DENIED Site Plan (2017)	NATURAL FEATURES PRESERVED DENIED Site Plan (2017)
Woodland (acres)	3.40 Acres				
Woodlands DISTURBED (acres)		3.40 Acres*		3.40 Acres*	
Woodlands PRESERVED (acres)			0 acres*		0 acres*
Woodland Trees (>6" DBH) DBH = Diameter at Breast Height (4.5' above ground)	208 trees** (2127" DBH)	146 Trees Removed (1459" DBH)	13 Trees Preserved w/ critical root zone impacts (137" DBH)	183 Trees Removed*** (1835" DBH)	13 Trees Preserved w/ critical root zone impacts (147" DBH)
			49 Trees Preserved w/ no impacts (531" DBH)		12 Trees Preserved w/ no impacts (121" DBH)
Landmark Trees	57 trees (1377" DBH)***	38 trees Removed (854" DBH)	5 trees Preserved w/ critical root zone impacts (157" DBH)	43 trees Removed (1036" DBH)	5 trees Preserved w/ critical root zone impacts (152" DBH)
			8 trees Preserved w/ no impacts (224" DBH)		2 trees Preserved w/ no impacts (39" DBH)
*The removal of trees for this development will reduce the basal area of the woodlands to less than 30 square feet per ½ acre and the areas will no longer meet the woodlands definition of Chapter 55.					
**Does not include Landmark Trees that are also considered Woodland Trees—see Landmark Trees					
***Includes Landmark Trees off-site that are within 50 feet of the property line/limits of disturbance.					

Planned Unit Development – The [PUD Supplemental regulations](#) have been submitted and are attached.

SITE PLAN DATA ANALYSIS:

		PROPOSED	PERMITTED/REQUIRED	EXISTING	PERMITTED/REQUIRED
Zoning		PUD (Planned Unit Development)	PUD	R1E (Single-family Residential District)	R1E
Gross Lot Area		326,469 sq ft* (7.49 acres)	sq ft MIN/dwelling unit	326,469 sq ft* (7.49 acres)	4,000 sq ft MIN/dwelling unit
Lot Width		406 ft	34 ft	406 ft	34 ft
Setbacks	Front	20 ft	20 ft	125 ft	15 ft MIN
	Side	3 ft	3 ft	115 ft	3 ft
	Rear	20 ft	20 ft	620 ft	20 ft
Building Height		1-2 stories**	30 ft	30 ft	30 ft MAX
Parking - Automobiles		153 spaces	102 space/dwelling MIN***	2 spaces	1 space/dwelling MIN
Parking – Bicycles		1 Space/garage	None****	None	None

* Net lot area is gross lot area minus Packard Road right-of-way.

** A minimum of 5 homes are to be ranch style

*** Private street requires 1 space/unit plus 1 space/dwelling

**** Bicycle parking located in garages

SERVICE UNIT COMMENTS:

Planning – Staff recommends the PUD zoning be approved because the proposed use provides a reasonable approach to develop this site, which contains significant constraints due to natural features. The plan proposes to preserve 4.4 acres of open space and preserve a total of 42 additional landmark/woodland trees from the previously denied proposal. Mitigation trees totaling 577 inches are proposed to be planted around the perimeter of the site to provide screening from adjacent neighbors and along the public Right-of-Way between the road and detention pond. A total of 1,119 inches of mitigation trees is required and a contribution of \$54,200 to the Street Tree Fund is proposed to make up this difference.

The proposed plan complies with PUD standards by providing public benefits in the form of a Maintenance Plan for the natural features and detaining off-site detention in the northeast detention pond, and a minimum requirement of open space.

The previous site plan proposed 51-single family detached units, while this site plan proposes the same number of units and preserving 42 additional trees totaling 558 inches of DBH. The

Master Plan: Land Use Element identifies this site as Site 8 and states this 7.9 acre site is located on the north side of the Packard, east of Easy Street. Single-family detached residential use is recommended. This PUD zoning is largely consistent with the underlying R1E zoning density and surrounding zoning and land uses, however attached units would not be permitted.

The rezoning of this parcel from R1E to PUD zoning accomplishes many goals identified in the City's Master Plan and supporting documents. The existing land use recommendation designates the site for single-family residential use. While this proposal does not meet this single-family land use designation, the proposed townhouses provide a diverse housing type as recommended by the City's Master Plan. Compact or clustered development concentrates development away from sensitive natural features and helps preserve natural systems and utilizes infrastructure more efficiently. In this case, the attached units are preserving 42 additional trees.

Providing pedestrian, bicycle and transit connections and amenities encourages alternatives to vehicular access by increasing travel choices. Sidewalks have been provided on both sides of the streets in the development to encourage pedestrian access throughout the site and connect to public transit.

The proposed single-family and townhouse use generates a comparable traffic impact at a rate similar to the surrounding residential neighborhoods.

Forestry - The PUD site plan proposes to have less impact on the site's natural features (i.e. landmark and woodland trees) than the 2017 site plan that was denied by City Council. High quality natural features proposed to be preserved on the PUD site plan, include trees in the bur oak stand on the western side of the property which contains the largest tree on the site, the 60" bur oak. Mid to low quality natural features proposed to be preserved include a black walnut stand in the center of the site and landmark and woodland trees along the perimeter. Based on the site's zoning (R1E), the density permitted under the zoning, the number and quality of natural features proposed to be preserved and the natural features mitigation provided, the City's reviewer has determined the PUD site plan meets city code natural features and landscaping requirements and standards for approval.

Parks - Proposed 51 dwelling units x .0125 acres (the amount desired to keep pace with existing parkland density) x \$50,000/acre (the average cost for parkland/acre) = \$31,875.

Storm Water – The WCWRC rules stipulate that detention must be provided for on-site runoff and any off-site runoff that is directed to the stormwater management system. If the off-site runoff can bypass the development to follow the natural flow paths, without greatly changing the existing flow patterns, the rules allow for that. With regard to the northeast basin under the current site layout, the off-site drainage could not bypass the system without changing the flowpath and/or concentrating the flow, so it was required to be included in the northeast basin. However, by having the runoff from the northern off-site areas be directed into the northeast basin, the amount of runoff that goes to the eastern adjoining properties will be greatly reduced from current conditions.

Prepared by Chris Cheng
Reviewed by Brett Lenart
6/15/19

Reference Documents: [March 21, 2019 & April 11, 2019 Neighborhood Meeting Minutes](#)
[September 19, 2017 Staff Report](#)
[PUD Zoning and Supplemental Regulations](#)
[PUD Site Plan & Maintenance Plan](#)
[Draft PUD Development Agreement](#)
[Zoning/Parcel Map](#)
[Aerial Map](#)

c: Robert R. Weber (Owner)
Jim Haeussler, Peters Building Co. (Petitioner)
Tom Covert, Midwestern Consulting, LLC (Petitioner's Agent)
Systems Planning
Project No. SP19-016, Z19-008